

Cambridge University Press
0521539366 - Elements of Justice
David Schmitz
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Elements of Justice

What is justice? Questions of justice are questions about what people are due, but what that means in practice depends on context. Depending on context, the formal question of what people are due is answered by principles of desert, reciprocity, equality, or need. Justice, thus, is a constellation of elements that exhibit a degree of integration and unity, but the integrity of justice is limited, in a way that is akin to the integrity of a neighborhood. A *theory* of justice is a map of that neighborhood.

David Schmitz is Professor of Philosophy, joint Professor of Economics, and Director of the Program in Philosophy of Freedom at the University of Arizona. He is the author of *Rational Choice and Moral Agency* and coauthor, with Robert Goodin, of *Social Welfare and Individual Responsibility*. He is editor of *Robert Nozick* and coeditor, with Elizabeth Willott, of *Environmental Ethics: What Really Matters, What Really Works*. His lectures on justice have taken him to twenty countries and six continents.

Cambridge University Press
0521539366 - Elements of Justice
David Schmitz
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Elements of Justice

DAVID SCHMITZ

University of Arizona



Cambridge University Press
 0521539366 - Elements of Justice
 David Schmitz
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521831642

© David Schmitz 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Schmitz, David.
 Elements of Justice / David Schmitz.
 p. cm.
 Includes bibliographical references and index.
 ISBN 0-521-83164-4 (hardback) – ISBN 0-521-53936-6 (pbk.)
 1. Justice (Philosophy) I. Title.
 B105.J87S35 2006
 172'.2-dc22 2005011489

ISBN-13 978-0-521-83164-2 hardback
 ISBN-10 0-521-83164-4 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-53936-4 paperback
 ISBN-10 0-521-53936-6 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
 the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
 third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication
 and does not guarantee that any content on such
 Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page vii</i>
PART 1 WHAT IS JUSTICE?	
1 The Neighborhood of Justice	3
2 The Basic Concept	7
3 A Variety of Contestants	13
4 Contextual Functionalism	17
5 What Is Theory?	21
PART 2 HOW TO DESERVE	
6 Desert	31
7 What Did I Do to Deserve This?	34
8 Deserving a Chance	40
9 Deserving and Earning	50
10 Grounding Desert	55
11 Desert as Institutional Artifact	62
12 The Limits of Desert	66
PART 3 HOW TO RECIPROCATE	
13 Reciprocity	73
14 What Is Reciprocity?	75
15 Varieties of Reciprocity	82
16 Debts to Society and Double Counting	90
17 The Limits of Reciprocity	94

PART 4 EQUAL RESPECT AND EQUAL SHARES	
18	Equality 107
19	Does Equal Treatment Imply Equal Shares? 109
20	What Is Equality for? 114
21	Equal Pay for Equal Work 120
22	Equality and Opportunity 126
23	On the Utility of Equal Shares 140
24	The Limits of Equality 150
PART 5 MEDITATIONS ON NEED	
25	Need 161
26	Hierarchies of Need 163
27	Need as a Distributive Principle 166
28	Beyond the Numbers 170
29	What Do We Need? 177
PART 6 THE RIGHT TO DISTRIBUTE	
30	Intellectual Debts 183
31	Rawls 185
32	Nozick 198
33	Rectification 208
34	Two Kinds of Arbitrary 216
35	Procedural versus Distributive Justice 220
	<i>References</i> 229
	<i>Index</i> 237

Acknowledgments

Whenever I would run into James Rachels at a conference, he always seemed acutely aware of how much fun it is to be a philosopher. I could not match the masterful simplicity of Jim's introductory text, *The Elements of Moral Philosophy*, but I did pretty much borrow his title, conceiving the tribute before I learned he was dying of bladder cancer. To my astonishment, Jim e-mailed me from his hospital bed only days before he died, saying one of his few regrets was not getting to know me better. I have no idea how many such e-mails Jim sent, but that's the kind of man he was, thoughtful and in love with life, no matter what.

I want to thank Marty Zupan for inviting me to a fundraiser in Palm Beach in February of 2003. I thank Randy Kendrick, whom I met in Palm Beach, for calling a week later to invite Elizabeth and me to dinner with her and her husband Ken in Phoenix. I declined, saying I had been diagnosed with a brain tumor two days before and was not feeling very social. Randy demanded that I consult her friend, Dr. Robert Spetzler. As one neurosurgeon described Spetzler, it is hard to explain what makes one pianist merely excellent and the next one a virtuoso, but Spetzler is a virtuoso. His patients simply do better than other people's patients. So, I thank Dr. Spetzler. Even as brain surgeries go, this was a delicate procedure. I may well have died, or survived as a shell, if not for him.

In the aftermath, Kit Wellman and John Tomasi, among many others, called to ask whether there was anything they could do. I probably was supposed to say, "No thanks, it's enough that you called, but if I think of anything . . ." Instead, emboldened by awareness that life is indeed short, I said, "How about a workshop on my book?" I'm especially grateful to Kit, John, and Dave Estlund for putting those events together. At the Georgia

State Workshop, Andrew Altman, Andrew I. Cohen, Bill Edmundson, George Rainbolt, Geoff Sayre-McCord, and Kit Wellman served as commentators. Alex Kaufman and Ani Satz were active participants. At the Brown workshop, my official commentators were John Tomasi, David Estlund, Neera Badhwar, Corey Brettschneider, Peter Vallentyne, and Arthur Applbaum.

I thank Galina Bitjukova of the Central Asian Resource Center in Almaty, Kazakhstan, for assembling twenty-one faculty from nine post-Soviet republics to spend a week discussing the book. Giancarlo Iburguen and Manuel Ayau, president and past president, respectively, of Francisco Marroquin University, organized a two-week visit to Guatemala where I presented nine lectures to various audiences. Michael Smith, Geoff Brennan, and Bob Goodin arranged for me to spend ten weeks at the Research School for Social Sciences at Australian National University in 2002. Thanks also to Jeremy and Pam Shearmur for welcoming me into their home outside Canberra.

I thank Michael Pendlebury for arranging a three-week visit to the University of Witwatersrand in 1999 where I presented early versions of several of these chapters. I thank Horacio Spector and Guido Pincione for the opportunity to present much of this material during visits to Torcuato di Tella School of Law in Buenos Aires. I thank David and Laura Truncellito for helping to arrange lectures at Chen Chi University, National Chung Cheng University, and University of Taiwan, and for an unforgettable week touring the island. I thank the Centre for Applied Ethics and Green College at the University of British Columbia for their splendid hospitality in the spring semester of 2000 and likewise the Social Philosophy and Policy Center at Bowling Green State University in the fall of 1999. For single lectures, I wish to thank audiences and organizers at Michigan, Yale, UNC–Chapel Hill, Ohio, Rochester Institute of Technology, Santa Clara, Auckland, Alabama–Birmingham, Tulane, Georgetown, West Virginia, and James Madison.

I wish to thank all the wonderful people at the Liberty Fund in Indianapolis for their stunningly generous support in the aftermath of my surgery when I needed peace and quiet so I could learn how to think again. I thank the Earhart Foundation and Institute for Humane Studies for sustaining not only me but several of the University of Arizona's students over the years. Needless to say, my greatest debt is to the University of Arizona. It is home, and I thank my colleagues for making it feel that way. More than anyone else (which is saying a lot), Chris Maloney makes

life in the department a thing of joy, from when I arrive in the morning until we walk home together in the evening.

All these good people, in addition to those mentioned above and those I'll credit more specifically in footnotes to follow, have done what they could to make this a better book: Scott Arnold, Lawrence Becker, Matt Bedke, Jeremy Bendik-Keymer, Jason Brennan, Gillian Brock, Chris Brown, Allen Buchanan, Tom Christiano, Andrew Jason Cohen, David Copp, Tyler Cowen, Peter Danielson, Jonathan Dancy, Stephen Darwall, Amitai Etzioni, James Fishkin, Ray Frey, Gerald Gaus, Allan Gibbard, Walter Glannon, Charles Goodman, Rob Gressis, Chris Griffin, Allen Habib, Rosalind Hursthouse, Jenann Ismael, Frances Kamm, Scott LaBarge, Jason Lesandrini, Loren Lomasky, Gerry Mackie, David Miller, Fred Miller, Chris Morris, Jan Narveson, Cara Nine, Guido Pincione, Steve Pink, Frances Fox Piven, Thomas Pogge, James Rachels, Peter Railton, Dan Russell, John T. Sanders, Steve Scalet, Daniel Shapiro, David Sobel, Horacio Spector, Christine Swanton, Mark Timmons, Mary Tjiattas, Kevin Vallier, David Velleman, Will Wilkinson, Elizabeth Willott, Matt Zwolinski, and those who toiled as anonymous readers for the Press.

Some of Part 2 previously appeared in "How To Deserve," *Political Theory*, 30 (2002) 774–99. DOI:10.1177/0090591702238203. © Sage Publications 2002. Some of Part 6 previously appeared in "History & Pattern," *Social Philosophy & Policy*, 22 (2005) 148–77. Part 4 incorporates material from "Equal Respect & Equal Shares," *Social Philosophy & Policy*, 19 (2002) 244–74. Chapter 22 updates and reworks material first covered in *Social Welfare and Individual Responsibility* (1998). © Cambridge University Press. An earlier version of Chapter 23 was published as "Diminishing Marginal Utility," *Journal of Value Inquiry*, 34 (2000) 263–72. © Kluwer Academic Publishers. Reprinted with kind permission of Springer Science and Business Media.