

# **Spatial and temporal patterns of recreational use at Ningaloo Reef, north-western Australia**



This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the School of  
Environmental Science, Murdoch University

**2009**

Claire B. Smallwood BSc (Hons)

## DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work which has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary educational institution.

---

Claire B. Smallwood

---

Date

## **Abstract**

Worldwide, studies of recreational use at fine temporal and spatial scales within marine protected areas are rare, even though this knowledge is essential for successful management with respect to biodiversity conservation, resource allocation and visitor experiences. Ningaloo, a diverse fringing coral reef extending 300 km along the coast of north-western Australia, is reserved as a multiple use marine park. Its isolation from major population centres and limited access has, until recently, shielded it from extensive tourism. However, a growing population and increased publicity have led to a growth in visitor numbers and development pressure. This study aimed to map the fine-scale patterns of recreation at Ningaloo over a 12-month period using a multi-faceted survey approach which recorded >40 000 people. Synoptic patterns were described from 34 aerial surveys, while specific activities (e.g. recreational line fishing, snorkelling and windsurfing) were characterised using 192 land-based coastal surveys. During peak months from April to October, spatial distribution and density of use increased by up to 50% and included expansion of boating activity beyond the sheltered lagoon environment. Sandy beaches were preferred sites for recreation and people were generally clustered around infrastructure such as boat ramps and camping sites. Park zonation influenced activities and recreational fishers exhibited >85% compliance with sanctuary zones. Significant relationships between user characteristics, recreational activities and adjacent land tenure (e.g. national parks and pastoral leases) were revealed through analysis of 1 208 interviews with people participating in recreational activities on the shores of the Marine Park. These geo-referenced interview data allowed tracing of travel pathways from accommodation to coastal access points (or boat ramps) and recreation sites and highlighted the node-focused nature of visitor use. Strong clustering and rapid distance decay was especially evident from beach access points, with a median distance of 100 m travelled for shore-based recreation. The robust and multi-

faceted sampling design applied in this study resulted in high spatial accuracy with strong congruency between different survey techniques and could be widely applied to other marine parks adjacent to coastlines. This study provides essential benchmark data on recreational use which can contribute to the design of cost-effective monitoring programs, enables managers to focus resources at high use sites and at peak times of year, and predict effects of coastal developments in dispersing or concentrating visitor use.

## Table of Contents

---

### Abstract

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	v
-------------------------	---

### Chapter 1 General introduction

<b>1.1 Introduction</b>	1
<b>1.2 CSIRO Wealth from Oceans Ningaloo Collaborative Cluster</b>	8
<b>1.3 Research aims</b>	9
<b>1.4 Thesis structure</b>	10

### Chapter 2 Ningaloo Reef: attributes and literature review

<b>2.1 Study area</b>	11
2.1.1 <i>Physical and environmental attributes</i>	11
2.1.2 <i>Biological attributes</i>	16
2.1.3 <i>Social attributes</i>	17
2.1.4 <i>Coastal access and infrastructure</i>	26
<b>2.2 What are the knowledge gaps in recreational use patterns?</b>	27

### Chapter 3 Methods

<b>3.1 Aerial and land-based coastal observation surveys</b>	37
3.1.1 <i>Sampling design</i>	37
3.1.2 <i>Survey design</i>	39
3.1.3 <i>Mapping and spatial analysis</i>	50
3.1.4 <i>Minimising spatial error in observation surveys</i>	55
<b>3.2 Intercept questionnaire survey</b>	57
3.2.1 <i>Sampling design</i>	57
3.2.2 <i>Questionnaire rationale</i>	58

### Chapter 4 Synoptic patterns of recreational use: an aerial approach

<b>4.1 Introduction</b>	65
<b>4.2 Research objectives</b>	69
<b>4.3 Analysis techniques</b>	69
<b>4.4 Results</b>	73
4.4.1 <i>Spatial and temporal patterns of usage</i>	73
4.4.2 <i>Boat-based activities</i>	75
4.4.3 <i>Shore-based activities</i>	82
4.4.4 <i>Spatial accuracy</i>	96
<b>4.5 Discussion</b>	98
4.5.1 <i>Spatial and temporal variability of recreational use</i>	98
4.5.2 <i>Sampling error</i>	101
<b>4.6 Conclusions</b>	104

## **Chapter 5 Characterizing fine-scale patterns of recreational use: a land-based approach**

<b>5.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	107
<b>5.2</b>	<b>Research objectives</b>	112
<b>5.3</b>	<b>Analysis techniques</b>	112
<b>5.4</b>	<b>Results</b>	113
5.4.1	<i>Summary of spatial and temporal patterns of use</i>	113
5.4.2	<i>Boat-based activities</i>	115
5.4.3	<i>Shore-based activities</i>	120
5.4.4	<i>Case studies of specific recreational activities</i>	125
5.4.5	<i>Spatial accuracy</i>	138
<b>5.5</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	140
5.5.1	<i>Spatial and temporal variability of recreational activities</i>	140
5.5.2	<i>Sampling error</i>	145
<b>5.6</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	146

## **Chapter 6 Land tenure, user characteristics and their effects on patterns of recreational activity**

<b>6.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	147
<b>6.2</b>	<b>Research objectives</b>	153
<b>6.3</b>	<b>Analysis techniques</b>	153
<b>6.4</b>	<b>Results</b>	154
6.4.1	<i>Demographics</i>	155
6.4.2	<i>Visit attributes</i>	158
6.4.3	<i>Previous visitation</i>	164
6.4.4	<i>Future visitation</i>	166
6.4.5	<i>Recreational activity participation</i>	167
<b>6.5</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	172
6.5.1	<i>Survey design</i>	172
6.5.2	<i>Land tenure and user characteristics</i>	173
<b>6.6</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	180

## **Chapter 7 Identification and quantification of intra-regional travel networks**

<b>7.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	181
<b>7.2</b>	<b>Research objectives</b>	186
<b>7.3</b>	<b>Analysis techniques</b>	187
<b>7.4</b>	<b>Results</b>	195
7.4.1	<i>Accommodation to beach access</i>	195
7.4.2	<i>Accommodation to boat launching site</i>	201
7.4.3	<i>Beach access to shore recreation location</i>	205
7.4.4	<i>Boat launching site to boat recreation location</i>	208
<b>7.5</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	211
7.5.1	<i>Survey design</i>	211
7.5.2	<i>Factors influencing distribution along travel networks</i>	212
<b>7.6</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	220

<b>Chapter 8</b>	<b>Data integration and comparative analyses</b>	
<b>8.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	221
<b>8.2</b>	<b>Research objectives</b>	223
<b>8.3</b>	<b>Integration and comparative analyses</b>	223
8.3.1	<i>Overview of sampling regimes</i>	223
8.3.2	<i>Boat-based activities</i>	227
8.3.3	<i>Shore-based activities</i>	231
8.3.4	<i>Tourism Pressure Index</i>	235
<b>8.4</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	240
<b>8.5</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	246
<b>Chapter 9</b>	<b>Applications and conclusions</b>	
<b>9.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	247
<b>9.2</b>	<b>Overview of study findings</b>	251
<b>9.3</b>	<b>Application to monitoring in marine parks</b>	255
<b>9.4</b>	<b>Contribution to management of marine parks</b>	264
<b>9.5</b>	<b>Future research</b>	269
<b>9.6</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	271
	<b>References</b>	273
	<b>Appendices</b>	308





## Acknowledgements

I would, first and foremost, like to recognise the efforts of my two supervisors, Lynnath Beckley and Sue Moore from the School of Environmental Science at Murdoch University. I am greatly indebted to them both for their tremendous enthusiasm, support and guidance which was instrumental in completing this thesis. Thankyou also for challenging me to keep developing my writing and research skills to the next level, it has been an extremely rewarding and growing experience.

The financial support from CSIRO and the Wealth from Oceans Ningaloo Collaborative Cluster program was instrumental in the completion of this project; enabling the ambitious 226 day fieldwork program and contributing to many other costs associated with a project of this magnitude. I would also like to acknowledge the financial support of Murdoch University for their research and completion scholarships and the School of Environmental Science for PhD running costs.

This PhD would not have been completed without assistance from a large number of people and agencies. I would like to sincerely thank the following for their assistance at various stages of the project, including;

- Heather Gordon, Frank Salleo, Halina Kobryn and Fraser MacGregor from Murdoch University for their administrative brilliance, 4WD training, GIS and mechanical repair skills (respectively),
- staff at the Department of Environment and Conservation in the Exmouth District Office who supported the project during the planning stages and throughout fieldwork; particularly Jennie Cary as well as all the rangers and office staff who became friends who joined me for the journey,
- staff at the Department of Environment and Conservation in Kensington and Fremantle for providing historical data and answering all of my queries; particularly Luisa Liddicoat, Martin Randall, Ray Lawrie, Colin Ingram, Amanda Smith and Robyn Weir,
- the Western Australian Department of Fisheries for historical data, equipment and database support as well as ongoing encouragement; particularly Carli Telfer, Brent Wise, Michael Tuffin, Tim Green and Stuart Blight,
- the pastoral leaseholders on Ningaloo, Cardabia, Warroora, Gnoraloo and Quobba Stations who supported the project and, along with camp hosts,

caretakers and staff, provided cheery welcomes during our repeated travels along the amazing Ningaloo coast,

- the Department of Planning and Infrastructure for reports and navigational data; particularly David Nunn and Ralph Talbot-Smith,
- the Commonwealth Department of Defence ranger Ric Karnovich, for providing insights to the Bombing Range and Navy Pier and,
- the Australian Institute of Marine Sciences (Ray Berkelmens) and Bureau of Meteorology (Brian Kowald) for providing weather data.

I would also like to extend a huge thanks to Chris Jones and Dani Rob who were also in the field during the 48°C days, flat tyres and goat attacks. You guys are the best and may ‘Scratchy’ our trusty 4WD live a long and happy life! Also thanks to Renae Adamson, whose hours in front of the computer kept us on top of the reams of data entry sheets.

There were also many friends who supported me through the highs and lows of this PhD experience with whom I could not have done without. I would like to particularly thank Matt Harvey for his GIS wizardry and who, along with Dave Holliday, had to endure my office antics for two years. I would also like to acknowledge Julianne De Pierres for her GIS advice, Martyn Churcher for his stats (and salsa) advice, the Honourable Mia Davies for always making time to visit, no matter how far the distance, and my partner Arvid Hogstrom for his amazing support and management of my stress levels in the final months of writing up. Finally, I would also like to thank my sister Rosie and my parents, David and Penny, for their never-ending encouragement, and for managing to appreciate the beautiful Ningaloo coast even when surrounded by flies at plague proportions!