

## The Ethics and Politics of Asylum

Asylum has become a highly charged political issue across developed countries, raising a host of difficult ethical and political questions. What responsibilities do the world's richest countries have to refugees arriving at their borders? Are states justified in implementing measures to prevent the arrival of economic migrants if they also block entry for refugees? Is it legitimate to curtail the rights of asylum seekers to maximise the number of refugees receiving protection overall? This book draws upon political and ethical theory and an examination of the experiences of the United States, Germany, the United Kingdom and Australia to consider how to respond to the challenges of asylum. In addition to explaining why asylum has emerged as such a key political issue in recent years, it provides a compelling account of how states could move towards implementing morally defensible responses to refugees.

MATTHEW J. GIBNEY is Elizabeth Colson Lecturer in Forced Migration at the Refugee Studies Centre, Queen Elizabeth House, University of Oxford, and Official Fellow of Linacre College, Oxford. He has published many articles on asylum and immigration and is the editor of *Globalizing Rights: The Oxford Amnesty Lectures* (2003). He is currently editing (with Randall Hansen) a three-volume encyclopedia *Global Migration in the Twentieth Century* (forthcoming).

Cambridge University Press  
0521804175 - The Ethics and Politics of Asylum: Liberal Democracy and the Response to  
Refugees - Matthew J. Gibney  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# The Ethics and Politics of Asylum

*Liberal Democracy and the Response to Refugees*

---

Matthew J. Gibney



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 0521804175 - The Ethics and Politics of Asylum: Liberal Democracy and the Response to  
 Refugees - Matthew J. Gibney  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
 The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK  
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain  
 Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa  
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Matthew J. Gibney, 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without  
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*Typeface* Plantin 10/12 pt.    *System* L<sup>A</sup>T<sub>E</sub>X 2<sub>ε</sub> [TB]

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data*

Gibney, Matthew J.

The ethics and politics of asylum: liberal democracy and the response to  
 refugees / Matthew J. Gibney.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 80417 5 (hb.) – ISBN 0 521 00937 5 (pb.)

1. Asylum, Right of.    2. Refugees – Government policy.    3. Refugees – Legal  
 status, laws, etc.    I. Title.

HV8652.G52    2004

172'.2 – dc22    2003060533

ISBN 0 521 80417 5 hardback

ISBN 0 521 00937 5 paperback

---

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that URLs for external  
 websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to  
 press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can  
 make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will  
 remain appropriate.

---

Cambridge University Press  
0521804175 - The Ethics and Politics of Asylum: Liberal Democracy and the Response to  
Refugees - Matthew J. Gibney  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

For Chimène

## Contents

---

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> viii
Introduction	1
1. Partiality: community, citizenship and the defence of closure	23
2. Impartiality: freedom, equality and open borders	59
3. The Federal Republic of Germany: the rise and fall of a right to asylum	85
4. The United Kingdom: the value of asylum	107
5. The United States: the making and breaking of a refugee consensus	132
6. Australia: restricting asylum, resettling refugees	166
7. From ideal to non-ideal theory: reckoning with the state, politics and consequences	194
8. Liberal democratic states and ethically defensible asylum practices	229
<i>List of references</i>	261
<i>Index</i>	279

## Acknowledgements

---

This work began life in the 1990s at Cambridge University. At King's College, I had the good fortune of being supervised by John Dunn. Not only was he an enthusiastic supporter of the idea of bringing political theory to bear on the (then far less controversial) topic of asylum, but he encouraged me to approach the topic in a way that confronted directly the challenges it posed for normative theorising about politics. His way of thinking about politics has remained with me over the last decade and I want to record my deep thanks to him here.

I also had the pleasure of drawing upon the advice, friendship and general intellectual ambience provided by a wonderful group of Cambridge graduate students in social and political sciences and philosophy. I would like to thank, in particular, Jacky Cox, Sam Glover, Rob Hopkins, Don Hubert, David Kahane and Melissa Lane. My long and enduring friendship with Jeremy Goldman, formed in my first days at Cambridge, began with a debate on Michael Walzer. In the years since this conversation, he has taught me a great deal about what it is to think systematically about political theory.

My period at Cambridge was made possible by a generous scholarship by the Commonwealth Scholars and Fellowship Plan, and near the end of the thesis by the financial support of King's College and the Holland Rose Trust.

In the years since the thesis was submitted, I changed the text both to update the empirical chapters and to take into account intellectual encounters with colleagues in New Haven, Connecticut; Cambridge, Massachusetts; and Oxford. A number of scholars in the UK, the US and Canada commented on the thesis or drafts of early chapters in many different shapes and forms. Joe Carens, Gil Loescher, Brian Barry, Richard Tuck, Howard Adelman, Andrew Linklater, Matthew Price, Andrew Shacknové and Phil Triadafilopoulos, all provided useful comments. I owe a particular debt to Rogers Smith, formerly of Yale University and now at the University of Pennsylvania. My early period living in the US

(after following my wife to Yale) could have been an isolating experience. But demonstrating the kind of generosity with his time and intellectual energy that will be familiar to any student who has crossed his path, Rogers showed a real interest in my work and made himself freely available to discuss it.

The ideas expressed in this work changed even more in the light of my experiences at Oxford, which began in 1997. My colleagues at the Refugee Studies Centre deepened my understanding of refugee issues and the legal and international framework within which they are located. Michael Barutciski, Stephen Castles, Agnes Hurwitz, Maryanne Loughry and Nick Van Hear, may not have shared my approach to refugee issues, but they helped shape it nonetheless. Other colleagues at Oxford, including Dawn Chatty, Andy Hurrell, Des King, Adam Roberts, Andrew Shacknové, Paul Slack and Frances Stewart have proven great sources of encouragement and intellectual support. Guy Goodwin-Gill and Neil MacFarlane have been valued sources of guidance, and exceedingly generous in sharing their knowledge on international law and international relations respectively. Randall Hansen, who shares my interest in the politics of migration and asylum, has collaborated with me on a number of articles and works. I have not always shared his sceptical and forthright approach to the issue of asylum, but his views have been a blast of fresh air. Working with him has been one of the great pleasures of my time at Oxford.

From the moment I set foot on St Giles', David Turton, the (now former) Director of the Refugee Studies Centre, made me feel at home. In the years since, I have come to admire his rigorous scholarship and intellectual generosity. His practical commitment to the ideal of scholarship as a mutual and ongoing conversation amongst equals has made him an exemplary academic role model.

At Oxford I have also drawn upon the help of two assistants, Heidi Becker, who helped me to update some of the empirical chapters and Kate Prudden, who performed a vast array of activities, not least proofing some of the chapters. I would like to acknowledge the support of Queen Elizabeth House's Oppenheimer Fund for financial assistance with travel and research support. The staff of the Refugee Studies Centre Library, ably led by Sarah Rhodes, have also greatly assisted this research.

Beyond my circle of colleagues in Oxford, I have learnt a great deal about asylum or received encouraging feedback from a range of people. I would like to mention in particular Chaloka Beyani, B. S. Chimni, Jeff Crisp, Jim Hathaway, John Scratch, Gerry Van Kessel, Joanne Van Selm, Monette Zard and Aristide Zolberg.

x Acknowledgements

John Haslam at CUP has been an extremely patient and helpful editor.

Earlier versions of some parts of this book were published in the *American Political Science Review* as 'Liberal Democratic States and Responsibilities to Refugees' (March 1999, 1: 169–81) and in *Government and Opposition* as 'Crisis of Constraint: The Federal Republic of Germany's Refugee Imbroglio' (Summer 1993: 372–93). I would like to thank the editors of these journals for permission to use sections from these articles.

While this book was written in the United Kingdom and the US, some of its deepest debts lie on the other side of the world. As an undergraduate at Monash University in Melbourne, Australia, I was encouraged to pursue graduate studies in political theory at Cambridge by two remarkable teachers, Ray Nichols and Andrew Linklater. Ray Nichols, my honours year supervisor, exhibited a faith in my abilities that I still find hard to fathom. Andrew Linklater exhibited a similar faith and showed me how impressive the results of bringing political theory and international relations into mutual engagement could be. His innovative approach to politics had a strong influence on my choice of asylum as a thesis topic while at Cambridge, and thus on my subsequent career.

In addition, I owe many debts to my family, some of them financial. My parents, in particular, have waited a long time for this book, and I hope they consider the wait worthwhile. I realise this book is no substitute for a grandchild. But they can hope that it has a long and happy life.

My thanks to all of these leads inexorably to my dear Chimène. This is a book about the state as a refuge. There are, however, many different types of refuge. Chimène Bateman has been a personal one: an inexhaustible source of love, support and advice during the long years through which this book has been in process. I dedicate this book to her with all my love and appreciation.