

SOCIAL AND
ENVIRONMENTAL POLICIES
IN EC PROCUREMENT LAW

New Directives and New Directions

Edited by

SUE ARROWSMITH

and

PETER KUNZLIK



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

<i>Contributors to the volume</i>	<i>page xv</i>
<i>Preface</i>	xvii
<i>Chronological table of cases</i>	xxiv
<i>Table of European legislation</i>	xxxii
<i>Table of UK legislation</i>	xxxix

Editors' Note – the decision in *Rüffert v. Land Niedersachsen* 1

1 **Public procurement and horizontal policies in EC law: general principles** 9

SUE ARROWSMITH AND PETER KUNZLIK

1. Introduction 9
2. The concept of horizontal policies, the equal status of horizontal policies and the issue of terminology 12
3. Purchasing autonomy, the market mechanism and the internal market 15
4. Government as purchaser and government as regulator under EC law 21
5. Horizontal policies and the objectives and competences of EC procurement regulation 29
 - 5.1. Introduction 29
 - 5.2. EC law and the discretion of Member States 30
 - 5.3. The EC's role in promoting or requiring use of horizontal policies 37
6. The impact of EC law on Member States' discretion: principles of interpretation 46
7. The relationship between primary and secondary Community law: using the directives to interpret the Treaty? 50
8. Conclusions 53

2	EC regulation of public procurement	55
	SUE ARROWSMITH AND PETER KUNZLIK	
1.	Introduction	55
2.	Procurement outside the scope of the Treaty	55
3.	Procurement within the Treaty but outside the procurement directives	56
3.1.	'Negative' obligations	57
3.1.1.	Free movement of goods	57
3.1.2.	Freedom of establishment and freedom to provide services	77
3.1.3.	Conclusion	80
3.2.	The positive obligation of transparency	82
3.3.	Development of a general principle of equal treatment in public procurement	85
4.	Procurement within the scope of a directive	88
4.1.	The history and nature of the public procurement directives	88
4.2.	Horizontal policies under the directives: legislation, jurisprudence and soft law	92
4.3.	Overview of the Public Sector Directive and its main obligations	98
4.3.1.	Introduction	98
4.3.2.	Coverage	98
4.3.3.	The general principles	100
4.3.4.	The permitted procurement procedures and techniques	101
4.3.5.	Specifications and other contract requirements	103
4.3.6.	Exclusion and selection of tenderers	104
4.3.7.	Award criteria	106
4.3.8.	Information obligations	107
3	A taxonomy of horizontal policies in public procurement	108
	SUE ARROWSMITH	
1.	Introduction	108
2.	Policies limited to compliance with general legal requirements and policies that go beyond legal compliance	109
2.1.	Policies limited to compliance with general legal requirements	109
2.2.	Policies that go beyond compliance with general legal requirements	116

3.	Policies confined to performance of the contract being awarded and policies that go beyond contract performance	121
3.1.	Introduction	121
3.2.	Policies confined to contract performance	122
3.3.	Policies that go beyond contract performance	125
4.	<i>Mechanisms for implementing horizontal policies</i>	127
5.	Conclusion	146
4	Application of the EC Treaty and directives to horizontal policies: a critical review	147
	SUE ARROWSMITH	
1.	Introduction	147
2.	<i>Horizontal policies and the EC Treaty: introductory remarks</i>	148
3.	Industrial policies and the EC Treaty	148
4.	Social and environmental policies and the EC Treaty	158
4.1.	Introduction	158
4.2.	The decision to purchase or not to purchase and the decision on what to purchase	159
4.3.	Contractual requirements laid down by the purchaser	159
4.3.1.	<i>Requirements confined to contract performance</i>	159
4.3.2.	Contractual requirements going beyond contract performance	177
4.4.	Packaging and timing of orders	182
4.5.	Set-asides	182
4.6.	Exclusion from contracts for non-compliance with government policies	184
4.6.1.	<i>Provisions limited to compliance with general legal requirements</i>	184
4.6.2.	<i>Provisions that go beyond compliance with general legal requirements</i>	185
4.7.	Preferences in inviting firms to tender	188
4.8.	Award criteria	188
4.8.1.	<i>Award criteria confined to contract performance</i>	188
4.8.2.	<i>Award criteria that are not confined to contract performance</i>	190
4.9.	Measures for improving access to government contracts	191
4.10.	Proving compliance with social and environmental measures under the EC Treaty	191
4.11.	Disclosure obligations under the EC Treaty	192
5.	<i>Horizontal policies and the Public Sector Directive: introductory remarks</i>	192

6.	The principles of equal treatment and non-discrimination in the directive	195
7.	The decision to purchase or not to purchase and the decision on what to purchase: impact of the directive	198
8.	Contractual requirements laid down by the purchaser: impact of the directive	198
8.1.	Requirements confined to contract performance	198
8.1.1.	Requirements limited to compliance with general legal requirements	198
8.1.2.	Requirements that go beyond compliance with general legal requirements: introduction	200
8.1.3.	Requirements that go beyond compliance with general legal requirements: technical requirements	201
8.1.4.	Requirements that go beyond compliance with general legal requirements: special conditions	206
8.1.5.	A third category: social and environmental conditions that may not be included as contract requirements ('prohibited requirements')	212
8.1.6.	Classification of social and environmental requirements that go beyond legal compliance: technical requirements, special conditions or prohibited requirements?	215
8.2.	Contractual requirements going beyond contract performance	226
9.	Packaging and timing of orders: impact of the directive	227
10.	Exclusion from contracts for non-compliance with government policies: impact of the directive	227
10.1.	Introduction	227
10.2.	Exclusion for non-compliance with general regulatory requirements	228
10.3.	Exclusion for non-compliance with standards that go beyond regulatory requirements	232
11.	Set-asides: impact of the directive	234
12.	Preferences in inviting firms to tender: impact of the directive	234
13.	Award criteria: impact of the directive	235
14.	Conclusions: impact of the directive on Member States' discretion	244
15.	Obligations to use procurement as a policy tool: impact of the directive	245
16.	The impact of the Government Procurement Agreement and other international trade agreements	247

5 The impact of the EC state aid rules on horizontal policies in public procurement 249

HANS-JOACHIM PRIESS AND MORITZ GRAF
VON MERVELDT

1. Introduction 249
2. The concept of state aid 250
3. The case law of the European Courts and the case practice of the Commission 250
 - 3.1. The case law of the ECJ 251
 - 3.2. The case law of the CFI 251
 - 3.3. The case practice of the Commission 253
4. Horizontal policies as state aid? 254
5. Application of the EC state aid rules on public procurement measures 255
 - 5.1. Relevant procurement situations 256
 - 5.2. Determination of the market price 257
 - 5.2.1. The 'market economy test' 257
 - 5.2.2. What would a private purchaser do? 258
 - 5.2.3. Which private investor? 260
 - 5.2.4. Which horizontal criteria? 261
 - 5.2.5. Which benchmark? 262
 - 5.2.6. Which procedure? 264
6. Conclusions 268

6 EC public procurement law and equality linkages: foundations for interpretation 271

CHRISTOPHER McCRUDDEN

1. Introduction 271
2. Some preliminary points 272
3. Equal treatment as the basis of EU status equality law and procurement law 274
 - 3.1. Conceptions of equality and non-discrimination 277
 - 3.1.1. Equality and equality as 'rationality' 277
 - 3.1.2. Equality and equality as protective of other 'prized public goods' 278
 - 3.1.3. Equality as preventing 'status-harms' arising from discrimination on particular grounds 279
 - 3.1.4. Equality as proactive promotion of equality of opportunity between particular groups 280
 - 3.2. Equal treatment in Community law 280

3.3.	Status equality and procurement law: the same principle of equal treatment?	285	
3.4.	Obligations to promote status equality in the procurement directives	286	
3.5.	Equal treatment as an interpretative principle	288	
4.	Freedom of contract and the subject matter of the contract		289
5.	Overall limits of the procurement directives: the limits of the Treaty	300	
6.	Conclusion	308	
7	Disability issues in public procurement		310
	ROSEMARY BOYLE		
1.	Introduction	310	
2.	Disability laws at European and national level and in the United States	311	
3.	Contract compliance – the United Kingdom experience		316
4.	Pre-existing possibilities for considering disability issues under the procurement directives	317	
4.1.	Introduction	317	
4.2.	Qualification and selection of firms to tender in restricted and negotiated procedures and (admission to) the open procedure	318	
4.2.1.	Criteria for exclusion	318	
4.2.2.	Criteria for selection	319	
4.3.	Specifications	320	
4.3.1.	The possibility for specifications relating to accessibility and the limits of discretion	320	
4.3.2.	Describing accessibility requirements to the market	324	
4.3.3.	Verification of compliance with accessibility requirements	325	
4.4.	A balanced score sheet or pass/fail?	326	
4.5.	Award criteria	327	
4.6.	Compliance with national legislation on disability issues		329
5.	Innovative provisions in the Public Sector Directive		329
5.1.	Introduction	329	
5.2.	Technical specifications	330	
5.3.	Contract compliance – the pursuit of social priorities through contract conditions	331	
5.4.	Reserved contracts	333	
5.4.1.	The context	333	
5.4.2.	Overview of the directive's new provisions		336

5.4.3.	The discretion of Member States and procuring entities, and the example of the United Kingdom	337
5.4.4.	Obligation to follow the normal tendering rules and to open reserved procurements to all Member States	339
5.4.5.	Eligible workshops and programmes	339
6.	Conclusion	343
8	The legality of SME development policies under EC procurement law	345
	NICHOLAS HATZIS	
I.	Introduction	345
2.	The role of SMEs	346
3.	Set-asides	348
3.1.	Contracts above Community thresholds	348
3.2.	Equality under the Treaty	349
3.3.	Discrimination and indistinctly applicable measures	352
3.4.	Affirmative action	356
4.	Subcontracting	357
4.1.	Rationale for SMEs' involvement	357
4.2.	Prohibited and compulsory subcontracting	359
5.	The design of the procurement process	364
5.1.	Identifying design defects	364
5.2.	SME-friendly procurement	365
6.	Conclusion	367
9	The procurement of 'green' energy	369
	PETER KUNZLIK	
1.	Community energy policy	369
2.	The implications of energy policy for procurement	372
3.	The implications of environmental principles for procurement	375
4.	Resolving procurement-environment tensions in the energy context	376
5.	Community trends that will impact on energy procurement and the procurement of energy-consuming goods, works and services	378
5.1.	Community policy on renewable energy	378
5.2.	Energy-use standards	381
5.3.	Energy-use labelling	382
5.4.	A Community horizontal policy on energy?	382
6.	The discretion of contracting authorities to pursue environmental objectives	388
7.	Procurement of energy-efficient products	389

8.	Procurement of electricity from renewable sources of energy	390
8.1.	Contract award criteria in electricity supply contracts favouring electricity from renewable sources of energy	390
8.2.	Electricity supply contracts – specifications requiring electricity to be produced from renewable energy sources	391
8.3.	Special conditions requiring electricity to be supplied from renewable energy sources	401
9.	Procurement of goods produced using electricity from renewable energy sources	402
9.1.	Award criteria favouring products produced using energy from renewable sources	402
9.2.	Specifications requiring that products to be supplied must themselves be made using only electricity from renewable energy sources	404
9.3.	Special conditions requiring that products to be supplied must themselves be made using only electricity from renewable energy sources	405
10.	Conclusions	406
10	Reconciling national autonomy and trade integration in the context of eco-labelling	408
	DAN WILSHER	
1.	Introduction and overview	408
2.	What are eco-labels?	410
3.	The effect of the EC Treaty: is procurement by reference to eco-labels consumption or regulation?	413
4.	The case law under the old procurement directives	417
4.1.	Eco-labelling and the case law of the ECJ under the old directives and the EC Treaty: a summary of possible approaches	418
4.1.1.	A discrimination test	419
4.1.2.	A mutual recognition/proportionality test	420
4.1.3.	A market access/proportionality test	420
4.2.	Conclusions on the EC Treaty	421
5.	Eco-labelling under the new procurement directives: enabling green procurement or a super-hurdle?	422
5.1.	Eco-labels and technical specifications	423
5.1.1.	Meeting the procedural standards for use of eco-labels as technical specifications	426
5.1.2.	A practical solution: a presumption of adequacy for certain eco-label schemes	430
5.2.	Eco-labels and award criteria	432
6.	Conclusions	433

- 11 CSR in the utilities sector and the implications of EC procurement policy: a framework for debate 436**
 SUE ARROWSMITH AND COLIN MAUND
1. Introduction 436
 2. CSR and its relevance for utilities' supply chain policies 438
 3. The EC Utilities Directive 441
 4. The Utilities Directive's impact on CSR policies 444
 - 4.1. Introduction 444
 - 4.2. Requirements concerning contract performance: technical requirements and 'special' conditions 445
 - 4.2.1. Permitted requirements 445
 - 4.2.2. Monitoring and enforcement 449
 - 4.3. CSR policies that go beyond contract performance 457
 - 4.3.1. Contract requirements that go beyond contract performance 457
 - 4.3.2. Excluding firms for non-compliance with norms that go beyond the contract being awarded 459
 - 4.3.3. Conclusion 461
 - 4.4. Exclusion for offences of corruption, money laundering etc. 461
 - 4.5. Other mechanisms 462
 - 4.6. Evidence for proving compliance with CSR policies 464
 - 4.7. Issues arising from the use of qualification systems 467
 - 4.7.1. The use of qualification systems 467
 - 4.7.2. Legal issues 469
 5. Utilities' procurement outside the Utilities Directive 471
 6. The problem of divergent regulatory regimes 472
 7. Issues for the future 474

12 Coordinating public procurement to support EU objectives – a first step? The case of exclusions for serious criminal offences 479

SOPE WILLIAMS

1. Introduction 479
2. EU policy on serious criminal offences 481
 - 2.1. Organised crime 482
 - 2.2. Corruption 484
 - 2.3. Fraud 486
 - 2.4. Money laundering 488
3. The use of procurement legislation to combat serious criminal offences 490

4. The procuring entities covered by the provisions	492
5. The range of contractors subject to the exclusions	492
6. The nature of investigations required	493
7. Time limits	495
8. Derogations	495
9. The significance of the mandatory exclusions for future EC policy on public procurement	497

<i>Index</i>	499
--------------	-----