

THE EVOLUTION OF INTERNATIONAL SECURITY STUDIES

International Security Studies (ISS) has changed and diversified in many ways since 1945. This book provides the first intellectual history of the development of the subject in that period. It explains how ISS evolved from an initial concern with the strategic consequences of superpower rivalry and nuclear weapons, to its current diversity in which environmental, economic, human and other securities sit alongside military security, and in which approaches ranging from traditional Realist analysis to Feminism and Post-colonialism are in play. It sets out the driving forces that shaped debates in ISS, shows what makes ISS a single conversation across its diversity, and gives an authoritative account of debates on all the main topics within ISS. This is an unparalleled survey of the literature and institutions of ISS that will be an invaluable guide for all students and scholars of ISS, whether traditionalist, 'new agenda' or critical.

BARRY BUZAN is Montague Burton Professor of International Relations at the London School of Economics and Honorary Professor at the Universities of Copenhagen and Jilin. His books include: The United States and the Great Powers: World Politics in the Twenty-first Century (2004); Regions and Powers: The Structure of International Security (2003, with Ole Wæver); The Arms Dynamic in World Politics (1998, with Eric Herring); Security: A New Framework for Analysis (1998, with Wæver and Jaap de Wilde); People, States and Fear: An Agenda for International Security Studies in the Post-Cold War Era (1991) and An Introduction to Strategic Studies: Military Technology and International Relations (1987).

LENE HANSEN is an Associate Professor of International Relations in the Department of Political Science at the University of Copenhagen. She is the author of Security as Practice: Discourse Analysis and the Bosnian War (2006) and the co-editor of European Integration and National Identity: The Challenge of the Nordic States (2002, with Ole Wæver).



THE EVOLUTION OF INTERNATIONAL SECURITY STUDIES

BARRY BUZAN

Department of International Relations London School of Economics and Political Science

LENE HANSEN

Department of Political Science University of Copenhagen





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

> > Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521694223

© Barry Buzan and Lene Hansen 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Buzan, Barry.

The evolution of international security studies / Barry Buzan, Lene Hansen.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-87261-4

Security, International – Study and teaching.
 Security, International – History.
 JZ5588.B887
 Security, International – Research.
 Hansen, Lene. II. Title.

355'.033 - dc22 2009025609

ISBN 978-0-521-87261-4 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-69422-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

Foreword is	X	
List of abbrevia	ations	xii
List of figures	XV	
List of tables	xvi	
Introduction	1	

1 Defining International Security Studies 8

Four questions that structure ISS 10
Security and its adjacent concepts 13
The disciplinary boundary of ISS 16
The Western-centrism conundrum 19

The key questions in International Security Studies: the state, politics and epistemology 21

From medieval to sovereign states 22
The French Revolution and domestic cohesion 26
The conception of politics in ISS 30
Epistemology and security debates 32
Mapping concepts of security 35

3 The driving forces behind the evolution of International Security Studies 39

A post-Kuhnian sociology of science 40
Internal versus external factors 44
The theoretical status of the driving forces framework 47
The five driving forces as general analytical categories 50
Great power politics 50
The technological imperative 53
Events 54
The internal dynamics of academic debates 57
Institutionalisation 60

v



vi

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-69422-3 - The Evolution of International Security Studies Barry Buzan and Lene Hansen Frontmatter More information

	CONTENTS
4	Strategic Studies, deterrence and the Cold War 66 Great power politics: the Cold War and bipolarity 68 The technological imperative: the nuclear revolution in military affairs 73 The pressure of current affairs and 'events' 83 The internal dynamics of academic debates 87 Institutionalisation 91 Conclusions 98
5	The Cold War challenge to national security Peace Research and Arms Control Great power politics: the Cold War and bipolarity 106 The technological imperative: the nuclear revolution in military affairs 109 Positive peace, integration and societal cohesion 118 Structural violence, economics and the environment 123 The internal dynamics of debates in Peace Research 129 From peace to security: Common Security, Feminism and Poststructuralism 135 Foregrounding 'security' 135 Women as a particular group: the birth of Feminist Security Studies 138
(Linguistic approaches and Poststructuralism 141 Institutionalisation 145 Conclusions 153
6	International Security Studies post-Cold War: the traditionalists 156 The loss of a meta-event: surviving the Soviet Union 159 Internal academic debates: state-centrism and epistemology 162 Great power politics: a replacement for the Soviet Union? 165 The technological imperative 170 Regional security and non-Western events 176 Institutionalisation 182 Conclusions 184
7	Widening and deepening security 187 Constructivisms: norms, identities and narratives 191 Conventional Constructivism 192 Critical Constructivism 197 Beyond the (Western) state 200 Post-colonialism 200



	CONTENTS
	Human Security 202 Critical Security Studies 205 Feminism 208
	Discursive security: the Copenhagen School and Poststructuralism The Copenhagen School and its critics 212 Poststructuralism 218
	Institutionalisation 221
	Conclusions 224
8	Responding to 9/11: a return to national security? 226
	Traditionalist ISS post-9/11 229
	The traditionalist response to the Global War on Terrorism 229 Continuities in traditionalist ISS after 2001 234
	Widening perspectives and the Global War on Terrorism Discourses and terrorist subjects 243 Information technology, bio-security and risk 248
	Institutionalisation and the Global War on Terrorism 251
	Conclusions 253
9	Conclusions 256
	The changing shape of ISS 258
	Driving forces reconsidered 261
	The state and future of ISS: conversation or camps? 262
	The outlook for ISS 265 Great power politics 266 Events 268
	Technology 269
	Academic debates 270 Institutionalisation 271
	monadonanadon 2/1
	References 273
	Author index 365
	Subject index 368



FOREWORD

There is a long as well as a short story as to why we wrote this book. The short story begins in 2005 when Lucy Robinson at SAGE asked Barry Buzan whether he would be interested in editing a four-volume reader on International Security. Barry thought it a nice idea to add Lene Hansen to the project, thereby bringing in someone with both a different perspective and a closer eye on the Poststructuralist-Feminist-Critical scene. The discussions and readings that went into selecting the articles for that reader, spanning Wolfers and Kennan from the 1940s and 1950s to recent Post-colonial and Feminist analyses of the Global War on Terrorism, led us to believe there was a book to be done on the evolution of International Security Studies (ISS) as an academic field. In the process of re-reading, we were struck by Nye and Lynn-Jones's (1988) observation that the intellectual history of ISS was yet to be written, and even more struck by another twenty years of silence on the subject. A sceptical reader might of course think that this indicates the futility, impossibility or lack of audience for such a project, but we beg to differ. We think that an intellectual history, and an account of how different perspectives play into each other, evolve and battle, is a useful thing to have. Historical context is always good, and allows ISS to enter the pantheon of related academic enterprises like Political Theory, Political Science and International Relations (IR) that do have such self-understanding. An intellectual and sociology of science history can provide those in ISS with a better sense of where they and others came from, why they might differ and about what, and which points of contestation do in fact tie the field together.

One difficulty with such a project, and a possible explanation of why ISS has not had an intellectual history, is that its sense of disciplinary identity is contested, making how to define what falls into ISS and what does not a political – and politicised – question. This issue of delineation takes us into the longer story to this book. Barry Buzan has worked for nearly forty years on security, from the heyday of traditionalist Strategic Studies



X FOREWORD

over the burgeoning turns to the widening and deepening of security in the 1980s to contemporary securitisation debates. Lene Hansen came to ISS in the early 1990s, reading Walker before Waltz and Der Derian rather than Deutsch. Clearly, for someone who picked up our CVs an immediate difference in starting point and positioning in relation to traditionalist versus widening/deepening debates would spring to mind. What we had in common however was a long connection, starting at the Copenhagen Peace Research Institute (COPRI) in 1991, with the Copenhagen School – Barry as a founding figure, Lene as a boundary-testing critic. We shared intellectual links through Ole Wæver, also then at COPRI, and an interest in the concepts and ways in which different perspectives could come to understand and recognise each other. All this of course makes us part of the story that we tell, and places us more on the European side of what is mainly an Atlantic story. Although we have aimed for a full and balanced account, a version of this book written from within the US mainstream ISS community might well reflect somewhat different priorities and perspectives. And since we come from the middle and radical end of the ISS spectrum, a version written by a traditionalist or a rational-choicer would also reflect different priorities and perspectives. Self-involvement also opens up the embarrassing contradiction that what qualifies us to tell the story also threatens our detachment from it. Readers will have to judge for themselves how well (or not) we dealt with this.

Our hunch is that the duration, immensity and diversity of the ISS archive, especially when casting the inclusion net widely, which we have deliberately done, mean that coming to grips with ISS requires the memory, perspective (and stamina!) of more than one person. Our age difference has helped us not only to understand the perspectives of different generations, but also to think about how one communicates the historical context of a particular literature as well as its contemporary relevance. One aim of our project was to counteract the illusion that there is a clear 'before and after 1990' structure to ISS, with everything changing as a result of the Cold War ending and widening approaches suddenly appearing. For new entrants into ISS it is quite easy to get the impression than nothing much before 1990 matters now. We hope to show that ISS has significant coherence not just across the many approaches that now define it, but also across time. One needs a sense of the whole story in order to understand both the structure and significance of what ISS looks like now.

Our thanks to Lucy Robinson for suggesting the idea that led to this book and to John Haslam at Cambridge University Press for taking on the



FOREWORD Xi

book project and being tolerant of its ever-lengthening word count and timetable. Thanks also to Mathias Lydholm Rasmussen, Anne Kathrine Mikkelsen Nyborg and Ian Siperco for research assistance; and to Maria-Lara Martin at the International Studies Association (ISA) Headquarters in Tucson, Arizona, for going through the files and sending us their material on the Peace Studies Section of the ISA. Many people have offered comments along the way and our appreciation goes to the audience at the ISA's annual convention in San Diego in 2006, particularly our discussant Michael C. Williams; the IR Group in the Department of Political Science, University of Copenhagen; the audience at the European Consortium for Political Research (ECPR) Standing Group on International Relations conference in Turin in 2007, particularly Francesco Ragazzi, who was the discussant; and to the three reviewers for Cambridge University Press, particularly for the suggestion that we look more closely at financing and the institutional side of ISS. Pinar Bilgin, Lene Cividanes, Lawrence Freedman, Matti Jutila, Sanne Brasch Kristensen, Jeppe Mülich, Nini Nielsen, Karen Lund Petersen, Mikkel Vedby Rasmussen, Christine Sylvester, Ole Wæver, Håkan Wiberg and Michael C. Williams did us the great favour of reading and commenting on the whole penultimate draft, and Anders Wivel did the same for particular chapters. These comments were extremely helpful to us in shaping the final manuscript. Finally, we wish to thank the Department of Political Science and the Centre for Advanced Security Theory (CAST) at the University of Copenhagen for funding most of the research assistance and multiple trips between Copenhagen and London, and the LSE for funding the rest of the research assistance.

> Barry Buzan (London) Lene Hansen (Copenhagen) September 2008



ABBREVIATIONS

ABM Anti-Ballistic Missile

ACDA Arms Control and Disarmament Agency

AFK Arbeitsgemeinschaft für Friedens- und Konfliktforschung

ARF ASEAN Regional Forum

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

BMD Ballistic Missile Defence CAC Council for Arms Control

CAST Centre for Advanced Security Theory
CDSS Centre for Defence and Strategic Studies

CEE Central and Eastern Europe

CESS Centre for European Security Studies
CFE Conventional Armed Forces in Europe

CHALLENGE Changing Landscape of European Liberty and Security

CND Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament
CNS Center for Nonproliferation Studies
COPRI Copenhagen Peace Research Institute

CPREA Canadian Peace Research and Education Association
CSIS Center for Strategic and International Studies

CSS Critical Security Studies

ECPR European Consortium for Political Research

ED Extended deterrence

END European Nuclear Disarmament
ESRC Economic and Social Research Council

EU European Union

EUISS European Union Institute for Security Studies

FRY Former Republic of Yugoslavia

FSU Former Soviet Union

GIPRI Geneva International Peace Research Institute

GWoT Global War on Terrorism

IAEAInternational Atomic Energy AgencyIDSAInstitute for Defence Studies and AnalysesIDSSInstitute of Defence and Strategic Studies

xii



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xiii

IFSH Institute for Peace Research and Security Policy at Hamburg

University

IISS International Institute for Strategic Studies

INF Intermediate-range Nuclear Forces IPE International Political Economy

IPRA International Peace Research Association
IPSHU Institute for Peace Science Hiroshima University

IR International Relations

ISA International Studies Association
ISS International Security Studies

JPR Journal of Peace Research
LNW Limited nuclear war

LSE London School of Economics and Political Science

MAD Mutually Assured Destruction
MIC Military-industrial complex
MTCR Missile Technology Control Regime
NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO Non-government organisation
NNWS Non-nuclear weapon states
NoD Non-offensive defence

NORDSAM Nordic Cooperation Committee for International Politics

NPT Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty

NUPI Norsk Utenrikspolitisk Institutt/Norwegian Institute of

International Affairs

NWFZ Nuclear weapon free zone NWS Nuclear weapon states

OSCE Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe

PADRIGU Department for Peace and Development Research, University of

Gothenburg

PfP Partnership for Peace

PRIF Peace Research Institute Frankfurt
PRIME Peace Research Institute in the Middle East

PRIME Peace Research Institute in the Middle East PRIO International Peace Research Institute, Oslo

RAND Research and Development (non-profit think-tank that grew out of

the United States Army Air Forces)

RAWA Revolutionary Association of the Women of Afghanistan

RMA Revolution in Military Affairs
RSCT Regional security complex theory
RUSI Royal United Services Institute
SALT Strategic Arms Limitation Talks
SDI Strategic Defense Initiative

SIPRI Stockholm International Peace Research Institute



XİV LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

SORT Strategic Offensive Reductions Treaty
SSRC Social Science Research Council
START Strategic Arms Reduction Talks
TAPRI Tampere Peace Research Institute

UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme
UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNIDIR United Nations Institute of Disarmament Research

UNPROFOR United Nations Protection Force
USIP United States Institute of Peace
WIIS Women in International Security
WMD Weapons of mass destruction



FIGURES

1.1.	Security and its adjacent concepts	page 14
3.1.	Sociology of science approach	42
4.1.	The main drivers of Strategic Studies	98
5.1.	The location of Arms Control on the terrain of ISS	105
5.2.	The internal structure and offshoots of Peace Research	146
5.3.	The main drivers behind Peace Research and its offshoots	152
6.1.	The composition of Post-Cold War traditionalism	157
6.2.	The main drivers behind Post-Cold War traditionalism	184
7.1.	The changing shape of ISS from Cold War to Post-Cold War	190
7.2.	The composition of Constructivism	193
7.3.	The evolution of ISS	222
7.4.	The main drivers behind the widening-deepening approaches	225



TABLES

2.1. Epistemological distinctions	page 34
2.2. ISS perspectives in relation to the five questions	38
3.1. The driving force of institutionalisation	61
5.1. Peace Research on societal cohesion	121