



University
of Glasgow

Patrick, F., Elliot, D., Hulme, M. and McPhee, A. (2010) *The importance of collegiality and reciprocal learning in the professional development of beginning teachers*. *Journal of Education for Teaching: International Research and Pedagogy*, 36 (3). pp. 277-289. ISSN 0260-7476

<http://eprints.gla.ac.uk/40458>

Deposited on: 18 October 2010

Title

The importance of collegiality and reciprocal learning in the professional development of beginning teachers

Authors

Fiona Patrick

F.Patrick@educ.gla.ac.uk

Dely Elliot

D.Eliot@educ.gla.ac.uk

Moira Hulme

M.Hulme@educ.gla.ac.uk

Alastair McPhee

A.McPhee@educ.gla.ac.uk

Postal address

Faculty of Education,
University of Glasgow,
St Andrew's Building,
11 Eldon Street,
Glasgow G3 6NH

Corresponding author

Fiona Patrick

Word count

5, 619

This paper discusses factors which enhance induction experiences for beginning teachers. It reports the findings from case studies which explore the impact of new entrants to the teaching profession in Scotland. The data suggest that the most supportive induction processes mix both formal and informal elements, but that the informal elements such as collegiality, good communication and a welcoming workplace environment should not be underestimated. The study also highlights the potential benefits of a more collegiate environment for teachers across the career phases. Experienced teachers and new entrants had a range of experience to offer each other, thus creating more cohesive professional working which was supportive of early career teachers while encouraging reflection on practice among the more experienced professionals.

Keywords: collegiality, reciprocal professional development, early professional development

Introduction

The research discussed in this paper is derived from a national study into the impact of new entrants to teaching on professional culture in Scottish schools. The findings extend understanding of the development needs of early career teachers during the post-training induction period and beyond. The research also indicates the importance of collegiate learning across the career stages in enhancing the professional capacities of early career teachers within a process we characterise as reciprocal professional learning. Reciprocal learning was an important aspect in the enculturation of new teachers into the profession. While the first years of teaching are vital in terms of socializing newly qualified teachers into the profession (Jones 2005, 516), they are also a time of vulnerability for teachers who are in the early stages of building professional identity and pedagogic skill (Anthony and Ord 2008, 361). This vulnerability may be one contributor to the high rates of drop-out among new entrants to teaching in the UK and elsewhere. For example, fewer than half those who begin courses of initial teacher education in England remain in teaching five years on (McIntyre, Hobson and Mitchell 2009, 358). In Australia up to one third of teachers leave the profession within three to five years of graduation (Ewing and Manuel 2005, 1), and in the USA thirty percent of new entrants leave following the first year of teaching (Hobson, Giannakaki and Chambers 2009, 322).

There are various factors associated with early career drop-out, such as workload (Hobson, Giannakaki and Chambers 2009), limited professional support (McIntyre, Hobson and Mitchell 2009; Garcia, Slate and Delgado 2009), and loss of commitment to teaching (Day, Elliot and Kington 2005). Given these factors, it would seem important to create quality induction and early professional development

schemes to provide structured opportunities for continued learning to enhance professional skills, knowledge and commitment among early career teachers (see Day, Elliot and Kington 2005, 575; Choi and Tang 2009, 768). In this way, a supportive culture can be developed to give new entrants the best chance of success as classroom teachers (Bubb and Early 2006).

Research context

The original research was commissioned by the Scottish Government and the General Teaching Council for Scotland (the professional regulatory body for Scottish teachers). The overall aim was to investigate the impact of recent policy initiatives concerning teacher education and induction on the professional culture of teachers in Scotland. One factor which came across strongly in the findings was the importance of providing a culture where new entrants felt supported within a formal induction process (see Hulme et al. 2008, 60). Statutory induction schemes have been introduced in the United Kingdom across the education systems in Scotland, England, Wales and Northern Ireland. The induction scheme in Scotland was introduced in August 2002 following the report of a Committee of Enquiry (chaired by Professor Gavin McCrone). The McCrone Report was critical of the conditions of employment for new teachers and expressed concern that many newly qualified teachers received inadequate support during the probationary period. This was particularly the case where they could not secure full time employment following initial qualification – a situation the Committee characterized as ‘little short of scandalous’ (Scottish Executive Education Department 2001, 7). To address this situation, the current induction scheme features a guaranteed placement in a local authority school during

the one year induction period, at the end of which it is expected that teachers will satisfy the Standard for Full Registration to become fully qualified.

High quality induction and early professional development can help new entrants to meet the challenges they face during the transition from student to teacher (McCormack, Gore and Thomas 2006, 96). Novices need to be effectively supported during this period if they are to avoid what has been called ‘practice shock’ (Stokking et al. 2003). This can arise from any one of a range of issues, from practical aspects such as workload, to the emotional and psychological effects arising from a mismatch between ideals and reality (see Goddard and O’Brien 2003), or the tendency for beginning teachers to be ‘unrealistically optimistic about their abilities’ (Malm 2009, 83). Professional learning therefore needs to form a continuum between initial teacher education and the early years of practice to support new entrants during what can be a stressful time.

As part of this continuum, teacher education in Scotland is now more purposefully designed to move from a training model of basic skills acquisition towards providing opportunities aimed at promoting sophisticated thinking about teaching and learning. Building on this stage, formalised professional learning is now offered in schools and local education authorities during structured induction programmes. The most valuable forms of induction tend to see early professional learning from a long-term capacity-building standpoint rather than a short-term technician view: something which is necessary because of the complex nature of teaching (McCormack, Gore and Thomas 2006). A developmental model of early career learning offers scope for improvement through reflecting on practice and

building an evidence-base for teaching. To do otherwise is to risk students retaining taken-for-granted beliefs about teaching and learning which can ‘mislead’ them into thinking that ‘they know more about teaching than they actually do and make it more difficult for them to form new ideas and new habits of thought and action’ (Feiman-Nemser 2001, 1016).

Arguably, effective induction and early career development can encourage new teachers to refine the professional reflective skills developed during initial teacher education. One important source of support for reflection comes through formal mentoring systems, which are now a part of many induction programmes (McCormack, Gore and Thomas 2006). Mentors also offer pedagogic and emotional support to beginning teachers, though it is important that a mentor is not seen as being there to solve problems but to be ‘an active listener who makes it easier for the novice to come to his or her own decisions’ (Lindgren 2005, 252). Again, the developmental aspect is important here: mentoring should not be about telling new entrants what they should do. Rather it should encourage them to think critically about their practice and enable them to appraise a range of potential strategies for enhancing pupil learning (Lindgren, 2005).

However it is of some concern that O’Brien and Christie’s research with probationer teachers in Scotland found little evidence that mentoring did encourage reflective practice or self-evaluation (O’Brien and Christie 2005, 200). Their study suggests that much of the instructional support received by new teachers can often be ‘at the level of practical craft knowledge which does not go beyond “what works”’ (O’Brien and Christie 2005, 200). Similarly, Dymoke and Harrison (2006) looked at performance review processes in England, and found that the portfolios of evidence

produced by newly qualified teachers as part of their induction tended not to show deep reflection. Instead they served ‘to provide the hoops through which the beginning teachers can be seen to be jumping’ on the road to full registration (Dymoke and Harrison 2006, 80).

Nevertheless, mentoring does form an important factor in supporting new entrants to adjust to their professional role in schools (Jones 2005, 517). Workplace socialization can be characterized broadly as having personal and professional features. Part of the process is undoubtedly the sense of fitting in with the informal aspects of working with others, but there are more complex elements than this. For instance, it can be difficult for new teachers to ‘understand the professionalism that is expressed in the culture, in the language, in the way the school system is organized and in the different ways of working in a school’ (Grimsæth 2008, 225). Indeed, it may now be more difficult to navigate professional culture given the increasing stress on collegiality and learning communities within revised concepts of teacher professionalism (see O’Brien and Christie 2005, 189). Teachers’ work can no longer be conceptualised as what the individual does alone since expectations of collegiate working extend the professional role and mean that a range of skills has to be developed to facilitate successful professional interactions.

In reality ‘we know little about how effective professional learning communities develop, how they are sustained, and how teachers work collaboratively’ (Dooner, Mandzuk and Clifton 2008, 565). In spite of this, there have been strong policy and regulatory moves in Scotland to frame an expectation of collegiate working by teachers, and in many countries there has been a shift from strong

individual autonomy in schools towards encouragement of collaboration and collective responsibility (Harris and Anthony 2001, 378). There are positive aspects to this move, given evidence that professional development is enhanced by establishing supportive professional relationships with colleagues (Wilson and Demetriou 2007). But there is a risk that formalised collaboration becomes inauthentic, especially in the Scottish system where specific time must now be set aside for collegiate activity. This might be seen as an example of ‘contrived collegiality’ (Hargreaves in Harris and Anthony 2001, 372). However, Williams, Prestage and Bedward (2001, 260) prefer the term ‘structural collegiality’ because even contrived forms of collegiate time can still offer the potential to act as a starting point for more effective forms of collaboration.

While learning communities are difficult to create and sustain (Dooner, Mandzuk and Clifton 2008), a great deal of support can be gained from colleagues in less formal situations. For beginning teachers it is important that the overall culture of the school is supportive. Where the school culture is welcoming, spontaneous forms of collaboration are more likely to occur (Williams, Prestage and Bedward 2001, 263). Beginning teachers will tend to

thrive and develop in an atmosphere of trust and openness as part of a genuine collaborative culture. Genuine collaborative cultures should be challenging without being threatening, should encourage debate, discussion and learning between new and experienced colleagues, and thus provide high levels of support and development. New teachers need

emotional support and encouragement as well as pedagogical support (Grimsæth 2008, 232).

Collegiate support is also important because beginning teachers must recognize that they do not as yet possess a wide repertoire of knowledge and skills, and that no matter how 'well prepared and committed they may be, teachers have no assurance that they will succeed in the classroom because teaching, by its very nature, is unpredictable work' (Johnson and Birkeland 2003, 584). In part, it is this unpredictability that can add to the sense of vulnerability mentioned by Anthony and Ord (2008). Supporting teachers to accept this unpredictability, to reflect on it, and to decide how best to alter practice in response, is an important part of teacher education as well as of induction.

It would seem, then, that effective induction and professional development for new teachers should take account of the needs of individuals, with mentoring included in the early stages as well as ongoing encouragement for teachers to self-evaluate in order to identify specific areas for continuing professional development (CPD). Our study indicates that there is evidence of this happening in Scottish schools. Moreover, in the case study schools, there is evidence that professional learning is enhanced when experienced and new teachers learn from each other.

Methodology

The original research used a combination of quantitative and qualitative data collected across four key elements (online questionnaire, six regional focus groups, semi-structured individual interviews and case study schools). Six case study schools

participated (three primary and three secondary) in which semi-structured interviews were conducted with a range of staff: 14 managers (seven primary, seven secondary); 23 experienced classroom teachers (nine primary, 14 secondary); 25 early career teachers (11 primary, 14 secondary).

For the case study element, the research team asked local authorities to nominate schools which had considerable experience of inducting probationer teachers within the one year scheme. The schools selected also had to meet criteria for representativeness with regard to urban and rural situations as well as remote and high density locations. However, the fact that the local authorities nominated the schools for the case studies is an obvious limitation to the findings. In addition, the small number of participant schools means that the findings may not be representative across the profession. Given these caveats, it was important to be judicious in the interpretation of the data and to cross reference the findings from this element of the study with evidence from the other research strands. By contextualising the data from the case study element with information from the study as a whole, it can be said that the findings reported here give considerable insight into professional culture and professional learning within the chosen schools. While there was evidence of positive indicators for supportive induction processes, the case studies also highlighted inhibitors to professional development (which are explored later in this article). These inhibitors were also indicated in other elements of the wider study (see Hulme et al. 2008, 116).

The case study element investigated three themes:

- (1) perceptions of the impact of the Teacher Induction Scheme in the context of the school;
- (2) continuing professional development of teachers at an early career stage post-induction;
- (3) factors that promote or inhibit professional learning across the career stages.

To gather data on these aspects, semi-structured interviews were conducted with same-status groups (either experienced teachers or early career teachers). These represented pre-existing professional groups within the schools: participant behaviour was therefore more likely to approximate naturally occurring interaction and so generate responses which would be less affected by issues of power or status (Kitzinger 1994, 105). Interview data was transcribed and the original transcripts were open coded through line by line analysis. A tree node was then generated using NVivo software before the data set was further explored by means of text searches. In the following discussion, schools are coded as: P (primary) 1, 2 and 3; S (secondary) 1, 2 and 3. Participants are referred to as being part of the management team, as experienced teachers or as early career teachers. Each quotation from the transcript is identified by participant code and school code (for example: early career teacher/P2).

Key themes emerged from the case study data relating to factors which enhanced or hindered early professional development. Broadly, the supportive factors align with those outlined by McCormack, Gore and Thomas (2006): the importance of formal induction programmes, formal mentoring, and peer support from colleagues in school. Supportive factors will be discussed first, before moving on to look at what factors can hinder a new entrant's professional learning.

Factors which support early professional development

Our study found that professional learning among new entrants was enhanced by: formal and informal support systems, a welcoming and inclusive school or department ethos, collegiality, and less hierarchical management styles. Collegiality seems a better term to use, rather than collegiate working, because much of what was thought of as helpful arose from a range of informal situations. Less formal situations included the sharing of experiences, discussing practice, and the positive effect on the professional culture of the school (as the enthusiasm of beginning entrants encouraged more openness among staff). Data from the case study schools are presented below within four key areas which emerged from the transcript analysis: the induction scheme, collegiality, approachable management, and school ethos.

The induction scheme

The probationer teachers in our study were taking part in the one year induction scheme, and many of the early career teachers we interviewed had also done so. Taking part in the induction scheme means that a new entrant is offered formal mentoring, contact with a probationer supporter, a reduced timetable, and tailored professional development courses from the local education authority. The induction scheme was generally regarded positively by our participants. Probationer teachers spoke favourably about school and local education authority support (through continuing professional development courses). They particularly noted the encouragement they received in their schools, informally and through mentoring, as

well as through being given the chance to work with experienced teachers on school development initiatives.

Another important aspect of support came from observed lessons during the induction process, with new entrants welcoming the opportunities for feedback from experienced teachers on classroom practice. For some this was reminiscent of the assessed lessons undergone during initial teacher education, but it had proved beneficial and had offered a means of enhancing professional learning. There were, then, high levels of support through formal mentoring and observed lessons, but the new entrants repeatedly mentioned the importance of being able to speak with a staff informally about teaching and learning matters. One early career teacher [P3] said: ‘the staff have been so good – if I wanted support on any type of lesson I would think “who is best suited to that”? ...They’re brilliant. I just go and ask.’

Of course there are challenges for schools and staff in providing such high levels of support. It is time-consuming to mentor new entrants and, while experienced staff were willing to give this time, repeatedly having to do so involved a heavy investment of time and personal professional involvement. Frustration was evident that after giving extensive support and encouraging professional development, probationer teachers left at the end of the academic year and so the time spent on their development did not benefit the school.

Collegiality

All the case study schools had an informal policy of inviting probationer teachers and early career teachers to become involved in a variety of activities at whole school and

departmental level. The activities included joining working parties, leading extra-curricular activities, and participating in whole-school or departmental development across a number of initiatives (such as curriculum development, active learning development, and collaborative learning development). In this way new entrants were given the chance to develop knowledge of policy and practice within a more collegiate environment.

Many of the early career teachers we interviewed had been invited to participate as part of the school professional community in ways that extended beyond the legitimate peripheral participation identified by Lave and Wenger (in Fuller et al. 2005, 51). Most were developing a clear professional identity and felt that they had been given the chance to work as fully contributing staff members. This development was enhanced by decisions at management level to include probationer and early career teachers on collegiate working groups, as occurred in several of the case study schools. One headteacher [S1] said that there had been a ‘conscious decision to encourage probationer teachers to join whole-school development groups’. A developmental stance was therefore evident: by including probationer teachers in whole-school working groups they were given the chance to work with more experienced colleagues in authentic situations. In terms of working together, an experienced teacher [S3] stated that there had been ‘positive feedback from the probationers that we had last year and this year... they feel very strongly that they are instantly part of the team... [and] that their contributions are welcome just as much at committee level’.

Overall, the less formalised elements of collegiality were equally important in building a cooperative atmosphere. One early career teacher [S2] said that there was ‘a dialogue between the more experienced teachers and the ones who are new to the profession’. Another commented that there was ‘a two-way relationship’ between experienced and early career teachers in terms of professional working [early career teacher/S1]. This relationship was helped by the perception that beginning teachers had been well educated during initial teacher education, and so had legitimate knowledge and skills to offer. Senior managers and experienced teachers across the sectors commented on the overall quality and preparedness of beginning teachers. For example, an experienced teacher [S2] said that early career teachers had ‘great confidence... I think years ago we didn’t listen so much – they were there to listen to us, now we’re listening more to them’. This belies to some extent the concept of novices who are unsure of their professionalism (both in terms of identity and pedagogic knowledge).

However, there was a recognition that beginning teachers are at the start of their professional journey, no matter how well prepared they might be by their experiences during initial teacher education. A balanced skill mix in schools was therefore seen as an important element in effective early career development. One mentor stated that probationer teachers were ‘coming in with quite up to date skills and ideas... but they need the benefit of working with experienced teachers’ [senior management/P3]. Another teacher highlighted the aspect of being able to learn from each other because ‘there’s a nice balance... [Early career teachers] are fresh and wanting to impress... and it bounced off in our practice because we can actually

reflect and think. What's really good is that it works both ways' [experienced teacher/P3].

A key aspect of working collegially which emerged from the data was the sense that reciprocal professional learning was taking place, with more experienced teachers giving examples of how they had learned from new entrants. This finding accords with Fuller et al. (2005) whose research notes the importance to social relations of workplace learning within a context where 'novices' become 'experts' for some of the time and where 'experienced workers are also learning through their engagement with novices' (Fuller et al. 2005, 64). One experienced teacher in our study said: 'There's no feeling of well, wait a minute, you've only been teaching for three years we don't want to listen to you, because you want to hear what they are bringing because we know that we need these ideas' [experienced teacher/P1]. Another commented that 'barriers' had been 'broken down... relationships have become better – people are willing to take on new ideas' [senior management/S1]. This sense of reciprocity was also shared by the new entrants, one of whom said that the experienced teachers seemed 'excited about having new ideas' [early career teacher/P3]. It seems that the enthusiasm of the new entrants had a revitalizing effect which made the more experienced teachers willing to revisit their own teaching styles to broaden their repertoire of skills and knowledge:

'[Early career teachers] bring vitality to the school and they bring... a different way of looking at teaching...' [senior management/P3].

‘[T]hey just keep us on our toes and it’s really quite good fun... it’s really lifted the school’ [experienced teacher/P1].

‘[W]hat they add is the enthusiasm and energy they bring to the job... there’s just that enthusiasm and freshness about them to take on ideas, to listen to advice and [they] just impact on the school’ [senior management/S2].

There was, then, some indication of reciprocal professional development being part of a generalised shift from a culture of individualism towards a culture of collegiality, with benefits for the working practices of both experienced and early career teachers.

Management style

Early career teachers regarded less hierarchical styles of management as supporting their ability to learn. A more approachable management style was welcomed, with recognition that early career teachers should ‘feel confident to be able to approach older members of staff’ to ask advice informally [senior management/P2]. However, there was also a role for senior managers to help newer staff ‘identify strengths and areas for development’ through formal review mechanisms [senior management/P3]. Formal processes could therefore be seen as developmental rather than only being part of a harder-edged performance review.

Only in one of the case study primary schools did early career teachers think that the collegiate approach to management was a veneer, commenting that their contribution to school decision-making was ‘very much superficial, so it’s tick the

box' [early career teacher/P1]. Another stated that there was a 'culture of seeking permission whereas maybe if you were perhaps more of an experienced teacher you might just go ahead' with whatever teaching and learning strategies had been planned [early career teacher/P1]. However, even in this school, the early career teachers felt that their contributions were 'taken on board' by more experienced colleagues [early career teacher/P1]. Additionally, in one secondary school an experienced teacher [S1] alluded to a top-down structure saying 'the management are still the management, and we are still the teachers'. Moving from hierarchical structures towards collegiate management is evidently taking more time in some schools than in others.

School ethos

Wilson and Demetriou (2007) stress the importance to new teachers' learning of establishing supportive relations with colleagues. Our case studies also highlight this factor. Early career teachers welcomed the fact that they could approach any member of staff in their school or department/primary stage to ask for information or advice. One experienced teacher [S1] believed that early career teachers 'need reassurance, mainly, and they need to feel they can speak to anybody and ask for help – and I think that's all to do with the rapport that you have within your department and the relationships you have with colleagues'.

The early career teachers spoke about having access to informal networks of colleagues who could offer advice, and effective communication between staff was seen as important to creating a supportive ethos. Specific support offered to early career teachers varied across three key areas: the behavioural (how to fit in with professional cultures), the cognitive (developing knowledge and understanding of

teaching and learning) and the emotional. The experienced teachers in our study stressed the importance of providing support either formally through mentoring or being a stage partner in primary school, or informally by such things as pointing out where resources or materials are kept, sharing resources and ideas, or simply ‘making them feel welcome’ [early career teacher/P2]. Some adopted a more subtle approach to offering support to newer teachers:

I think we’re just used to nipping into each other’s classrooms at the end of the day or before, and you just sort of have a chat about anything... and then if they have got something to ask you it’s a lot easier for them to do that. They don’t have to come and seek us out [experienced teacher/P2].

Both early career and experienced teachers indicated that there was a great deal of meaningful interaction in small informal discussions as well as in the formal mentoring and review processes.

In general, our study indicates that learning among early career teachers is enabled by a supportive school culture, because their learning is so much predicated on meeting the challenges they encounter as they make the transition from student to novice teacher (see McCormack, Gore and Thomas 2006, 96). A supportive school culture enables the new teacher to better meet these challenges as they learn to ‘find a professional place within the school’ (McCormack, Gore and Thomas 2006, 96).

Inhibitors to learning

There were some inhibitors to early professional learning identified by the participants in the case study schools. The main barriers were seen as being:

- A lack of full-time employment posts after induction year.
- A lack of middle-management posts leaving new entrants unsure of future career paths.
- The perceived lack of structured support in schools and local authorities for teachers between years two and five.

Of these, the main source of frustration was the lack of full-time employment for new entrants once they had completed probation and successfully attained the Standard for Full Registration.

Figures from a GTC Scotland survey of 1478 teachers who had just completed their induction year in June 2008 show that 33.4% had gained permanent employment, with 79% overall in some form of employment (GTC Scotland 2008a). However, of those surveyed, 45.5% were in temporary work (GTC Scotland 2008b). Figures for 2009 show an increase to 89% of new entrants in some form of employment, with 44.2% in permanent posts, and 21.9% working as supply (relief) teachers (GTC Scotland 2009a). This indicates significant numbers of new entrants in temporary or supply (relief) posts. In terms of early career learning, temporary and relief employment tends to lead to reduced access to formal CPD opportunities within schools. Financially it is not always possible for schools to offer attendance at CPD courses to teachers on short-term contracts – something that was referred to by

several of our participants (early career teachers and CPD coordinators). In addition, early career teachers who are on supply may find that they are in schools for very short periods of time, or will move between several schools during an academic year. This denies them the opportunity to become part of the school team in a way that fosters collegiality, which may impact on their professional development. This situation is not unique to Scotland. Jenkins, Smith and Maxwell (2009) highlight similar difficulties faced by newly qualified teachers in Australia in terms of accessing continuity of support for professional learning.

For those who gain permanent employment in Scotland, there can be frustration at the lack of middle-management posts available in schools. Following the McCrone Report, restructuring of management positions took place and some middle management posts were lost (for example, assistant principal teachers of subject in secondary schools). In addition, secondary schools have increasingly moved towards faculty structures where previously independent subjects (each having a principal teacher) are merged under the leadership of a faculty head. There are thus fewer opportunities for teachers to apply for promotion around year seven of their careers. They may opt to follow the qualification route to gaining Chartered Teacher status after year seven, but this initiative is about financially and culturally recognizing good classroom practice – it is not a route to promotion. The Chartered Teacher initiative in Scotland was established in 2003 to give fully registered teachers the opportunity to extend their expertise in teaching and learning by studying towards the Standard for Chartered Teacher once they are at the top of the main grade salary scale (see GTC Scotland 2009b). While the Chartered Teacher route is acceptable for those who prefer not to seek management posts, the revised structures in Scottish

schools mean there is a limited career path for newly qualified teachers if they wish to seek promotion. A teacher in our study with five years experience stated that the lack of mid-career promoted posts could potentially hinder motivation and career planning: 'I'm just floating... There are no promotional opportunities at the school I'm in just now' [early career teacher/S1].

Early career teachers who had completed probation would also have welcomed more support following the induction year: 'when I started here as my first full-time job I felt that support disappeared ... It's not that there's no support, it's that the official support structure of your probation year is taken away' [early career teacher/S1]. Another agreed, saying that when they came into full-time teaching it was as though they 'had just been dropped from a high level of support into a full timetable' [early career teacher/S1]. Managers concurred with this to some extent, mentioning the need to support professional development more formally in the early years of teaching [management team/P3]. However, there was also mention of the need for early career teachers and probationers to be self-reliant to some degree. One experienced teacher said that some probationer teachers 'expect high levels of support, and some have competence issues which they may not be as able to address or recognise' [experienced teacher/S1]. It may be that formal induction has set up an expectation that support will continue beyond any probationary period. One early career teacher referred to the 'culture shock' of this transition so, for some, the 'practice shock' spoken of by Stokking et al. (2003) might simply be delayed by the induction year rather than avoided.

Conclusion

While the importance of quality induction for new teachers is indicated by research, there is a need to acknowledge that early career support should continue beyond the induction year. Some UK countries such as England and Northern Ireland are now providing opportunities for early professional development tailored to the needs of teachers between years two and five. However, the extent to which this support is seen in developmental terms varies. For example, the system in England expresses early professional development firmly in terms of performance management (TDA, no date). To be fair, there are elements of performativity across the career phases within the UK education systems, and beyond, relating to professional development with regard to the framing of professionalism within competence-based models (see Patrick, Forde and McPhee 2003). Arguably, early professional development which moves from a performance management approach towards a developmental approach might be preferable if a more rounded, autonomous professionalism is sought.

A 'developmental stance' is noted as a characteristic of effective induction schemes (Feiman-Nemser 2001, 1035), and elements of a developmental approach were seen in the schools that participated in our research. The findings indicate that this approach was evident but not always embedded in induction practices. However, there was a sense of shift from an individualized professional culture towards a culture where teachers were learning from one another within a framework which aimed to be explicitly supportive of early career development. While the teachers in our study did not speak of fully collaborative cultures in their schools, the indications were of changes to practice in line with Day's concept of 'bridging' towards more effective collaboration (Day in Williams, Prestage and Bedward 2001, 260).

Our study also highlights the importance of a collegiate ethos to professional development and suggests that informal collegiality may be as beneficial as structured collegiate activity in terms of providing the environment for beginning teachers to develop their knowledge and skills. The teachers in our case studies identified a collegiate approach as essential in this process, with reciprocal professional learning regarded as leading to a revitalisation of the professional culture in their schools. This revitalisation was not solely generated by the new entrants, although their enthusiasm played a part. It was also generated by experienced teachers who shared their pedagogic knowledge and skills, and who were open to learning from recently qualified colleagues. Culture change takes time, but there is evidence from our study that professionalism in some Scottish schools is developing towards a culture where individual and collective professional learning are both seen as cornerstones of effective teaching.

References

- Anthony, G., and K. Ord. 2008. Change-of-career secondary teachers: motivations, expectations and intentions. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education* 36, no. 4: 359–376.
- Bubb, S., and P. Early. 2006. Induction rights and wrongs: the ‘educational vandalism’ of new teachers’ professional development. *Journal of In-service Education* 32, no. 1: 5–12.
- Choi, P.L., and S.Y.F. Tang. 2009. Teacher commitment trends: Cases of Hong Kong teachers from 1997 to 2007. *Teaching and Teacher Education* 25: 767–777.
- Day, C., B. Elliot, and A. Kington. 2005. Reform, standards and teacher identity: Challenges of sustaining commitment. *Teaching and Teacher Education* 21: 563–577.
- Dooner, A-M., D. Mandzuk, and R.A. Clifton. 2008. Stages of collaboration and the realities of professional learning communities. *Teaching and Teacher Education* 24: 564–574.
- Dymoke, S., and J.K. Harrison. 2006. Professional development and the beginning teacher: issues of autonomy and institutional conformity in the performance review process. *Journal of Education for Teaching* 32, no. 1: 71–92.
- Ewing, R., and J. Manuel. 2005. Retaining quality early career teachers in the profession: New teacher narratives. *Change: Transformations in Education* 8, no. 1: 1–16.
- Eraut, M. 2004. Informal learning in the workplace. *Studies in Continuing Education* 26, no. 2: 247–273.

- Feiman-Nemser, S. 2001. From Preparation to Practice: Designing a Continuum to Strengthen and Sustain Teaching. *Teachers College Record* 103, no. 6: 1013–1055.
- Fuller, A., H. Hodkinson, P., Hodkinson, and L. Unwin. 2005. Learning as peripheral participation in communities of practice: a reassessment of key concepts in workplace learning. *British Educational Research Association* 31, no. 1: 49–68.
- Garcia, C.M., J.R. Slate, and C.T. Delgado. 2009. Salary and Ranking and Teacher Turnover. *International Journal of Policy and Leadership* 4, no. 7: 1–8.
- GTC Scotland. 2009(a). *Employment statistics for newly qualified teachers*. Edinburgh: GTCS. http://www.gtcs.org.uk/About_GTCS/Media_Centre/03.06.09-employment-survey-07-08-follow-up.aspx (accessed 9.11.2009).
- GTC Scotland. 2009 (b). *The Standard for Chartered Teacher*. Edinburgh: GTCS. http://www.gtcs.org.uk/Publications/StandardsandRegulations/The_Standard_for_Chartered_Teacher.aspx (accessed 8.12.2009).
- GTC Scotland. 2008a. *Employment statistics for newly qualified teachers*. Edinburgh: GTCS. http://www.gtcs.org.uk/About_GTCS/Media_Centre/04.06.08_employment_statistics_follow_up.aspx (accessed 14.12.2009).
- GTC Scotland. 2008b. *Employment Survey Report*. Edinburgh: GTCS.
- Grimsæth, G., G. Nordvik, and E. Bergsvik. 2008. The newly qualified teacher: a leader and a professional? *Journal of In-service Education* 34, no. 2: 219–236.
- Goddard, R., and R. O'Brien. 2003. Beginning teachers' perceptions of their work, well-being and intention to leave, *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education* 6, no. 2: 99–118.

- Harris, D.L., and H.M. Anthony. 2001. Collegiality and its Role in Teacher Development: perspectives from veteran and novice teachers. *Teacher Development* 5, no. 3: 371–389.
- Hobson, A.J., M-S Giannakaki, and G.N. Chambers. 2009. Who withdraws from initial teacher education and why? *Educational Researcher* 51, no. 3: 321–348.
- Hulme, M., D. Elliot, A.D. McPhee, and F. Patrick. 2008. *Professional culture among new entrants to the teaching profession: Report to the General Teaching Council for Scotland and the Scottish Government*. Edinburgh: GTCS/Scottish Government.
- Johnson, S.M., and S.E. Birkeland. 2003. Pursuing a ‘Sense of Success’: New Teachers Explain Their Career Decisions. *American Educational Research Journal* 40, no. 3: 581– 617.
- Jones, M. 2005. Fitting in, Feeling Excluded or Opting Out? An Investigation into the Socialisation Process of Newcomers to the Teaching Profession in Secondary Schools in England. *Journal of In-service Education* 31, no. 3: 509– 526.
- Kitzinger, J. 1994. The methodology of focus groups: the importance of interaction between research participants. *Sociology of Health and Illness* 16, no. 1: 103–121.
- Lindgren, U. 2005. Experiences of beginning teachers in a school-based mentoring program in Sweden. *Educational Studies* 31, no. 3: 251– 263.
- Malm, B. 2009. Towards a new professionalism: enhancing personal and professional development in teacher education. *Journal of Education for Teaching* 35, no. 1: 77– 91.

- McCormack, A., J. Gore, and K. Thomas. 2006. Early Career Teacher Professional Learning. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education* 43, no. 1: 95–113.
- McIntyre, J., A.J. Hobson, and N. Mitchell. 2009. Continuity, support, togetherness and trust: findings from an evaluation of a university–administered early professional development programme for teachers in England. *Professional Development in Education* 35, no. 3: 357– 379.
- O’Brien, J., and F. Christie. 2005. Characteristics of support for beginning teachers: evidence from the new Teacher Induction Scheme in Scotland. *Mentoring and Tutoring* 31, no. 2: 189–203.
- Patrick, F., C. Forde, and A.D. McPhee. 2003. Challenging the 'New Professionalism': from managerialism to pedagogy? *Journal of In-service Education* 29, no. 2: 237– 254.
- Scottish Executive Education Department. 2000. *A teaching profession for the 21st century. The Report of the Committee of Inquiry into professional conditions of service of teachers*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive Education Department
- Stokking, K., F. Leenders, E. de Jong, and J. van Tartwijk. 2003. From student to teacher: reducing practice shock and early dropout in the teaching profession. *European Journal of Teacher Education* 26, no. 3: 329–50.
- Training and Development Agency for Schools. No date. *Priorities for EPD*. <http://www.tda.gov.uk/partners/cpd/epd/priorities.aspx> (accessed 12/01/2009).
- Williams, A., S. Prestage, and A. Bedward. 2001. Individualism to Collaboration: the significance of teacher culture to the induction of newly qualified teachers. *Journal of Education for Teaching* 27, no. 3: 254–267.
- Wilson, E., and H. Demetriou. 2007. New teacher learning: substantive knowledge and contextual factors. *The Curriculum Journal* 18, no. 3: 213–229.

Notes on contributors

Dr Dely Elliot is a researcher with SCRE, which is situated within the Faculty of Education at the University of Glasgow. Her research has included exploring the role of emotions in teaching practice, contributory factors to learning effectiveness and learning in a cross-cultural context.

Dr Moira Hulme is a Research Fellow in the Faculty of Education at the University of Glasgow. Her research interests include professional knowledge in teacher education, practitioner enquiry and curriculum innovation.

Dr Alastair McPhee is an Honorary University Teacher with the Faculty of Education, University of Glasgow. He has conducted a range of research investigating the development of musical gift, musical intelligence and music education, teacher professional development and widening access to teacher education.

Dr Fiona Patrick is a lecturer in the Faculty of Education, University of Glasgow. Her main research interest is in the area of teacher professionalism, specifically the nature of teachers' work and the needs of beginning teachers in developing their professional identity.