

UC Irvine

UC Irvine Previously Published Works

Title

The Marwaris: From Traders to Industrialists. By Thomas A. Timberg. New Delhi: Vikas, 1979. vi, 176 pp. Appendixes, Bibliography, Glossary, Index. \$15.95. (Distributed by Advent Books, New York.)

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/25g5d0nk>

Journal

The Journal of Asian Studies, 42(2)

ISSN

0021-9118

Author

Leonard, Karen

Publication Date

1983-02-01

DOI

10.2307/2055160

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Peer reviewed

land remained that of the peasant" (pp. 63–64). Here, as elsewhere in the study, the author's tendency is to collapse his findings into such neat but simple polarities as tradition and modernity.

Similar problems vitiate his use of the concept of the peasant household, which is described in the introduction as central to his thesis. But the concept is never fully developed and seems to mean little more than peasant families who are engaged in subsistence agriculture and, by definition, either impervious to, or pitted against, the mechanisms of the market. When Swartzberg finally elaborates on the concept in the conclusion (chap. 5), he is content to cull long quotes from Karl Polanyi and other authorities. A. V. Chayanov's theory of peasant economy crops up belatedly in this section, too late to supply a framework of analysis for viewing the wider economic and social articulations of the peasant household. Alas, *The North Indian Peasant Goes to Market* does not live up to its title.

ANAND A. YANG
University of Utah

The Marwaris: From Traders to Industrialists. By THOMAS A. TIMBERG. New Delhi: Vikas, 1979. vi, 176 pp. Appendixes, Bibliography, Glossary, Index. \$15.95. (Distributed by Advent Books, New York.)

The Marwaris are emigrant businessmen from Rajasthan and have contributed significantly to India's economic development. For this book, Thomas Timberg did extensive research in India on the Marwaris. In addition to public and English language materials, he used privately held family and business records, Gujarati and Hindi publications, and interviewed relevant informants. The book is often interesting and informative, but it is also immensely frustrating.

There are three major problems with this book. One is its poor organization and editing, perhaps stemming from its origin as a Ph.D. thesis. Historical themes are prominent—the nineteenth-century migrations of Marwari firms from Rajasthan, their relationships with various political and economic powers, their changing investment patterns over time—but the author's sense of chronology is hazy. The disorderly presentation of historical data prevents the reader from, for example, following the development of an argument about traditional Marwari family firms and their adaptability to the modern economy, but it is not clear that Timberg is making such an argument.

That brings us to the second major problem—the lack of an argument and the failure to use the data to test anything. Many of the elements for hypothesis testing are present: significant issues and a review of the social science literature on them to date (entrepreneurship, migration theory); detailed census data on Marwari places of origin and settlement; case studies of particularly successful "great firms." But these elements are not linked together to address a problem. They are simply presented, an example of what a colleague calls the "suitcase method" of doing Indian history—the collection of lots of fascinating material in India and its unpacking, more or less as collected, on arrival home.

Unfortunately, even the usual benefits of the "suitcase method"—a sound chronology and the reproduction of detailed, reliable information that others can use—are denied us because of the third major problem with this book. The data and

its sources are so confusingly and inconsistently described and presented that one cannot really make sense of it or feel confident about using it.

More frustrating is the attempt to learn about the sample: "so much of this volume depends on my use of sample Marwari firms" (p. 115). This sample was constituted largely but not entirely from four Hindi caste histories published in the 1930s. I could not find a discussion of the remaining sources. Timberg does tell us the admittedly rather arbitrary criteria by which some firms were omitted from the sample, but not how many were thus omitted nor how many were left in the sample. In his discussion of the sample results, Timberg has allowed totals in table 11 to deviate from the totals he specifies in the text (for example, in the categories "Aggarwal firms" or "Marwari firms in Calcutta," pp. 114-17).

The same kind of inconsistency marks other parts of the book, where individual or corporate groups rather than firms are being discussed. Table 6-A shows no Marwaris born in Rajasthan resident in Bengal in 1901, but Table 7 shows 7,000 Marwaris born in Rajasthan in 1901, for example. And Timberg never succeeds in clearly delineating the subgroups within the category of Marwari or their relationships with each other.

Despite these serious problems, the book introduces important issues in Indian social and economic history. Appendix B, which reproduces satirical cartoons of Maheshwari reformers, is quite delightful, and the excellent bibliography testifies to pioneering and diligent research work.

KAREN LEONARD

University of California, Irvine

The Ordeal of Love: C. F. Andrews and India. By HUGH TINKER. New York: Oxford University Press, 1980. 315 pp. Sources, Index. \$17.50 (cloth).

It is hard to be objective about Tinker's marvelous biography of that curious do-gooder and fellow traveler of the Indian nationalists, C. F. Andrews, for his is the story of the sympathetic Western encounter with Asia. The great era for that encounter peaked and began its decline during Andrew's lifetime, and yet the quests that propelled him and the images of Asia that captivated him are not unlike many of our own.

We envy Andrews' freedom. Sent to Asia as a missionary, teacher, and writer, Andrews had the run of India. He yearned for a spiritual freedom as well and cast free from his cultural past, severed his institutional ties and embarked on a personal mission for spiritual truth and social service that led him directly to Tagore and Gandhi and the Arya Samaji, Munshi Ram. At the same time he maintained his ties to the British: his intimates included Lord Hardinge, Lord Irwin, and a host of Christian universalists and Indian sympathizers back home. Andrews became a central mediator in British negotiations with the nationalists; they, in turn, sent him to intercede on their behalf in issues involving Indian citizens in places as diverse as South Africa and the South Pacific. It seems Andrews was everywhere at once, square in the middle of some of this century's most interesting company and most formative events.

Andrews lived out a role in India to which any sympathetic Westerner might