

The Pragmatic Enlightenment

This is a study of the political theory of the Enlightenment, focusing on four leading eighteenth-century thinkers: David Hume, Adam Smith, Montesquieu, and Voltaire. Dennis C. Rasmussen calls attention to the particular strand of the Enlightenment these thinkers represent, which he terms the "pragmatic Enlightenment." He defends this strand of Enlightenment thought against both the Enlightenment's critics and some of the more idealistic Enlightenment figures who tend to have more followers today, such as John Locke, Immanuel Kant, and Jeremy Bentham. Professor Rasmussen argues that Hume, Smith, Montesquieu, and Voltaire exemplify an especially attractive type of liberalism, one that is more realistic, moderate, flexible, and contextually sensitive than most other branches of this tradition.

Dennis C. Rasmussen is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Tufts University. He is the author of *The Problems and Promise of Commercial Society: Adam Smith's Response to Rousseau* (2008), which received an honorable mention for the Delba Winthrop Award for Excellence in Political Science.





The Pragmatic Enlightenment

Recovering the Liberalism of Hume, Smith, Montesquieu, and Voltaire

DENNIS C. RASMUSSEN

Tufts University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107045002

© Dennis C. Rasmussen 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Rasmussen, Dennis Carl, 1978-

The pragmatic enlightenment : recovering the liberalism of Hume, Smith, Montesquieu, and Voltaire / Dennis C. Rasmussen, Tufts University.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04500-2 (hardback)

1. Enlightenment. 2. Liberalism. 3. Hume, David, 1711–1776. 4. Smith, Adam, 1723–1790. 5. Montesquieu, Charles de Secondat, baron de, 1689–1755. 6. Voltaire, 1694–1778. I. Title.

B802.R375 2013

148-dc23 2013022249

ISBN 978-1-107-04500-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

A Note on the Citations		page vii
Ac	knowledgments	ix
	Introduction	I
HEGEMONIC UNIVERSALISM?		25
I.	Morality in Context	27
2.	Pragmatic Liberalism	80
BLIND FAITH IN REASON?		133
3.	The Age of the Limits of Reason	135
4.	The Perils of Political Rationalism	191
ATOMISTIC INDIVIDUALISM?		231
5.	The Social and Encumbered Self	233
6.	Negative Liberty for a Positive Community	260
	Conclusion	294
Bibliography		303
Index		329





A Note on the Citations

Because I hope this book will find an audience beyond specialists in Enlightenment thought, I have wherever possible cited widely available English translations of the works of Montesquieu and Voltaire, rather than the critical French editions. Where reliable translations are not available, I cite standard French versions; in these cases, the translations are my own. In some instances I have also made small alterations to the existing translations for the sake of a more literal rendering.

For some of the more frequently cited texts, I use the following intext abbreviations. Where appropriate, I include references to volume, book, part, chapter, and/or paragraph numbers in addition to the page number.

Works of David Hume

EHU	An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding, ed. Tom L.	
	Beauchamp (Oxford: Clarendon Press, [1748] 2000).	
EMPL	Essays, Moral, Political, and Literary, ed. Eugene F. Miller	
	(Indianapolis: Liberty Fund, [1741–77] 1987).	
EPM	An Enquiry Concerning the Principles of Morals, ed. Tom L.	
	Beauchamp (Oxford: Clarendon Press, [1751] 1998).	
HE	The History of England, from the Invasion of Julius Caesar	
	to the Revolution in 1688, six volumes (Indianapolis: Liberty	
	Fund, [1754–62] 1983).	
THN	A Treatise of Human Nature, ed. David Fate Norton and	
	Mary I. Norton (Oxford: Clarendon Press, [1739-40]	

vii

2007).



viii

A Note on the Citations

Works of Adam Smith

LJ Lectures on Jurisprudence, ed. R. L. Meek, D. D. Raphael, and P. G. Stein (Indianapolis: Liberty Fund, [1762–66] 1982).

TMS The Theory of Moral Sentiments, ed. D. D. Raphael and A. L. Macfie (Indianapolis: Liberty Fund, [1759–90] 1982).

WN An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations, ed. R. H. Campbell, A. S. Skinner, and W. B. Todd, two volumes (Indianapolis: Liberty Fund [1776], 1981).

Works of Montesquieu

Pensées *My Thoughts*, trans. Henry C. Clark (Indianapolis: Liberty Fund, [c. 1720–55] 2012).

PL The Persian Letters, trans. George R. Healy (Indianapolis: Hackett, [1721] 1999).

SL The Spirit of the Laws, trans. Anne M. Cohler, Basia C. Miller, and Harold S. Stone (Cambridge: Cambridge University

and Harold S. Stone (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, [1748] 1989).

Works of Voltaire

EM Essai sur les moeurs et l'esprit des nations, ed. René Pomeau, two volumes (Paris: Garnier, [1756-69] 1963).

LCE Letters Concerning the English Nation, ed. Nicholas Cronk (Oxford: Oxford University Press, [1733] 1994).

PD *Philosophical Dictionary*, trans. Theodore Besterman (London: Penguin, [1764–69] 2004).

TM A Treatise on Metaphysics, in Voltaire: Selections, trans. Paul Edwards (New York: Macmillan, [1736] 1989).



Acknowledgments

Given the somewhat peripatetic nature of my early academic career, I have accumulated numerous debts, both individual and institutional, in the course of writing this book. The project was first conceived during my time as a visiting faculty member at Bowdoin College. Paul Franco imparted sound advice at the outset, has remained a good friend, and provided thoughtful feedback on the entire manuscript at a late stage. I began research on the book in earnest while at Brown University's Political Theory Project, where I enjoyed engaging discussion with Corey Brettschneider, Sharon Krause, John Tomasi, and my fellow postdocs on all things political theory. More recently, Emily Nacol provided valuable comments on each chapter as it was written (some of them more than once). My next stop was the University of Houston, where Jeremy Bailey and Sue Collins were both excellent colleagues. My greatest institutional debt is to my academic home since 2009, Tufts University, whose Faculty Research Awards Committee and generous junior leave policy afforded me the time to write the book with limited interruptions. My fellow political theorists at Tufts, Rob Devigne, Yannis Evrigenis, and Vickie Sullivan, have all provided crucial advice and feedback.

My debts are by no means limited to these institutions. I also received helpful comments on the manuscript from my friends and former graduate school colleagues Bill Curtis and Ari Kohen, and my fellow Bostonarea student of the Enlightenment, Michael Frazer. For reading parts of the manuscript and/or for conversations that influenced my thinking on these matters, I am grateful to Josh Bandoch, Richard Boyd, Keegan Callanan, Patrick Deneen, Graeme Garrard, Michael Gillespie, Ruth Grant, Charles Griswold, Ryan Hanley, Louis Hunt, Jonathan Israel,



x

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04500-2 - The Pragmatic Enlightenment: Recovering the Liberalism of Hume,
Smith, Montesquieu, and Voltaire
Dennis C. Rasmussen
Frontmatter
More information

Acknowledgments

Steve Kautz, Ben Kleinerman, Alan Levine, Jacob Levy, Folke Lindahl, Arthur Melzer, Michael Mosher, Eric Petrie, Andy Sabl, Diana Schaub, David Lay Williams, and Richard Zinman. I would also like to thank Henry Clark for kindly sharing his excellent translation of Montesquieu's *Pensées* prior to publication. Finally, I am indebted to Aurelian Craiutu and an anonymous reviewer for Cambridge University Press for their insightful comments and queries, and to my editor, Robert Dreesen, for the confidence that he showed in the project. While all of these individuals have helped to improve the book in ways large or small, any errors or oversights that remain are, of course, my responsibility alone.

As is often the case, my greatest debts are of the nonacademic variety. I owe more than I can say to my family and friends, above all to my wife Emily, for her love, support, encouragement, and willingness to endure my ramblings about the eighteenth century. The book is dedicated to her.