

This is a repository copy of Sixty-three years of thinking sociologically: Compiling the bibliography of Zygmunt Bauman.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/157001/

Version: Accepted Version

# Article:

Palmer, J orcid.org/0000-0003-3091-8763, Brzeziński, D and Campbell, T (2020) Sixty-three years of thinking sociologically: Compiling the bibliography of Zygmunt Bauman. Thesis Eleven, 156 (1). pp. 118-133. ISSN 0725-5136

https://doi.org/10.1177/0725513619898289

© The Author(s) 2020. This is an author produced version of an article published in Thesis Eleven. Uploaded in accordance with the publisher's self-archiving policy.

### Reuse

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

### Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/ Dr Dariusz Brzeziński<sup>1</sup>, Institute of Philosophy and Sociology of the Polish Academy of Science, University of Leeds (Visiting Research Fellow) Dr Tom Campbell, University of Leeds Dr Jack Palmer, University of Leeds

# Sixty Three Years of Thinking Sociologically: Compiling the Bibliography of Zygmunt Bauman

### INTRODUCTION

In a very personal, retrospective text, published in 2008, Zygmunt Bauman acknowledged: "Among the skills I never managed to learn in the course of a half-century of study and writing, is how to finish a book... With the benefit of hindsight I can see that all my books were sent to the publishers unfinished. (...) The most intriguing and provocative questions emerged after the answers" (Bauman 2008: 240). This attitude towards writing was both an effect of his constant openness to questions and doubts, and the result of his conviction that no answer will ever be conclusive. Any attempts at understanding the social world may only be a more-or-less adequate interpretation, he thought. Guided by such a methodological principle, made explicit in his Hermeneutics and Social Science (Bauman, 1978), Bauman became notoriously prolific: he published more than eighty books, and hundreds of articles, essays and reviews, and, although not included in the bibliography accompanying this article in this collection on Bauman, he also gave several hundreds of public lectures. If his contribution to our science is to be properly understood we must endeavour to understand the sheer scale of Bauman's output, the wide variety of forms he choose to deploy and important themes that could be easily lost amongst the shadow cast by his many great works on the crowded shelf of his oeuvre.

Bauman's first academic publication appeared in 1953; it was a Polish piece co-written with Jerzy Wiatr and was titled "O roli mas w historii" [On the historical role of the masses] (Bauman and Wiatr 1953).<sup>2</sup> Since his death in January 2017, four books (Bauman 2017a, 2017b, 2018; Bauman and Leoncini, 2018) and several articles bearing his name have appeared in English, including the translation of Sketches in the Theory of Culture, the 'lost book' that was seized by the authorities upon his expulsion from Poland in March, 1968<sup>3</sup>. Additional 'lost writings' have been found in collaboration with the University of Leeds Special Collections team during the archiving of the many boxes of his personal papers and correspondence, and

the digital archiving of floppy discs and USB sticks. This is, therefore, as good a time as any to attempt to start compiling the complete bibliography of Zygmunt Bauman.

This article is devoted to presenting those characteristics of Bauman's writings that are the most significant from a perspective of completing our initial archival work and compiling of his bibliography. In the first part of the paper we analyse his exceptional productivity by taking into consideration both his attitudes towards writing and the extraordinary thematic diversity of his papers. Here, we also address questions related to the curious reception of Bauman in the discipline of sociology, and beyond. Our reflections in the second part of this paper concentrate on the stylistic, formal and substantive heterogeneity of Bauman's writing. In summary, we emphasise that not only the work of interpreting Bauman's oeuvre, but also the efforts to compile it will perhaps remain an "unfinished adventure" (Bauman 2004). Before this, however, we will consider how our work in compiling the bibliography has been aided by the fact that, along with Mark Davis, we have the privilege of being the academic part of a project team developing the Janina and Zygmunt Bauman Archive at the University of Leeds.

# BIBLIOGRAPHY AND THE ARCHIVE

The generous gift of the research materials of Zygmunt and Janina Bauman from the Bauman family has provided us with the opportunity to work in collaboration with the University of Leeds Special collections team to develop a soon to be opened public research resource. The Zygmunt and Janina Bauman Archive collects personal papers, the book collection, and other materials amassed by Janina and Zygmunt Bauman over six decades. To give a sense of scale, the team of academics and professional archivists are currently processing 156 x large boxes of papers; 32 x USB sticks; 126 x 3-inch CF2 Compact discs; 216 x 3.5 inch Compact discs; 98 x CD/RW 108 discs; 20 x VHS tapes; 38 x Audio Cassettes; and a great many metres of books that made up Janina and Zygmunt personal libraries. Material in the archive is mainly concentrated in the decades that followed Zygmunt and Janina's arrival in Leeds, but does contain a limited number of documents from their period in Israel and some documents from the lives before the exile of 1968.<sup>4</sup> Written documents take the form of draft manuscripts, essays, research notes, personal correspondence with friends, invitations and extraordinarily rich professional correspondence with major sociological luminaries from across the decades in which Bauman wrote. We have compiled the bibliography in part to aid Special Collections in the cataloguing of the vast material that Leeds now has. Working with this material in its raw un-archived form has been a privilege and the excitement we felt when we discovered published papers previously unknown to us and unpublished manuscripts cannot be understated. It also made evident to us the challenges of interpreting a major thinker across changing time and space contexts, as intellectual positions evolve, as personal and intellectual networks mutate, as there are inevitably blank spots in the fragmentary composition of the archive, and it is not always clear what a thinker is reading. Many of these challenges are exacerbated in the case of Bauman whose life and work was destabilized by forced exile in 1968. What is more, we believe the archive will become an important resource for those working on the history of sociology and social theory in the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> centuries because of the breadth of the correspondence it holds.

Access to Zygmunt Bauman's 'documents of life' (Plummer, 2001), in their currently unarchived form, has been invaluable for the purposes of finding numerous papers that were not included in previous bibliographies of Bauman, and are likely still unknown even to many of his expert readers. It has allowed us to continue the work of that others have carried out previously. For example, Richard Kilminster and Ian Varcoe, both former colleagues of Bauman's during his time at Leeds, included a substantial bibliography in their Festschrift, published as Culture, Modernity and Revolution (Kilminster & Varcoe, 1996). The late Keith Tester, along with Michael Hviid Jacobsen and Sophia Marshman, built upon this work with the annotated bibliographies that they developed in their volumes Bauman Before Postmodernity and Bauman Beyond Postmodernity (Jacobsen & Tester, 2006; Jacobsen, Marshman & Tester, 2007). These are vital resources for scholars of Bauman's work. Over a decade or two have passed since these volumes appeared, however, and in that time Bauman became still more prolific. The sheer scale of Bauman's output – its translation into multiple languages, shifting styles and formats, and various locations of development - mean that there inevitably gaps now apparent in these earlier efforts that we are able to fill. What is more, the existing bibliographies do not include many of his papers published in Poland, both before March 1968, and in the subsequent years. All in all, our aim is to prepare as complete picture of Bauman's oeuvre as possible. This bibliography will be housed on the Bauman Institute website and will be updated as we become aware of new material or it is published.

## BAUMAN THE "GRAPHOMANIAC"

Bauman dedicated his life to thinking. By his own admission, he couldn't think without writing, a daily task that began at 4am according to Aleksandra Jasińska-Kania's moving memoir of their time spent together during their marriage in the last five years of his life (Kania, 2018). Reflecting on the relationship between reading, thinking and writing in This is not a

Diary, in the letter written to Janina Bauman, his first wife, just days after her death, Bauman put it thus:

"I suppose I am a reader first and writer second – scraps, snippets, bits and pieces of thoughts struggling to be born, their ghostly/ghastly spectres whirling, piling up, condensing and dissipating again, need to be caught by the eyes first, before they can be stopped, held in place and given contours. They must first be written down in a row for the tolerably rounded thought to be born; or, failing that, to be aborted or buried as stillborn" (Bauman, 2012:2)

Eo ipso, for Bauman reading, thinking and writing were clearly interrelated moments in the process of understanding. Therefore, the writings gathered in the bibliography are, we might say, the surface evidence of the life of the mind. Borrowing from the beautiful metaphors deployed by Hannah Arendt we can also acknowledge that his papers are the cairns erected along "the timeless track that thinking beats into the world of space and time", monuments "inserted between an infinite past and an infinite future" that today, after his death, may serve as a guide to "each new generation, every new human being ... [as they] ploddingly pave anew the path of thought" (Arendt, 1978:210, 212).

The bibliography is testament to Zygmunt Bauman's lifework as a writer, in the sense elaborated by Theodor Wiesengrund Adorno in his "The Essay as Form" (Adorno, 1984). The writer, in Adorno's terms, is typically a pejorative label ascribed to the essayist by the self-appointed guardians of the academic disciplines. Its implicit function – even when it is given in praise – is to place the writer outside of the disciplinary boundary itself. Adorno draws on Georg Simmel and Walter Benjamin as examples of writers in this sense, and both were of especial importance as far as Bauman's style of writing is concerned as well as key characters in the drama of Jewish modernity as narrated in Bauman's 'Jewish writings'<sup>5</sup>. Moreover, his sociology was explicitly and self-consciously distanced from the kind of totalising synthesis – for him, best represented sociologically by the work of Talcott Parsons (Bauman 1976) – that, to use Adorno's words, "dresses itself up with the nobility of the universal, the everlasting, and today – when possible – with the primal" (Adorno, 1984:141). In the totalising mode, as read by Adorno, all individual parts of a sociologist's output must "build a continuum of operations" and "advance in a single direction" along "the main road to the origins" (Adorno, 1984:159-160). Bauman's work abandons this kind of order to embark on multiple paths. The end result

is that "the aspects of the argument interweave as in a carpet" and "the fruitfulness of the thoughts depends on the density of this texture" (Adorno, 1984:160)

The anti-totalising character of Bauman's sociology is reflected in the forms he adopted to express his sociological analysis. There is no single enormous tome that can be easily identified as Bauman's chef'de'ouevre, the centre through which all his works must be read, but rather like Simmel and Benjamin before him, a multiplicity of forms and the polyvocality of authorial voices in Bauman's sociology emphasises the pluralistic and the fragmentary over the totalising and the systematising. This is reflected in his mastery of the art of writing in various forms – the essay, the monograph, the diary piece, the blog post, the epistolary, the dialogic book, the interview, the review essay. Once again like Simmel, Bauman writes about topics that comfortably fall within the realms of mainstream academia, but he also deals with phenomena that would seem to be more ephemeral. The different forms he utilised allowed for different forms of sociological analysis to be pursued. His private letters uncovered in the archive are full of love for his friends, admiration for his peers and are often rich in sociological insight in their own right. His book reviews are often essays that elaborate a sociological theme or develop concept, his 'diary volumes' are aphoristic and personal yet maintain a sociological emphasis. His blog posts allow him to say something of a fleeting moment of social life or comment on urgent matters of current affairs. In his essay "The Philosopher in the Age of Noise" (Bauman, 1987), Bauman evinced a recognition that the sociologist must adopt many voices and write in many forms if they are to analyse the variegated and dynamic world in which we live. Sociological thinking was for him to vital to our task of finding a way to live together in our shared world. Sociological writing is useless if it exists only in the pages of peer reviewed journals (Dawes 2011; Bauman 2000: 202-216).

In the conversation between Zygmunt Bauman and Keith Tester (Bauman and Tester, 2001) the latter asked the former which were his 'desert island' books. In his answer Bauman mentioned a few books: Robert Musil's The Man Without Qualities, Georges Perec's Life: A *User's Manual*, Jorge Luis Borges' Labyrinths and Italo Calvino's Invisible Cities. "These books" he said:

"exemplify everything I learned to desire and struggled, in vain, to attain: the breadth of vistas, the at-homeness in all compartments of the treasury of human thought, the sense of the many-facetedness of human experience and sensitivity to its as-yet-undiscovered possibilities – the style of thinking, and writing, I'd dearly wish to master but alas never did nor will. If pressed to limit my choices,

I'd probably settle for Borges' 'The Garden of Forking Paths'" (Bauman and Tester 2001: 24)

The paths of Bauman's thought diverge and converge, approach each other, break off, and fork perpetually towards his future writings. Some of these paths are very familiar in the commentaries of his work (the "modern trilogy", the "liquid writings"), and often are detrimentally severed from earlier paths (his discussions on the philosophy of the social sciences, the elaboration of a hermeneutic and critical sociology, etc.)<sup>6</sup>.

Other paths are less well-trodden. There is the "Jewish turn" for instance, that was made visible in his neglected essays published in journals like The Jewish Quarterly and Polin in the late 1980s, accompanying the better-known Modernity and the Holocaust (1989a) and Modernity and Ambivalence (1991). This was simultaneously an "autobiographical turn". It was inextricable from the testimonies of Janina Bauman, of course. More than this, however, the archive contains a number of documents that show that Zygmunt was engaged in delving into his own biography, not least in a memoir written in 1986 called "The Poles, the Jews, and I: An Investigation into Whatever made me who I am". This extraordinary document accords his writings of this period an undeniably personal slant. The title of one essay - 'The Homecoming of Unwelcome Strangers' (1989b) - reflects, we might surmise, the ambiguity of his and Janina's return to Poland in 1988, twenty years after their exile. This points to another less-trodden path in Zygmunt Bauman's work, namely his political sociology of east-central Europe and of Soviet-type societies, especially well-represented in the annals of Telos throughout the 1980s. This work was perhaps what he was best known for in the USA. The correspondence from the 1960s held in the archive are littered with invitations from luminaries of the young International Sociological Association - such as Reinhard Bendix, Seymour Martin Lipset, and Robert K. Merton – inviting him to offer a 'Polish perspective' on themes such as youth, education, and political parties. Later, his reputation as a 'Sovietologist' - a label that he strongly resisted (Bauman in Jacobsen and Tester, 2005: 44) – led to the offer of a chair at Yale in Soviet and Comparative Communist Studies<sup>7</sup>. Also neglected are his commentaries on many of the major figures of sociology classical and contemporary expressed through artfully crafted review essays, such as those on Norbert Elias (1979, 1993), Richard J. Bernstein (Bauman, 1987) and Gillian Rose (1993b, 1994). These are each "hidden paths" (Campbell et al, 2018) or "otherwise hidden avenues in the thought for which Bauman has become well known" (Jacobsen & Tester, 2005:8).

On the other side there were preoccupations in Bauman's sociological work that stretched over its entirety. In 2009, in the conversation with his Polish friends, Anna Zeidler-Janiszewska and Roman Kubicki, he said: "It seems to me (...) that all this time (and this is already half a century ...) I asked myself the same or very similar questions, but I wandered from one place to another in search of an answer" (Bauman, Kubicki and Zeidler-Janiszewska 2009:256). Eighteen years earlier, in the conversation with Kilminster and Varcoe, Bauman distinguished two themes that his work always addressed, namely suffering and culture (Bauman 1992: 206). In the light of his bibliography, it is legitimate to state that both utterances aptly apply to all of his work. Regardless of the phase of his work, he both made efforts to describe the factors responsible for human misery and paid attention to the need to take actions that could lead to the limitation of suffering. The difference was only in the ways he was implementing these assumptions. As far as culture is concerned, Bauman wrote two books and several articles on the topic in his Polish period (Bauman 1966; 2018). Although many of the aspects of his theory of culture were further developed and refined, there were some to which he remained faithful until the end of his life (Brzeziński 2018a: 77-94; 2018b: vii-xxv). He acknowledged as much in his afterword to Sketches in the Theory of Culture, written almost fifty years after this book was first prepared to be published in Poland (Bauman 2018: 251-255).

In terms of the challenges related with the process of compiling a complete bibliography of Zygmunt Bauman, his extraordinary industry, and the fact that his oeuvre resembles a "garden of forking paths", should be listed together with its multilingual nature. Bauman started his academic career in the University of Warsaw. Between 1953 and 1968 he wrote fifteen books and many articles of which only a few have ever been published in English<sup>8</sup>. The first book he published in English in 1972 – Between Class and Elite, which he prepared during the 1950s during a research visit to the LSE under the supervision of Robert McKenzie – was in fact a development of his habilitation that had been originally published in Polish in 1960. Some of his Polish books, however, were translated into Czech, Hebrew, Slovak, Serbo-Croat, Hungarian, Italian and French, but the vast majority of material from this era has not yet been translated into English. Evaluations of Bauman published in English, therefore, despite their best efforts remain partial. It should be stressed as well that before March 1968 Bauman's network of co-correspondents, collaborators, students and audience was in fact global. In the archive we have found correspondence from that time between him and Theodor Adorno, Julia Kristeva, and many of the luminaries of US sociology including those mentioned above. Moreover, despite the "iron curtain" Bauman was able to travel across the

globe and to build the social capital that was indispensable when he was expelled from the University of Warsaw. As a Professor at Tel-Aviv University (1968-1971), Bauman started teaching and writing in Hebrew which is reflected in the materials gathered in the Archive in Leeds. Both at that time, and since he held a position of Professor of Sociology at the University of Leeds, he wrote above all in English<sup>9</sup>. With the passing of time, however, his articles and books were available in an increasing number of languages across the world. This process was intensified when he started writing on postmodernity.

Today, Bauman is one of the most well-known sociologists across the globe. His books are translated for the large international readership that he enjoyed in countries such as Argentina, Brazil, China, Japan, Mexico, Turkey, and South Korea. There is also, of course, great interest in his work across Europe and he had a mastery of a number of European languages: Polish and English, of course, but also French, German, Russian, Hebrew, and more<sup>10</sup>. This is reflected in the development of a bibliography by scholars at the Fondazione Collegio San Carlo di Modena, itself indicative of the great public and academic attention paid to his writings and lectures in Italy<sup>11</sup>. More recently, Simon Tabet developed a bibliography that included some of Bauman's few publications in French (Tabet, 2017). Bauman also exercised a great influence on Czech sociology as it emerged from the ruins of the Stalinist period, and he later donated a substantial section of his library to the Institute of Sociology in Prague after it was damaged by flooding (Petrusek, 2010). As such he cannot simply be pigeonholed as a Polish, British, Jewish or Polish-British-Jewish academic. We suggest that he can only be problematically understood as a "European" writer and intellectual, and then only if we choose to accept that part of being a "European" intellectual means also the ability and privilege of being able to communicate across national borders. As has been suggested by William Outhwaite (2010), it follows that no language can lay claim to the complete Bauman. With this in mind, we have decided to include in the bibliography his English and Polish articles above all. Modern technology means that we can create this bibliography as a living document, to be permanently housed on the Bauman Institute website<sup>12</sup>, that will be updated regularly more fully to encompass his prolific, multi-thematic, and multilingual oeuvre as our archival work progresses, and as many people around the world join in our efforts to find hitherto unknown or long forgotten pieces of work.

# STYLISTIC AND FORMAL HETEROGENEITY

Any reflection on Bauman's bibliography should also recognise the stylistic diversity of his work. For the whole sixty three years of his reading, writing and thinking sociologically,

he wrote for academics but also self-consciously and deliberately for a more general population especially after his formal retirement. The proportions of both forms of his work changed over time. His approach to writing for the general reader was formed already when he worked at the University of Warsaw. Referring to his Polish sociological masters, Stanisław Ossowski and Julian Hochfeld, Bauman admitted that he learned from them that:

> "(...) a sociologist may not do without a 'popular' language, if he or she is to honor this concept. A 'popular' language means a language which is understandable for the 'uninitiated,' that is, exactly for the people for whose benefit sociological thinking is done – or is worth doing – and towards whom one bears responsibility for the words uttered" (Bauman, Kubicki and Zeidler-Janiszewska 2009: 25).

This conviction was reflected in the style of such books as: Kariera. Cztery szkice socjologiczne [Career: Four Sociological Sketches] (1960) Socjologia na co dzień [Sociology for Everyday Life] (1962b) or *Idee, idealy, ideologie* [Ideas, Ideologies] (Bauman, 1963). At the time, works written in that style were not so common and the majority of his books and articles before March 1968 were written in more technical academic prose. Due to both the popularity of sociology in Poland during the nineteen sixties (Bauman, 1964: 9-16), and his own growing reputation, some of the more academic texts were nevertheless widely read. Following his enforced exile in 1968, first working as a Professor at Tel Aviv University and then beginning his career in Leeds, Bauman used the 'popular' language in his sociological writings rather less frequently. The most important topic for his sociological studies in that time was to develop a theory of culture (Bauman 1972, 1973) and a philosophy of social sciences (Bauman, 1976, 1978), with the condition of Central and Eastern European countries, Poland in particular (Bauman, 1971), an ongoing and important empirical reference point. These are evidently more technical and recognisably academic topics. It is perhaps unsurprising that an emigre intellectual would turn to these more formal topics when trying to rebuild his life and career after exile. Moreover, in contrast to the position he had enjoyed in Poland, he was in those early years not well known among the British scholars, nor the wider British public at all<sup>13</sup>.

This last issue should be analyses in the broader context as well. In his contribution to the epilogue of A.H. Halsey's seminal text on the history of academic sociology in Britain (Halsey, 2004), Bauman notes how, coming from Poland and deeply familiar with sociological

traditions in the West via thinkers based in France and Germany, he was shocked at how little impact sociology had in British public life. As he put it, "to say that sociology had a 'bad press' would be to play down that mixture of hostility and ridicule in which it seemed to be held". Nevertheless, this "internal exile" of sociology had its benefits:

"neither spoiled by excessive public demands nor rushed by overblown and impossible-to-gratify public expectations, insured against the dangers awaiting the academics seduced into the corridors of power, sociology was free to select its own topics and could be guided by social and cultural criteria of relevance" (Bauman, 2004:207).

In terms of Bauman's recognition, this all began to change in the middle of the nineteen eighties when he started writing on the genesis and condition of modernity and postmodernity. At that time, Bauman began to develop a sociological language that blended the analytical and the essayistic<sup>14</sup>, a fine example of what Clifford Geertz called the "blurred genre" (Geertz, 1980: 165-179). Peter Nijhoff, who analysed and interpreted this language in the end of the last century, wrote as follows:

"His discourse combines terminology from different contexts: by transferring expressions – concrete and abstract, colloquial and esoteric, narrative and analytical – he dovetails in fact all sorts of separate spheres and sectors. (...) When Bauman, in his writings, contaminates the purity of analytical lines with terminology from other branches ('and/and') he is demonstrating in a stylistic way that our reality is multitudinous (...)" (Nijhoff, 1998: 96-97).

Bauman was, as Keith Tester (2004: 12-16) also recognised, the most self-conscious of sociological stylists in this regard. But the stylistic changes in Bauman's writings attracted some controversy and are important for considering his reputation in and beyond sociology. His position in professional sociology is peculiar. On the one hand, he is widely celebrated, firmly established in the contemporary canon of British sociology for instance (Outhwaite, 2009). On the other hand, he also provokes consternation. Especially in the post-2000 period of Bauman's career – and in a good example of the pejorative ascriptions of "the writer" and "the essayistic" addressed by Adorno – his work has sometimes been reduced to quasi-journalistic "commentary" that valorizes the fragmentary and lacks unifying characteristics<sup>15</sup>.

This peculiarity and paradoxicality of Bauman's position in sociology is at least in part related to the difficulty of pinning him down. Martin Jay captured something important when he spoke of Bauman's Mercurian characteristics (Jay, 2010). These render him difficult to capture in the prevailing interpretive frames established in the sociology of intellectuals. Bauman also had no discernible commitment to a given 'school' in sociology and was in no way interested in establishing his own. He largely seems to have escaped the pressures of the professionalization of sociology (Elias, 2009) and his work is quite genuinely transdisciplinary in its inception, substance and also in its reception. He certainly engaged in 'intellectual positioning', in Patrick Baert's terms, but was just as much positioned by others (Baert, 2012). He was unavoidably entangled in intellectual networks as theorised by Randall Collins, but his membership of the coterie of exiled social and political thinkers of the twentieth century meant that he didn't straightforwardly operate in one, easily distinguishable network but several simultaneously (Collins, 1999). It also meant that he, in his own terms, was something of a 'stranger' in all of them, a peripheral figure who made a creative advantage of his 'weak ties' to these networks, to borrow a term from social network analysis (Scott, 2017).

It should be also emphasised that Bauman's productivity sharply increased from the moment of his retirement in 1990. He retired, it seems, at the right time, when the marketisation of UK higher education inaugurated in earnest under the Thatcher governments had yet to reach full fruition. Even still, in a letter to his friend and former colleague at Leeds, Ralph Miliband, he noted with regret the degradation of the university: 'Bit by bit the flesh is cut away, and people clearly grow used to it'<sup>16</sup>. In retirement, not overcome by cynicism or burn-out, he was able to pursue the vita completativa. What is more, since his retirement Bauman referred in his writings more and more often to phenomena of popular culture, interpreting them in the contexts of more general changes within the social world and granting them the same significance as more technical academic topics because they helped him to say something meaningful to his readers. Driving this method of writing was the ongoing endeavour, shaped by Ossowski and Hochfeld's teachings, to conduct "an ongoing dialogue with human experience" (Bauman and Tester, 2001: 40). Even his detractors would have to admit that he was remarkably successful in this sense; through his writings, Bauman has amassed a global popular audience and influence, the types of which again seem rather unthinkable today.

Perhaps the most representative style of Bauman's writings in his liquid modern phase of work was that many of his books were dialogues between him and other scholars, journalists or artists. The first of these books was Conversations with Zygmunt Bauman, published in 2001, with Keith Tester. Subsequent books – like Identity (2004b), Living on Borrowed Time

(2010), posthumously published Born Liquid (Bauman and Leoncini, 2018) and many others - were in fact the result of a new way of reading, writing and thinking sociologically that was technologically facilitated. The overwhelming majority of these books emerged out of email correspondence, where long answers could be prepared over a much greater time period than in a face-to-face interview. In some fragments of these "dialogical" books Bauman referred to the issues that were very rarely analysed by him in his more 'conventional' volumes. For example, in the book Living on Borrowed Time he referred to the issue of biotechnology and genetic modifications. In Born Liquid he wrote – among other topics – about tattoos and plastic surgery. The idea of 'dialogical' books may be interpreted as a way of realising Bauman's concept of 'an ongoing dialogue', not only with the intellectuals, but – above all – with 'human experience'<sup>17</sup> that 'unlike the university buildings, is not divided into departments' (Bauman and Tester, 2001: 40). In the afterword to the last – unfinished – book that took the form of a conversation between Bauman and the Italian journalist, Thomas Leoncini, the latter wrote: 'Zygmunt Bauman had an extraordinary gift: he taught us an analytical method and he lived to build the instruments that allow us to understand where we are and where we're going' (Leoncini in Bauman and Leoncini, 2018:106).

A very important – and often overlooked – aspect of Bauman's writings are his book reviews. Seldom a celebrated part of scholarship, we invite the reader to discover that Bauman's own are far more than dry page-long summaries. They are, according to one prominent journal editor in a private letter found in the archive, 'evaluations at ... [a] high level' that 'do more for a book than a pound of thoughtless encomiums'<sup>18</sup>. In 'Philosophy for Everyday – Though not for Everyone', his review of Gillian Rose's The Broken Middle, Bauman characterizes his approach to reading as 'inspired' rather than 'methodical' (categories borrowed from Richard Rorty). Whereas the methodical reader aims at the 'correct reading', or the knowledge of 'what the book they put on the grill was really about', the inspired reader searches for the 'illuminating' reading, aware that their 'reading will differ from that of any other reader, much as her or his interests and commitments and biographically shaped relevances differ from mine' (Bauman, 1993: 115). These reviews combined with essays on major schools of thought and influential thinkers establish that Bauman is an under-appreciated commenter on the sociological tradition.

For Bauman, the 'classical' and 'dialogical' books, his scientific and more essayistic papers, his reviews and review essays, each have to be considered together with his press and video interviews, conference keynotes, shorter press articles, and many blog posts. Both in the earliest phases of his writings, whilst a very well-known sociologist in Poland, and in the last few decades of his life, when he was a globally-recognised public intellectual, Bauman was using as many platforms of communication with his readers as possible. This, of course, corresponds with his idea of an engaged sociology that was targeted not only to the intellectuals but also to the general public (Bauman 1976; 2000: 202-216). Bauman's writings – or, more broadly, his texts – reflected wider changes within the information society (Castells, 1996-1998). Within the last decades of his life, Bauman was interviewed by press and television journalists from a great many countries, wrote articles and commentaries on blogs in different languages and accepted invitations to submit articles to newspapers across the globe<sup>19</sup>. Although we knew many of his texts that were published outside of academia, our work in the development of the Janina and Zygmunt Bauman Archive at Leeds made us fully realize the scale of this more popular writing. Taking this into consideration we decided to include in the bibliography his books, journal articles and reviews. We hope that with the collaboration of many Bauman readers from around the world, this new 'living' version of his bibliography can continue be updated further and we invite readers of this article to share with us any known gaps.

## SUMMARY

In the same article cited at the start of our paper, Bauman wrote:

"Human experience, I believe, is richer than any of its interpretations. No interpretation, however ingenious and 'comprehensive', would exhaust it; none could, since the unceasing and unstoppable labour of Wiederholung (recapitulation in Heidegger's terms) or iteration (in Derrida's terms) is the prime factor of the element. Those who embark on the life of conversation with human experience, better abandon all dream of the restful and to their journey. This journey has no end – all happiness is in travel" (Bauman, 2008:240).

This general utterance may well be applied to any attempt at interpreting Bauman's oeuvre. He wrote for sixty three years and published an extraordinary number of papers. They cover almost every aspect of human experience in an 'on ongoing dialogue' with it. What is more, Bauman uses very different platforms of communication in order reach the widest range of readers. The numerous forms which he penned his sociological insights in, the heterogeneity of the styles he deployed and the different publics he wrote for makes evident that he viewed

form and style as purposefully chosen vehicles that could enhance both the acuity of sociological analysis and the ability of its intended public to hear it. We have shown in this article as well that not only any analysis of his papers, but even the process of gathering all of them together may be compared to the journey that 'has no end'. In the bibliography that follows, we have chosen to focus upon his English and Polish publications on linguistic grounds, based both on our own competencies and since these were the two written languages in which Bauman was most productive. In close, there is also another issue that we would like to stress. As a result of our archival work at Leeds, we were able to find many of his previously unpublished papers. Currently we are working on a new project to make them available to readers in the form of a three volume book series. They will include both his unpublished articles, papers that were published in English. We hope that the first volume in this new series will appear in 2021, with two further volumes planned in subsequent years.

Acknowledgements: The authors would like to express their gratitude to Prof. Aleksandra Jasińska-Kania, Lorna Sweeney and Robert Irnazarow for their support in compiling the bibliography, and to Mark Davis for his comments and substantial editorial work to improve this article

## Reference List

- Adorno, T.W. 1984. The Essay as Form. New German Critique, 32 (3-4), 151-171.
- Baert, P. 2012. Positioning Theory and Intellectual Interventions. Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour, 42 (3), 304-324.
- Bauman, Z. 1960. Kariera. Cztery szkice socjologiczne [Career: Four Sociological Sketches]. Warszawa: Iskry.
- Bauman, Z. 1962a, Social Structure of the Party Organization in Industrial Works. The Polish Sociological Bulletin, vol. 2, no. 3-4, pp. 50-64.
- Bauman, Z. 1962b. Socjologia na co dzień [Everyday Sociology]. Warszawa: Iskry.
- Bauman, Z. 1962c, Values and Standards of Success of the Warsaw Youth. The Polish Sociological Bulletin, vol. 2, no. 1-2, pp. 77-90.
- Bauman, Z. 1963. Idee, idealy, ideologie [Ideas, Ideals, Ideologies]. Warszawa: Iskry.

- Bauman, Z. 1964. Wizje ludzkiego świata. Studia nad społeczną genezą i funkcją socjologii
  [Visions of Human World: Studies on the Social Genesis and Function of Sociology].
  Warszawa: Ksiażka i Wiedza.
- Bauman, Z. 1966, *Kultura i społeczeństwo. Preliminaria* [Culture and Society: Preliminaries].Warszawa: Państwowe Wydawnictwo Naukowe.
- Bauman, Z. 1967, Notatki poza czasem [Notes Beyond Time], Twórczość, 10 (267): 77-89.
- Bauman, Z. 1971. Social Dissent in the East European Political System. Archives Européennes de Sociologie, vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 25-51.
- Bauman, Z. 1972. Culture, Values and Science of Society. The University of Leeds Review, vol. 15, no. 2, pp. 185-203.
- Bauman, Z. 1973. Culture as Praxis. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Bauman, Z. 1976. Towards a Critical Sociology: An Essay on Common-Sense and Emancipation. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Bauman, Z. 1977. Stalin i rewolucja chłopska. Studium dialektyki pana i niewolnika [Stalin and the peasant revolution. Study of the master's and slave dialectic] 'Aneks' 15: 102–139.
- Bauman, Z. 1978. Hermeneutics and Social Science: Approaches to Understanding. London: Hutchinson.
- Bauman, Z. 1979: The Phenomenon of Norbert Elias, Review of: N. Elias, 'What is Sociology?', N. Elias, 'The Civilising Process. The History of Manners', J. Goudsblom, "Sociology in the Balance. A Critcal Essay', 'Human Figurations. Essays for Norbert Elias', Sociology, 1: 117-125.
- Bauman, Z. 1985. Stalin and the Peasant Revolution: A Case Study in the Dialectics of Master and Slave. Leeds Occasional Papers in Sociology, no. 19.
- Bauman, Z. 1987. The Philosopher in the Age of Noise: A Reading of Richard J. Bernstein's Philosophical Profiles. Theory, Culture & Society, 4 (1), 157-165.
- Bauman, Z. 1989a. Modernity and the Holocaust. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Bauman, Z. 1989b. The Homecoming of Unwelcome Strangers. The Jewish Quarterly, vol. 36, no. 3, pp. 14-23.
- Bauman, Z. 1991. Modernity and Ambivalence. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bauman, Z. 1992. Intimations of Postmodernity. Oxon: Routledge.
- Bauman, Z. 1993a. Review of: N. Elias, 'The Society of Individuals', Sociological Review, 3: 585-589.

- Bauman, Z. 1993b. Philosophy for Everyday Though not for Everyone. Review of G. Rose 'The Broken Middle'. Economy and Society, 22 (1), 114-122.
- Bauman, Z. 1994: Review of: G. Rose, 'Judaism and Modernity: Philosophical Essays', Sociological Review, 3: 572-576.
- Bauman, Z. 2000. Liquid Modernity. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bauman, Z. 2004a. Europe: An Unfinished Adventure. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bauman, Z. 2004b. Identity: Conversations with Benedetto Vecchi. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bauman, Z. 2008. Bauman on Bauman Pro Domo Sua, In: M. H. Jacobsen & P. Poder (ed.), The Sociology of Zygmunt Bauman. Challenges and Critique, Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 231-240.
- Bauman, Z. 2010. Living on Borrowed Time: Conversations with Citlali Rovirosa-Madrazo. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bauman, Z. 2012. This is not a Diary. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bauman, Z. 2017a. A Chronicle of Crisis, 2011-16. London: Social Europe Edition.
- Bauman, Z, 2017b, Retrotopia. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bauman, Z. 2018. Sketches in the Theory of Culture. Cambridge: Polity. [Originally intended for publication in 1968].
- Bauman, Z. & Wiatr, J. 1953. 'O roli mas w historii' ['On the Historical Role of the Masses'] *Myśl filozoficzna*, 3: 69-99.
- Bauman, Z. & Tester, K. 2001. Conversations with Zygmunt Bauman, Oxford-Malden: Polity Press.
- Bauman Z & Lioncini, T. 2018. Born Liquid. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bauman, Z., Kubicki, R. & Zeidler-Janiszewska, A. 2009 Życie w kontekstach. Rozmowy o tym, co za nami i o tym, co przed nami [Life in the contexts. Talks about what's behind us and what's ahead of us]. Warszawa: Wydawnictwa Akademickie i Profesjonalne.
- Brzeziński Dariusz, 2018a, Consumerist Culture in Zygmunt Bauman's Critical Sociology: A Comparative Analysis of his Polish and English Writings, Polish Sociological Review, 2018, nr 1, s. 77-94.
- Brzeziński Dariusz, 2018b, A Message in a Bottle: on the Recovered Work of Zygmunt Bauman. In: Z. Bauman, Sketches in the Theory of Culture, Cambridge: Polity Press, pp. vii-xxv.
- Campbell, T., Davis, M. & Palmer, J. 2018. Hidden Paths in Zygmunt Bauman's Sociology: Editorial Introduction. Theory, Culture & Society, 35 (7-8), 351-374.

- Castells, M. 1996-1998. The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture, 3 vols. Oxford: Wiley Blackwell.
- Collins, R. 1999. Sociology of Philosophies: A Global History of Intellectual Change. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Davis, M., 2010, Bauman's Compass: Towards a Sociology of Hope, Compass. Direction for the Democratic Left: Think Pieces, nr 67, <u>https://www.bl.uk/britishlibrary/~/media/bl/global/social-welfare/pdfs/non-</u> secure/b/a/u/baumans-compass-towards-a-sociology-of-hope.pdf (16.04.2019).
- Dawes, S., 2011. The role of the intellectual in liquid modernity: An interview with Zygmunt Bauman. Theory, Culture & Society, 28(3), pp.130-148.
- Elias, Norbert. 2009. Essays on the Sociology of Knowledge and the Sciences. Dublin: UCD Press [Collected Works, vol. 14].
- Favell, A. 2005. Review of Society under Siege. American Journal of Sociology, 111 (1), 342-344.
- Geertz Clifford, 1980, Blurred Genres: The Reconfiguration of Social Thought, The American Scholar, 49(2): 169-175.
- Halsey, A. H. 2004. A History of Sociology in Britain: Science, Literature, and Society. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Jacobsen, M.H. & Tester, K. 2005. Bauman Before Postmodernity: Invitation, Conversations and Annotated Bibliography, 1953-1989. Aalborg: Aalborg University Press.
- Jacobsen, M.H. & Tester, K. 2006. Editor's Introduction: Being a Sociologist, Polish Sociological Review, 3(155): 263-266.
- Jacobsen, M.H., Marshman, S. & Tester, K. 2005. Bauman Beyond Postmodernity: Critical Appraisals, Conversations and Annotated Bibliography, 1989-2005. Aalborg: Aalborg University Press.
- Jacobsen, M. H., Marshman, S., 2008a, Bauman on Metaphors A Harbinger of Humanistic Hybrid Sociology, In: M. H. Jacobsen, P.Poder (ed.), The Sociology of Zygmunt Bauman. Challenges and Critique, Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 19-39.
- Jay, M. 2010. Liquidity Crisis: Zygmunt Bauman and the Incredible Lightness of Modernity. Theory, Culture & Society, 27 (6), 95-106.
- Kania, A. 2018. Living with Zygmunt Bauman, Before and After. Thesis Eleven, 149 (1), 86-90.
- Kilminster, R. & Varcoe, I. 1996. Culture, Modernity and Revolution: Essays in Honour of Zygmunt Bauman.

Nijhoff, P., 1998, The Right to Inconsistency, Theory, Culture & Society, 1: 87-112.

- Outhwaite, W. 2009. Canon Formation in Late 20<sup>th</sup>-Century British Sociology. Sociology, 43 (6), 1029-1045
- Outhwaite, W. 2010. Bauman's Europe, Europe's Bauman. In Davis & Tester (eds.) *Bauman's* Challenge: Sociological Issues for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Petrusek, M. 2010. Zygmunt Bauman and Czech Sociology (1964-2010). Sociologický *Časopis /* Czech Sociological Review, 46, 6,1035-1045.
- Plummer, K. 2001. Documents of Life 2: An Invitation to a Critical Humanism. London: SAGE.

Scott, J. 2017. Social Network Analysis, 4th ed. London: SAGE.

Tabet, S. 2017. Bibliographie exhaustive anglophone et francophone de Zygmunt Bauman.

La nouvelle revue des sciences sociales, 8, 27-34.

- Tester, K. 2002. Paths in Zygmunt Bauman's Social Thought. Thesis Eleven, 70, 55-71.
- Tester, K. 2018. On Repetition in the Work of Zygmunt Bauman. Thesis Eleven, 149 (1), 104-118.

Therborn, G. 2008. From Marxism to Post-Marxism? London: Verso.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Dariusz Brzezinski's research was funded by the Institute of Philosophy and Sociology of the Polish Academy of Science on the basis of the grant, based on the decision No POR/2017/S/08.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The collation of the Polish language material with English translation makes evident to the reader the scholar richness and breadth of Bauman's pre-Leeds career much of which penned in his native language and thus inaccessible to many of his readers. Despite Bauman's leading role in Polish sociology in the 50's and 60s this material is also not well known in Poland. After his exile, he became a persona non grata, whose work could not be included in reading lists or cited. There are also some Polish pieces written after 1968 that have not been translated into English.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Written when Bauman was a professor in Poland, and originally intended for publication in 1968, this book was suppressed by the Polish government in the wave of repression following the protests in March of that year. It was thought to be lost until Dariusz Brzezinski found a set of uncorrected set of proofs in the combined libraries of Department of Philosophy and Sociology at the University of Warsaw.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The collation of the Polish language material with English translation makes evident to the reader the scholar richness and breadth of Bauman's pre-Leeds career much of which penned in his native language and thus inaccessible to many of his readers. Despite Bauman's leading role in Polish sociology in the 50's and 60s some of this material are also not well known in Poland. After his exile, he became a persona non grata, whose work could not be included in reading lists or cited. This situation lasted for about two decades.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See Cheyette and Dawson in this collection for more on the significance of Bauman's 'Jewish writings'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Mark Davis in this collection. Two nods must also be extended here to Keith Tester: for a discussion of Bauman's work in terms of the 'garden of forking paths', see Tester, 2002; and for the argument that the adversarial commentaries of recent years focus on the familiar paths of Bauman's thought, and are considerably weakened as a result of doing so, see Tester, 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See letter from David Apter to Zygmunt Bauman, 14<sup>th</sup> March, 1989, in Janina and Zygmunt Bauman archive, MS 2067/B/5/2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> His first English articles that appear in the Polish Sociological Bulletin are translations of Polish-language articles that were written earlier (Bauman 1962c: 77-90; 1962a: 50-64).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> There are, however, some of his papers that he wrote in Polish between 1968 and 1989. See for example the article *Stalin i rewolucja chlopska*. *Studium dialektyki pana i nie* wolnika [Stalin and the peasant revolution. Study

of the master's and slave dialectic] (Bauman 1977: 102-139), published in English in Leeds Occasional Papers in Sociology eight years later (Bauman 1985).

<sup>10</sup> Even if Bauman didn't publish formally in all these languages, our archival work shows that he used them in his extensive correspondence.

<sup>11</sup> Dated January, 2000. Available online at: <u>https://www.fondazionesancarlo.it/wp-content/uploads/2016/12/bauman\_zygmunt.pdf</u>. We are particularly indebted to the anonymous compilers of this bibliography for listing the books reviews written by Zygmunt Bauman for various journals over several decades which are difficult to trace using conventional research techniques.

<sup>12</sup> https://baumaninstitute.leeds.ac.uk/

<sup>13</sup> Michael Hviid Jacoben and Keith Tester wrote on that topic in 2006 as follows: "From the perspective of the present, when Bauman's work is so widely known, it is difficult to remember know unknown he was before he started to write about postmodernity and the Holocaust. Let us provide a few anecdotes: in 1985, when Keith Tester told a very solid and established British sociologist that he was going to study for a PhD under Zygmunt Bauman's supervision, the sociologist remarked that he 'had vaguely heard of Bullman (sic!).' Equally, when Michael Hviid Jacobsen was a visiting scholar in the US a few years back, nobody at this rather esteemed sociology department had ever come across the name Zygmunt Bauman nor any of his books for that matter. Many, however, were later thrilled when reading his books and discovering his unique sociological imagination" (Jacobsen, Tester 2006: 263-266).

<sup>14</sup> There were some examples of this discourse in the papers written by Bauman before his expulsion from the University of Warsaw. See e.g.: Bauman 1967: 77-89.

<sup>15</sup> For example one of the reviewers of Society Under Siege wrote that his work was 'flimsy, overwrought, speculative sociocommentary' (Favell 2002: 344). In Goran Therborn's more charitable formulation Bauman's 'prolific output of social commentary ... travel light, burdened neither by research nor by theoretical analytics, but borne up by an unusual life wisdom, a trained observer's eye and a fluent pen' (Therborn, 2008:168)

<sup>16</sup> Letter from Zygmunt Bauman to Ralph Miliband, 26<sup>th</sup> January, 1981. Ralph Miliband Papers held at the University of Leeds, MS1712, CO16.

<sup>17</sup> See Davis in this collection for more on the significance of human experience for Bauman's method of sociological hermeneutics.

<sup>18</sup> Irving Louis Horowitz, quoted in Letter from Ferenc Feher to Zygmunt Bauman, 8th June, 1988, in Janina and Zygmunt Bauman Archive, MS 2067/B/5/2.

<sup>19</sup> The posthumously published book A Chronicle of Crisis 2011-2016, is in fact a collection of articles Bauman wrote for Social Europe Journal (Bauman 2017a).