

KEMAL BASLAR

The Concept of
the Common Heritage of Mankind
in International Law



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

THE HAGUE / BOSTON / LONDON

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements.....	xiii
Abbreviations.....	xv
Table of Treaties	xvii
Introduction.....	xix

PART I

THE CONCEPTUAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE CONCEPT OF THE COMMON HERITAGE OF MANKIND

Chapter One

<i>Philosophical Bases</i>	1
I. A Conceptual Framework.....	1
II. Philosophical Foundations.....	7
A. The Natural Law Tradition: A Retrospective View	9
B. The Resurrection of International Solidarity Through Human Rights	11
C. Natural Law and the Common Heritage of Mankind	13
1. Theological Natural Law Teaches the Stewardship Ethic	14
2. Modern Natural Law and the Common Heritage of Mankind	20
D. Positive Law v. the Common Heritage of Mankind.....	23
III. Lessons to be Learned from Grotian Thought.....	29
A. Grotian Thought and the Freedom of the High Seas.....	30
B. Pardo and the Common Heritage of Mankind: A November Revolution?.....	31

Chapter Two

<i>The Vocabulary of the Common Heritage of Mankind</i>	38
I. What is the Meaning of 'Common'?.....	38
A. The Antecedent of the Common Heritage: <i>Res Communis</i>	40
1. <i>Res Communis Omnium</i>	40
2. <i>Res Extra commercium</i>	41
3. <i>Res Communis Humanitatis</i>	42
B. The Need for a New Regime in International Spaces	43

1. The Technology Parameter	43
2. The Scarcity Parameter	45
C. The Re-examination of the Suitability of the Res Concept	47
1. Common Interest v. Private Interest.....	47
2. Is the Res Approach Plausible?	50
3. The Entitlement Theory of Justice	52
a. The Application of the Provisos to International Spaces	54
b. The Application of the Provisos to National Territories	55
c. Future Generations and the Provisos	56
D. An Alternative Approach to Resource Management	57
1. From an <i>Intragenerational</i> Justice Perspective	57
2. From an <i>Intergenerational</i> Justice Perspective	60
II. The Term 'Heritage' Under the Public Trust Doctrine.....	61
A. From Common Property to Common Heritage	61
B. The Public Trust Doctrine as a Suitable Jacket	65
C. The Identification of the Common Heritages	68
III. Who is 'Mankind'?	70
A. General Remarks	70
B. Definition	72
1. The Present Generation: Interspatial Dimension	74
2. Future Generations: Intertemporal Dimension	76

Chapter Three

<i>The Elements of the Common Heritage of Mankind</i>	79
I. The Conventional Approaches	80
A. The Conventions' Approach	82
B. The Conventional Approach of Publicists	84
II. Tailoring a New Jacket for the Common Heritage of Mankind	85
A. Non-Exclusive Use	85
1. International Spaces	86
2. National Territories	89
B. Planetary Administration.....	91
C. Benefit and Burden-Sharing.....	96
1. Benefit-Sharing	96
2. Burden-Sharing	99
D. Sustainable Management.....	103
E. Peaceful Purposes	105
F. Common Concern of Mankind.....	107
III. Conclusion	112
A. Lessons to be Learned from European Integration	112

Table of Contents

B. An Evaluation of the Elements.....	115
---------------------------------------	-----

Chapter Four

<i>Stewardship Sovereignty and Mankind</i>	117
I. Economic and Ecological Interdependence.....	118
A. New International Economic Disorder	120
B. New Global Ecological Disorder.....	123
C. Two Divergent Policies Towards the Common Heritage of Mankind	124
1. The US Policy	124
2. The Brazilian Policy	129
II. Sovereignty or Mankind?	131
A. A New Dimension: Stewardship Sovereignty.....	136
B. Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources v. the Common Heritage	137
1. The Brazilian Amazon, the PSNR and the Common Heritage	140
III. Two Tentative Solutions.....	146
A. The Rational Hypothetical Consent.....	147
B. Humanitarian Intervention: A First Step in the Establishment of Common Heritage Regimes.....	150
1. Eco-Intervention, Human Rights and Eco-Security: The Amazon Example	152
2. The Application of Eco-Intervention: The Green Helmets are Coming	155

PART II

THE APPLICATION OF THE COMMON HERITAGE OF MANKIND
IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Chapter Five

<i>Outer Space and the Common Heritage of Mankind</i>	159
I. The Common Heritage of Mankind in the Moon Treaty (<i>De Lege Lata</i>)	161
A. Political Differences	161
B. Economic Confrontation	164
C. Legal Reflection	166
1. Non-Appropriation of the Natural Resources of the Moon and Other Celestial Bodies.....	166

2. International Management.....	170
3. Equitable Sharing of Benefits.....	171
4. Sustainable Management	174
II. The Common Heritage of Mankind and the Moon Treaty (<i>De Lege Ferenda</i>)	175
A. Political and Economic Realities.....	175
B. Legal Expectations	179
1. The Problem of Non-Appropriation.....	179
2. International Management.....	181
3. Equitable Sharing	185
III. Other Natural Resources not Covered by the Moon Treaty	190
A. The Geostationary Orbit (GSO)	191
1. Non-Exclusive Use.....	193
2. International Management.....	194
3. Equitable Sharing	195
4. Sustainable Management	196
B. Other Orbital Positions.....	197
1. The Low Earth Orbit (LEO).....	197
2. The La Grange Positions (L-5s).....	198
C. Solar Energy	199
IV. Conclusion.....	201

Chapter Six

<i>The Law of the Sea and the Common Heritage of Mankind</i>	205
I. The Common Heritage and the Law of the Sea Convention (<i>De Lege Lata</i>)	206
A. Singling Out the Elements of the Common Heritage of Mankind from Part XI: A Textual Approach	206
B. Part XI: An Ideological Battleground of the NIEO.....	210
C. The 1994 Agreement: A Triumph of Liberalism	216
1. The Road to the Agreement	216
2. The Agreement in Hindsight.....	218
II. The Common Heritage and a New World Ocean Order (<i>De Lege Ferenda</i>)	221
A. The Common Heritage: Transcending Part XI.....	221
B. The Vertical Dimension: An Examination of the EEZ	221
1. Fish Stocks	229
2. Protection of the Marine Environment from Pollution.	235
C. The Horizontal Dimension: The Continental Shelf.....	238
D. Revitalizing the Common Heritage of Mankind	239

Table of Contents

Chapter Seven

<i>Antarctica and the Common Heritage of Mankind</i>	243
I. Introduction.....	243
II. The Antarctic Treaty System: A Viable System?.....	244
A. The First Stage: Antarctic Aristocratic Club (1959–1982)	245
B. The Second Stage: Oligarchic Rule (1982–1991).....	247
C. The Third Stage: Towards International Democracy (1991– Onwards)	249
D. An Assessment of the ATS: Justice and Common Interest.....	250
1. The Achievements of the ATS	250
2. The Failures of the ATS	253
a. The International Lawyers' Dilemma: The Legal Status	253
b. The Lack of Equity and Justice	254
c. The Lack of Universality	255
III. Alternative Management Systems for Antarctica.....	256
A. The United Nations' Involvement in Antarctica.....	257
B. The World Park Idea	258
IV. The Common Heritage and Antarctica.....	261
A. Non-Exclusive Use.....	266
B. International Administration	269
C. Sharing of Benefits and Burdens.....	272
V. Conclusion.....	274

Chapter Eight

<i>International Environmental Law and the Common Heritage of Mankind</i>	277
I. Preliminary Remarks.....	277
II. From Conceptual Anarchy to Clarity	280
A. In Terms of Scope	280
B. In Terms of Content	282
III. The Elements of the Common Heritage for the Protection of Resources and Areas.....	284
IV. The Common Concern of Mankind.....	287
A. The CCM as a Concept of Joint Action	287
B. The CCM as a Political Concept:	289
C. The CCM as a Concept of Burden Sharing:	290
D. The CCM as a Concept of Locus Standi	291

The Concept of the Common Heritage of Mankind in International Law

E. The CCM as a Concept Free from Non-Appropriation Connotations.....	292
F. The CCM as a Synonym of the Common Heritage of Mankind	293
G. The CCM as a Substratum of 'Common Interest'	294
V. Preservation of the Cultural Heritages of Mankind.....	296
A. The Concept of Cultural Property of Mankind.....	296
B. The Concept of World Cultural Heritages	298
VI. The Atmosphere and the Climate Change.....	304
VII. Biodiversity Resources.....	307
VIII. Living Resources.....	310
IX. Conclusion.....	314

Chapter Nine

*International Human Rights Law and the Common Heritage
of Mankind*

.....	318
I. Introduction.....	318
II. The Third Generation of Human Rights.....	319
A. The Right to the Common Heritage of Mankind.....	321
B. The Relationship Between the Right to the Common Heritage of Mankind and Other Human Rights.....	322
1. The Right to Life.....	322
2. The Right to Development.....	323
3. The Right to Peace	324
4. The Right to Self Determination	325
5. The Right to Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources	326
6. The Right to Environment.....	327
7. The Right to Food	327
8. The Right to Communicate	328
III. The Common Heritage of Mankind, Humanitarian Intervention and Advancement of Universal Human Rights.....	329
IV. Conclusion.....	332

Chapter Ten

<i>The Legal Status of the Common Heritage of Mankind</i>	335
I. Preliminary Overview.....	335
A. The First Parameter: The West v. the Rest.....	336

Table of Contents

B. The Second Parameter: The Market Economy v. the Common Heritage of Mankind.....	338
II. Traditional View.....	340
A. The Problem of Definition	341
B. Formalist International Lawyers	344
III. Traditional Sources of International Law	347
A. Conventions and the Common Heritage	348
1. Global Conventions.....	348
2. Regional Conventions	349
3. Bilateral Conventions.....	350
B. Customary International Law	350
C. General Principles of Law and Equity.....	352
D. The International Court of Justice	354
E. The Opinions of Publicists	355
IV. Other Sources of International Law	357
A. The Need to Refer to Alternative Sources	357
B. General Assembly Resolutions	359
C. International Organizations and NGOs	362
V. Jus Cogens.....	363
VI. Neither Apology nor Utopia: Back to the Eclectic Philosophy.....	367

Appraisal

I. The Common Heritage: 'Res Indian?'	371
II. Towards 'Planetary Resources Management Law'	374
III. The Common Heritage: Pardo's Box?	379

Selected Bibliography

I. Articles	382
II. Books	410
III. Relevant Theses and Dissertations.....	417
<i>Index</i>	420