Student Articles   **Student Scholarship**

2006

The "Data Slant": Why Lack of Media Generated by Minority Users Online Is an Offline Problem

Laura R. Rochet
Indiana University Maurer School of Law

JEROME HALL LAW LIBRARY
INDIANA UNIVERSITY
Maurer School of Law
Bloomington

The "Data Slant": Why Lack of Media Generated by Minority Users Online Is an Offline Problem

Laura R. Rochet

Laura R. Rochet is an associate instructor in the Department of Telecommunications at Indiana University Bloomington, as well as the senior articles editor of volume 59 of the Federal Communications Law Journal, the official journal of the Federal Communications Bar Association. Her communications experience ranges from spectrum management research for the National Telecommunications and Information Administration in the U.S. Department of Commerce to media relations coordination for the Congressional Hispanic Caucus Institute. Presently, Rochet is a 2008 joint-degree candidate at the Indiana University School of Law, pursuing her J.D. and M.A. in telecommunications.

Abstract

User-generated media, such as blogs, vlogs, and podcasts, are rapidly becoming an integral aspect of political and commercial discourse. However, the information derived from this media is fundamentally biased due to the disproportionately low amount of minority user-generated media on the Web. In order to correct what I term the "data slant," politicians and commercial entities must seek information from minorities offline to supplement data derived from user-generated media online, or markedly increase investment in measures designed to bridge the digital divide—the primary source of the data slant problem. Failure to act will lead to the neglect of a significant portion of potential consumers and constituents because of the inevitable effects of online activities upon the offline world.

Introduction

As society continues its transition into the digital age, it should be no surprise that online activities increasingly influence the offline world. These online activities, specifically user-generated media such as blogs, vlogs, and podcasts, are rapidly becoming an integral aspect of political as well as commercial discourse. David Bohrman, CNN's Washington bureau chief, told MiamiHerald.com on 1 November 2006, "[M]ost of the political dialogue in this country is happening online, so if you don't incorporate that into your coverage, you're missing a major element. Moreover, commercial advertising expenditures "on user-generated online media is forecast to grow at a compound annual rate of 106.1 percent from 2005 to 2010, reaching $757 million in 2010" (PQ Media 2006). This is due in part to services such as Nielsen BuzzMetrics, which analyze user-generated media for the specific purpose of leveraging that information to the benefit of their clients.

However, the usefulness of the information derived from user-generated media is contentious. I argue that what could be exceptionally valuable data is fundamentally biased and skewed, an outcome owing to the disproportionately low amount of minority user-generated media on the Web. Therefore, as reliance upon this inaccurate information proliferates, commercial entities and politicians neglect a significant portion of potential consumers and constituents because of the inevitable effects of online activities upon the offline world.

In order to correct what I term the "data slant," politicians and commercial entities must actively seek information from minorities offline to supplement data derived from user-generated media online, or markedly increase investment in measures designed to bridge the digital divide—the primary source of the data slant problem. Ultimately, without political and commercial intervention, failure to remedy the data slant will likely lead to long-term economic, political, and social consequences.

This paper is organized into four sections. The first section provides an overview of the most common forms of user-generated media, the demographics of its producers, and notable instances of its growing influence beyond the Web. Second, I briefly describe the digital divide—the primary source of the data slant problem—and highlight the significance of Internet access. Accordingly, the third section considers the likely economic and political consequences of failure to address the data slant. The fourth section discusses potential uses for user-generated media (UGM) within the Latino community and its resultant internal and external effects. The final section offers recommendations concerning offline data supplementation and outlines past proposals to overcome the digital divide.

User-Generated Media: What Is It? Who Does It? And Why Should You Care?

Blogs, Vlogs, and Podcasts

UGM encompasses the content developed and circulated by users on the Web. The most prominent forms of this type of online expression include blogs, vlogs, and podcasts.

Presently, the most pervasive form of UGM is the blog. A *Web log*, as it was originally named, "describe[d] the simple web pages people made to post links to interesting sites that they had found while surfing the Web" (Kuhns and Crew 2005, 5). Web logs gained momentum in the mid-1990s and became known as "blogs" in 1998, due to a Web log post by Peter Merholz, president and founding partner of the San Francisco-based consulting firm Adaptive Path (Kuhns and Crew 2005, 5). Within three years of the term's creation, blog "became the most consulted term in the Merriam Webster dictionary" (7th Society and Information Technologies Encounter).

With the help of publishing platforms such as Blogger.com and LiveJournal, the popularity of blogging—the "process of posting a text journal entry (to your own . . . blog page) or contributing a comment or response as a visitor (to another person's . . . blog)"—steadily rose (Dagys and Hedtke 2006, 220). Yet it was not until September 11 and the subsequent wars in the Middle East that bloggers—people who contribute to blogs—became an undeniable force (Kuhns and Crew 2005, 6).

By 2004, "politicians, corporations, and consultants began using [blogs] as tools for influencing opinion or spreading a specific message," going so far as to "grant bloggers access as bona fide journalists" to "both the Democratic and Republican National Conventions" (Kuhns and Crew 2005, 6). Today, according to Technorati, a search engine for blogs, "there are over 175,000 new blogs . . . [created] every day. Bloggers update their blogs regularly to the tune of over 1.6 million posts per day, or over eighteen updates a second."

Oftentimes incorporated into blogs, podcasts are the audio (and sometimes video) form of UGM. A podcast (coined from the combination of the words *iPod* and *broadcast*) is a digital audio broadcast, which a user can download to any device supporting MP3 files, such as an iPod, a computer, or a PDA. Similar to the blog, "in 2005, the *New Oxford American Dictionary* declared 'podcast' the word of the year" (Madden 2006). Podcasting involves "posting an audio entry . . . or listening to the podcast audio on a Weblog" or Web site (Dagys and Hedtke 2006, 224). There are countless uses for podcasts in addition to general entertainment. For example, at the Museum Podcast Tours at PodTrip, tourists can download museum tours onto their portable media devices and explore at their own pace instead of depending on costly tour guides.

Closely related to podcasting, a vlog is the video counterpart of a blog. Vloggers create, post, and watch videos (with or without sound) on blogs or Web sites like MySpace and Yahoo! (Dagys and Hedtke 2006, 227). Like blogs and podcasts, vlog subject matter ranges anywhere from sports, as in Kate Troescher's Kate on Sports; to news, like Joanne Colan's Rocketboom; to comedy, as on the Web site You Got Questions, Ninja Got Answers; to the war in Iraq, like Alive in Baghdad. In the fall of 2006, this form of UGM received a great deal of press coverage, due in part to Google's $1.65 billion purchase of YouTube in October of 2006, a mere twenty months after YouTube's founding, as noted by Paul La Monica in an article for CNNMoney. YouTube is a self-proclaimed "consumer media company," and according to Ellen Lee in the 10 October 2006 *San Francisco Chronicle*, "on any given day, YouTube plays more than 100 million clips, drawing a greater viewership than many cable television channels."

Content Creators by the Numbers

Nielsen//NetRatings (2006) estimates that "overall internet penetration in the United States has stabilized over the past few years, reaching 74 percent of homes in February 2006." This suggests that roughly 220 million Americans access the Internet from home, while other sources indicate the range is more likely between 146 million, as stated by the European Travel Commission, and 207 million (Miniwatts Marketing Group). According to a 2004 survey by the Pew Internet and American Life Project, of those Americans with Web access, "44 percent . . . [had] created content for the online world through building or posting to Web sites, creating blogs, and sharing files" (Lenhart, Horrigan, and Fallows 2004).

In addition, Pew found that 77 percent of all UGM creators are White (see Table 1), despite the higher propensity of Blacks and Latinos to generate online content (see Table 2). Interestingly, as Table 1 displays, Pew's survey indicated that while Web users with incomes of $75,000 and above are the most likely to generate content, the probability of Web users to generate online content from the three lower

income levels was relatively equal (Lenhart, Horrigan, and Fallows 2004; Horrigan 2006).

Another characteristic of those most likely to generate online content is that the majority of these users have home broadband access. As defined by the FCC, the "term 'broadband' refers to advanced communications systems capable of providing high-speed transmission of services such as data, voice, and video over the internet and other networks." Pew researchers observed a "significant statistical association between having a home broadband connection and users' putting content online" (Horrigan 2006). Consequently, the Government Accountability Office's (2006) conclusion that "White households are more likely to purchase broadband service than households of other races" further reduces the probability of online media arising from minority users.

I do not include the Asian American and Pacific Islander demographic group when referring to "minorities" throughout this paper because this group has the "highest level of home Internet access at 56.8 percent, compared to a national rate of 41.5 percent" (Kuttan and Peters 2003, 26). Therefore, the digital divide does not affect the ability of Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders to generate online media.

Electioneering, Corporate Libel, and Other Fun Things to Do Online

Political bloggers were described by K. Daniel Glover and Mike Essl as "the pamphleteers of the 21st century" in a 3 December 2006 article in the *New York Times* and are, according to Jeanne Cummings in the 14 October 2003 *Wall Street Journal*, an entity whose "effect is a never-ending virtual town-hall meeting." As such, they irrefutably receive the most offline attention compared to other users generating online media. As noted by Anne Kornblut in a 5 November 2006 *New York Times* article, since the advent of the campaign blog in 2003, the "movement known as the netroots—that amalgam of bloggers and online fund-raisers—has grown more forceful with every election cycle." An October 2006 AP-AOL news poll, as reported on 27 October 2006 by Laurie Sullivan of TechWeb Technology News, "suggested that some 35 percent of Americans, or 43 percent of likely voters, go online for election information," and nearly a quarter of the poll's respondents reported visiting a political blog.

The proven efficiency of UGM concerning online fund raisers continues to spur political investment online. Specifically, Web fund raisers "net . . . at least ninety-five cents for every dollar given" versus direct mailings and banquet events, which net seventy-five cents and thirty cents, respectively, as Cummings's *Wall Street Journal* article notes. In recognition of this high rate of return, governors, members of Congress, and "potential presidential hopefuls like Hillary Rodham Clinton and John McCain," actively campaign on the Web, even hiring bloggers as consultants to maneuver their online efforts according to Glover and Essl. The rising incidence of these hiring practices compelled Markos Moulitsas Zúniga, founder of the Daily Kos, one of the most popular political blogs in the blogosphere, to explicitly state on his page:

> I don't consult now. I haven't consulted since 2004. I don't plan on consulting in the future. I don't want to consult . . . Did I mention I'm not a consultant,

and will not be a consultant in the future? Because if I didn't, let me make clear—I'm not a consultant. And I won't be.

Aside from offline political effects, UGM concerning products and services increasingly influence the business world, sometimes resulting in devastating consequences. For example, in 2004, bloggers discovered "industry-leading Kryptonite-brand bike lock[s]" could be opened with a Bic pen, and began posting videos on vlogs and online forums to demonstrate how to pick the lock (Neuhaus 2005). Accordingly, offline media caught wind of the bloggers' findings, further publicizing the defect. As a consequence, Ingersoll Rand, the parent company of Kryptonite received the Grand Prize for "Dumbest Moment of 2004" (Horowitz 2005) and claim on their site to have replaced over 380,000 locks and lost several million dollars. Videos illustrating the simplicity of Kryptonite lock-picking remain available on YouTube today.

In November 2006, PodTech, an online marketing company specializing in "customized social media services," hosted the Vloggies, an award ceremony "celebrating achievement in vlogs and online video." With over six hundred nominees and seventy award categories ranging from Best Cooking Vlog to Best Instructional/Educational Vlog, the ceremony was such a success that Podtech has scheduled the Second Annual Vloggies and chosen to move the event from San Francisco to Los Angeles.

As reported by Laura Blum in a 14 November 2006 article for the AdWeek Web site, in recognition of the talent behind Rocketboom, a Vloggie award-winning news vlog, the ABC network hired Amanda Congdon, Rocketboom's former anchor. Rocketboom is self-described as "currently one of the most popular [vlogs] on the Internet with more daily subscribers for original syndicated multi-media content than nearly any other site, including podcasts." HBO has also recruited Congdon to develop a comedy show.

In contrast to Congdon's positive offline interactions, vlogger Josh Wolf has been in and out of jail since July 2006 for "refusing to turn over video he took at an anticapitalist protest" and refusing to testify concerning crimes committed at the protest, as reported in a 8 July 2005 post on Wolf's eponymous Web site and by Jesse McKinley in the 2 August 2006 New York Times. As of this writing, he maintains his vlog, The Revolution Will Be Televised—winner of the Most Controversial Vlog award—from a federal correctional facility in Dublin, CA.

The Digital Divide: In This Case, Quantity Does Equal Quality

As the primary cause of the data slant, the digital divide signifies "the gap between those who can effectively use communication and information tools such as the internet and those who cannot." (Edwards 2005, 585). There is an innumerable amount of information concerning the subject of the digital divide, which "is usually measured in terms of personal computer ownership and Internet access" (Kuttan and Peters 2003, 5). In consideration of that fact I limit this discussion to one aspect of the problem, the disparity between those with and those without Internet access. Ultimately, as more Whites have Internet access or, more

significantly, broadband Internet access, Whites constitute a substantial majority of the users generating online content.

In order to define the data slant, one must compare the biased Web (the present Internet population resulting from the digital divide) with a nonbiased Web (the Internet population absent from the digital divide). The biased Web leads to an overrepresentation of Whites among online content creators, whereas the demographics of a nonbiased Web would likely reflect that of the offline population. Thus, while minorities as a demographic group are relatively more likely to generate online content, as suggested above, the biased Web leads to the diminished presence of minority UGM online relative to its potential presence were there no digital divide. Therefore, as long as the digital divide persists, data derived from UGM will be distorted.

While attributing the lack of minority UGM online to Web access may appear overly simplistic, basic principles of economic efficiency dictate that minimal demand warrants an equally minimal supply. Thus, the disproportionately low numbers of minorities with Web access presumably demand an equally low supply of minority-user-generated media. In contrast, a 2005 offline poll "by the New California Media, a national association of more than 700 ethnic media organizations, found that nearly half of U.S. minorities . . . prefer ethnic media to mainstream media," according to a 28 July 2005 article by Joyce King on the *USA Today* Web site. Offline, despite this high demand for minority-generated media, substantial barriers to entry such as access to capital and federal licensing inhibit the provision of a corresponding supply.

If decisions based upon data derived from UGM had solely online effects, use of that data would be appropriate because it is functionally representative of the likelihood of the present online population to create content. Yet with the rising number of decisions based upon this data affecting the offline world?such as the migration of market research surveys to the Web, as advocated by Bradley Johnson on 17 July 2006 in *Advertising Age*, and, most significantly, the increasing adoption of Internet voting, which a 23 January 2004 editorial in the *New York Times* warns against?the data slant threatens to cause commercial and political neglect of prospective consumers and constituents. Aside from offline data supplementation, only a combined effort by political and commercial entities to invest in increasing opportunities for Web access and methods of overcoming the digital divide will cure the data slant.

Indisputably, the digital divide is a multi-faceted issue. Apart from access limitations, the following are a number of other factors affecting the future of the digital divide:

> (1) the quality of . . . the telecommunications network; (2) the capacity of computing devices, such as computers and modems; (3) pricing systems for online access; (4) content and services; (5) relationship of users to internet service providers; (6) issues of technological literacy and the degree of support and facilitation available for new [information and communication technology] users; and (7) overarching national and international policies toward internet access and use, such as support for

computing in schools and universities, universal service obligations for telecommunications service providers, or measures to promote more equitable access to information resources globally (Flew 2005, 74).

Dollars and Sense: The Perils of Failure to Remedy the Data Slant

Political Action Based on Biased Data

The likely consequence of failure to cure the data slant in the political realm is the exclusion of minorities from new forms of civic engagement. Coverage and incorporation of the political views and actions of a small, yet rapidly expanding, sector of the Web population into television newscasts, newspaper editorials, and other forms of offline media makes the influence of UGM on politics irrefutable. Politicians should actively seek information from minorities offline to supplement data derived from UGM online because this data increasingly influences campaign strategies and ultimately the way people vote.

A prime example of the data slant resulting in the exclusion of minorities from new forms of civic participation arose during the 2003 presidential primaries. In a interview on the 5 August 2003 *News Hour with Jim Lehrer*, former Vermont governor Howard Dean explained,

> We have the most advanced Internet campaign in the country. We have 34,000 volunteers all over the country because of the Internet. The next biggest campaign has 1,300. [Yet] we have a disproportionate number of White middle-class kids, because the Internet does not reach enough people in the Latino and the African American community.

Dean's initial campaign success drew largely from his partnership with Meetup.com—"a Web tool for forming social groups"—and "the help . . . of hundreds of bloggers." Dean used the Web "to organize thousands of volunteers who go door-to-door, write personal letters to likely voters, host meetings, and distribute flyers" (Wolf 2004).

In November 2003, the Michigan Democratic Party chose to offer constituents the opportunity to vote online. Its action received a great deal of criticism from the press, several members of the Michigan Democratic Party, and a number of Michigan voters, who argued that the plan "create[d] a clear and colossal digital divide between those who have easy Internet access and those who do not." One Black DNC member from Lansing said to *USA Today*, "Internet voting puts the party's most reliable constituency—Blacks and the poor—at a disadvantage," according to a 20 November 2003 article by Nedra Pickler. Although a number of the Democratic candidates objected to the plan, Howard Dean did not, owing to his strong online following. Hence, as more states adopt online voting, candidates, like Dean, may increasingly concentrate on online campaigns, which will further exclude minorities from these new forms of civic engagement.

Commercial Action Based on Biased Data

Commercial entities must actively seek information from minorities offline to supplement data derived from UGM online or risk neglecting potential consumers. Consumers no longer consider a company's CEO its "most credible source of information." Today, "a person like me" is the consumer's preferred source,

"according to a survey of 2,000 'opinion leaders' by PR firm Edelman" (Boyle 2006). What "a person like me" refers to is that consumers increasingly trust recommendations from colleagues, word of mouth, and "peer-to-peer dialogue among consumers and [rank-and-file] employees" over the statements of a CEO, as described by Derek Creevey in an article posted 23 January 2006 on the Edelman News Web site. Due to this shift, as Pete Blackshaw describes in his 28 June 2005 Clickz.com post, corporate entities are utilizing blogs, "industry or interest-focused" message boards and forums, and review and ratings Web sites, where "consumers combine online reviews with aggregated ratings about product and services," to connect with and to understand their customers (Nielsen BuzzMetrics).

If consumers are largely influencing each other's buying patterns through these online communities, and market research companies such as Nielsen//NetRatings are leveraging that information to the benefit of their clients, then the effectiveness of that information is most likely limited to consumers with Web access. DoubleClick, a service used by online market researchers, maintains that its ad server reports "include a relatively small subset of the total universe of U.S. Internet users in a panel from which they can make statistically reliable projections about the characteristics of the whole audience" (Bruner and Koegel 2005). Yet commercial entities remain skeptical. Seth Diamond, director of Consumer Insights and Strategy at Kraft Foods, explains to Johnson in the 17 July 2006 *Advertising Age* article, "Online is not a solution in and of itself to all of our business challenges . . . but it does expand our toolkit."

While corporations such as Kraft alleviate the potential neglect of offline consumers due to the data slant, saving money continues to motivate marketers to shift from offline to online research. Some marketers, according to Johnson, claim to "cut costs 15 to 20 percent by moving from mail surveys to online and about 30 percent by shifting from phone surveys to online." In the words of Laurence Gold, the editor and publisher of the newsletter *Inside Research*, as quoted in Advertising Age, "Faster. Cheaper. It boils down to that."

User-Generated Media and the Latino Community

User-generated online media present the Latino community with virtually limitless opportunities for self-expression, at a level unattainable in the offline world. Through UGM, Latinos may produce short films or engage in photojournalism on vlogs; they may maintain discussion forums or message boards in order to facilitate communication between family, friends, or the curious Web surfer; or they may create podcasts to expose listeners to musical artists that radio conglomerates fail to play on their limited play lists. Most significantly, Latino bloggers may offer perspectives on issues neglected by traditional news media, due to the unrestricted nature of UGM subject matter.

In a Google search for "immigration blog," the first ten results produce only one Web site semi-supportive of immigrants—the online opinion presence of the *Los Angeles Times*—while the rest link to either immigration attorneys or Web sites similar to the first result—FOX News contributor Michelle Malkin's Immigration Blog, an anti-immigrant blog featuring links to similar blogs such as

DeportAliens.com. According to Google, found the largest and most popular search engine on the Web by SearchEngineWatch.com, "important, high-quality sites receive a higher PageRank"—Google's system for ranking Web pages— "which Google remembers each time it conducts a search." Thus, Google's search results indicate that blogs offering anti-immigration content are ostensibly more important and of higher quality than those lower on the results list. Absent the digital divide, these search results would likely change, particularly because of minorities' inclination to generate online content.

In addition, politicians could benefit from a rise in UGM produced by Latinos because it may help define what many consider an "elusive" voting bloc and subsequently increase civic participation among the Latino community, as Sandra Nygaard notes in a 28 August 2003 article for the Medill News Service. Moreover, Latino candidates could use the Web to help finance their campaigns and connect with potential voters through UGM. Defining this demographic group through deriving data from UGM will also benefit online marketing firms, such as Carrera Ecommerce, that specialize in multicultural marketing. Perhaps, like Amanda Congdon's success, popular online media generated by Latinos will find its way offline, leading to new employment opportunities and increased coverage minority viewpoints.

Recommendations and Realizations

Essentially, seeking information from minorities offline to supplement data derived from UGM online, or markedly increasing investment in measures designed to bridge the digital divide, are the likely remedies to the data slant. This final section offers recommendations concerning offline data supplementation and outlines past proposals by which to overcome the digital divide.

Enhancing Information Derived From UGM Through Offline Resources

First, commercial entities and politicians must acquire information to supplement the data derived from UGM. One option available to supplement both political and commercial data is the provision of free, promotional, or subsidized Internet access targeted at minorities. These online sessions could expose the user to new products or candidates, allow the user the opportunity to generate online media, or simply track user search habits. Additionally, partnerships with electronics or software manufacturers and Internet service providers in providing these sessions would decrease the financial burden on politicians and spread the risk for corporations.

Another potential means by which to supplement information derived from UGM, already practiced by a number of corporations, is the continued funding of offline surveys. As long as UGM remains dominated by White users, decisions based upon the information derived from such media will be less effective offline. Commercial and political entities must not rely solely on online researchers until the Web better reflects the offline world. Further, as other states begin offering online voting, politicians must be careful not to develop campaigns depending largely on information from those with Web access or risk further excluding minorities from civic participation.

Past Policy Recommendations Concerning the Digital Divide

For years, scholars, researchers, and legislators have offered solutions for over-coming the digital divide. As access is the largest barrier to minority users generating content, bridging the digital divide is the central means by which to cure the data slant. The following are the leading policy options for overcoming the digital divide in abbreviated form:

1. Let the market fix the problem

2. Government action

3. Rely on philanthropy and community action

4. Private/public partnerships (Kuttan and Peters 2003, 141–154)

While each of these options on its own or in combination would probably lead to universal access in the long term, an emphasis upon providing Web access to minorities in the short term is necessary in order to reduce the data slant. Online UGM frequently and significantly affects the offline world, and the data slant will persist as long as the digital divide inhibits minorities from meaningfully con-tributing to UGM. As long as commercial and political entities make decisions based on information derived from UGM, it is in their best interest economically and politically to ensure that data is not biased.

In the end, the ease with which Web users may create and share media online rel-ative to the offline world is unprecedented. This content, created for the people and by the people, is rapidly becoming an integral aspect of political and commer-cial discourse. As long as the ability of creating such content is not widespread, skepticism must accompany choices based upon information drawn from it. Thus, politicians and commercial entities must actively seek information from minorities offline to supplement data derived from UGM online or markedly increase invest-ment in measures designed to bridge the digital divide. Without such intervention, the data slant will persist.

References

7th Society and Information Technologies Encounter. Speakers: Peter Merholz. http://www.clienteper-dido.cl/expositores/expo_merh_en.php (accessed 30 November 2006).

Boyle, Matthew. 2006. Do's and Don'ts of Corporate Blogging. *Fortune Magazine*, February 28.

Bruner, Rick E., and Kathryn Koegel. 2005. Target Demographics, Before and After: New Methodologies for Matching Pre-Campaign Audience Plans with Post-Campaign Ad Serving Reports.. Doubleclick.com. http://www.doubleclick.com/us/knowledge_central/documents/RESEARCH/dc_tar-getdemo_0506.pdf (accessed 16 January 2007).

Dagys, Andrew, and John Hedtke. 2006. *Podcasting Now! Audio Your Way*. Boston: Thomson Course Technology PTR.

Edwards, Yolanda D. 2005. Looking Beyond the Digital Divide. *Federal Communications Law Journal* 57: 585–92.

Flew, Terry. 2005. *New Media: An Introduction*. 2nd ed. South Melbourne, Australia: Oxford University Press.

Horowitz, Adam. 2005. 101 Dumbest Moments in Business. *Business 2.0*, January 1.

Horrigan, John. 2006. *Home Broadband Adoption 2006*. Pew Internet and American Life Project. http://www.pewinternet.org/pdfs/PIP_Broadband_trends2006.pdf.

Kuhns, Peter, and Adrienne Crew. 2005. *Blogosphere: Best of Blogs*. Indianapolis: Que   Publishing.

Kuttan, Appu, and Laurence Peters. 2003. *From Digital Divide to Digital Opportunity*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, Inc.

Lenhart, Amanda, John Horrigan, and Deborah Fallows. 2004. *Content Creation Online*. Pew Internet & American Life Project. http://www.pewinternet.org/pdfs/PIP_Content_Creation_Report.pdf.

Madden, Mary. 2006. *Podcast Downloading*. Pew Internet & American Life Project. http://www.pewinternet.org/pdfs/PIP_Podcasting.pdf (accessed 1 December 2006).

Neuhaus, Cable. 2005. The Rise of the Consumer-Generated Media Machine. *Media Magazine*, April.

Nielsen BuzzMetrics. *Get Smart Guide: Quick Consumer-generated Media Vocabulary at Your Fingertips*. http://www.nielsenbuzzmetrics.com/downloads/collateral/NBZM_GetSmartGuide.pdf (accessed 30 November 2006).

Nielsen//NetRatings. Two-Thirds of Active U.S. Web Population Using Broadband, Up 28 Percent Year-Over-Year to an All-Time High, According to Nielsen//NetRatings. http://www.nielsennetratings.com/pr/pr_060314.pdf (accessed 10 December 2006).

PQ Media. New PQ Media Report: Blog, Podcast, RSS Advertising Grow Fastest Among Alternative Media, Surging 198% in 2005 and Forecast to Grow 145% in 2006. http://www.pqmedia.com/about-press-20060411-amrs1.html (accessed 1 December 2006).

U.S. Government Accountability Office. 2006. *Broadband Deployment Is Extensive Throughout the United States, But It Is Difficult to Assess the Extent of Deployment Gaps in Rural Areas*. Washington, DC. http://www.gao.gov/new.items/d06426.pdf.

Wolf, Gary. 2004. How the Internet Invented Howard Dean. *Wired Magazine*, January.

Who Creates Content

The Percentage of Online Content Creators Who Come From Each Demographic Group	
Men	51%
Women	49%
Race/Ethnicity	
Whites	77%
Blacks	9%
Hispanics	9%
Household Income	
Less than $30,000	19%
$30,000–$50,000	21%
$50,000–$75,000	17%
$75,000+	31%

Source: Lenhart, Horrigan, and Fallows 2004. N for Internet users = 1,555. Margin of error is ±3 percent.

A Portrait of Those Who Post Content Online

The Percentage of Internet Users in Each Group Who Have Done at Least One of the Following Online: Shared Something They Created Themselves Like a Story or a Video, Created Their Own Web Page, Worked on Others' Web Pages, or Created a Blog	
	Percent Who Are Content Creators
Gender	
Men	37%
Women	32%
Race/Ethnicity	
White (not Hispanic)	32%
Black (not Hispanic)	39%
Hispanic (English speaking)	42%
Household Income	
Less than $30,000	32%
$30,000–$50,000	32%
$50,000–$75,000	33%
$75,000+	41%

Source: Horrigan 2006. N for Internet users = 1,931.

1 **Abel Ramirez,** *Metroplex,* **2004. Acrylic on Wood; 4' x 3'.**
Latino Art Museum

"This work is for the visually literate. It is for the enhancement of your living space and for the sheer pleasure of viewing."

Origin of artist: Chicano

The arts are commonly considered a form of entertainment, a medium of expression produced to please the senses. Indeed, art is revered around the world as a means to communicate, stimulate, celebrate, appreciate, and articulate what words cannot.

  Few, however, realize the significance of art when used as a policy tool. Thomas L. Birch, writing in the 2002 issue of the online newsletter for the National Association of State Arts Agencies, describes the efficacy of art as a tool for policy makers "in improving student learning, in building a strong workforce, in developing America's creative industries, and in offering positive alternatives to troubled youth." Investing even minimally in the arts can "strengthen the economy . . . by promoting tourism, revitalizing the core commercial district, and attracting business to expand local job opportunities."

2 **Mario Gee Lopez,** *Funky Donkeys,* **2007. Acrylic on Canvas; 10' x 4'.**
Latino Art Museum

"My new art creations are part of my colorful past childhood."

Origin of artist: Honduran

The artwork featured here comes from the Latino Art Museum, a not-for-profit organization located in Pomona, CA, created to promote the works of talented Latin American contemporary artists living in the United States. Its mission is to instill a sense of appreciation for Latino art in the minds and hearts of children and adults.

3 **Graciela Horne Nardi,** *Tango IV*, **2005. Oil on Wood; 22" x 19".**
Latino Art Museum

"Art is like good vintage that ripens well in passion."

Origin of artist: Argentine

The staff of the Harvard Journal of Hispanic Policy chose pieces that represent a microcosm of the diversity that exists within the U.S. Hispanic community. These paintings serve as a reminder that the policies discussed in this volume affect individuals from diverse geographical locations with diverse interests and diverse histories. We at the journal plan to continue featuring the vibrancy of Latino artwork in subsequent years.

3