

Open access · Posted Content · DOI:10.21203/RS.3.RS-152074/V1

Spatio-temporal patterns of pneumonia in Bhutan: A Bayesian analysis — Source link 🖸

Kinley Wangdi, Kinley Penjor, Tsheten Tsheten, Chachu Tshering ...+3 more authors

Published on: 27 Jan 2021

Topics: Pneumonia





Preprints are preliminary reports that have not undergone peer review. They should not be considered conclusive, used to inform clinical practice, or referenced by the media as validated information.

Spatio-temporal patterns of pneumonia in Bhutan: A Bayesian analysis

Kinley Wangdi (kinley.wangdi@anu.edu.au) Australian National University
Kinley Penjor Ministry of Health
Tsheten Tsheten Australian National University
Chachu Tshering Ministry of Health
Peter Gething Curtin University
Darren Gray Australian National University
Archie Clements Curtin University

Research Article

Keywords: Bhutan, pneumonia, Bayesian, spatial, temporal, risk factors, modelling

Posted Date: January 27th, 2021

DOI: https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-152074/v1

License: (c) This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. Read Full License

1 Spatio-temporal patterns of pneumonia in Bhutan: A Bayesian

2 analysis

- 3 Kinley Wangdi^{1†*}, Kinley Penjor^{2*}, Tsheten Tsheten^{1,3}, Chachu Tshering⁴, Peter Gething^{5,6},
- 4 Darren J Gray¹, Archie CA Clements^{5,6}
- 5
- ⁶ ¹Department of Global Health, Research School of Population Health, Australian National
- 7 University, Canberra, Australia
- 8 ²Vector-borne Diseases Control Programme, Department of Public Health, Ministry of Health,
- 9 Bhutan
- 10 ³Royal Centre for Disease Control, Ministry of Health, Bhutan
- ⁴ Child Health Program, Communicable Diseases Division, Department of Public Health
- 12 Ministry of Health, Thimphu, Bhutan
- 13 ⁵Telethon Kids Institute, Nedlands, Australia
- ⁶Faculty of Health Sciences, Curtin University, Perth, Australia
- 15 [†]Corresponding author
- 16 ^{*}Co-first author
- 17 Authors:
- 18 KW: <u>kinley.wangdi@anu.edu.au</u>
- 19 KP: <u>kinleyp@health.gov.bt</u>
- 20 TT: <u>tsheten.tsheten@anu.edu.au</u>
- 21 CT: <u>ctshering@health.gov.bt</u>
- 22 PG: <u>peter.gething@telethonkids.org.au</u>
- 23 DG: <u>darren.gray@anu.edu.au</u>
- 24 ACAC: <u>archie.clements@curtin.edu.au</u>

25

26 Abstract

27 Pneumonia is one of the top 10 diseases by morbity in Bhutan. This study aimed to investigate 28 the spatial and temporal trends and risk factors of pneumonia in Bhutan. A multivariable Zero-29 inflated Poisson regression using a Bayesian Markov chain Monte Carlo simulation was 30 undertaken to quantify associations of age, sex, rainfall, maximum temperature and relative 31 humidity with monthly pneumonia incidence and identify underlying spatial structure of the 32 data. Overall pneumonia incidence was 96.5 and 4.57 per 1,000 populations over nine years in 33 people aged <5 years and ≥ 5 years, respectively. Children <5 years or being a female are more 34 like to get pneumonia than \geq 5 years and males. A 10mm increase in rainfall and 1°C increase 35 in maximum temperature was associated with a 7.2% (95% (credible interval [CrI] 0.7%, 36 14.0%) and 28.6% (95% CrI 27.2%, 30.1%) increase in pneumonia cases. A 1% increase in 37 relative humidity was associated with a decrease in the incidence of pneumonia by 8.6% (95%) 38 CrI 7.5%, 9.7%). There was no evidence of spatial clustering after accounting for the 39 covariates. Seasonality and spatial heterogeneity can partly be explained by the association of 40 pneumonia risk to climatic factors including rainfall, maximum temperature and relative 41 humidity.

42 Keywords: Bhutan, pneumonia, Bayesian, spatial, temporal, risk factors, modelling

43 Introduction

Pneumonia is a major cause of morbidity and mortality worldwide¹. Each year, pneumonia 44 45 accounts for over 12 million hospital admissions and 1.3 million deaths in children aged less than 5 years worldwide^{2,3}. In 2017, pneumonia was the fourth-leading cause of death and it is 46 47 estimated that it will be the third-leading cause of death by 2040⁴. The World Health 48 Organization (WHO) estimates that respiratory infections account for 6% of the total global 49 burden of disease. This accounts for a higher percentage compared to the burden of diarrheal disease, cancer, human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) infection, ischemic heart disease or 50 51 malaria⁵.

52 Pneumonia is a potentially life-threatening illness with a particularly high burden in South Asia 53 and sub-Saharan Africa^{3,6,7}. It is not only a major cause of morbidity and mortality but is also associated with a substantial economic burden on healthcare systems^{8,9} and household 54 income¹⁰. Pneumonia often has a complex aetiology involving multiple pathogens, including 55 56 many that are transmitted person-to-person. Past time-series analyses have identified various 57 pneumonia and influenza outcomes to be temporally seasonal, demonstrating highly consistent peaks in winter months and troughs in summer months^{11,12}. Other studies have found that 58 pneumonia admissions were highly spatially clustered¹³, driven by contact with infected people 59 during indoor activities¹⁴. 60

Pneumonia continues to be an important communicable disease in Bhutan- locate in the Eastern Himalayas¹⁵⁻¹⁷ (**Fig. 1**). In 2019, pneumonia was one of the top-ten ranked diseases in terms of morbidity and accounted for 19% of the overall disease burden¹⁸. Every year the Bhutanese government spends a huge amount on the treatment and management of pneumonia. In the financial year 2017–2018, 7.1% of current health expenditure was spent on treating infectious respiratory diseases^{19,20}. Despite the importance of pneumonia, and the infectious nature of the disease, there have been no previous studies to understand the underlying ecological drivers of 68 pneumonia in the country^{21,22}. Understanding the spatial and temporal patterns of pneumonia 69 will be important for prevention and preparedness through more efficient targeting of scarce 70 health care resources. This study aims to investigate the trends of pneumonia, identify potential 71 high-risk geographical areas and quantify associations between disease risk and climatic risk 72 factors.

73 **Results**

74 **Descriptive analysis**

75 A total of 100,015 pneumonia cases were reported in the country during the study period (2010-76 2018). This corresponded to 71,807 and 28,208 cases in people aged <5 years and ≥ 5 years, with an incidence of 96.5 and 4.57 cases, respectively, per 1,000 people during the nine years 77 78 (Table 1). In both the age groups incidence decreased: from 119.28 and 47.73 cases per 1,000 79 population in 2010 to 54.73 and 3.19 cases per 1,000 in 2018 for the <5 years and ≥ 5 years age 80 groups, respectively (Table 1). The seasonal-trend decomposition of monthly pneumonia 81 cases based on locally (STL) is illustrated in Figure 2. The highest cases were reported in 2014 82 and pneumonia displayed a strong seasonal pattern. There were two peaks in May and 83 September of each year. The standard morbidity ratio (SMR) of pneumonia at sub-district level 84 varied from 0 to 13.02, with a Standard Deviation=1.45 (Fig. 3).

85 Spatio-temporal model

Model I, containing the unstructured random effects was better fitting than Model II and Model
III containing the spatially structured random effects with lower deviation information criterion
(DIC) (206,093). The incidence of pneumonia was 21.3% (95% credible interval [CrI] 21.0%,
21.6%) times higher in people aged <5 years as compared to ≥5 years. Females were 8% (95%)
CrI 7.0%, 9.0%) more like to get pneumonia compared to males. Pneumonia decreased by 11%
(95% CrI 10%, 13%) during the study period. A 10mm increase in rainfall was associated with

a 7.2 % (95% CrI 0.7%, 14.0%) increase in incidence of pneumonia. Similarly, a maximum
temperature increase of a 1°C was associated with a 28.6% (95% CrI 27.2%, 30.1%) increase
in pneumonia cases. However, a 1% increase in relative humidity was associated with a
decrease in the incidence of pneumonia by 8.6% (95% CrI 7.5%, 9.7%) (Table 2).

96 There was no evidence of spatial clustering after accounting for the covariates (**Table 2** and 97 **Fig. 4**). There was >95% probability of a higher than the national average trend of pneumonia 98 in 56/205 sub-districts, whereas 67/205 sub-districts had >95% probability of a trend less than 99 the national average. There was no clear spatial pattern, with sub-districts showing higher and 100 lower average trends across all the 20 districts (**Fig. 5**).

101

102 **Discussion**

Pneumonia was spatially and temporally heterogeneous across sub-districts of Bhutan during the study period. There was a decreasing trend, in addition to a strong seasonal pattern during the study period. Pneumonia mainly affected children aged <5 years and females. Rainfall and maximum temperature were associated with an increased incidence of pneumonia while relative humidity was associated with a decrease incidence.

In addition to climatic factors, spatial heterogeneity could be due to differences in the sociodemographic characteristics of sub-districts. The risk factors responsible for exacerbation and spread of pneumonia in Bhutan were low birth weights, malnutrition, smoky and overcrowding households, bottle-feeding of infants and poor personal and environmental hygiene^{23,24}. This was evident from the two districts of Haa and Paro which has the lowest poverty²⁵, and also reported lowest SMR of pneumonia. Similar to the decreasing trend in the incidence of global childhood pneumonia²⁶, the national pneumonia trend decreased during the study period. This 115 could be attributed to a decrease in exposure to key risk factors including poor housing
 116 conditions and overcrowding, incomplete immunisation and malnutrition²⁶.

117 Pneumonia is the single largest infectious cause of death in children worldwide. It accounts for 118 15% of all deaths of children <5 years²⁷. In this study, children <5 years were at a much higher 119 risk of pneumonia compared to those ≥ 5 years. Infants (aged between 0-11 months) was reported to contribute up to 24.2% of cases in another study²⁸. The WHO and United Nations 120 121 Children's Fund (UNICEF) initiated a Global action plan for pneumonia and diarrhoea (GAPPD) to accelerate pneumonia control in children²⁹. The GAPPD strategies include 122 promoting exclusive breastfeeding and adequate complementary feeding to protect children 123 124 from pneumonia; prevent pneumonia through vaccinations, hand washing with soap, reducing 125 household air pollution, HIV prevention and cotrimoxazole prophylaxis for HIV infected and 126 exposed children; and treating children with pneumonia with antibiotics and oxygen. 127 Strengthening GAPPD strategies should be considered in Bhutan, as is the case in other 128 countries in the South Asia region (Bangladesh and India). The introduction of pneumococcal 129 conjugate vaccines in Bhutan in 2019 is timely in prevention of pnuemonia^{19,30}. Exclusive breastfeeding rates from birth until six months in Bhutan varies from 35.9-51.0%^{31,32}. 130 Increasing exclusive breastfeeding rates are likely to reduce pneumonia associated morbidity³³. 131

132 Pneumonia was highly seasonal and was associated with climatic factors including 133 temperature, rainfall and relative humidity. The association of temperature with pneumonia has been reported in other studies^{34,35}. A plausible explanation is the association of higher 134 temperature with air pollution³⁶ which in itself is known risk factor and cause of pneumonia³⁷⁻ 135 ⁴⁰. Most industries are located in the southern parts of Bhutan where air pollution is expected 136 137 to be higher as compared to other districts. This was reflected by these sub-districts having 138 higher SMR for pneumonia. Additionally, traditional methods of cooking in rural Bhutan using fire wood could also contribute to respiratory illness such as pneumonia^{41,42}. 139

The incidence of Pneumonia tends to be higher during the rainy season⁴³⁻⁴⁵. Rainfall may 140 141 trigger socio-ecological behavioural changes such as increased contact between people and the distribution of pathogens. Further, heavy rainfall during the monsoon is likely to pollute 142 143 drinking water, particularly the surface water from streams, which is the main drinking water source for rural populations⁴⁶. Unsafe drinking water and sanitation are important drivers of 144 pneumonia⁴⁷. Relative humidity was associated with a decrease in pneumonia incidence in this 145 study which is in concordance with other studies^{35,48}. Higher relative humidity decreases the 146 147 survival of lipid-enveloped viruses such as influenza A, influenza b and Respiratory Syncytial Virus^{49,50}. 148

149 There are a number of limitations that need to be considered when interpreting the results of 150 this study. First, the study used routine case reports to measure incidence of pnuemonia. Known 151 issues exist surrounding completeness and representativeness of such data. Secondly, the causal 152 organisms of pneumonia were not available and the association could be different based on the 153 organisms. Thirdly, there was no reconciliation to accommodate different levels of aggregation 154 of the climate variables (district) and the disease data (sub-district), and the climate conditions 155 were assumed to be homogeneous within a district. Lastly, unaccounted risk modifiers were 156 not included in the modelling due to a lack of available data. These important unmeasured 157 factors, such as immunization coverage, air pollution level, living standards and socio-158 economic status, crowding, smoking, access to safe drinking water and latrine usage might have resulted in confounding, which was not able to be quantified 39,51,52 . 159

Despite these limitations, the strengths of this study are the capacity to implement the spatial analysis at a relatively fine resolution, being the sub-district level, and over a long time series (108 months). Traditionally, spatial patterns of infectious disease risk have been displayed at larger geographical units, such as a district, province, national, regional, and global scales^{46,53,54}. Such low resolution can mask localized disease patterns due to averaging⁵⁵.

165 Conclusion

Pneumonia is an important childhood disease and the introduction of pneumococcal conjugate vaccines to reduce the burden of this disease is timely. Pneumonia was highly seasonal and spatially heterogeneous across sub-districts. Seasonality can be explained by climatic factors including temperature, rainfall and relative humidity. The spatial and temporal variability of pneumonia should inform in better targeting of its prevention and control in the country through rational decision making and proper resources allocation.

172 Materials and methods

173 Study area

Bhutan located in the Eastern Himalayas, borders China in the north and India in the east, south and west. The country is divided administratively into 20 districts and 205 sub-districts, with a total projected population of 741,672 in 2019 ⁵⁶. Around 62.2% (452,178) of the population live in rural areas and practice subsistence farming. The altitude ranges from 75m above sea level in the south to more than 7000m in the Himalayas (**Fig. 1**).

179 Study design and data source

180 This is a retrospective study using secondary data on pneumonia from January 2010 to 181 December 2018, stratified by sex and age (> 5 years and \geq 5 years) at the sub-district level. The 182 data were obtained from the National Acute Respiratory Infections surveillance system, hosted 183 by the Bhutan Health Information and Management Systems (HIMS) under the Bhutan 184 Ministry of Health. These data contain all pneumonia cases treated by health centres including 185 hospitals and primary health care facilities and reported to the HIMS every month. Pnuemonia 186 is defined as " a patient with history of cough or reported breathing difficulty, and increased 187 respiratory rate (RR) or chest indrawing (RR \geq 50 breaths per minute in children aged two 188 months or more and less than 12 months or $RR \ge 40$ breaths per minute in children aged 12

189 months or more and less than 60 months³⁵⁷. Daily climatic variables (rainfall, relative 190 humidity, minimum and maximum temperature) were obtained from the National Centre for 191 Hydrology and Meteorology under the Ministry of Economic Affairs of Bhutan. Monthly 192 average climatic variables were calcuted for this study. Population estimates used in the study 193 were obtained from the National Statistical Bureau, Bhutan⁵⁸. Administrative boundary maps 194 were downloaded from the DIVA-GIS website⁵⁹.

195 Crude standardized morbidity ratios

An initial descriptive analysis of pneumonia incidence across the country was conducted.Crude SMR for each sub-district were calculated using the following formula:

198
$$Y_i = \frac{O_i}{E_i}$$

199 Where *Y* is the overall SMR in sub-district *i*, *O* is the total number of observed pneumonia 200 cases over the entire study period in the sub-district and *E* is the expected number of pneumonia 201 cases in the sub-district across the study period. The expected number was calculated by 202 multiplying the national incidence by the average population for each sub-district over the 203 study period.

204 Exploration of seasonal patterns and inter-annual patterns

The time series of pneumonia incidence was decomposed using STL weighted regression to show: the seasonal pattern, inter-annual patterns and the residual variability. The STL model was structured as follows:

where Y_t represents numbers of local pneumonia cases with logarithmic transformation, S_t is the additive seasonal component, T_t is the trend, and R_t is the "remainder component"; t is time in months^{60,61}.

212 Spatio-temporal model

A Bayesian statistical framework was deployed for spatial analysis. It provides a convenient framework for the simultaneous inclusion of covariates and spatial autocorrelation in a single model, while providing robust evaluation of and expression of uncertainty. The posterior distributions can be used to quantify uncertainties in parameters of interest (e.g., covariate effects and spatial patterns of disease risk)⁶².

Initially, a preliminary bivariate Poisson regression of pneumonia cases was undertaken to select the covariates. The covariates with a *p*-value of <0.05 and the lowest Akaike's information criterion (AIC) were selected. The co-linearity of the selected climatic and environmental variables was tested using variance inflation factors (VIF). In the final model, rainfall, maximum temperature and relative humidity were included.

223 Of the 88,560 observations stratified by sub-districts, <5 and ≥ 5 years and sex over 108 months, 224 there were 55,975 (63.2%) zero counts of pneumonia. Therefore, Zero-inflated Poisson (ZIP) 225 regression was constructed in a Bayesian framework. The first model (Model I), assumed that 226 spatial autocorrelation was not present in the relative risk of pneumonia. This model was 227 developed with selected climatic factors (rainfall, maximum temperature and relative 228 humidity), age (<5 and \geq 5 years) and gender as explanatory variables, and an unstructured 229 random effect for sub-districts; the second model (Model II) contained a spatially structured 230 random effect in addition to the covariates; and the final model (Model III), a convolution 231 model, contained all of the components of the preceding two models. The best model with the 232 lowest DIC was selected as the final explanatory model.

Model III assumed that the observed counts of pneumonia, *Y*, for *i*th sub-district (*i*=1..205) in the *j*th month (January 2010-December 2018) followed a Poisson distribution with mean (μ_{ij}), that is,

236
$$P(Y_{ij} = y_{ij}) = \begin{cases} \omega + 1 (1 - \omega)e^{-\mu}, & y_{ij} = 0\\ (1 - \omega)e^{-\mu} \mu_{ij}^{y_{ij}} / y_{ij}, & y_{ij} > 0; \end{cases}$$

237
$$Y_{ij} \sim \text{Poisson}(\mu_{ij})$$

238
$$\log(\mu_{ij}) = \log(E_{ij}) + \theta_{ij}$$

239 $\theta_{ij} = \alpha + \beta_1 \times \text{Age} + \beta_2 \times \text{Sex} + \beta_3 \times \text{trend}_j + \beta_4 \times \text{Rainfall}_{ij} + \beta_5 \times \text{Humidity}_{ij} + 240 \qquad \beta_6 \times \text{Tempmax}_{ij} + u_i + s_i + w_i$

where expected number of cases in sub-district *i*, month *j* (acting as an offset to control for population size) was represented by E_{ij} and θ_{ij} is the mean log relative risk (RR). The intercept (α), and coefficients for age (\geq 5 as reference), sex (male as reference), monthly trend, rainfall, relative humidity and maximum temperature are $\beta 1$, $\beta 2$, $\beta 3$, $\beta 4$, $\beta 5$ and $\beta 6$. The spatially unstructured and structured random effects are represented as u_i and s_i , respectively, with u_i excluded from Model II and s_i excluded from Model I. Spatiotemporal random effect with a mean of zero and variance of σ_w^2 was denoted by w_i as in other studies ^{63,64}.

A conditional autoregressive (CAR) prior structure was used to model the spatially structured random effect. Spatial relationships between the sub-districts were based on a 'queen' contiguity matrix. A weight of 1 was assigned to sub-districts sharing a border and 0 otherwise. A flat prior distribution was specified for the intercept, whereas a non-informative normal prior distribution was used for the coefficients. The priors for the precision of unstructured and spatially structured random effects were specified using non-informative gamma distributions with shape and scale parameters equal to 0.01. 255 The model was run for an initial 10,000 iterations, which were then discarded. Subsequently, 256 visual inspection of posterior density and history plots were used to note convergence at 257 intervals of 20,000 iterations. Convergence occurred at approximately 100,000 iterations for 258 all models. Following convergence, posterior distributions from model parameters were stored 259 for inference. Markov Chain Monte Carlo simulation was used to estimate model parameters ⁶⁵. Summaries of parameters were calculated, including posterior mean and 95% credible CrI. 260 In all analyses, an α -level of 0.05 was adopted to indicate statistical significance (as indicated 261 262 by 95% CrI for relative risks (RR) that excluded 1).

Seasonality decomposition was carried out using the R statistical package, release 3.3.1. The ZIP regression model was constructed using WinBUGS software, version 1.4.3 (MRC Biostatistics Unit 2008)⁶⁶. ArcMap 10.5 software (ESRI, Redlands, CA) was used to generate maps of the posterior means of the unstructured and structured random effects and the spatiotemporal random effects.

268 **Reference**

- 269 1 WHO. Pneumonia, the forgotten killer of children. (Geneva 27: UNICEF/WHO,
- 270 2006).
- 271 2 Nair, H. et al. Global and regional burden of hospital admissions for severe acute
- lower respiratory infections in young children in 2010: a systematic analysis. *Lancet*.
- 273 381, 1380-1390, doi:10.1016/s0140-6736(12)61901-1 (2013).
- 274 3 WHO. Pneumonia, <<u>https://www.who.int/en/news-room/fact-</u>
- 275 <u>sheets/detail/pneumonia</u>> (2019).
- Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation (IHME). Findings from the Global Burden
 of Disease Study 2017. (Seattle, WA, 2018).
- 5 Mizgerd, J. P. Lung infection--a public health priority. *PLoS Med.* 3, e76,
- doi:10.1371/journal.pmed.0030076 (2006).

- 280 6 Di Pasquale, M. F. *et al.* Prevalence and Etiology of Community-acquired Pneumonia
- in Immunocompromised Patients. *Clin Infect Dis.* 68, 1482-1493,
- 282 doi:10.1093/cid/ciy723 (2019).
- 283 7 Franco, J. Community-acquired Pneumonia. *Radiol Technol.* 88, 621-636 (2017).
- 2848Prina, E., Ranzani, O. T. & Torres, A. Community-acquired pneumonia. Lancet. 386,
- 285 1097-1108, doi:10.1016/s0140-6736(15)60733-4 (2015).
- 286 9 Tan, K. K. *et al.* Burden of hospitalized childhood community-acquired pneumonia:
- 287 A retrospective cross-sectional study in Vietnam, Malaysia, Indonesia and the
- 288 Republic of Korea. *Hum Vaccin Immunother*. 14, 95-105,
- 289 doi:10.1080/21645515.2017.1375073 (2018).
- 290 10 Sabin, L. L. et al. Household Costs Associated with Hospitalization of Children with
- 291 Severe Pneumonia in Quito, Ecuador. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 102, 731-739,
- 292 doi:10.4269/ajtmh.19-0721 (2020).
- 293 11 Farrar, D. S. *et al.* Seasonal variation and etiologic inferences of childhood
- 294 pneumonia and diarrhea mortality in India. *Elife*. 8, doi:10.7554/eLife.46202 (2019).
- 295 12 Nimbalkar, P. M. & Tripathi, N. K. Space-time epidemiology and effect of
- 296 meteorological parameters on influenza-like illness in Phitsanulok, a northern
- 297 province in Thailand. *Geospat Health*. 11, 447, doi:10.4081/gh.2016.447 (2016).
- 298 13 Crighton, E. J., Elliott, S. J., Moineddin, R., Kanaroglou, P. & Upshur, R. E. An
- exploratory spatial analysis of pneumonia and influenza hospitalizations in Ontario by
- 300 age and gender. *Epidemiol Infect*. 135, 253-261, doi:10.1017/s095026880600690x
- 301 (2007).
- 302 14 Paynter, S., Ware, R. S., Weinstein, P., Williams, G. & Sly, P. D. Childhood
- 303 pneumonia: a neglected, climate-sensitive disease? *Lancet.* 376, 1804-1805,
- 304 doi:10.1016/s0140-6736(10)62141-1 (2010).
 - 13

- 305 15 MoH. (Ministry of Health, Thimphu, Bhutan, 2018).
- 306 16 MoH. (Ministry of Health, Thimphu, Bhutan, 2017).
- 307 17 MoH. (Ministry of Health, Thimphu, Bhutan, 2019).
- 308 18 MoH. (Ministry of Health, Thimphu, Bhutan, 2020).
- 309 19 Dorji, K. *et al.* Towards the introduction of pneumococcal conjugate vaccines in
- 310 Bhutan: A cost-utility analysis to determine the optimal policy option. *Vaccine*. 36,
- 311 1757-1765, doi:10.1016/j.vaccine.2018.02.048 (2018).
- 312 20 MoH. (Ministry of Health, Thimphu, Bhutan 2019).
- 313 21 Jullien, S., Pradhan, D. & Bassat, Q. Pneumonia in Bhutanese children: what we
- know, and what we need to know. *Pneumonia (Nathan)*. 12, 1, doi:10.1186/s41479-
- 315 019-0065-x (2020).
- Jullien, S. *et al.* Pneumonia in children admitted to the national referral hospital in
 Bhutan: A prospective cohort study. *Int J Infect Dis.* 95, 74-83,
- 318 doi:10.1016/j.ijid.2020.04.017 (2020).
- 319 23 Wangchuk, S., Zangmo, S. & Thapa, B. Epidemiological analysis of Influenza–Like
- 320 Illness and Severe Acute Respiratory Infection surveillance for 2011. 6 (Public Health
- 321 Laboratory, 2011).
- 322 24 Balaraman, K. Assignment report on acute respiratory infections in Bhutan: Review
- 323 of the magnitude of the problem and formulation of strategies for prevention and
- 324 control, 27 November 1985-7 January 1986. (1987).
- 325 25 RGoB. Bhutan poverty analysis report 2017. (Royal Government of Bhutan,
- 326 Thimphu, Bhutan, 2017).
- 327 26 McAllister, D. A. *et al.* Global, regional, and national estimates of pneumonia
- 328 morbidity and mortality in children younger than 5 years between 2000 and 2015: a

329		systematic analysis. Lancet Glob Health. 7, e47-e57, doi:10.1016/s2214-
330		109x(18)30408-x (2019).
331	27	WHO. Ending preventable child deaths from pneumonia and diarrhoea by 2025.
332		(2013).
333	28	Sangay, N. Effects of indoor air pollution on risk of acute respiratory infection and
334		other respiratory problem in children under five in Thimphu, Bhutan MPH Thesis
335		thesis, College of Public Health, Chulalongkorn University, (2004).
336	29	WHO. End preventable deaths: Global Action Plan for Prevention and Control of
337		Pneumonia and Diarrhoea. (World Health Orgnization and United Nations Children's
338		Fund, Geneva, Switzerland, 2013).
339	30	Ojal, J. et al. Sustained reduction in vaccine-type invasive pneumococcal disease
340		despite waning effects of a catch-up campaign in Kilifi, Kenya: A mathematical
341		model based on pre-vaccination data. Vaccine. 35, 4561-4568,
342		doi:10.1016/j.vaccine.2017.07.019 (2017).
343	31	Pokhrel, H. P., Pavadhgul, P. & Srisorrachatr, S. Factors associated with exclusive
344		breastfeeding practices in western Bhutan. Bhutan Health Journal. 4 (2018).
345	32	MoH. National Nutrition Survey. (Ministry of Health, RGoB, Thimphu, Bhutan,
346		2015).
347	33	Hanieh, S. et al. Exclusive breast feeding in early infancy reduces the risk of inpatient
348		admission for diarrhea and suspected pneumonia in rural Vietnam: a prospective
349		cohort study. BMC Public Health. 15, 1166, doi:10.1186/s12889-015-2431-9 (2015).
350	34	Ho, N. T. et al. Retrospective analysis assessing the spatial and temporal distribution
351		of paediatric acute respiratory tract infections in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam. BMJ
352		Open. 8, e016349, doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2017-016349 (2018).

- 353 35 Silva, D. R., Viana, V. P., Muller, A. M., Livi, F. P. & Dalcin Pde, T. Respiratory
- 354 viral infections and effects of meteorological parameters and air pollution in adults
- 355 with respiratory symptoms admitted to the emergency room. *Influenza Other Respir*
- 356 *Viruses.* 8, 42-52, doi:10.1111/irv.12158 (2014).
- 357 36 Ayres, J. G. *et al.* Climate change and respiratory disease: European Respiratory
- 358 Society position statement. *Eur Respir J.* 34, 295-302,
- doi:10.1183/09031936.00003409 (2009).
- 360 37 Nhung, N. T. T. et al. Short-term association between ambient air pollution and
- 361 pneumonia in children: A systematic review and meta-analysis of time-series and
- 362 case-crossover studies. *Environ Pollut*. 230, 1000-1008,
- 363 doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2017.07.063 (2017).
- 364 38 Gordon, S. B. *et al.* Respiratory risks from household air pollution in low and middle
 365 income countries. *Lancet Respir Med.* 2, 823-860, doi:10.1016/s2213-2600(14)70168366 7 (2014).
- 367 39 Ruchiraset, A. & Tantrakarnapa, K. Time series modeling of pneumonia admissions

368 and its association with air pollution and climate variables in Chiang Mai Province,

- 369 Thailand. Environ Sci Pollut Res Int. 25, 33277-33285, doi:10.1007/s11356-018-
- 370 3284-4 (2018).
- 371 40 Rudan, I., Boschi-Pinto, C., Biloglav, Z., Mulholland, K. & Campbell, H.
- 372 Epidemiology and etiology of childhood pneumonia. *Bull World Health Organ.* 86,
- 373 408-416, doi:10.2471/blt.07.048769 (2008).
- 41 Langbein, J. Firewood, smoke and respiratory diseases in developing countries-The
 375 neglected role of outdoor cooking. *PLoS One*. 12, e0178631,
- doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0178631 (2017).

377	42	Juntarawijit, Y. & Juntarawijit, C. Cooking smoke exposure and respiratory
378		symptoms among those responsible for household cooking: A study in Phitsanulok,
379		Thailand. Heliyon. 5, e01706, doi:10.1016/j.heliyon.2019.e01706 (2019).
380	43	Singh, V., Sharma, B. B., Patel, V. & Poonia, S. Clinical profile of pneumonia and its
381		association with rain wetting in patients admitted at a tertiary care institute during
382		pandemic of influenza A (H1N1) pdm09 virus infection. Indian J Chest Dis Allied
383		Sci. 56, 21-26 (2014).
384	44	Paynter, S. et al. Sunshine, rainfall, humidity and child pneumonia in the tropics:
385		time-series analyses. Epidemiol Infect. 141, 1328-1336,
386		doi:10.1017/s0950268812001379 (2013).
387	45	Chowdhury, F. R. et al. The association between temperature, rainfall and humidity
388		with common climate-sensitive infectious diseases in Bangladesh. PLoS One. 13,
389		e0199579, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0199579 (2018).
390	46	Wangdi, K. & Clements, A. C. Spatial and temporal patterns of diarrhoea in Bhutan
391		2003-2013. BMC Infect Dis. 17, 507, doi:10.1186/s12879-017-2611-6 (2017).
392	47	Gessner, B. D. Lack of piped water and sewage services is associated with pediatric
393		lower respiratory tract infection in Alaska. J Pediatr. 152, 666-670,
394		doi:10.1016/j.jpeds.2007.10.049 (2008).
395	48	Tasci, S. S., Kavalci, C. & Kayipmaz, A. E. Relationship of Meteorological and Air
396		Pollution Parameters with Pneumonia in Elderly Patients. Emerg Med Int. 2018,
397		4183203, doi:10.1155/2018/4183203 (2018).
398	49	Schaffer, F. L., Soergel, M. E. & Straube, D. C. Survival of airborne influenza virus:
399		effects of propagating host, relative humidity, and composition of spray fluids. Arch

400 *Virol.* 51, 263-273, doi:10.1007/bf01317930 (1976).

17

- 401 50 Tellier, R. Aerosol transmission of influenza A virus: a review of new studies. *J R Soc*402 *Interface*. 6 Suppl 6, S783-790, doi:10.1098/rsif.2009.0302.focus (2009).
- 403 51 Amsalu, E. T., Akalu, T. Y. & Gelaye, K. A. Spatial distribution and determinants of
- 404 acute respiratory infection among under-five children in Ethiopia: Ethiopian
- 405 Demographic Health Survey 2016. *PLoS One*. 14, e0215572,
- 406 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0215572 (2019).
- 407 52 Beninca, E., van Boven, M., Hagenaars, T. & van der Hoek, W. Space-time analysis
- 408 of pneumonia hospitalisations in the Netherlands. *PLoS One*. 12, e0180797,
- 409 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0180797 (2017).
- 410 53 Clements, A. C., Barnett, A. G., Cheng, Z. W., Snow, R. W. & Zhou, H. N. Space-
- 411 time variation of malaria incidence in Yunnan province, China. *Malar J.* 8, 180,
- 412 doi:10.1186/1475-2875-8-180 (2009).
- 413 54 Hundessa, S. H. et al. Spatial and space-time distribution of *Plasmodium vivax* and
- 414 Plasmodium falciparum malaria in China, 2005-2014. Malar J. 15, 595,
- 415 doi:10.1186/s12936-016-1646-2 (2016).
- 416 55 Haddow, A. D., Jones, C. J. & Odoi, A. Assessing risk in focal arboviral infections:
- 417 are we missing the big or little picture? *PLoS One.* 4, e6954,
- 418 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0006954 (2009).
- 419 56 NSB. (ed Royal Government of Bhutan National Stastical Bureau) (Thimphu,
 420 Bhutan, 2019).
- 421 57 WHO. (ed World Health Organization) (Geneva, Switzerland, 2014).
- 422 58 National Statistical Bureau. (2017).
- 423 59 Robert J. Hijmans, Luigi Guarino & Mathur, P. DIVA-GIS Version 7.5 manual,
- 424 <<u>https://www.diva-gis.org/docs/DIVA-GIS_manual_7.pdf</u>> (2012).

- 425 60 Cleveland, R. B. STL: A Seasonal-Trend decomposition Prodecures Based on Loess.
 426 *J Offic Statistics* (1990).
- Wangdi, K., Clements, A. C. A., Du, T. & Nery, S. V. Spatial and temporal patterns
 of dengue infections in Timor-Leste, 2005-2013. *Parasit Vectors*. 11, 9,
- 429 doi:10.1186/s13071-017-2588-4 (2018).
- Basanez, M. G., Marshall, C., Carabin, H., Gyorkos, T. & Joseph, L. Bayesian
 statistics for parasitologists. *Trends Parasitol.* 20, 85-91 (2004).
- 432 63 Wangdi, K. *et al.* A spatio-temporal analysis to identify the drivers of malaria
- 433 transmission in Bhutan. *Sci Rep.* 10, 7060, doi:10.1038/s41598-020-63896-7 (2020).
- 434 64 Wangdi, K. *et al.* Analysis of clinical malaria disease patterns and trends in Vietnam
- 435 2009-2015. *Malar J.* 17, 332, doi:10.1186/s12936-018-2478-z (2018).
- Gelfand, A. E. & Smith, A. F. M. Sampling-Based Approaches to Calculating
 Marginal Densities. *J Am Stat Assoc.* 85, 398-409,
- 438 doi:10.1080/01621459.1990.10476213 (1990).
- 439 66 Thomas, A., Best, N., Lunn, D., Arnold, R. & Spiegelhalter, D. GeoBUGS User
- 440 Manual version 1.2. . *Cambridge: Medical Research Council Biostatistics Unit*.

442

441

443 Acknowledgments

(2004).

444 The authors would like to thank the Bhutan Ministry of Health for allowing to use these445 surveillance data.

446 Authors contribution

- 447 KW and KP were involved in the conception of the study. KW and TT undertook the analysis.
- 448 KP and CT obtained the data. KW and KP drafted the manuscript. ACAC, PG and DJG

critically reviewed and edited the manuscript. All authors read and approved the finalmanuscript.

451 **Competing interest**

452 Authors declare there is no competing interest.

453 Ethical approval and patient confidentiality

454 Administrative approval to use these datasets was provided by the Ministry of Health, Bhutan.

455 This study was a low-risk study since the surveillance data did not contain identifying

456 information on individual participants.

457 Data availability

The datasets of thie current study will be made available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

460

461 Figures

- 462 Figure 1 Map of Bhutan with districts and sub-districts with altitude.
- Figure 2 Decomposed monthly cases of pneumonia: (a) under 5 years and (b) 5 years
 and older during the study period, 2010-2018.
- Figure 3 Crude standardized morbidity ratios (SMR) of pneumonia by sub-districts the
 study period, 2010-2018.
- 467 Figure 4 (a) Spatial distribution (b) significance map of the posterior means of
 468 unstructured random effects of pneumonia in Bhutan, 2010-2018.
- 469 Figure 5 Trend of pneumonia by sub-districts of Bhutan during the study period, 2010470 2018.
- 471
- 472

Tables 473

475

Year	Veen		Under 5 years			5 years and older		
	rear	Cases	Population	Incidence [*]	Cases	Population	Incidence*	
	2010	9,204	77,161	119.28	3,369	70,582	47.73	
	2011	7,975	78,618	101.44	3,210	718,702	4.47	
	2012	9,939	80,985	122.73	3,683	741,572	4.97	
	2013	8,956	81,899	109.35	3,064	749,937	4.09	
	2014	9,434	82,947	113.74	3,669	759,536	4.83	
	2015	7,489	84,009	89.15	3,037	769,258	3.95	
	2016	8,150	85,084	95.79	3,023	779,105	3.88	
	2017	5,883	86,173	68.27	2,606	789,077	3.30	
-	2018	4,777	87,276	54.73	2,547	799,177	3.19	

474 Table 1 Yearly incidence of pneumonia stratified by age.

476

*incidence per 1,000 population 477

478

Table 2 Regression coefficients, relative risk and 95% credible interval from Bayesian 479 spatial and non-spatial models of pneumonia cases in Bhutan, January 2010-December

480

2018. 481

Model/Variable	Coeff, posterior mean (95% CrI)	RR, posterior mean (95% CrI)
Model I (Unstructured)		
$\alpha (Intercept)^{\dagger}$	-4.18 (-4.32, -4.13)	
Age (base over 5 years)	3.06 (3.04, 3.07)	21.26 (20.95, 21.59)
Sex (base male)	0.08 (0.06, 0.09)	1.08 (1.066, 1.094)
Mean monthly trend	-0.12 (-0.14, -0.10)	0.886 (0.870, 0.902)
Rainfall (10mm)	0.07 (0.01, 0.13)	1.072 (1.007, 1.140)
Relative humidity**	-0.09 (-0.10, -0.08)	0.914 (0.903, 0.925)
Maximum temperature (°C)	0.25 (0.24, 0.26)	1.286 (1.272, 1.301)
Probability of extra zero	0.26 (0.21, 0.30)	
Heterogeneity		
Unstructured	0.43 (0.35 0.53)	
Structured (trend)	1.82 (1.43 2.29)	
DIC*	206,040	
Model II (Structured)		
α (Intercept) [†]	-4.18 (-4.32, -4.13)	
Age (base over 5 years)	3.06 (3.02, 3.09)	21.26 (20.55, 22.02)
Sex (base male)	0.08 (0.05, 0.10)	1.08 (1.052, 1.108)
Mean monthly trend	-0.12 (-0.14, -0.10)	0.886 (0.869, 0.903)
Rainfall (10mm)	0.07 (-0.01, 0.14)	1.070 (0.999, 1.014)
Relative humidity**	-0.09 (-0.10, -0.08)	0.914 (0.902, 0.927)
Maximum temperature (°C)	0.25 (0.24, 0.27)	1.287 (1.270, 1.304)
Probability of extra zero	0.18 (0.17, 0.19)	
Heterogeneity		
Structured (spatial)	0.09 (0.07, 0.11)	
-		

Structured (trend)	1.82 (1.42, 2.28)		
DIC	206,093		
Model III (Mixed)			
α (Intercept) [†]	-4.15 (-4.36 -3.91)		
Age (base over 5 years)	3.06 (3.04, 3.07)	21.26 (20.72, 21.82)	
Sex (base male)	0.08 (0.06, 0.09)	1.080 (1.059, 1.101)	
Mean monthly trend	-0.12 (-0.14, -0.10)	0.886 (0.870, 0.902)	
Rainfall (10mm)	0.07 (0.01, 0.13)	1.071 (1.000, 1.014)	
Relative humidity**	-0.09 (-0.10, -0.08)	0.914 (0.903, 0.926)	
Maximum temperature (°C)	0.25 (0.24, 0.26)	1.287 (1.271, 1.303)	
Probability of extra zero	1.201 (1.191, 1.211)		
Heterogeneity	0.60 (0.42, 1.02)		
Unstructured	1.68 (0.13, 8.04)		
Structured (spatial)	1.68 (0.13, 8.04)		
Structured (trend)	1.82 (1.42, 2.28)		
DIC	206,058		

482

483 * best-fit model; ** Lagged three months, [†]coefficient

484

485 Abbreviations: coeff-coefficients; CrI- credible interval; RR-relative risk; DIC- deviation

486 information criterion

487

Figures



Figure 1

Map of Bhutan with districts and sub-districts with altitude. Note: The designations employed and the presentation of the material on this map do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of Research Square concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. This map has been provided by the authors.



Figure 2

Decomposed monthly cases of pneumonia: (a) under 5 years and (b) 5 years and older during the study period, 2010-2018.



Figure 3



Crude standardized morbidity ratios (SMR) of pneumonia by sub-districts the study period, 2010-2018.

Figure 4

(a) Spatial distribution (b) significance map of the posterior means of unstructured random effects of pneumonia in Bhutan, 2010-2018.



Figure 5

Trend of pneumonia by sub-districts of Bhutan during the study period, 2010-2018.

Supplementary Files

This is a list of supplementary files associated with this preprint. Click to download.

• ARISupplementary.pdf