### The Political Economy of Terrorism

The Political Economy of Terrorism presents a widely accessible approach to the study of terrorism that combines economic methods with political analysis and realities. It applies economic methodology - theoretical and empirical - along with political analysis to the study of domestic and transnational terrorism. In so doing, the book provides both a qualitative and a quantitative investigation of terrorism in a balanced, up-to-date presentation that informs students, policymakers, researchers, and the general reader of the current state of knowledge of the subject. Included in the treatment are historical aspects of the phenomenon, a discussion of watershed events, the rise of modern-day terrorism, examination of current trends, the dilemma of liberal democracies, evaluation of counterrorism, and analvsis of hostage incidents. Rational-actor models of terrorist and government behavior and game-theoretic analysis are presented for readers with no prior theoretical training. Where relevant, the authors display graphs using the data set International Terrorism: Attributes of Terrorist Events (ITERATE) and other data sets.

Walter Enders holds the Bidgood Chair of Economics and Finance at the University of Alabama. He has published numerous research articles in eminent journals such as the *Review of Economics and Statistics, Quarterly Journal of Economics, American Economic Review, Journal of Economic Literature, Journal of Business and Economic Statistics, and the American Political Science Review.* Professor Enders's *Applied Econometric Time-Series* is a leading book in the field. He is a current holder (along with Todd Sandler) of the National Academy of Sciences' Estes Award for Behavioral Research Relevant to the Prevention of Nuclear War for their pathbreaking work on understanding terrorism.

Todd Sandler holds the Robert R. and Katheryn A. Dockson Professorship of International Relations, Economics, and Law at the University of Southern California. He has written or edited nineteen books, including *Global Collective Action, Economic Concepts for the Social Sciences, The Political Economy of NATO* (with Keith Hartley), and *Global Challenges: An Approach to Economic, Political, and Environmental Problems*, all published by Cambridge University Press, as well as more than two hundred journal articles in economics and political science. Professor Sandler's work on terrorism dates back to 1983. In 2003, he was the corecipient (with Walter Enders) of the National Academy of Sciences' Estes Award for Behavioral Research Relevant to the Prevention of Nuclear War.

# The Political Economy of Terrorism

### WALTER ENDERS

University of Alabama

### TODD SANDLER

University of Southern California



## CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521851009 - The Political Economy of Terrorism Walter Enders and Todd Sandler Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

> > Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521851008

© Walter Enders and Todd Sandler 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Enders, Walter, 1948– The political economy of terrorism / Walter Enders, Todd Sandler. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0-521-85100-9 – ISBN 0-521-61650-6 1. Terrorism. 2. Terrorism – Economic aspects. I. Sandler, Todd. II. Title. HV6431.E54 2006 303.6'25 – dc22 2005016251

> ISBN-13 978-0-521-85100-8 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-85100-9 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-61650-8 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-61650-6 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

> To Linda Enders and to the memory of Henry Sandler (1939–2005)

# Contents

List of Tables and Figures		page viii
Preface		xi
1	Terrorism: An Introduction	1
2	The Dilemma of Liberal Democracies	24
3	Statistical Studies and Terrorist Behavior	52
4	Counterterrorism	84
5	Transference	111
6	International Cooperation: Dilemma and Inhibitors	134
7	Hostage Taking	160
8	After 9/11	188
9	The Economic Impact of Transnational Terrorism	203
10	Homeland Security	224
11	The Future of Terrorism	245
References		259
Author Index		269
Subject Index		

# Tables and Figures

#### TABLES

1.1	Some Terrorist Tactics	page 8
1.2	Historical Terrorist Campaigns	19
2.1	Odds Ratio for Presence of Terrorist Group	29
2.2	Features Distinguishing Left-Wing from Fundamentalist	
	Terrorists	48
3.1	Key Variables in ITERATE	59
3.2	Number of Incidents by Type (1968–2003): ITERATE	
	Data	59
3.3	Cyclical Properties of the Terrorist Time Series	72
3.4	Impact of Metal Detectors on Skyjackings: Intervention	
	Analysis	78
3.5	Interventions	81
3.6	Effects of the Interventions	82
5.1	Description of the Intervention Variables	130
5.2	Results of the VAR	132
6.1	Essential Asymmetries between Terrorists and Targeted	
	Governments	144
6.2	Global and Regional Conventions and Treaties Relating	
	to Controlling International Terrorism	152
6.3	International Efforts against the Funding of Terrorism	156
7.1	Select Key Hostage-Taking Incidents Prior to 1986	166
7.2	Select Hostages Captured during the 1982–1992	
	Lebanon Hostage Crisis	172
7.3	Select Hostages Captured during 2004 in Iraq	174

	Tables and Figures	ix
7.4	Significant Determinants of Various Aspects of Hostage	
	Incidents	184
8.1	Summary Statistics of the Various Incident Types by	
	Income Group	197
8.2	Summary Statistics of the Various Incident Types by	
	Region	200
9.1	Insured Losses of Other Terrorist and Natural Disasters	205
10.1	Highlights of the USA Patriot Act (HR 3162)	226
10.2	Directorates and Mission Agencies of Homeland	
	Security	229
10.3	Total Budget Authority by Organization as of	
	31 January 2004	232
10.4	Homeland versus Nonhomeland Security Funding	
	Breakdown, Fiscal Years 2004 and 2005	234
11.1	Potential Mass-Casualty Terrorist Attacks	249
11.2	Select Mass-Casualty Terrorist Attacks	251
11.3	Inhibiting and Promoting Factors Regarding Terrorists'	
	Use of WMDs	253
11.4	Past Incidents of Chemical, Biological, and Radiological	
	Terrorism	254

#### FIGURES

2.1	Terrorism-civil liberties constraint	32
2.2	Indifference map for terrorism-civil liberties trade-off	33
2.3	Social equilibrium	34
2.4	Alternative equilibriums	35
2.5	Transnational terrorist incidents: 1968-2003	41
2.6	Proportion of US transnational terrorist incidents:	
	1968–2003	42
2.7	Suicide incidents: quarterly, 1981–2001	49
2.8	Victims of suicide: quarterly, 1981–2001	50
3.1	Annual number of sunspots	53
3.2	All incidents and bombings	61
3.3	Hostage takings and assassinations	62
3.4	Threats and hoaxes	64
3.5	Incidents with deaths and casualties	65
3.6	The proportion of lethal incidents	66
3.7	Suicide bombings in Israel	67
3.8	Typical intervention functions	75

# CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521851009 - The Political Economy of Terrorism Walter Enders and Todd Sandler Frontmatter More information

x Tables and Figures		
3.9	US domestic transnational skyjackings	77
4.1	Terrorists' resource constraints	86
4.2	Prisoners' Dilemma	93
4.3	Chicken and assurance games	95
4.4	Two-target preemption game	97
4.5	Six-nation preemption game	97
4.6	Asymmetric preemption game	99
4.7	Two-target deterrence game	100
4.8	Deterrence versus preemption – symmetric case	102
4.9	Deterrence versus preemption – asymmetric case	103
4.10	Weakest-link security risk	105
4.11	Best-shot security innovation	107
5.1	Expected utility of a potential skyjacker	113
5.2	Indifference curves for terrorist and nonterrorist actions	118
5.3	The optimal allocation	119
5.4	Increasing the cost of terrorist attacks	120
5.5	Reduction in terrorists' resources	121
5.6	Substitutability between attack modes	123
5.7	Substitutions between attack modes	131
6.1	Transnational external costs	137
6.2	Transnational external benefits	139
6.3	Prisoners' Dilemma viewed from period 2 of a	
	two-period game	146
6.4	Freezing assets: coordination game	148
7.1	Percentage of hostage-taking missions	164
7.2	Game theory for hostage event	179
8.1	Proportion of incident types in the LIC group	195
8.2	Casualty incidents by region	198
9.1	Macroeconomic variables and 9/11	210
9.2	Net capital stock held by foreigners in Spain	222
10.1	Organizational chart of the Department of Homeland	
	Security	230

### Preface

Prior to the four hijackings of 11 September 2001 (hereafter 9/11), the study of terrorism was an active field of research, with many new books appearing each year. Since 9/11, the study of terrorism is an even more active field of research, with even more books appearing each year. Hence, one must wonder why another book merits one's attention.

This book presents a widely accessible political economy approach that combines economic methods with political analysis and realities. In so doing, the book provides both a qualitative and a quantitative investigation of terrorism in a balanced, up-to-date presentation that informs students, practitioners, policymakers, researchers, and the general reader of the current state of knowledge. Most books on terrorism focus on historical, cultural, factual, and conceptual details and shy away from rational-choice-based analyses backed by statistical inference. Our book presents not only the historical and conceptual issues, but also the scientific-based analyses of the behavior of terrorists and government policymakers. Moreover, we are concerned with knowing how these adversaries make rational decisions in a strategic interactive framework. That is, how do the choices of the terrorists influence governments' counterterrorism policies, and how do these policies affect the choices of the terrorists? The strategic interactions among targeted governments are also investigated. To establish the relevancy of the theories presented, we display data and review statistical findings from a variety of studies.

Although we are particularly interested in rational-choice models and their empirical verification, we are no less interested in the history of terrorism, the causes of terrorism, and the dilemma faced by liberal democracies. Unlike other books, this book identifies rational explanations for

#### xii

#### Preface

observed behavior – for example, why terrorist groups cooperate and form networks with one another, while targeted governments are slow to cooperate. We address many questions, including the following: When confronted with a common terrorist threat, why do targeted governments rely on defensive measures that merely deflect attacks to soft targets, and often eschew proactive responses that would reduce the threat for all governments? Why do countries fail, at times, to adhere to a stated policy of not conceding to hostage takers' demands when it is in their long-run interests never to concede? Which counterterrorism policies work best?

By applying simple economic models and statistical analyses, our book provides a unique perspective on the study of terrorism. This perspective is increasingly being used at the Centers of Excellence, funded by the Department of Homeland Security. To better understand terrorism and to counter its threat, society must apply varied techniques and knowledge from many disciplines – for example, history, sociology, law, psychology, statistics, and economics. Our book draws insights from all of these disciplines. If one looks through a typical book on terrorism, especially those used in college courses, one will find few, if any, statistical displays of the incidence of terrorist events over time. More important, these books do not present any analysis or explanation of these patterns of events. Most books rely, instead, on some "watershed" events or case studies to draw some general principles. By contrast, we present data on terrorist events over time to bolster our investigation of numerous watershed incidents. Thus, our book is rich in detail about past terrorist events and the changing pattern of terrorism.

Our book is intended for use in college-level economics, political science, and public policy classes on terrorism. The book will also be appropriate for classes at military colleges. Our approach will particularly appeal to teachers who want to emphasize a rational-choice basis for understanding terrorism and policies to ameliorate its threat. The book assumes no pre-knowledge of the techniques used. Thus, the game-theoretic methods are explained in detail for readers who have never seen a game matrix or game tree. The book is also useful for researchers who are new to the field and who may be driven to study terrorism because of their interest in the topic or the availability of funding from numerous sources since 9/11. Our book allows a researcher to gain the requisite background in the field, because we have incorporated a rich and diverse set of references and techniques. The interested reader can consult our references for further details about a particular approach or analysis. In addition, the book should interest people in the Department of Homeland Security,

#### Preface

the intelligence community, the defense sector, law enforcement, and the insurance industry, all of whom have to address myriad issues concerning modern-day terrorism. Our book provides a different way of thinking about terrorism.

We have profited from perceptive comments on various drafts from two anonymous reviewers. We have received helpful support and counsel from Scott Parris, the economics editor at Cambridge University Press (CUP). We also appreciate the efforts of the production staff at CUP, who transformed the typescript into a book. Sara Fisher typed and retyped the many drafts of the book; we appreciate her care and cheerfulness. We acknowledge our debt to our coauthors of articles, where some of the concepts applied here were originally developed. Prominent on this list are Dan Arce, Jon Cauley, Harvey Lapan, Kevin Siqueira, and John Tschirhart. Others include Scott Atkinson, Dwight Lee, B. Peter Rosendorff, and John Scott. This project succeeded because of the support of our wives – Linda Enders and Jeannie Murdock – and our children. Todd Sandler acknowledges research funding from the Center for International Studies, University of Southern California.

Tuscaloosa and Los Angeles April 2005 WALTER ENDERS Bidgood Chair of Economics and Finance University of Alabama

TODD SANDLER Robert R. and Katheryn A. Dockson Professor of International Relations, Economics, and Law University of Southern California xiii