

The European Court and National Courts—Doctrine and Jurisprudence

Legal Change in Its Social Context

Edited by

ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER, ALEC STONE SWEET
and J. H. H. WEILER



• HART •
PUBLISHING
OXFORD
1998

Contents

<i>Prologue</i>	v
<i>Contributors</i>	xxi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxxv

PART I: NATIONAL REPORTS

1. Report on Belgium	1
HERVE BRIBOSIA	
General Introduction	1
Doctrinal Review	4
Conditions of domestic applicability	4
Direct applicability	6
Supremacy over conflicting domestic law	10
<i>Kompetenz-Kompetenz</i>	21
Contextual observations	28
“Specificity” of European Community law	28
Political and constitutional context	29
Evolution of jurisprudence	33
References	37
2. Report on France	41
JENS PLOTNER	
The Reception of the Direct Effect and Supremacy Doctrine by the French Supreme Courts	41
Doctrinal development of the three supreme courts	42
<i>Kompetenz-Kompetenz</i>	50
The Social Context of Legal Change Concerning European Union Law in France	54
Chronology of the social context	55
The influence of doctrine on jurisprudence	71
3. Report on Germany	77
JULIANE KOKOTT	
Introduction	77
Doctrinal Matrix	79
Constitutional law background	79
Doctrinal matrix before and after the <i>Maastricht</i> decision	81

Doctrine, Jurisprudence and Beyond	82
Doctrinal shifts of the Federal Constitutional Court's jurisprudence and their possible causes	82
The European Courts and national courts	108
Beyond doctrine	126
Conclusions	129
4. The Italian Constitutional Court and the Relationship Between the Italian Legal System and the European Union	133
MARTA CARTABIA	
The theoretical bases of the Italian membership to the European Union	133
The Italian Constitutional Court case-law concerning the supremacy of European law: from the denial of supremacy to the supremacy under condition	135
The Italian Constitutional Court case-law concerning the direct effect of European law	140
The Italian Constitutional Court and the <i>kompetenz-kompetenz</i> principle	142
The contribution of " <i>la doctrine</i> " to the development of the Italian Constitutional Court's attitude towards European integration	144
5. Report on Italy	147
P. RUGGERI LADERCHI	
Introduction	147
Beyond the Doctrine	148
The actors—judges	148
The actors— <i>la doctrine</i>	152
Cross-fertilisation	155
Looking back at the "Community path" of the Constitutional Court	157
The origin of the Constitutional Court's doctrine: a device used to avoid declaring the EC Treaty contrary to the Constitution	157
Error! Reference source not found—some observations on the post- <i>Granital</i> case law	166
The problem of competence	169
6. Report on the Netherlands	171
MONICA CLAES and BRUNO DE WITTE	
The Dutch Sources of the European Court's Doctrine	172
Direct effect and supremacy of international treaties in the Netherlands prior to <i>Van Gend en Loos</i>	172
The influence of the Dutch legal order on the European Court's doctrine	178

The Reception of the European Court's Doctrine in the Netherlands	181
The Question of " <i>Kompetenz-Kompetenz</i> "	187
Beyond the Law: the Search for Explanations	188
The traditional openness of the Dutch legal system	188
Separation of powers and the judicial function	190
Judicial empowerment?	191
The comparative dimension as a factor in the explanation	192
Judicial dialogue	193
Legal pragmatism	194
7. Report on the United Kingdom	195
P. P. CRAIG	
Constitutional Doctrine within the United Kingdom: the Impact of the EC	195
Supremacy: the traditional debate in the United Kingdom	195
Supremacy and the judicial response prior to <i>Factortame</i>	197
Supremacy and the <i>Factortame</i> litigation	200
Supremacy and Community law after <i>Factortame</i>	203
Direct effect	204
Preliminary rulings	205
" <i>Kompetenz-Kompetenz</i> ": Practice and Doctrine	206
Doctrine, Jurisprudence and Beyond	209
Judicial identity, national identity and biting the constitutional bullet	209
The balance of power between different branches of government: the not-so-hidden agenda	212
Judicial empowerment, national courts and new tasks	216
The impact of legal culture: the common law method and the reception of community law	218
Judicial discourse: the vertical dimension	220
Judicial discourse: the horizontal dimension	222
Individual litigants: national courts and the ECJ	222
Judicial composition and the role of individual judges	223
Conclusion	224
PART II: COMPARATIVE ANALYSES	
8. Explaining National Court Acceptance of European Court Jurisprudence: a Critical Evaluation of Theories of Legal Integration	227
KAREN ALTER	
National Courts: the Critical Intermediaries in Legal Integration	227
Alternative Explanations of National Judicial Behaviour in Legal Integration	229
Legalism: legal logic and legal reasoning as the motor of legal integration	230

Neo-realism: national interests as the motor of legal integration	234
Neo-functionalism: self-interest as the motor of legal integration	238
Inter-court competition explanations: bureaucratic politics as the motor of legal integration	241
Conclusion: Legal Integration in a Comparative Political Perspective	246
Political support as a pre-condition for continued legal integration?	247
Preliminary ruling system and the ECJ as a pre-condition for continued legal integration?	249
References	251
9. The Role of National Courts in the Process of European Integration: Accounting for Judicial Preferences and Constraints	253
WALTER MATTLI AND ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER	
Introduction	253
The Role of National Courts in EC Legal Integration	257
Judicial preferences	259
Constraints on the process of legal integration	265
Conclusion	276
10. Sovereignty and European Integration: the Weight of Legal Tradition	277
BRUNO DE WITTE	
Introduction	277
Sovereignty and the Demands of Community Law: the Development of "Peaceful Coexistence" (1945–1990)	281
Limitation of sovereignty as the constitutional basis of EC membership	281
Sovereignty as a limit to the reception of Community law	287
Sovereignty and the European Union: an Unavoidable Conflict?	293
The reassertion of state sovereignty in the aftermath of "Maastricht"	293
Sovereignty: resilient or obsolete?	301
11. Constitutional Dialogues in the European Community	305
ALEC STONE SWEET	
Introduction	305
Constitutionalising the Treaty System	306
The process of constitutionalising the treaty system	306
Understanding constitutionalisation	308
Constitutional Dialogues: Three Problems of Supremacy	312
Supremacy and the problem of constitutional review	312
Supremacy and the problem of fundamental rights	317
Supremacy and the constitutional limits to integration	319
A preliminary assessment	324
A criticism	325

Constitutional Dialogues: Supremacy, Litigation and Policy-making	325
Study the case law of national courts	326
(Re)-specify judicial interests	327
Correlate judicial outcomes with factors external to the law	329
Study the behaviour of litigators	330
Conclusion	330
12. Constitutional or International? The Foundations of the Community Legal Order and the Question of Judicial Kompetenz-Kompetenz	331
J. H. H. WEILER AND ULRICH R. HALTERN	
13. Epilogue: The European Courts of Justice: Beyond “Beyond Doctrine” or the Legitimacy Crisis of European Constitutionalism	365
J. H. H. WEILER	
<i>Index</i>	393