

# Students' Tolerance Behavior in Religious-Based Primary School: Gender Perspective

Wita Juwita<sup>1\*</sup>, Abdul Salim<sup>2</sup>, Winarno Winarno<sup>3</sup>

---

## ARTICLE INFO

### Article History:

Received 06.04.2018

Received in revised form

Accepted 23.05.2018

Available online 01.07.2018

## ABSTRACT

Tolerance in the pluralism and multiculturalism is a demand. The diversity requires a unity through the acceptance and appreciation, furthers, it is a cooperative attitude that upholds the value of harmony. The aim of this research is to analyze and describe how the students' tolerance behavior in a religious-based primary school in the gender perspective. The distinct attitude on the male and female students in the daily basis heightens the fact of this case in tolerance also happened among them. Employing the qualitative method, this study implemented case study. The result shows that there is a distinct tolerance behavior to the male and female students in religious-based primary school. The male students tend to be more ignorant towards the differences; meanwhile; the female students are more sensitive towards the diversity in their environment.

© 2018 IJERE. All rights reserved

### Keywords:

Tolerance behavior, religious-based primary school, gender.

---

## INTRODUCTION

Tolerance is a necessary element of intercultural communication; is the ability to understand the important thing not only in own, but in a different culture, to see value starts in the other, alien faith, to isolate the grounds that do not contradict the spiritual and moral values (Aubakirova, Ismagambetova, Karabayeva, Rysbekova, & Mirzabekova, 2016). Terminologically, tolerance is letting other people do according to their interest (Jamrah, 2015). Tolerance of individuals requires that each person's viewpoint receives a courteous hearing, not that all views have equal worth, merit, or truth (Von Bergen & Collier, 2013). Tolerance is based on the diversity. The difference is absolute, everyone can not change it. Besides, the essence of tolerance is that it is the quality of the culture of every society and every citizen regardless of gender, age, profession or ethnicity (Aubakirova et al., 2016). Each person has various differences in physics, personalities and perspectives. There are two sides of impacts of diversity, which are negative and positive. The negative impact is the conflicts occurred from the inability to accept the differences or even from self-obtrude. In the other side, the positive impact shows that there is a more unique and more varied culture and identity of the country.

Indonesia is a plural country with its archipelago area which has particular unique identity. The well-known motto of the Indonesian state is "Bhinneka Tunggal Ika", which means "Unity in Diversity". This word symbolizes the fact that this populous nation is spread across thousands of islands and consists of multi-ethnic groups with their own vernaculars, colourful cultures, religions and/or indigenous beliefs and live and spread on the thousands of islands (UNESCO, 1998). With its large geographical area and various socio-cultural, it demands every single civilian to apply the tolerance in daily life. The country who has unique multi-ethnic and multi-mental like Indonesia, faces its own dilemma, in one side it leads Indonesia being a multi-cultural nation-state, in another side it leads to some threats (Lestari, 2015). The importance of tolerance in pluralism and multiculturalism will have effect on the cooperation and harmony among the civilians. It is urgently required to introduce tolerance behavior to the children in early age (Safrilsyah, 2015). Moral education and character is used for strengthening human relationships within a framework of a broad organizational system that is state or government (Slamet, 2018).

Indonesia consists of 34 provinces, each province has its own characteristics ranging from ethnicity, language, color and culture. Cultural characteristics of each region is different and therefore the culture of each region needs to be introduced as a local wisdom so that cultural identity can be understood by anyone. Every culture in Indonesia has similarities and differences. In general, Indonesia has a strong culture of

---

<sup>1</sup>witajuwita@student.uns.ac.id, orcid.org/0000-0003-0398-4474 Sebelas Maret University, Sebelas Maret University<sup>2</sup>, Sebelas Maret University<sup>3</sup>

Juwita,W., Abdul Salim, Winarno Winarno (2018). Students' tolerance behavior in religious-based primary school: Gender perspective. *International Journal of Educational Research Review*,3(3),51-58.

cooperation among its citizens. The undermining of the culture of cooperation in Indonesia is limited to inter-regional cooperation. The existence of cultural differences between regions limits the implementation of the attitude of cooperation of Indonesian citizens.

Education has important role to revert person's behavior including the tolerance behavior implementation. Religion teaching becomes an effort in shaping and strengthening the characteristics (Mahmoudi, 2017). Therefore, Religious-based primary schools are able to be the alternative in shaping the positive characteristics on the students' tolerance behavior due to both education and religion have high relevancy in shaping characteristics (Short, 1970). The difference in male and female characteristics in several aspects becomes one of this research backgrounds (Hyde, 2014). The male who tends to be more masculine and female who is feminine have special characteristics in social interaction and individual life (Santrick, 2006).

The conduct of this research contributes to many parties, especially parents in providing the best education and quality for their children. Religious-based primary schools can be an alternative in applying tolerance to students so that students have good social skills with the people around them. The lack of time allocation in religion subject in Indonesia has been a reason for establishment of religious-based school in Indonesia (Ministry of religion, 2007). The learning activities inside and outside the class are taught based on the religion they believe.

Recent development in this research is on the latest way in analyzing the students' tolerance behavior conducted in religious-based primary school in gender perspective. The previous research discusses the religion role on the religion ethnic (Idris, Abdullah, Ahmda, & Mansor, 2016), others focuses on the more general aspects not on the tolerance behavior in primary school (Von Bergen & Collier, 2013).

### **Situation of the Problem**

The fact happening today is that students in religion-based primary schools commit discriminatory actions against each other and sometimes show things that are not taught by their religion such as insulting, bullying, and mocking. Especially in male and female student. These acts reflect intolerance. So, what factors are the causes of intolerance attitude happened to students who attend religion-based primary school? Is the role of religion-based elementary school in teaching and applying the attitude of tolerance has not been optimal yet? or such deviations occur due to outside influences that becomes a tradition perpetuated by students?

### **Aim of the Study**

The purpose of this study is to describe how the student's tolerance attitude in primary schools in a gender perspective. Analyzing whether there is a difference between male and female students' tolerance stance and the causes and effects of such differences in tolerance. The novelty and uniqueness of this research is the existence of gender reviews in analyzing students' tolerance. Characteristic differences in male and female students are usually only analyzed in general and not in depth on a particular attitude, but in this study discussed in detail about the tolerance of male and female students

## **METHOD**

This research was conducted by using a qualitative approach with case study method (Creswell, 2012). The population of this study is all religion-based primary schools in Bandung. While the samples used are Islamic and Christian religion-based primary schools. The sampling technique used is purposive sampling. Purposive sampling is a technique of sampling data sources with certain considerations (Yin, 2002). The reason for the use of purposive sampling technique is that the majority of the population of Indonesia is Islam adherents, following next is Christianity adherents. The instrument used in this study is the researcher himself, because in qualitative research the researcher acts as a human instrument that serves to establish the focus of research, to select informants as data sources, to collect data, to assess data quality, to analyze data, to interpret data and to make conclusions on the findings (Miles & Huberman, 1992).

Data collection techniques used in this study are interview and observation. The reason of using interview and observation is that with both data collection techniques, the researcher can obtain deeper data sources from informants and resource persons with extensive information on the role of religious-based primary schools in applying tolerance. The type of interview used in this study is an unstructured interview

or better known as an open interview (Sugiyono, 2016). Open interviews were conducted because the researcher did not use interview guidelines that had been arranged systematically and completely, interview guidelines are used only in the form of outlines of the issues to be asked. Interviews were conducted to students, parents, teachers and principals. Observations were conducted in a participatory way in which the researcher was involved with the student's daily activities.

Validity and credibility of data in qualitative research is carried out by using triangulation time and triangulation of source. It means checking data from various sources at various times. By doing the validity by using triangulation of source and time, all data obtained from this research can be said valid, because sources and time obtained not only come from one source and one time, but also from some source and data taking data done in multiple time.

Data analysis technique used is Miles and Huberman data analysis model where the data are analyzed through three stages, namely data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing / verification. Data reduction means summarizing, selecting or focusing data on important findings in the field. After the data is reduced the next step is to display the data. Presentation of data can be done in the form of short descriptions or charts, but data analysis in qualitative research more often uses narrative texts (Miles & Huberman, 1984). The last step of data analysis techniques according to Miles and Huberman is to make conclusions and verification. Conclusions in qualitative research are new findings that have not previously existed.

## RESEARCH RESULT AND FINDINGS

The finding demonstrates the presence of the gap on the female and male students' tolerance behavior. The male tends to be more ignorant and female are more sensitive to the differences in the environment. Males have more discriminative tendencies in treating the differences while females have less. Difference response to tolerance between males and females highlights the factor of different characteristics between them. The sensitive feelings the females have encourage the boys to tease them for every little mistake they made and laughed at it. Due to its embarrassment, most of the girls are embarrassed and unconfident to be around their friends.

Another result found that the school has taught the tolerance behavior concept to the students well through the learning activities inside and outside of the class. The limited allocation of time at school shortens the teachers' ability to monitor further implementation of the tolerance behavior on the students' daily lives. Accordingly, the school and parents build a relationship in supervising the achievement of the students' tolerance behavior. The religion subject has optimally been taught, however, the students still need self-awareness about the importance of tolerance behavior in daily life. Hence, they can implement it in any place they are.

## RESULT, DISCUSSION, AND SUGGESTIONS

There are about six religions recognized in Indonesia, Islam, Christian, Catholic, Hindu, Buddha and Confucianism. Indonesia is dominated by civilians with Islamic religion, follows after it Christian religion (Na'im & Syaputra, 2010). Indonesia is well-known for its plural and multiculturalism. Its large geography and diverse socio-cultural unite the diversity in each region (Lestari, 2015). As a plural country, Indonesia faces several threats from conflict triggers such as religion, economy, social, and culture.

The conflict occurred due to the distinct understandings and beliefs are frequently started by the problems related to the different in principles and beliefs adopted by people (Wittmann, 2014). The lack acceptance and appreciation trigger the conflicts.

Rationally, difference is absolutely reasonable and an asset for a country, especially in creating a country identity. Indonesia has a slogan "*Bhineka Tunggal Ika*" which means unity in diversity (Winarno, 2013). This slogan becomes a handbook or guidance for Indonesia to uphold the harmony and cooperation in facing the diversity. It is expected as a mediator to unite every difference in Indonesia and a unifier for the diversity.

The difference must be responded well and mature so it will not cause any harm on any party (Cefai et al., 2015). Several conflicts in Indonesia must be faced and handled by the applicable law. Indonesia as a plural and multicultural country has a huge responsibility for harmony and unity. Tolerance is considered

Juwita,W., Abdul Salim, Winarno Winarno (2018). Students' tolerance behavior in religious-based primary school: Gender perspective. *International Journal of Educational Research Review*,3(3),51-58.

as one of the positive responses as a way in upholding the harmony in diversity (Naumenko, Naumenko, & Federation, 2016). It is an act of accepting, respecting and appreciating the diversity (UNESCO, 1998). Various diversity should be able to strengthen the unity. Tolerance in Islamic perspective means letting, permitting and liberating each person to adopt a religion (Jamrah, 2015).

Tolerance is influenced by the difference in principle like religion and ethnicity (Iverson, 2015). Fundamental difference made it important to implement it in the country with the large geography and crowded population. The difference in belief can be handled by the factors occurring harmony and cooperation. It is a mark of dynamic and positive tolerance. Static tolerance is only limited to the understanding taught not to the implementation and its impacts (Yaqin, 2005). The implementation of the tolerance behavior is based on the social and individual attitude, either in their way in interacting and socializing, or in their individual skills, such as moral (Elliot, Xiao, & Wilson, 2015).

Parenting pattern from the parents holds huge role in developing both aspects (social and individual). It influences how people respond and react (Santrock, 2007). Besides parenting, education has quite essential role in developing both aspects. The length of time intensity and discipline implementation put education for having an important role in shaping behavior. Furthermore, it is able to use as an answer in solving the conflicts caused by the decline of the attitude and behavior (Khan, 2016). The role of families in managing children's educational experiences at home and at school has long been considered critical for children's success in school (ÖKTEN, 2016).

Negative response, usually called intolerance will lead to the bad effect if it is not handled. It must be prevented from unexpected events. As mentioned above, education as a solution minimizes the possibility of unexpected events occurred. In addition, religion acts as a benchmark controller on response and reaction (Nash & Eugenio, 2012). Its role is as important as education in improving social and individual skills effort. The supervision makes the religious-based primary school begin to be noticed by parents to shape their children attitude, especially in Indonesia.

Parochial school or well-known as religious-based begins to be noticed by the parents as the alternative to provide best education for their children. One of the appeals is that it teaches religion intensively than the public school. Religious curriculum is personally designed by inserting some supported and essential religious material to be implemented by the students. It is able to be a knowledge basis which is as important as other lessons learned by them.

Those religious-based school privileges attract the parents to believe on giving such education can improve children social and individual skills. With excellent competence on the teachers puts them in a high level trust of religious education to it. Even some parents give off their primary responsibilities in educating their children because of their overly trust given to the school.

Difference behavior on the male and female becomes the background of the observation on the tolerance behavior in the religious-based primary school, male and female have special characteristic in nature from the birth to the adult (Ormrod J.E., 2009). It is not merely on their daily attitude they also have certain tolerance behavior on the differences in the environment.

The measurement of the tolerance on the primary level students in Indonesia is based on some indicators that are refrain from disturbing their different religion friends in practicing their rituals, keep their rights to practice their religion, greet the friends who have different opinions, respect different opinions, help friends in need even with different religion, race, and ethnic, cooperate with them at class and at school, accept different opinions from their friends, and groove with them (KEMENDIKNAS, 2010).

In the first stage of research, the writer conducted an observation on the case happened recently in Indonesia. Some of them are the tolerance among religious people has paid much attention from the society. Further, it will be connected to the tolerance behavior in the field studied. The writer focuses on the case of the tolerance behavior of primary school students in gender perspective. Religious-based primary school is believed to provide positive activities with intensively time for the students based on the religion they practice.

Generally, learning activities in these schools are not different than the other schools. The curriculum implemented is the national curriculum. The tolerance concept is taught by the teachers through the Pkn subject (Civic Education), the learning process in the class (all subjects) and other activities after -school time. Pkn teachers more focus on the lesson about tolerance. It is taught through the simple models in daily life.

They instruct them to narrate their experience in implementing the tolerance behavior in school or in neighborhood.

In another subject, the teachers implement it through some approaches and methods. By cooperative learning, they are able to observe how the students' tolerance develops. Based on the concept of every child is unique, the teachers group them into different kind of competence and attitude. It is not purposely conducted to give a special treatment for particular student or discriminate them; however, it aims to make learning time efficient and risen their cooperative skills. The teachers get some help from the higher level students to teach their groups.

In the middle of the learning, the students' tolerance behavior occurs and the teachers are able to observe it. The male students show intolerance behavior in the class and influence others to do the similar thing. They tend to frequently tease or mock the female students. Some discrimination toward the female students are provoked by the male students if they find any little mistake. So that it causes the chaotic condition in class in which it is often done by the higher grade (4, 5 and 6 graders).

Another intolerance behavior is shown from the higher graders in religious-based school is the disrespect attitude. It happened when they were in the group discussion time. The clash in their opinions sometimes leads to some hassle in the class. Reinforcing their opinions and inability in accepting the different opinions in discussion indicate their low level of tolerance. The teachers' effort in preventing it is by imposing point reduction in the group if one of the members does some discriminative action to others. Consequently, they will refrain themselves from doing it.

Beside the class activity, it is also conducted the routine program such as sport, scout, extra-curricular and other activities including religious ritual in outside of the class to improve their tolerance behavior. It is held for all graders. The tolerance shown in those activities are that they want to share and join with other students without paying much attention to the age gap among them.

Routine program held in the religious-based school is the morning inspiration. This program involves all students in a class to take turn in conveying what they have read in the program "Sarapan Buku" (Book Breakfast). They are obliged to read one book from various biography, history, or narrative story which then they retell it to other students in front of the class. They listen to it and give some opinions about what they have heard. Feedback between them is as result of what they have read.

The teachers are able to identify their students' intolerance behavior through the program. Some female students felt less confidence especially when they perform in front of the class. The female students' confidence declines and they often feel shy to perform. It is strongly predicted that is caused by bullying and mocking from the male students. They laughed it hard and create chaos in the class. It clearly represents the impacts of the intolerance will influence the individual and social condition of the students.

The outside activities held by school make the students are able to mingle with other students such as competition. It makes them connected even with different religion to compete sportively through various contest such as brain battle and sport competition. For the competition in religion knowledge, the participants are from homogeny students due to the different religion they have.

In the middle of the contest or waiting, a student permits himself to practice their ritual to his friends without any tactless from different religion friends to communicate. The lack of this program is that there are only high achiever students whom are able to join it. As a result of it, the first and second indicator can not be identified clearly. It is clarified from the communication with parents about the students' development in social skill at home.

From the parents' elaboration that the students mostly are able to have a nice friendship with their friend in the neighborhood demonstrates the students' ability to accept the different with different religion friends. It is found that there are some students having different religion friends in their course, and their acceptances to them are good and they want to interact with them. In addition, they also want to keep their rights to practice their religion. It is proven by their action in suggesting and reminding their friends to pray.

In the interview result, it is found that the teachers have optimally done some efforts to build the school tolerance atmosphere. It is relevant with the observation result. Even though, the intolerance behavior are shown from the students; nonetheless, the teachers' effort in creating tolerance atmosphere in the school has been good. They are always taught to do good things and respect the differences, from the simple difference like difference opinion to the complex difference.

Juwita,W., Abdul Salim, Winarno Winarno (2018). Students' tolerance behavior in religious-based primary school: Gender perspective. *International Journal of Educational Research Review*,3(3),51-58.

According to the indicators determined by National development of cultural education and character (Kemendiknas, 2010:40) mentioned before, it is concluded that the students' tolerance behavior in both of the religious-based primary school is quite good, moreover, it needs more follow-up and needs more investigation so that the tolerance behavior is not only understood theoretically, but also it is reflected in their attitude as Indonesian people.

By doing this research is expected in the future can provide benefits for schools to keep trying to actualize the attitude of tolerance in students so that tolerance can be embedded properly and internalized in students not only in the school environment but in the home and community. The limitations of this study is that the researcher can not examine the attitude of student tolerance in more depth because of the limited time in this research. Students live in different environments so that the attitude of student tolerance when in the home environment can not be examined in more depth. therefore the researchers expect further research to examine the attitude of student tolerance, including in the environment where they lived.

## REFERENCES

- Aubakirova, S. S., Ismagambetova, Z. N., Karabayeva, A. G., Rysbekova, S. S., & Mirzabekova, A. S. (2016). Tolerance issue in kazakh culture. *International Journal of Environmental and Science Education*, 11(12), 5034–5048.
- Badan Penelitian dan Pengembangan Pusat Kurikulum, Kementrian Pendidikan Nasional. (2010). *Pengembangan Pendidikan Budaya dan Karakter Bangsa*. Jakarta: Kementrian Pendidikan Nasional.
- Bangwayo-Skeete, P. F., & Zikhali, P. (2011). Social tolerance for human diversity in Sub-Saharan Africa. *International Journal of Social Economics*, 38(6), 516–536.
- Boonjeam, W., Tesaputa, K., & Sri-ampai, A. (2017). Program development for primary school teachers' critical thinking. *International Education Studies*, 10(2), 131. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ies.v10n2p131>
- Brooks, M. C. (2017). Southern Filipino school leaders and religious diversity: a typology. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 31(5), 646–660. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-08-2016-0164>
- Casram, C. (2016). Membangun sikap toleransi beragama dalam masyarakat plural. *Wawasan: Jurnal Ilmiah Agama Dan Sosial Budaya*, 1(2), 187–198.
- Cefai, C., Cavioni, V., Bartolo, P., Simoes, C., Miljevic-Ridicki, R., Bouilet, D., ... Eriksson, C. (2015). Social inclusion and social justice. *Journal for Multicultural Education*, 9(3), 122–139.
- Das, J., DiRienzo, C., & Tiemann, T. (2008). A global tolerance index. *Competitiveness Review: An International Business Journal Incorporating Journal of Global Competitiveness*, 18(3), 192–205. <https://doi.org/10.1108/10595420810905975>
- Davidson, J. D., & Pyle, R. E. (2012). *Religious Stratification in America. Research in the Sociology of Work* (Vol. 23). Emerald Group Publishing Ltd. [https://doi.org/10.1108/S0277-2833\(2012\)0000023004](https://doi.org/10.1108/S0277-2833(2012)0000023004)
- Earthman, G. I., & Lemasters, L. K. (2009). Teacher attitudes about classroom conditions. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 47(3), 323–335. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09578230910955764>
- Eirich, G. M. (2012). *Parental Religiosity and Children's Educational Attainment in the United States. Religion, Work, and Inequality* (Vol. 23). Emerald Group Publishing Ltd. [https://doi.org/10.1108/S0277-2833\(2012\)0000023010](https://doi.org/10.1108/S0277-2833(2012)0000023010)
- Elliot, E. A., Xiao, Y., & Wilson, E. (2015). A multicultural blend: metaphors, cognitive social capital and multiculturalism. *International Marketing Review*, 32(2), 200–218. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IMR-01-2014-0032>
- Endang, B. (Untasn). (2009). Mengembangkan Sikap Toleransi Dan Kebersamaan Di Kalangan Siswa. *Jurnal Visi Ilmu Pendidikan*, 1(2), 89–105.
- Fauzi, A., & Hasbullah, H. (2016). Pre-Eminent Curriculum in Islamic Basic School Integrated Comparative Studies in Islamic Basic School Integrated Al-Izzah Serang and Al-Hanif Cilegon, Banten, Indonesia. *International Education Studies*, 9(4), 124. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ies.v9n4p124>

- Juwita,W., Abdul Salim, Winarno Winarno (2018). Students' tolerance behavior in religious-based primary school: Gender perspective. *International Journal of Educational Research Review*,3(3),51-58.
- Garreta Bochaca, J. (2006). Ethnic minorities and the Spanish? Catalan educational systems: from exclusion to intercultural education', *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 30(2): 26179
- Gebert, D., Boerner, S., & Chatterjee, D. (2011). Do religious differences matter? An analysis in India. *Team Performance Management*, 17(3/4), 224–240. <https://doi.org/10.1108/13527591111143736>
- Hayik, R. (2015). Addressing Religious Diversity through Children ' s Literature : An " English as a Foreign Language " Classroom in Israel. *International Journal of Multicultural Education*, 17(2), 92–107.
- Hedayati, N., Kuusisto, E., Gholami, K., & Tirri, K. (2017). Gender-Specific Religious Moral Dilemmas in Iranian Schools. The Power of Resistance: Culture, Ideology and Social Reproduction in Global Contexts *Advances in Education in Diverse Communities: Research, Policy and Praxis*, 12, 365–381. <https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-358X20140000012017>
- Hyde, J. S. (2014). Gender Similarities and Differences. *Annual Review of Psychology*. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-psych-010213-115057>
- Idris, F., Abdullah, M. R. N., Ahmad, A. R., & Mansor, A. Z. (2016). The Effect of Religion on Ethnic Tolerance in Malaysia: The Application of Rational Choice Theory (RCT) and the Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB). *International Education Studies*, 9(11), 13. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ies.v9n11p13>
- Iverson, D. (2015). Multiculturalism. In *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences* (pp. 22–27). Elsevier. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.63052-0>
- Jamrah, S. A. (2015). Toleransi antarumat beragama: Perspektif Islam. *Jurnal Ushuluddin*, 2, 194.
- Kemenag. (2007). Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 55 Tahun 2007 Tentang Pendidikan Agama Dan Pendidikan Keagamaan, 1–27.
- Khan, Z. N. (2016). Role of education in building social cohesion. *International Journal of Secondary Education*, 4(2), 23–26. <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ijsedu.20160402.12>
- Larraz, N., Vázquez, S., & Liesa, M. (2017). Transversal skills development through cooperative learning. Training teachers for the future. *On the Horizon*, 25(2), 85–95. <https://doi.org/10.1108/OTH-02-2016-0004>
- Lau, P., Kwong, T., Chong, K., & Wong, E. (2013). Developing students' teamwork skills in a cooperative learning project. *International Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies*, 3(1), 80–99. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJLLS-03-2013-0018>
- Lestari, G. (2015). Bhinneka Tunggal Ika : Khasanah Multikultural. *Jurnal Pendidikan Pancasila Dan Kewarganegaraan*, 1(Februari), 31–37.
- Mahmoudi, A. (2017). The theology of Eckankar : Its critique and study based on the Islamic teachings, 12(4), 799–816.
- Mason-Jones D.R., R. and T. (2002). Working definitions: Educational organization and the meaning of multiculturalism. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09574090910954864>
- Massengill, R. P., & MacGregor, C. A. (2012). *Religious nonaffiliation and schooling: The educational trajectories of three types of religious "Nones."* *Religion, Work and Inequality* (Vol. 23). Emerald Group Publishing Ltd. [https://doi.org/10.1108/S0277-2833\(2012\)0000023011](https://doi.org/10.1108/S0277-2833(2012)0000023011)
- Na'im, A., & Syaputra, H. (2010). *Kewarganegaraan, Suku Bangsa, Agama dan Bahasa Sehari-hari Penduduk Indonesia* (2010th ed.). Badan Pusat Statistik, Jakarta.
- Nash, R. J., & Eugenio, V. S. (2012). *Teaching about religious and spiritual difference in a global society.* *Advances in Educational Administration* (Vol. 16). Emerald Group Publishing Ltd. [https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-3660\(2012\)0000016006](https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-3660(2012)0000016006)
- Naumenko, E. A., Naumenko, O. N., & Federation, R. (2016). Pedagogical experience on formation of tolerant and multicultural consciousness of students. *European Journal of Contemporary Education*, 17(3), 335–343. <https://doi.org/10.13187/ejced.2016.17.335>

- Juwita,W., Abdul Salim, Winarno Winarno (2018). Students' tolerance behavior in religious-based primary school: Gender perspective. *International Journal of Educational Research Review*,3(3),51-58.
- Okten, P. (2016). Parental academic support in education. *International Journal of Educational Research Review Parental*,1(2), 18-24.
- Ormrod, J.E. (2009). *Psikologi pendidikan: Membantu siswa tumbuh dan berkembang*. Penerbit Erlangga. Jakarta.
- O'Sullivan, S. L. (2017). Applying cultural intelligence to religious symbols in multinationals. *Cross Cultural & Strategic Management*, 24(2), 365–382. <https://doi.org/10.1108/CCSM-05-2015-0069>
- Pirmohamed, S., Debowska, A., & Boduszek, D. (2017). Gender differences in the correlates of academic achievement among university students Sarah. *Journal of Applied Research in Higher Education*, 9(2), 313–324. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JARHE-03-2016-0015>
- Rashidah, A. R., & Faisal, D. (2015). al-Wasatiyyah in the practice of religious tolerance among the families of new Muslims in sustaining a well-being society. *Humanomics*, 31(3), 354–371. <https://doi.org/10.1108/H-04-2014-0037>
- Safrilsyah. (2015). Sikap toleransi beragama di kalangan siswa sma di banda aceh. *Substantia Journal*, 17(April), 103–120.
- Scheitle, C. P., & Smith, B. G. (2012). *Religious affiliation, college degree attainment, and religious switching. Research in the Sociology of Work* (Vol. 23). Emerald Group Publishing Ltd. [https://doi.org/10.1108/S0277-2833\(2012\)0000023012](https://doi.org/10.1108/S0277-2833(2012)0000023012)
- Schirmer, W., Weidenstedt, L., & Reich, W. (2012). From tolerance to respect in inter-ethnic contexts. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 38(7), 1049–1065. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2012.681448>
- Short, E. (1970). Religion in the schools. *Education + Training*, 12(4), 129–137. <https://doi.org/10.1108/eb001596>
- Darsono, Slamet, Winarno. (2018). The Need Textbook Writing of Children's Story Based on Character Education. *International Journal of Educational Research Review*, 3(2),1-8.
- Suparlan, P. (2003). Bhinneka tunggal ika: Keanekaragaman Sukubangsa atau Kebudayaan? *Antropologi Indonesia*, 72, 24–37.
- Teah, M., Lwin, M., & Cheah, I. (2014). Moderating role of religious beliefs on attitudes towards charities and motivation to donate. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 26(5), 738–760. <https://doi.org/10.1108/APJML-09-2014-0141>
- UNESCO. (1998). Learning to live together in peace and harmony, 182.
- Vincent, S. K., & Torres, R. M. (2015). Multicultural competence: A case study of teachers and their student perceptions. *Journal of Agricultural Education*, 56(2), 64–75. <https://doi.org/10.5032/jae.2015.02064>
- Von Bergen, C. W., & Collier, G. (2013). Tolerance As Civility in Contemporary Workplace Diversity Initiatives. *Administrative Issues Journal Education Practice and Research*, 86–97. <https://doi.org/10.5929/2013.3.1.6>
- Wahab, N. A., & Mustapha, R. (2015). Reflections on pedagogical and curriculum implementation at orang asli schools in pahang. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 172, 442–448. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.376>
- Walker, J., & Langan, E. (2016). Histlexia observed in training pre-service social studies teachers to teach world religions. *Current Issues in Middle Level Education*, 21, 15–23.
- Wemyss, G. (2006). The power to tolerate: Contests over Britishness and belonging in East London. *Patterns of Prejudice*, 40(3), 215–236. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00313220600769406>
- Winarno. 2013. *Paradigma baru pendidikan kewarganegaraan*. PT Bumi Aksara. Jakarta.
- Wittmann, V. (2014). World society and globalisation. *Journal for Multicultural Education*, 8(3), 194–206. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JME-05-2014-0021>
- Yasir, M. (2014). Makna toleransi dalam Al-Qur ' an (pp. 170–188).