

The Rights of Others

The Rights of Others examines the boundaries of political community by focusing on political membership – the principles and practices for incorporating aliens and strangers, immigrants and newcomers, refugees and asylum seekers, into existing polities. Boundaries define some as members, others as aliens. But when state sovereignty is becoming frayed, and national citizenship is unraveling, definitions of political membership become much less clear. Indeed, few issues in world politics today are more important, or more troubling. In her Seeley Lectures, the distinguished political theorist Seyla Benhabib makes a powerful plea, echoing Immanuel Kant, for moral universalism and cosmopolitan federalism. She advocates not open but porous boundaries, recognizing not only the admittance rights of refugees and asylum seekers, but also the regulatory rights of democracies. The Rights of Others is a major intervention in contemporary political theory, of interest to large numbers of students and specialists in politics, law, philosophy, and international relations.

SEYLA BENHABIB is one of the leading political theorists in the world today and Eugene Meyer Professor of Political Science and Philosophy at Yale University.



The John Robert Seeley Lectures have been established by the University of Cambridge as a biennial lecture series in social and political studies, sponsored jointly by the Faculty of History and Cambridge University Press. The Seeley Lectures provide a unique forum for distinguished scholars of international reputation to address, in an accessible manner, themes of broad and topical interest in social and political studies. Subsequent to their public delivery in Cambridge the University Press publishes suitably modified versions of each sets of lectures. Professor James Tully delivered the inaugural series of Seeley Lectures in 1994 on the theme of *Constitutionalism in an Age of Diversity*.

The Seeley Lectures include

- (1) Strange Multiplicity: Constitutionalism in an Age of Diversity
 JAMES TULLY
 ISBN 0 521 47117 6 (hardback) 0 521 47694 1 (paperback)
- (2) The Dignity of Legislation

 JEREMY WALDRON

 ISBN 0 521 65092 5 (hardback) 0 521 65883 7 (paperback)
- (3) Woman and Human Development: The Capabilities Approach
 MARTHA NUSSBAUM
 ISBN 0 521 66086 6 (hardback)
- (4) Value, Respect and Attachment
 JOSEPH RAZ
 ISBN 0 521 80180 x (hardback) 0 521 00022 x (paperback)
- (5) The Rights of Others: Aliens, Residents, and Citizens
 SEYLA BENHABIB
 ISBN 0 521 83134 2 (hardback) 0 521 53860 2 (paperback)



THE RIGHTS OF OTHERS

Aliens, Residents, and Citizens

SEYLA BENHABIB Yale University





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Seyla Benhabib 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Minion 11/15 pt. System LaTeX 2E [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Benhabib, Seyla.

The rights of others: aliens, residents, and citizens p. cm. – (The John Robert Seeley Lectures; 5)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 83134 2 – ISBN 0 521 53860 2 (pbk.)

Political rights.
 Internationalism.
 Citizenship.
 Emigration and immigration.
 Aliens – Civil rights.
 Refugees – Civil rights.
 Title.
 Series.

JF799.B44 2004 323.3'291 – dc22 2004045665

ISBN 0 521 83134 2 hardback ISBN 0 521 53860 2 paperback

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.



"No human is illegal"

Immigrant Workers' Freedom Ride 2003 October 4, 2003 Queens, New York



Contents

Acknowledgments [x]
Introduction [1]

- 1 On hospitality: rereading Kant's cosmopolitan right [25]
- 2 "The right to have rights": Hannah Arendt on the contradictions of the nation-state [49]
- 3 The Law of Peoples, distributive justice, and migrations [71]
- 4 Transformations of citizenship: the European Union [129]
- 5 Democratic iterations: the local, the national, and the global [171]

Conclusion: cosmopolitan federalism [213]

Bibliography [222]

Index [239]

ix



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book presents the revised and expanded version of the John Robert Seeley Lectures, delivered at the invitation of the University of Cambridge in King's College on April 27—May 2, 2002. I thank Gareth Stedman Jones and Miri Rubin for their generous hospitality during this period. Special thanks go to Quentin Skinner under whose auspices I was first invited to deliver them. Susan James, Istvan Hont, Onora O'Neill, John Dunn, Richard Tuck, Emma Rothschild, Amartya Sen, and Andrew Kuper enriched my stay in Cambridge through their questions and comments.

Among the many occasions on which I presented the ideas gathered in this volume, the discussion at the Yale Law School's Legal Theory Colloquium in February 2002 was one of the most memorable. My thanks to Dean Anthony Kronman, who presided, and to my colleagues Bruce Ackerman, Owen Fiss, Paul Kahn, Judith Resnik, and Reva Siegel for subsequent conversations and remarks. I am particularly grateful to Judith Resnik for supplying me with pertinent international law references.

My colleagues at the University of Toronto, Joseph Carens, Melissa Williams, Audrey Macklin, and Jennifer Nedelsky, heard me present some of this material under the auspices of the Priestley lectureship in October 2003. I am grateful to them for their incisive comments.

X



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

For their questions and reflections on Kant, Arendt, and the European Union, I also thank Veit Bader, Rainer Bauboeck, Jay Bernstein, Richard J. Bernstein, James Bohman, Nancy Fraser, Morris Kaplan, Riva Kastoryano, John McCormick, Max Pensky, Ulrich Preuss, and Sayres Rudy. I am particularly grateful to Carolin Emcke for her thoughts on chapters 3 and 5, and to Nancy Kokaz for her spirited defense of Rawls against my criticisms. Special thanks go to Willem Maas for many conversations on citizenship within the European Union, and in particular for his help with chapter 4. Melvin Rogers was an indispensable assistant in preparing the bibliography and helping me with references throughout. David Leslie provided crucial copyediting assistance in the final stages of this book.

A special word of gratitude is due to my family, my daughter, Laura and my husband, Jim Sleeper, who have accompanied me from Boston to Amsterdam, to London, to Istanbul, and to Connecticut, as this book took shape over many voyages, border crossings, and passport controls.

Parts of chapter 1 have previously appeared as "Of Guests, Aliens and Citizens: Rereading Kant's Cosmopolitan Right," in *Pluralism and the Pragmatic Turn: The Transformation of Critical Theory. Essays in Honor of Thomas McCarthy* ed. by William Rehg and James Bohman (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2001). Chapter 2 has been published in part as "Political Geographies in a Changing World: Arendtian Reflections," *Social Research*, 69 (2) (Summer 2002): 539–556; material from chapter 4 is included in "Transformations of Citizenship: The Case of Contemporary Europe," *Government and Opposition*,

хi



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

37 (4) (Fall 2002): 439–465. My Seeley Lectures expand, revise, and continue reflections which I initiated in my Spinoza Lectures under the title *Transformations of Citizenship: Dilemmas of the Nation-State in the Era of Globalization* (Amsterdam: Van Gorcum, 2001), copyright Seyla Benhabib.

Finally, many thanks to Richard Fisher, Karen Anderson Howes, and Alison Powell of Cambridge University Press. It was a pleasure to work with them.