The Autonomy of Morality

In *The Autonomy of Morality*, Charles Larmore challenges two ideas that have shaped the modern mind. The world, he argues, is not a realm of value-neutral fact, nor is reason our capacity to impose principles of our own devising on an alien reality. Rather, reason consists in being responsive to reasons for thought and action that arise from the world itself. In particular, Larmore shows that the moral good has an authority that speaks for itself. Only in this light does the true basis of a liberal political order come into view, as well as the role of unexpected goods in the makeup of a life lived well.

Charles Larmore is W. Duncan MacMillan Family Professor in the Humanities and Professor of Philosophy at Brown University. He is the author of *The Morals of Modernity* and *The Romantic Legacy* and a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. In 2004, he received the Grand Prix de Philosophie from the Académie Française for his book *Les pratiques du moi*.

In memory of Marlowe

The Autonomy of Morality

CHARLES LARMORE

Brown University



Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-71782-3 - The Autonomy of Morality Charles Larmore Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521717823

© Charles Larmore 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Larmore, Charles E. The autonomy of morality / Charles Larmore. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-88913-1 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-71782-3 (pbk.) 1. Ethics. 2. Reasoning. 1. Title. BJ 37 L 37 2008 170'.42-dc22 2007045635

ISBN 978-0-521-88913-1 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-71782-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Acknowledgments	page ix
Introduction: Response and Commitment	1
PART I REASON AND REASONS	
1 History and Truth	19
1. Historicist Skepticism	20
2. Growth and Progress	22
3. Agreeing and Coping	25
4. Overcoming Dualisms	28
5. Moral Progress	30
2 Back to Kant? No Way	33
1. Kant's Modesty	34
2. Dualisms and Ultimate Principles	37
3. Kant on Reason	39
4. The Fate of Autonomy	43
3 Attending to Reasons	47
1. Introduction	47
2. Experience and Reality	5^{1}
3. Experience as a Tribunal	55
4. Platonisms	60
5. The Conservation of Trouble	6_{4}
PART II THE MORAL POINT OF VIEW	
4 John Rawls and Moral Philosophy	69
1. The One and the Many	69
2. The Critique of Utilitarianism	7^{2}
3. Hume vs. Kant	$\frac{1}{76}$
4. Moral Constructivism	81

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-71782-3 - The Autonomy of Morality Charles Larmore Frontmatter More information

vi	Contents
 5 The Autonomy of Morality 1. The Problem with Morality 2. Morality and Advantage 3. Instrumentalism and Its Failure 4. Letting Morality Speak for Itself 5. The Ethics of Autonomy 6. Reflection and Reasons 7. Reconceiving the World 8. Reconceiving the Mind 	87 87 91 95 103 105 112 123 129
 PART III POLITICAL PRINCIPLES 6 The Moral Basis of Political Liberalism Introduction Classical and Political Liberalism Political Legitimacy and Moral Respect Rawls' Ambiguities What Habermas and Rawls Share Metaphysics and Politics Habermas' Ideal of Political Autonomy Democracy and Liberalism Freedom and Morality 	139 139 144 146 149 153 155 158 160 164
 7 The Meanings of Political Freedom 1. Three Concepts of Liberty 2. Freedom and Self-Government 3. Freedom and Pluralism 4. Republican vs. Liberal 5. Domination and Respect 	168 169 175 178 184 190
 8 Public Reason 1. Publicity in A Theory of Justice 2. From Publicity to Public Reason 3. The Domain of Public Reason 4. Aims and Exceptions 5. Conclusion 	196 197 203 208 213 219
 PART IV TRUTH AND CHANCE 9 Nietzsche and the Will to Truth Pious and Free Spirits Truth and Morality Deception and Self-deception Truth and Thought Perspectivism Truth as a Goal Overcoming the Ascetic Attitude 	223 223 225 227 230 234 237 243

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-71782-3 - The Autonomy of Morality Charles Larmore Frontmatter More information

Contents	vii
10 The Idea of a Life Plan	246
1. A Philosophical Prejudice	246
2. Ancient Roots	253
3. The Rawlsian Conception	² 59
4. Some Other Objections	262
5. Prudence and Wisdom	268
Index	273

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank Beatrice Rehl, my editor at Cambridge University Press, for her help in the preparation of this volume. My thanks to Ronald Cohen, who edited the manuscript with great care and made many helpful comments and suggestions. I am also indebted to many colleagues and audiences, too numerous to mention, for their comments and criticisms over the years as I wrote and presented various versions of the essays collected here.

Finally, I owe everything to my dear wife Amey, who keeps me going.

All of the previously published essays in this volume have been significantly and extensively revised, and I would like to thank the original publications and publishers that kindly granted me permission to use them here:

Chapter 1, "History and Truth." Originally published in *Daedalus* (summer 2004), pp. 46–55. Copyright © 2004 American Academy of Arts and Sciences. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 2, "Back to Kant? No Way." Originally published in *Inquiry* 46(2) (June 2003), pp. 260–271. Copyright © 2003 Taylor & Francis. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 3, "Attending to Reasons." Originally published in Nicholas Smith (ed.), *Reading McDowell* (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), pp. 193–208. Copyright © 2003 Routledge Ltd. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 4, "John Rawls and Moral Philosophy." Originally published under the title, "Lifting the Veil" in *The New Republic*, 5 February 2001. Copyright © 2003 Charles Larmore. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 5, "The Autonomy of Morality," is new.

х

Acknowledgments

Chapter 6, "The Moral Basis of Political Liberalism." Originally published in *The Journal of Philosophy* 96(12), December 1999, 599–625. Copyright © 1999 *The Journal of Philosophy*. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 7, "The Meanings of Political Freedom." Originally published under the title "A Critique of Philip Pettit's Republicanism" in *Noûs: Philosophical Issues* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001), vol. 11, pp. 229–243. Copyright © 2001 Blackwell. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 8, "Public Reason." Originally published in Samuel Freeman (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Rawls* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 368–393. Copyright © 2003 Cambridge University Press. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 9, "Nietzsche and the Will to Truth." Originally written in German and published under the title "Der Wille zur Wahrheit" in O. Höffe (ed.), *Nietzsche: Zur Genealogie der Moral (Klassiker Auslegen)* (Berlin: Akademie-Verlag, 2004), pp. 163–176. Copyright © 2004 Akademie-Verlag.

Chapter 10, "The Idea of a Life Plan." Originally published in *Social Philosophy & Policy* 16(1), 1999, 96–112. Copyright © 1999 Cambridge University Press. Also published in E. F. Paul et al. (eds.), *Human Flourishing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999). Copyright © 1999 Cambridge University Press. Reprinted with permission.