Karin Brodie

## Teaching Mathematical Reasoning in Secondary School Classrooms

With Contributions by

Kurt Coetzee Lorraine Lauf Stephen Modau Nico Molefe Romulus O'Brien



## Contents

Introduction to Part 1		
Teaching Mathematical Reasoning: A Challenging Task	7	
The Centrality of Mathematical Reasoning in Mathematics Education	7	
Justifying and Generalizing	8	
The Role of Proof in Mathematical Reasoning	9	
Creativity and Reasoning	10	
Theories of Learning and Mathematical Reasoning	12	
Constructivism	12	
Socio-Cultural Theories	14	
Situated Theories	16	
	18	
Tasks for Mathematical Reasoning	- 19	
Classroom Interaction	20	
The Challenges of Teaching Mathematical Reasoning	22	
Contexts, Resources, and Reform	23	
Responses to Reforms	23	
The South African Context	26	
Five Schools: Contexts and Resources	28	
Race and Socio-Economic Status	28	
School Resources	29	
Classroom Resources	31	
Learner Knowledge	- 33	
The Tasks	35	
The Grade 11 Tasks	35	
The Grade 10 Tasks	36	
	Teaching Mathematical Reasoning: A Challenging Task   The Centrality of Mathematical Reasoning in Mathematics Education   Justifying and Generalizing   The Role of Proof in Mathematical Reasoning   Creativity and Reasoning   Theorics of Learning and Mathematical Reasoning   Constructivism   Socio-Cultural Theories   Situated Theories   Situated Theories   Tasks for Mathematical Reasoning   Classroom Interaction   The South African Context   Five Schools: Contexts and Resources   Race and Socio-Economic Status   School Resources   Classroom Resources   Learner Knowledge   The Tasks   The South African Context   Five School Resources   Classroom Resources   Learner Knowledge	

## Contents

In	Introduction to Part 2	
3	Mathematical Reasoning Through Tasks: Learners' Responses	43
	Tasks that Support Mathematical Reasoning	44
	Teaching for Mathematical Reasoning	46
	The Classroom and the Tasks	47
	Learners' Responses: An Overview	48
	Learners' Responses: Detailed Analysis	49
	Teacher-Learner Interactions	52
	Encouraging Participation	52
	Using the Contribution to Move Forward	53
	Pushing for Explanation of Particular Ideas	54
	Conclusions and Implications	55
4	Learning Mathematical Reasoning in a Collaborative	
•	Whole-Class Discussion	57
		51
	What Is Mathematical Reasoning?	58
	Why Teach Mathematical Reasoning?	59
	Collaborative Learning and Mathematical Reasoning	60
	Summarizing My Perspective	61
	My Classroom	62
	The Analysis	62
	Winile's Learning	63
	Making Observations	64
	Explaining and Justifying Assertions Made	64
	Connecting Observations with Mathematical Representations	65
	Reconstructing Conceptual Understanding	67
	Testing Other Claims	68
	The Teacher's Role	69
	Establishing Discourse	69
	Framing Discussion	70
	Lesson Flow or Momentum	70
	Conclusions and Implications	71
5	Classroom Practices for Teaching and Learning	
-	Mathematical Reasoning	73
	Classroom Practices	74
	Learning Mathematical Reasoning	75
	Teaching Mathematical Reasoning: Questioning and Listening	76
	My Classroom	78
	Teacher Moves and Practices	79
	Learner Moves and Practices	82
	Conclusions and Implications	84

Contents
----------

6	Teaching Mathematical Reasoning with the Five Strands	87
	A Social-Constructivist Framework	88
	Mathematical Practices and Proficiency	89
	My Classroom and the Tasks	- 90
	Initial Analysis	94
	Classroom Interaction	- 94
	Learners' Work	95
	The Five Strands in the Lesson	- 96
	Procedural Fluency	- 96
	Conceptual Understanding	97
	Strategic Competence	98
	Adaptive Reasoning	99
	The Five Strands in the Learners' Work	99
	Conclusion	100
7	Teaching the Practices of Justification and Explanation	103
	Construction and Practices	104
	The Practices of Justification and Explanation	104
	The Importance of Tasks	106
	The Teacher's Contribution	106
	My Classroom	100
	The Learners' Written Responses	109
	Whole-Class Interaction	111
	Incorrect Justification	112
	Partial Justification	114
	Correct Justification	115
	Conclusions	117
	Conclusions	117
In	troduction to Part 3	119
8	Learner Contributions	121
	Learner Contributions and Mathematical Reasoning	122
	Describing Learner Contributions.	123
	Distribution of Learner Contributions	124
	Accounting for Learner Contributions	126
	Basic Errors	127
	Appropriate Errors	128
	Missing Information	130
	Partial Insights	131
	Complete, Correct Contributions	132
	Going Beyond the Task	134
	Summary	136

9	Teacher Responses to Learner Contributions	139
	Teacher Moves	139
	Distributions of Teacher Moves	142
	Mainly Maintaining: Mr. Nkomo	142
	The Power of Inserting: Ms. King	145
	Strategic Combinations: Mr. Daniels	149
	Supporting Learner Moves: Mr. Mogale	153
	Entertaining Errors: Mr. Peters	157
	Overview: Teacher Responses to Learner Contributions	160
	Trajectories for Working with Learners' Contributions	163
10	Dilemmas of Teaching Mathematical Reasoning	167
	Teaching Dilemmas	167
	Linking Learners with the Subject	168
	Working Simultaneously with Individuals and Groups	169
	The "Press" Move	170
	To Press or Not to Press?	172
	To Take Up or Ignore Learners' Contributions?	176
	Conclusions	179
11	Learner Resistance to Teacher Change	183
	Resistance to Pedagogy	183
	The Context of the Resistance	187
	Learner Resistance	191
	The Teacher's Contributions	193
	Making Sense of the Resistance	196
12	Conclusions and Ways Forward: The "Messy" Middle Ground	199
	Tasks and Mathematical Reasoning	200
	Supporting Learner Contributions	201
	Working with Learner Errors	202
	Classroom Conversations	202
	Maintaining the IRE/F	203
	Supporting all Learners to Participate	204
	Learner Resistance	205
	Conclusions	205
Ap	pendix	207
Ref	erences	213
Ind	ex	223