

## The Practice of Global Citizenship

In this novel account of global citizenship, Luis Cabrera argues that all individuals have a global duty to contribute directly to human rights protections and to promote rights-enhancing political integration between states. The Practice of Global Citizenship blends careful moral argument with compelling narratives from field research among unauthorized immigrants, activists seeking to protect their rights, and the 'Minuteman' activists striving to keep them out. Immigrantrights activists, especially those conducting humanitarian patrols for border-crossers stranded in the brutal Arizona desert, are shown as embodying aspects of global citizenship. Unauthorized immigrants themselves are shown to be enacting a form of global 'civil' disobedience, claiming the economic rights central to the emerging global normative charter while challenging the restrictive membership regimes that are the norm in the current global system. Cabrera also examines the European Union, seeing it as a crucial laboratory for studying the challenges inherent in expanding citizen membership.

Luis Cabrera is Senior Lecturer in Political Theory at the University of Birmingham, where he also serves as an associate member of the Centre for the Study of Global Ethics.



# The Practice of Global Citizenship

Luis Cabrera





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521128100

© Luis Cabrera 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Cabrera, Luis, 1966 –

The practice of global citizenship / Luis Cabrera.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-19936-0 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-12810-0 (pbk.)

1. World citizenship. 2. Human rights. 3. Cosmopolitanism. I. Title.

JZ1320.4.C33 2010

323.6-dc22

2010024607

ISBN 978-0-521-19936-0 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-12810-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Alice



## Contents

	Preface Acknowledgments	page ix xii
	Introduction	1
	Part I: Theoretical concerns	11
1	Global citizenship as individual cosmopolitanism	13
2	Rights, duties, and global institutions	34
3	Defining and distributing duties	66
	Part II: Global citizenship in practice	97
4	Minutemen and desert samaritans: citizenship practice in conflict	99
5	Mobile global citizens	131
6	Global citizen duties within less-affluent states	154
	Part III: Advocacy and institutions	179
7	Regional citizenship and global citizenship	181
8	Advocacy duties and global democracy	211
9	Education and motivation for global citizenship	238
	Conclusion: the practice of global citizenship	258
	Appendix Works cited Index	263 265 305

vii



## Preface

You have to burn some shoe rubber to get the story. That was the axiom drilled into me as a cub reporter for The Associated Press, some time ago now. Only so much can be learned through the telephone, my senior colleagues advised. To tell the story right, you need to be able to take in the look, the feel, and even the smell of a place. You need to observe your subjects in their own surroundings, try to develop a genuine sense of where and how they live their lives. Something similar is true, I am increasingly coming to believe, of the political theorist's work. A theory argument, especially if it has clear policy implications, can benefit enormously from engagement with salient actors in their own contexts, offering their own justifications for action, and their own insights on possibilities for change.

When I began this book, I was already several years distant from filing my last story on the AP wire. I had completed the transition from reporter to academic, fulfilling a long-held ambition to be able to delve more deeply into arguments and issues, and to develop my own positions on them. I knew precious little at first about the immigration context that figures so centrally in this work. I quickly became frustrated with trying to think through the issues arising, especially around unauthorized immigration, using what I could glean from theoretical treatments, news, and non-fiction accounts. So, I began to accompany colleagues' classes on experiential learning trips to the border between the US state of Arizona and the Mexican state of Sonora. I was exposed with their students to ground-level views of border economics, deprivation, and the reasons behind mass unauthorized entry. I began to meet some of the activists who had for decades been bringing issues of social justice from the borderlands to national and global audiences.

My intention had been to follow an earlier theoretical argument for institutional cosmopolitanism – a macro-level case for the desirability and feasibility of some forms of global political integration – with a straightforward theoretical treatment of the individual duties that

ix



#### x Preface

could arise in such a frame. Unauthorized immigration had seemed to be an area in which many issues of global justice came to a head, and one which could be a productive site for the exploration of duties applicable to all persons. It became apparent, after my first few trips to the border, that I would have to conduct some more systematic field study if I were to fully grasp the significance of unauthorized immigration for individual duties, or global citizenship, as I was coming to conceive of the project. With the help of numerous colleagues, I took what was effectively a crash course in qualitative methodology. I also gave close study to the relatively few political theory works at that time which had sought to incorporate original empirical research – in particular Jane Mansbridge's (1983) seminal study of democracy in practice at Vermont town meetings and among workers at a community crisis center.

I began to seek out those conducting humanitarian patrols for unauthorized crossers who were stranded and at risk of dying in the desert, as well as immigration-rights activists more generally. Both groups seemed to me to be clearly practicing aspects of global citizenship. I also wanted to observe and interview those "civilian border patrol" members of the Minuteman Project in Arizona. They appeared to be enacting a stringently nation-centric form of citizenship in taking it upon themselves to guard their own international boundary against unauthorized entry. Initial interviews and field observations quickly corrected an error in my approach. I found that I had neglected perhaps the most important set of global-citizen actors: unauthorized immigrants themselves. Such individuals were, more than any others, acting as though it were already possible to be a global citizen. They crossed borders in search of opportunities for themselves and their family members. They often made civic contributions in both their host and sending communities. Further, they appeared to be practicing something akin to global "civil" disobedience in attempting, by violating entry laws, to claim economic and other rights that are enumerated in major human rights treaties. They had a strong sense that their violation was morally permissible.

Later fieldwork involved going closer to the source of unauthorized immigration in North America, in this case the immigrant-sending state of Veracruz, Mexico. Veracruz was a particularly significant site. It provided the opportunity to speak with groups of ordinary Mexicans offering food and shelter to Central Americans riding atop freight trains to the US border. That is probably the most dangerous means of making the journey. Riders are frequently preyed on by gangs and Mexican authorities, and many lose limbs or their lives when they fall under the moving trains. Interviews and observations with those aiding the riders



Preface xi

reinforced a sense that individuals within less-affluent states could, and often already did, discharge significant global-citizen duties.

Field research in Western Europe, and especially in the North African Spanish enclave of Ceuta, helped to complete the picture and reveal important similarities across contexts. European activist groups lobbied to have rights protections extended to all persons, regardless of immigration status. Prospective unauthorized entrants went to often extraordinary lengths to try to reach European soil. They spoke of weeks-long treks through the Sahara Desert, where many saw their companions drop and die beside them. Or they had tried to run the gauntlet of the Gibraltar crossing, or the more dangerous ocean crossing from Africa's northwest coast to the Spanish-controlled Canary Islands, a route that has claimed thousands of lives in the past decade. It would take a book much longer than this one to do such stories justice. What hopefully will emerge, however, is the richness of both the empirical and theoretical contexts of global citizenship, and the importance of bringing excluded voices into global justice debates, including within works such as this one. Individuals who are pressing at the normative edges of the current global system are often capable of speaking eloquently, or with simple power, about why they act as they do. Their insights fundamentally inform the theoretical treatment of global citizenship here, as well as the possibilities identified for institutional transformation.



# Acknowledgments

This work has been a collaboration from the start. It is the end product of a conversation stretching back several years with academic colleagues in two hemispheres, and with hundreds of interviewees, all better informed about specific empirical issues than I was, and all gracious enough to take the time to set me straight. Any errors remaining are my own.

I would like to thank first the members of activist groups, nongovernmental organizations, and aid efforts who offered extended guidance, often in multiple interviews and written contact. These include Paco Villagran, Laura Ilardo, Delmi Ortega, and Jason Odhner of No More Deaths Phoenix; Tommy Bassett of Just Coffee; Rick Ufford-Chase, formerly of BorderLinks; Kiko Trujillo of BorderLinks Mexico, Rev. Gene Lefebvre and Rev. John Fife of No More Deaths Tucson, Margo Cowan and Lupe Castillo of No More Deaths Tucson, Rev. Robin Hoover and Rev. Liana Rowe of Humane Borders, Ray Ybarra of the American Civil Liberties Union, Kim Lambert of Christian Peacemakers, Melissa Rodis of the Arizona League to End Regional Trafficking, and Linda Bayless of Samaritans. I thank Michele LeVoy of PICUM in Brussels, Don Flynn of the Migrant Rights Network (UK), and especially Deirdre Coghlan in Dublin. Deserving special thanks, and continuing to serve as an inspiration for the author and many others, is Sister Alma Delia Isais Aguilar of the Order of Colima in Mexico. I also would like to thank leaders of the Minuteman Project and related groups who took time for multiple interviews and accepted invitations to speak to classes and in public events. These include in particular Chris Simcox, Frank Alvarez, and Stacey O'Connor. Though many of their views are critically engaged in this work, I have strived to present them accurately and fairly.

Among academic colleagues, particular thanks are owed to Barbara Tinsley, then Chair of the Department of Social and Behavioral Sciences at Arizona State University West campus, for material support that made crucial portions of the fieldwork possible. Prof. Tinsley also offered invaluable guidance and encouragement at several stages. For similar

xii



## Acknowledgments

xiii

support, I thank Emily Cutrer, former Dean of the ASU New College of Interdisciplinary Arts and Sciences. For reading portions of the manuscript and offering extremely constructive written comments, I thank Mark Beeson, Andre Broome, Thomas Diez, Catherine Lu, Raffaele Marchetti, Richard North, Tom Sorell, Zornitsa Stoyanova, and especially the anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press. I thank in particular David Bailey and Christopher Finlay at the University of Birmingham for their constructive comments and many collegial discussions; and Jamie Mayerfeld at the University of Washington for still taking the time to offer critique when and how it is needed, and for so brilliantly modeling enthusiasm and encouragement for students. I thank also the editors of the Press, including Andrew Shackleton, for highly competent copy editing, Carrie Parkinson, Christina Sarigiannidou, and particularly John Haslam, for his work in shepherding this project through.

For helpful guidance and comments, I thank also Brooke Ackerly, Daniele Archibugi, Terence Ball, Gillian Brock, Steve Buckler, James Caporaso, Paula Casal, David Coon, Campbell Craig, Christine DiStefano, Roxanne Doty, Dan Deudney, Richard Falk, Sonya Glavac, Anna Guevarra, Patrick Hayden, Bonnie Honig, Christine Keating, Kristin Koptiuch, Mika LaVaque-Manty, Seth Lazar, Katy Long, Paul Miller, Darrel Moellendorf, Jeremy Moss, Carol Mueller, Julie Murphy Erfani, Edward Newman, James Nickel, Ronen Palan, James Pattison, Elias Robles-Sotelo, Richard Shorten, Henry Shue, Richard Sigurdson, William Simmons, Asaf Siniver, Dianne Solís, Leandro Soto, Michael Stancliff, Michelle Tellez, Christien Van Den Anker, Suzanne Vaughn, Alex Wendt, Gillian Wylie, Lea Ypi, and Christopher Zurn. Jeffrey Anastasi and Sonya Glavac deserve special thanks as research collaborators on related work. Dr. Anastasi should also be recognized for his exceptional commitment as co-chair of an annual campus service drive, discussed in Chapter 9, which supported a locally initiated and operated hot-lunch program for children in Nogales, Mexico. Finally, I thank Pablo Pumares Fernández, Professor of Human Geography at the Universidad de Almería, for offering invaluable guidance on the Spanish immigration context, and for providing introductions to key interviewees.

For research assistance in Spain, I thank Frédérique Guilbot, whose superb organizational skills and ability to interpret in several languages made much of the fieldwork there possible. I thank also Lisa Wood for rapid and accurate transcription of interviews, and Liam Clegg for fine work on preliminary coding of qualitative data. For additional research assistance or help on related projects, I thank in particular Esmeralda Gonzalez and Erika Cecilia Pacheco, as well as Mike Archer, Stan



### xiv Acknowledgments

Buzzelle, Brandie Doyle, Imran Kirkland, Ponteciana Lukau, Roberto Manriquez, Stephanie Ortiz, Jessi Pederson, Angel Sotelo, Lisa Steenson, and Emily Taylor. Thanks are owed also to students at ASU West and the University of Birmingham, in particular in the courses Transnational Justice at ASU and Global Ethics at Birmingham, for providing some important challenges to arguments as the project developed.

I thank my father, Angel Luis Cabrera II, for sound professional advice and encouragement. He passed away in March 2006, in the early stages of this work. I thank my mother, Carrel Cabrera, for a lifetime's worth of moral support, and for continuing to teach me how to get the job done; as well as my in-laws, Drs. Laura and Glenn Ayers, for many years of encouragement and wise counsel. I especially thank my wife, Alice, for extraordinary patience in an inordinately long process of research, writing, and distributing to her an unequal share of the family duties. Rectification surely is owed. I thank Alice also for her ability to expose flimsy theoretical arguments, and of course for the countless ways in which she has supported this project and me. I am pleased also to be able to thank our daughter Cristina, 12, for serving as a thoughtful first audience for many of the ideas presented here, and our daughter Kittrell, 7, for her burgeoning skill as a critic. Peering over my shoulder at the computer screen one day, she advised, "Write something more interesting, or by the time your colleagues read the first page they'll fall asleep." Such prodding can only have improved subsequent drafts.

Some field research conducted in the United Kingdom, Ireland, and Brussels was underwritten by British Academy Grant SG-50879. I thank the academy for this support. I thank also the Arizona State University New College of Interdisciplinary Arts and Sciences for internal grants that made initial field research possible in 2005–06.

A version of Chapter 1 appeared as Luis Cabrera, "Global Citizenship as the Completion of Cosmopolitanism," *Journal of International Political Theory* 4(1): 84–104.

A version of Chapter 8 appeared as Luis Cabrera, "The Inconveniences of Transnational Democracy," *Ethics & International Affairs* **21**(2): 219–38.

Some material in Chapter 9 was drawn from Luis Cabrera, "An Archaeology of Borders: Qualitative Political Theory as a Tool in Addressing Moral Distance," *Journal of Global Ethics* 5(2): 109–23.

All royalties from this work go to One World Action www. oneworldaction.org. That London-based NGO, through its collaboration with dozens of affiliate organizations in developing states, exemplifies in many ways the partnership aid orientation that is advocated in Chapter 6.