

Open access • Journal Article • DOI:10.1016/J.DSR2.2010.10.015

The SOLAS air-sea gas exchange experiment (SAGE) 2004 — Source link 🗹

Mike Harvey, Cliff S. Law, Murray J. Smith, Julie A. Hall ...+29 more authors

Institutions: National Institute of Water and Atmospheric Research, Lamont–Doherty Earth Observatory, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Plymouth Marine Laboratory ...+9 more institutions

Published on: 15 Mar 2011 - Deep-sea Research Part li-topical Studies in Oceanography (Pergamon-Elsevier Ltd)

Topics: Phytoplankton

Related papers:

- · Mesoscale iron enrichment experiments 1993-2005 : Synthesis and future directions
- Southern Ocean Iron Enrichment Experiment: Carbon Cycling in High- and Low-Si Waters
- · A mesoscale phytoplankton bloom in the polar Southern Ocean stimulated by iron fertilization
- Did dilution limit the phytoplankton response to iron addition in HNLCLSi sub-Antarctic waters during the SAGE experiment?
- Synthesis of iron fertilization experiments: From the iron age in the age of enlightenment



The SOLAS Air-Sea Gas Exchange Experiment (SAGE) 2004.

Mike J. Harvey¹, Cliff S. Law¹, Murray J. Smith¹, Julie A. Hall², Edward R. Abraham^{1,A}, Craig L. Stevens¹, Mark G. Hadfield¹, David T. Ho^{3,B}, Brian Ward^{4,C}, Stephen D. Archer⁵, Jill M. Cainey⁶, Kim I. Currie⁷, Dawn Devries⁸, Michael J. Ellwood^{2,D}, Peter Hill¹, Graham B. Jones⁹, Dave Katz^{10#}, Jorma Kuparinen¹¹, Burns Macaskill^{2#}, William Main^{1#}, Andrew Marriner¹, John McGregor¹, Craig McNeil¹⁰, Peter J. Minnett¹², Scott D. Nodder¹, Jill Peloquin¹³, Stuart Pickmere², Matthew H. Pinkerton¹, Karl A. Safi², Rona Thompson^{1#}, Matthew Walkington¹, Simon W. Wright¹⁴, Lori A. Ziolkowski^{15#}

¹National Institute of Water and Atmospheric Research (NIWA), P.O. Box 14-901, Kilbirnie, Wellington, New Zealand

²National Institute of Water and Atmospheric Research (NIWA), P.O. Box 11-115, Hamilton, New Zealand

³Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory of Columbia University, 61 Route 9W Palisades, NY 7 10964, U.S.A.

⁴Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, 266 Woods Hole Road, Woods Hole, MA 02543-1050, U.S.A. ⁵Plymouth Marine Laboratory, Prospect Place, West Hoe, Plymouth, PL1 3DH, U.K.

6 Cape Grim B.A.P.S., Bureau of Meteorology, PO Box 346, Smithton, Tasmania 7330 Australia

⁷National Institute of Water and Atmospheric Research (NIWA), Centre for Chemical and Physical Oceanography, Department of Chemistry, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand

⁸University of Colorado Denver, P.O. Box 173364, Denver, Colorado 80217-3364, U.S.A.

⁹Centre for Climate Change Studies, School of Environmental Science and Management, Southern Cross University, Lismore, NSW 2480, AUSTRALIA

¹⁰Graduate School of Oceanography, University of Rhode Island, South Ferry Road, Narragansett, RI 02882 USA

¹¹Department of Biological and Environmental Sciences, P.O. Box 65, FI-00014 University of Helsinki, Finland

¹²Meteorology & Physical Oceanography, Rosenstiel School of Marine & Atmospheric Science, University of Miami, 4600 Rickenbacker Causeway, Miami, FL 33149-109, USA

¹³Virginia Institute of Marine Science, College of William and Mary, P.O. Box 1346, Gloucester Point, VA 23062. U.S.A.

¹⁴Australian Antarctic Division, Channel Highway, Kingston, Tasmania 7050, Australia

¹⁵Department of Oceanography, Dalhousie University, Halifax, NS B3H 4J1, Canada

[#]No longer affiliated with organisation

Current Affiliation:

^ADragonFly, Wellington, New Zealand.

^BDepartment of Oceanography, University of Hawaii, 1000 Pope Road, MSB 517, Honolulu, HI 96822, USA

^CSchool of Physics & Environmental Change Institute, National University of Ireland, University Road, Galway, Ireland

^DDepartment of Earth and Marine Sciences, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia

Keywords: air-sea gas exchange, iron fertilisation, ocean biogeochemistry, SOLAS

1 Abstract

2 The SOLAS air-sea gas exchange experiment (SAGE) was a multiple-objective study investigating

3 gas-transfer processes and the influence of iron fertilisation on biologically driven gas exchange in

4 high-nitrate low-silicic acid low-chlorophyll (HNLSiLC) Sub-Antarctic waters characteristic of the

5 expansive Subpolar Zone of the southern oceans. This paper provides a general introduction and

6 summary of the main experimental findings. The release site was selected from a pre-voyage desktop

7 study of environmental parameters to be in the south-west Bounty Trough $(46.5^{\circ}S \ 172.5^{\circ}E)$ to the

8 south-east of New Zealand and the experiment conducted between mid-March and mid-April 2004. In

9 common with other mesoscale iron addition experiments (FeAX's), SAGE was designed as a 10 Lagrangian study quantifying key biological and physical drivers influencing the air-sea gas exchange 11 processes of CO₂, DMS and other biogenic gases associated with an iron-induced phytoplankton 12 bloom. A dual tracer SF₆/³He release enabled quantification of both the lateral evolution of a labelled 13 volume (patch) of ocean and the air-sea tracer exchange at the 10's of km's scale, in conjunction with 14 the iron fertilisation. Estimates from the dual-tracer experiment found a quadratic dependency of the 15 gas exchange coefficient on windspeed that is widely applicable and describes air-sea gas exchange in 16 strong wind regimes. Within the patch, local and micrometeorological gas exchange process studies 17 (100 m scale) and physical variables such as near-surface turbulence, temperature microstructure at the 18 interface, wave properties, and wind speed were quantified to further assist the development of gas 19 exchange models for high-wind environments.

20

21 There was a significant increase in the photosynthetic competence (F_v/F_m) of resident phytoplankton 22 within the first day following iron addition, but in contrast to other FeAX's, rates of net primary 23 production and column-integrated chlorophyll a concentrations had only doubled relative to the 24 unfertilised surrounding waters by the end of the experiment. After 15 days and four iron additions totalling 1.1 tonne Fe^{2+} , this was a very modest response compared to the other mesoscale iron 25 26 enrichment experiments. An investigation of the factors limiting bloom development considered co-27 limitation by light and other nutrients, the phytoplankton seed-stock and grazing regulation. Whilst 28 incident light levels and the initial Si:N ratio were the lowest recorded in all FeAX's to date, there was 29 only a small seed-stock of diatoms (less than 1% of biomass) and the main response to iron addition 30 was by the picophytoplankton. A high rate of dilution of the fertilised patch relative to phytoplankton 31 growth rate, the greater than expected depth of the surface mixed layer and microzooplankton grazing 32 were all considered as factors that prevented significant biomass accumulation. In line with the limited 33 response, the enhanced biological draw-down of pCO₂ was small and masked by a general increase in 34 pCO₂ due to mixing with higher pCO₂ waters. The DMS precursor DMSP was kept in check through 35 grazing activity and in contrast to most FeAX's dissolved dimethylsulfide (DMS) concentration 36 declined through the experiment. SAGE is an important low-end member in the range of responses to 37 iron addition in FeAX's. In the context of iron fertilisation as a geoengineering tool for atmospheric 38 CO_2 removal, SAGE has clearly demonstrated that a significant proportion of the low iron ocean may 39 not produce a phytoplankton bloom in response to iron addition.

41 Introduction

Of the ~ 8 Pg yr⁻¹ of carbon emitted to the atmosphere through fossil fuel combustion 42 (Canadell et al., 2007), there is a net annual uptake of $\sim 5 \text{ PgC yr}^{-1}$ split roughly equally 43 44 between terrestrial and ocean sinks. Within the latitude band from 40° to 60° S there exists a 45 strong sink region associated with photosynthetic (biological) carbon uptake, and Takahashi 46 et al. (2009) have identified the southern hemisphere oceans (south of $14^{\circ}S$ to Antarctica) as 47 providing the largest oceanic sink region for CO₂. Increased observation has helped to refine 48 this estimate. Takahashi et al. (2002) previously identified a disproportionate influence of the 49 southern oceans (between 50 and 62°S), which occupy 10% of the global ocean yet account 50 for 20% of the global CO₂ uptake, although the more recent estimates by Takahashi et al. 51 (2009) with a 3x larger database do not support such a large influence. This net uptake of 52 CO₂ reflects the balance between the biological drawdown during summer and significant 53 emission in winter.

54

55 There is uncertainty in the mean ocean uptake of CO_2 , and its inter-annual variability, due in 56 part to windspeed dependence of the gas exchange coefficient k (Carr et al., 2002; Olsen et 57 al., 2005). There are a number of wind-based parameterisations of k derived from 58 observation: Liss and Melivat (1986) found a linear-spline relationship to wind; Wanninkhof 59 (1992) and Nightingale et al. (2000) a quadratic relationship; Wanninkhof et al. (2004) either 60 quadratic or cubic and Wanninkhof and McGillis (1999) a cubic relationship. Clearly 61 estimates from these different parameterisations will diverge with increase in windspeed and 62 so the uncertainly in k will be larger at higher windspeed. The requirement to further 63 constrain the processes determining gas-exchange is especially relevant to the subantarctic 64 waters where zonally averaged windspeeds increase poleward through the mid-latitude 40° to 65 60°S storm belt (Sura, 2003). Processes associated with strong winds, such as bubble-66 mediated exchange (D'Asaro and McNeil, 2008; Woolf, 1997), will not be adequately 67 accounted for in parameterisations developed at lower windspeed. In addition to the wind 68 influence on the magnitude of surface air-sea exchange processes, concern has arisen from 69 model analyses that suggest the CO_2 sink strength in this region could in fact decline due to 70 the poleward displacement and intensification of westerly winds that drive increased 71 upwelling of carbon rich waters from the ocean interior (Le Quéré et al., 2007). The certainty 72 of this finding is still the subject of debate, in part because the model predictions are poorly 73 constrained by observation (Law et al., 2008). Model results presented by Zickfeld (2008) 74 found that as atmospheric CO_2 continues to rise through the 21st century, the efficiency of the 75 southern ocean sink will tend to increase.

78 This paper provides a general introduction and summary of the main experimental findings of 79 the SOLAS Air-Sea Gas Exchange Experiment (SAGE). Accompanying papers in this 80 volume provide more details of the results of SAGE conducted in sub-Antarctic waters of the 81 south-west Bounty Trough (46.5°S 172.5°E) between mid-March and mid-April 2004. The 82 experiment used the 3 He/SF₆ dual tracer method which has been successfully used in the open 83 ocean to provide a patch-scale (10-100 km) air-sea gas exchange estimate in a diffusive ocean 84 mixed-layer (Nightingale et al., 2000; Wanninkhof, 1993; Wanninkhof et al., 1997; 85 Wanninkhof et al., 2004). Whilst most of the existing dual tracer gas exchange data from ocean experiments are from shallower water bodies such as the North Sea, Georges Bank, or 86 87 the Florida Shelf, these studies have confirmed that the uncertainty in the parameterization of 88 gas exchange coefficient k increases as a function of wind speed, and so refinement of the 89 parameterisation is particularly important in regions such as the subantarctic waters which are 90 subject to high wind speeds. For SAGE, the dual-tracer release was complemented by 91 micrometeorological-scale gas exchange determination and measurement of the dominant 92 physical processes known to affect gas exchange, including wind speed, near surface 93 turbulence, the micro-structure of temperature and salinity, and wave characteristics.

94

95 From early planning stages, SAGE was devised as a combined gas-exchange process and 96 mesoscale iron fertilisation experiment. The initial aim was to produce a purposefully 97 stimulated and tracer labelled phytoplankton bloom, and provide a laboratory in the natural 98 environment for study of enhanced biogeochemical fluxes and associated air-sea gas 99 exchange, particularly of CO_2 and DMS driven by the biological activity. The southern 100 oceans are the largest High Nutrient Low Chlorophyll (HNLC) area of ocean where 101 productivity is limited by levels of the micro-nutrient iron. Previous experience with iron 102 fertilisation has shown that significant enhancement of algal biomass and primary production 103 can occur (e.g. Boyd et al., 2000; Trull et al., 2001). The results of a review of eight 104 mesoscale fertilisations (de Baar et al., 2005) has since confirmed that maximum biological 105 signal typically scales inversely with the depth of the wind-mixed layer, mediated through the 106 relationship between underwater light climate and phytoplankton photosynthesis.

107

The HNLC condition as applied to sub-Antarctic waters is more precisely described as (HNLSiLC) or "low-silicic acid HNLC" (Dugdale and Wilkerson, 1998). This condition is found over much of the southern hemisphere oceans in the Sub-Antarctic zone south of 45°S down to the Antarctic Polar frontal zone (Brzezinski et al., 2005). This HNLSiLC ocean area south of 45°S is approximately twice that of HNLC polar waters south of 60°S. Following addition of iron to the low Si waters, it is highly likely that silicic acid will rapidly limit the 114 development of diatoms (Coale et al., 2004). Prior to SAGE, there was interest in examining 115 the response to iron over a longer duration into the bloom decline phase, as done with the 116 European Iron Fertilisation Experiment EIFEX (Bathmann, 2005), with the aim of 117 quantifying carbon sedimentation fluxes. Following the SAGE experiment, there has been 118 further synthesis of the results from 12 mesoscale iron addition experiments including SAGE 119 (Boyd et al., 2007) and heightened interest in the prospects of ocean (iron) fertilisation as a 120 (bio)geoengineering solution to atmospheric CO_2 build-up (Lenton and Vaughan, 2009). 121 However, the need for caution has been clearly identified due to the relatively low efficiency 122 as a carbon sink (Boyd et al., 2004), the difficulty in confirming the degree of permanence of 123 CO_2 removal from the atmosphere and the large uncertainty around unplanned consequences 124 and other environmental impacts without further biogeochemical research (Buesseler and 125 Boyd, 2003; Buesseler et al., 2008).

126

127 The progression in iron fertilisation experimentation from incubation study (Martin et al., 128 1990), to open-ocean equatorial HNLC (Coale et al., 1996), to the Southern Ocean HNLC 129 (Boyd et al., 2000), and more recently to longer-term tracking (Coale et al., 2004), and natural 130 fertilisation study (Blain et al., 2001; Pollard et al., 2009), has been mirrored to an extent by 131 advances in gas exchange studies. Early wind tunnel experiments (Liss, 1983) have been 132 followed by shelf-sea tracer experiments (Nightingale et al, 2000; Wanninkhof et al, 1997) to 133 open ocean process studies (Fairall et al., 2000; Feely et al., 2004; Ward et al., 2004), More 134 recently, attention turned to the higher windspeed regime of the southern oceans (Wanninkhof 135 et al., 2004) where there has been little in-situ study, given the logistic challenges of this 136 work. In extending the observational work at the time, there is no doubt that the combined 137 broad goals of mesoscale iron fertilisation and gas-exchange process study under episodic 138 high-wind conditions, as proposed by SAGE, were ambitious.

139

140 **Experimental goals and site selection**

141 SAGE had three main experimental goals to determine the drivers and controls of ocean-

142 atmosphere gas exchange through quantification of:

biological production and utilisation of climatic relevant gases (in particular CO₂ and DMS) in the surface ocean in association with a phytoplankton bloom through measurement of environment and ecosystem variables, dissolved and atmospheric gas concentrations;

 physical control of gas exchange across the interfaces of the surface mixed layer through the dual tracer method at the patch scale (Ho et al., 2006), ship-borne micrometeorological flux measurement, with a combination of in-situ measurement of boundary layer exchange and remote sensing of the air-sea interface for sea surface temperature and wave properties;

152 production of aerosols resulting from interaction of biological and physical processes, (in 153 particular, study of the oxidation products of DMS) through measurement of the 154 atmospheric mixing ratios of DMS, SO₂ and condensation nuclei properties. 155 156 There were five criteria that guided the site selection: 157 1. a relatively quiescent and homogeneous region allowing tracer labelled patch tracking 158 for up to a month. 159 2. a 30 to 80 m mixed layer depth to limit dilution of SF_6 and iron 160 3. a range of atmospheric wind speeds to allow study of gas exchange coefficient—wind 161 speed relationship 162 4. Non-limiting macro-nutrient availability and phytoplankton in HNLC waters 163 receptive to iron fertilisation 164 5. low variability and shear in currents on the patch scale for maintenance of a coherent 165 patch. 166 167 Sites for SAGE were identified in a pre-experiment desktop study (Hadfield, 2010) at three 168 potential locations. Site 1 at the NIWA Southern Biophysical time series mooring (S. Bio Mooring in Figure 1) 46° 40'S, 178° 30'E, was rejected as possibly too dynamic, as was found 169 170 with the FeCycle experiment conducted at this location (Boyd et al., 2005). The second site 171 on the Central Campbell Plateau, approximately 169.5°E, 50.5°S, is relatively quiescent but 172 has consistently low phytoplankton stocks based on remote-sensing data. The third and 173 chosen site was around the South-western Bounty Trough, at approximately 47° 0'S, 172° 0'E 174 shown as the red dot in Figure 2. In this region of Sub-Antarctic waters, the mean flow is 175 towards the northwest, adjacent to the Southland Current and has lower current variability 176 than the SBM site. In common with the SBM site, the SAGE site has a naturally occurring 177 late summer (February) chlorophyll maximum (Figure 3) which in 2004 peaked at around 0.5 mg m⁻³ satellite-derived chlorophyll a. Examination of remote sensing data (SST, SSH 178 179 and ocean colour) immediately prior to the voyage lead to the decision to move the site 180 slightly east to avoid entrainment into the Southland current. Following the pre-release 181 survey, the first iron infusion was made at 46° 44'S 172° 32'E (Law et al., 2010). 182

183 In the following summary it is apparent that not all the site selection criteria were met, 184 particularly those related to "quiescence" and low current speed and sheer, and the 185 consequences of this are discussed.

186 **Initial conditions and iron addition**

187

Table 1 gives the initial upper ocean conditions at the time of the first infusion, made just east of the cyclonic eddy centred at 47°S 172°E (Figure 4) which was a persistent feature during SAGE. In Figure 5 the cruise track is overlaid on a geostrophic current plot. More detail on the infusion pattern and subsequent evolution of the labelled patch are presented by Law *et al.* (2010).

194 For the iron addition, a solution was prepared in two plastic 7500 litre tanks that were initially 195 half-filled with seawater and acidified to ~pH 2 by the addition of 25 litres of hydrochloric 196 acid. A total of 1.35 tonnes of FeSO₄.7H₂O (containing 274 kg Fe2+) were used in each 197 infusion. The aim was to raise the initial dissolved iron concentration to 2nM over a 6x6 km 198 patch with a 50 m mixed layer depth. The dual tracer solution was prepared in two steel 4000 199 litre containers of seawater by saturation with SF₆ and ³He. A headspace of \sim 5 L was 200 continuously flushed with SF_6 and circulated through the water via a diffusion hose by pump, 201 until the water was saturated. ³He saturation was undertaken just prior to release, with ~ 10 202 litres of ³He dissolved for 20 minutes of headspace recirculation (Law et al., 2010).

203

204 Details of the infusions are shown in Table 2 below. The iron and SF_6 solution were pumped out at a depth of ~12-15m from a pipe attached to a towed fish at a distance of ~20m behind 205 206 the vessel. As sea-water was pumped out of the tracer tanks the volume was replaced by 207 water filling a meteorological balloon by gravity feed from the top of the tank; this flexible 208 cap minimised diffusive loss of ³He and SF₆ that would have occurred if a headspace had been allowed to develop. The 1st infusion on the 25 March covered 6 x 6 km and was 209 210 executed within a Lagrangian framework with an expanding hexagonal release track (with 211 track spacing of 0.7 km), referenced to a drogued drifter buoy at the nominal patch centre. 212 The need to reinfuse was dictated by the decline in SF_6 towards background concentrations. The 2^{nd} infusion on 31 March of iron, SF₆ and ³He took place when the patch was distributed 213 214 as a long filament running NNW-SSE, and so was adapted to an along filament release track 215 of ~12 x 3 km using the nocturnal underway Fv/Fm signal as reference for patch location. The 3^{rd} infusion on 3 April was iron only, and was released using the underway surface SF_6 216 signal. The 4th and final infusion, of SF_6 and iron, on 6 April was released using the underway 217 218 Fv/Fm signal as reference because the dissolved SF_6 signal was low at this stage. All re-219 infusions were successfully placed within the boundaries of the existing patch (Law et al., 220 2010).

221 Patch evolution and response to addition

The accompanying papers in this volume expand on a number of key aspects of the SAGE experiment. Unlike other experiments, there was no evidence for macro-nutrient depletion during the experiment (Figure 6a) and there is a trend of nutrients increasing around days 5-8 when the fertilised area was affected by an interflow/intrusion of a water body at the west boundary (Law et al., 2010). Whilst initial post-fertilisation dissolved iron levels were generally greater than 1 nM (Table 2), values did decline rapidly although levels were generally kept above 0.1-0.2 nM within the fertilised patch (Figure 6b). There was a rapid initial response to iron addition detected as an increase in photosynthetic competence (F_v/F_m) measured by fast repetition rate fluorometry (Figure 6d). The increase is consistent with observations in other iron experiments (Boyd et al., 2000). A difference in F_v/F_m of ~0.04 between IN and OUT of the patch was maintained throughout the experiment based on the threshold of 10 fM SF₆ as demarcation of the patch boundary (Law et al., 2010). After the second infusion, this IN-OUT Fv/Fm difference was maintained against an increasing trend in F_v/F_m outside the patch.

236

237 Kuparinen et al. (2010) identified that bacterioplankton growth rates were in general low with 238 no significant enhancement in the patch, but with the greatest increase towards the end of the 239 experiment. Phytoplankton stocks and primary productivity were slow to respond in spite of 240 the partial relief of iron stress with a small increase in surface chlorophyll a until Day 3 241 (Figure 6 c and e). Details are discussed by Peloquin *et al.* (2010b). Whilst a clear in-patch 242 enhancement in biomass and primary productivity appeared to exist around days 4-5, the 243 elevated IN concentrations declined the following day and there was then little difference 244 between IN and OUT patch values through to day 12 although the background values were 245 slowly increasing. From day 13 onwards, the in-patch chlorophyll a and IN-OUT difference 246 began once again to increase. The final enhancement (IN-OUT) at the end of the experiment 247 (day 16) was an approximate doubling of both surface (Figure 6 c and e) and column integrated (~40 mg m⁻² OUT, ~80 mg m⁻² IN) chlorophyll a and primary productivity 248 (~0.4 gC m⁻²d⁻¹ OUT, ~0.8 gC m⁻²d⁻¹ IN) (Peloquin et al., 2010b). In the accompanying 249 250 volume we consider the component factors that are thought to have led to this modest 251 response (Law et al., 2010; Peloquin et al., 2010b).

252 Limiting factors

253 Physical factors limiting and causing the rapid shift in chlorophyll concentrations around days 254 5-6 were investigated. Figure 7 shows a summary of u_{10} wind statistics discussed in detail by 255 Smith et al. (2010). With the northward passage of a storm along the east coast of New 256 Zealand on day 3, there was an accompanying maximum in the recorded u_{10} windspeed of 257 $>20 \text{ m s}^{-1}$. The strong wind produced a deepening of the surface wind-mixed layer. 258 Comparison of the predicted conditions with those encountered by Hadfield (2010) identified 259 that the actual mixed-layer depth during SAGE was significantly greater than that predicted 260 by climatological values. Stevens et al. (2010) describe detailed physical measurements of the 261 ocean mixed-layer and environmental influences governing the mixed-layer depth and include 262 a new method for mixed-layer depth estimation. It was a few days after this storm around 263 days 5-8 that an interflow/intrusion produced a high rate of lateral dilution as the patch was 264 drifting north-east (Law et al., 2010). Chlorophyll concentrations did not increase further until after the final infusion of iron, coincident with a decrease in windspeed and rate of patch advection as well as improved meteorological conditions with higher incident light levels (*e.g.* on days 9, 10, 12 in Figure 8). Law *et al.* (2010) found that there were only two periods when the phytoplankton growth rate exceeded the minimum dilution rate (0.125 d⁻¹) on D3-6 and D10-14, and these correspond to periods when IN station chlorophyll exceeded that at the OUT station (Fig. 6c).

271

272 The pivotal role of light in limiting the development of diatom blooms in subantarctic waters 273 towards the equinox has been discussed by others (Boyd et al., 1999; van Oijen et al., 2004). 274 SAGE was conducted at a time and location that experienced the lowest range of theoretical 275 clear-sky photosynthetically active radiation (PAR) for any of the FeAX's (Figure 9). In the 276 figure we also show the likely range of surface PAR (allowing for cloud attenuation) using 277 the SeaWIFS PAR product described by Frouin (2003) for 8-day composite data of a 7 x 7 tile 278 of 9-km tile of pixels over the duration of each experiment. In these data, SAGE and 279 SOIREE have equal lowest median incident surface PAR. SOIREE was conducted in high 280 silicic acid polar waters (61°S) and there is a persistent trend of increasing fractional 281 cloudiness poleward from 30° to 60° (Mokhov and Schlesinger, 1994). In-situ measured PAR 282 data are available for both SOIREE and SAGE and there is good agreement with the median 283 of the in-situ and SeaWIFS estimates The measured range for SOIREE was relatively large between 13 - 40 (average 21.4) mol m² d⁻¹ and a significant bloom followed the alleviation of 284 iron stress (Boyd and Abraham, 2001). In SAGE, the range of PAR of 16 – 32 (average 19.7) 285 mol m² d⁻¹ was similar yet there was a much smaller biological response. Peloquin *et al.* 286 287 (2010a) consider in more detail macro- and micro-nutrients, light, seed-stocks and relative 288 rates of phytoplankton growth against grazing by micro- and meso-zooplankton and influence 289 of dilution of the patch. Peloquin et al. (2010a) suggest that received irradiance was not the 290 major limiting factor affecting the biological response of SAGE in the HNLSiLC waters 291 although the phytoplankton assemblage may have been on the cusp of light limitation.

292

293 The potential for macro-nutrient co-limitation was also assessed (Law et al., 2010). The 294 mixed-layer deepening & intrusion resulted in an increase in mixed-layer macronutrient 295 concentrations until D10, with the result that concentrations were higher at end than the 296 beginning, unlike any other FeAX's. No significant floristic shifts occurred during the 297 experiment and, with a very low $(\sim 1\%)$ initial diatom seed-stock in waters and the lowest 298 initial silicic acid to nitrate (Table 1) ratio of any of the iron addition experiments (Boyd et 299 al., 2007), there was little likelihood of a diatom bloom following the fertilisation. In the 300 absence of suitable conditions for diatom growth, the main biological response came from a 301 modest increase in picophytoplankton biomass but without an increase in particulate organic

302 carbon (POC). Growth was thought to have been kept in check by the resident 303 microzooplankton grazers with the increase in POC being recycled through the microbial food 304 web. In the patch, growth generally exceeded biomass except during the middle of the 305 experiment (D5-7) with high grazing on eukaryotic picoplankton during the first 7 days 306 (Peloquin et al., 2010a). Law et al. (2010) found that the mean net algal growth: dilution rate 307 of 1.13 (0.4-2.2) is the lowest reported for a FeAx, underpinning the importance of dilution in 308 SAGE. However the dilution rate decreased for Day 10-14 and growth exceeded grazing for 309 the total picophytoplankton and picoprokaryotes from D11.6 until the end of the experiment 310 (D15). We conclude, therefore that a combination of biological (grazing) and physical 311 (dilution rate) factors were important in limiting biomass accumulation in the treated patch.

312

313 Consistent with the limited biological response, the change in biologically influenced climate 314 relevant gases (CO₂ and DMS) was small (Figure 6f). Any enhanced biological draw-down 315 of pCO₂ was masked by a general increase in pCO₂ in the patch and mixing with higher pCO₂ 316 waters to the west (Currie et al., 2010) during the period of intrusion. In the final phase of the 317 patch occupation, the median or mean in-patch CO_2 fugacity never dropped more than 1 µatm 318 below the OUT patch value. The cycling of sulfur components is discussed by Archer et al. 319 (2010). Any enhancement in production of dimethylsulfoniopropionate (DMSP) appears to 320 have been kept in check through grazing activity and, in contrast to most other iron 321 fertilisation experiments, the dissolved dimethylsulfide (DMS) concentration actually 322 declined over the course of the experiment.

323

324 Comparisons and concluding remarks

325 The ocean physics component of SAGE investigated processes important for gas exchange 326 estimation at strong windspeeds where the commonly used windspeed-based 327 parameterisations diverge. The SAGE dual-tracer gas exchange experiment was successful in 328 obtaining measurements under the highest average windspeed conditions (up to 16 m s^{-1}) 329 sampled to date, as described in Ho et al. (2006) and in Smith et al., (2010). From re-330 examination of previous dual-tracer experiments along with the SAGE measurements, Ho et al. (2006) found that a quadratic relationship $k = 0.266 u_{10}^2 (600/Sc)^{0.5}$ accurately described 331 332 gas transfer for SAGE and previous dual-tracer datasets for the entire windspeed range. Here 333 k is gas transfer velocity, u_{10} is the windspeed 10 metres above the surface estimated from 334 QuikSCAT satellite derived winds, and Sc the Schmidt number used for normalisation with 335 600 being the Schmidt number for CO_2 in freshwater at 20°C. In contrast, the Liss and 336 Merlivat (1986) relationship significantly underestimated and the Wanninkhof and McGillis 337 (1999) cubic relationship significantly overestimated exchange. Ho et al. (2006) suggest that

338 their function is applicable to the entire global ocean including both the coastal and open 339 ocean environments. Smith et al. (2010) examine the influence of uncertainty and error in 340 windspeed (u) measurement on the gas-transfer velocity (k) windspeed relationship, and 341 considered the sea-state properties that can be used for refining estimates for strong winds e.g. 342 when bubble mediated transfer can be significant. Minnett et al. (2010) made skin 343 temperature measurements at higher windspeeds during SAGE than previously reported and 344 suggest that skin temperature is a more relevant temperature for input to gas exchange 345 estimation that bulk ocean temperature. The impact of skin versus bulk temperature on gas 346 exchange estimation is further examined by Currie et al. (2010).

347

348 Following the synthesis of de Baar et al. (2005) we compare the outcome of SAGE with other 349 iron addition experiments (FeAX's). Figure 10 shows the trend of increasing $\Delta f CO_2$, i.e. the 350 difference between IN and OUT patch CO_2 fugacity, with increasing surface chlorophyll a 351 biomass. The SEEDS experiment (Tsuda et al., 2003) produced a very large draw-down 352 through a centric diatom bloom that developed in a very shallow surface mixed layer; by 353 comparison SAGE had a negligible impact in a deep mixed layer. Figure 11 shows SAGE 354 and SEEDS at the extremes of the range of response in chlorophyll concentrations in relation 355 to the range of mixed layer depths encountered in mesoscale iron addition experiments.

356

357 It is instructive to compare the biological responses in SAGE with the SEEDS II experiment 358 which was published after the de Baar et al. (2005) synthesis. SEEDS II was conducted in a 359 more diffusive ocean with a deeper mixed-layer depth and windier atmosphere resulting in a 360 much smaller response compared to the first SEEDS (Tsumune et al., 2009). In both SAGE 361 and SEEDS II, picoplankton are an important component of the total assemblage. In SEEDS II the picoplankton biomass (sized as 0.2 or 0.7 to 2.0 μ m) of 0.17 mg m⁻³ initially accounts 362 363 for $\sim a$ quarter of the surface Chl-a. The picoplankton biomass increased substantially (1.1 mg m⁻³); at Day 10 and accounts for an increased proportion (40%) of the surface Chl-a 364 365 (Kudo et al., 2009). The trend continues in the decline phase with picoplankton accounting 366 for 65% of the surface Chl-a after 25 days. In SAGE, the initial picoplankton Chl-a amount 367 and proportion is substantially larger than in SEEDS II (0.47 mg m⁻³ and \sim 70%) (Peloquin et al., 2010b) and whilst the Chl-a reaches 0.9 mg m⁻³ by Day 15, the dominant proportion 368 369 around 65-70% remains almost unchanged. Under the ecumenical iron hypothesis (Cullen, 370 1995; Morel et al., 1991) it is proposed that small cells with high surface to volume ratio are 371 less sensitive to iron limitation and likely to be more sensitive to grazing controls. The results 372 from SAGE do not contradict this hypothesis where picoplankton biomass increased when 373 grazing pressure is reduced (Peloquin et al., 2010b). In both experiments, diatoms did not 374 bloom. Initially in SEEDS II diatoms were the second most abundant of larger plankton

375 (Suzuki et al., 2009), and as the assemblage evolved, there tended to be a dominance of 376 grazing resistant species (Tsuda et al., 2009). However, Tsuda et al. (2007) reported an 377 exponential increase in copepod mesozooplankton, with copepod grazing representing a 378 major factor that prevented the formation of a diatom bloom. By contrast (Peloquin et al., 379 2010b) found that diatoms comprised less than 1% of the initial biomass of SAGE and there 380 was no evidence of increase through the experiment. Whilst at first sight, this finding appears 381 to contradict the ecumenical iron hypothesis with the expectation of floristic shifts following 382 iron fertilisation, allowing diatoms that are less grazing dependent to bloom, it does agree 383 with the broader principle behind the hypothesis which suggests that no single factor will 384 regulate bloom development.

385

386 The biological response of SAGE was unexpected, representing a minimum end member 387 amongst the FeAX's conducted to date (Boyd et al., 2007), and has provided an excellent 388 framework for the study of multiple factors limiting primary productivity (Peloquin et al., 389 2010a). The findings support and extend the analysis of de Baar et al. (2005) in the 390 relationship between response to iron addition and depth of the wind-mixed layer. Peloquin 391 et al (2010a; 2010b) suggest the system was only on the verge of light limitation and 392 important limiting factors included an active zooplankton grazing community and the diluting 393 effects of strong horizontal and vertical mixing. Furthermore, a diatom bloom in a HNLSiLC 394 region was unlikely because of the small (1%) initial diatom biomass and the low Si:N 395 nutrient status, especially later in the growing season following the seasonal drawdown of 396 macro-nutrients.

397

398 SAGE has demonstrated that iron fertilisation will not produce a response in all HNLC 399 regions at all times. In addition to the small response, conditions favoured the dominance of 400 picophytoplankton $\leq 2 \mu m$ (Peloquin et al., 2010b) which might suggest that any iron-401 mediated gain of carbon is most likely to stay in the mixed-layer and be remineralised rather 402 than sink and be sequestered in the deep ocean. This leads us to suggest that seasonal effects, 403 HNLC sub-type (e.g. HNLSiLC) as well as ecosystem factors all need to be considered in 404 large-scale global models of iron fertilisation and in projected estimates of the ocean carbon 405 sink resulting from any large-scale ocean fertilisation (Browman and Boyd, 2009).

406

407 In planning this work, the SOLAS programme provided the case for integration of physical 408 and biological process studies to develop understanding of biologically driven air-sea gas 409 exchange. In conducting the broad-ranging SAGE experiment in the challenging environment 410 of the southern oceans, logistical capabilities were close to the limit of what is achievable 411 with a single vessel. For future multidisciplinary studies of this type, there are clear benefits 412 in the development of experimental design with multiple platforms, as has since been

413 demonstrated with some of the longer duration FeAX's.

414

415 Acknowledgements

416 This challenging experiment was made possible through the high quality of logistic support 417 provided by the entire crew of R.V. Tangaroa and personnel at NIWA Vessels Ltd. We thank 418 Greg Foothead for his lead with logistics co-ordination. SAGE was jointly funded through 419 the New Zealand Foundation for Research, Science and Technology (FRST) programs 420 (C01X0204) "Drivers and Mitigation of Global Change" and (C01X0223) "Ocean 421 Ecosystems: Their Contribution to NZ Marine Productivity," Funding was also provided for 422 specific collaborations by the US National Science Foundation from grants OCE-0326814 423 (Ward), OCE-0327779 (Ho), and OCE 0327188 OCE-0326814 (Minnett) and the UK Natural 424 Environment Research Council NER/B/S/2003/00282 (Archer). The New Zealand 425 International Science and Technology (ISAT) linkages fund provided additional funding 426 (Archer and Ziolkowski), and the many collaborator institutions also provided valuable 427 support.

428

429 Figure legends

430 Figure 1: Bathymetry map to the south-east of New Zealand in the vicinity of the SAGE

431 experiment. Depth (meters) is indicated by the colour bar.

432

433 Figure 2: SeaWiFS chlorophyll *a* composite Mar – Apr 2004. SAGE site is shown as a red 434 dot.

435

436 Figure 3: Timeline of SeaWiFS chlorophyll *a* for SAGE site, extracted from 8 day composite

437 standard mapped images. Statistics are for a tile of up to 48 pixels (approx 50 x 50 km)

438 centred on 46.5°S 172.5°E. The vertical arrow marks the time of the SAGE experiment.

439

440 Figure 4: Sea surface height plot for 24 March 2004 from AVISO delayed-time, reference,

441 merged, Mapped Sea Level Anomalies (MSLA_DT_REF) from sea level anomaly data set at

442 $0.25^{\circ} \times 0.25^{\circ}$ derived from satellite altimeters on TOPEX/Poseidon and ERS satellites

443 <u>www.aviso.oceanobs.com</u> and NRL Coastal Ocean Model Sea Surface Height Mean. Release

- site is centred on the white dot. Anomaly (m) is indicated by the colour bar.
- 445

Figure 5: Geostrophic current velocity calculated from SSH for 3 April 2004, data source as in Figure 4 (Hadfield, 2010). The yellow line shows the entire voyage track which progressed in an anti-clockwise direction. Current barbs show direction, filled contours show speed (m s⁻¹): 0–0.05 white, 0.05–0.10 light grey, 0.10–0.20 darker grey, 0.20–0.30 blue, 0.30-0.40 navy.

452 Figure 6: Evolution of the SAGE fertilised patch. Variables in the left column were measured 453 from daily CTD casts, where Day 0 is the night 25/26 March (19:00 25-Mar-2004 for 454 continuous data). The vertical arrows show the mid-times of the four iron infusions. Variables 455 in the right column are from continuous underway seawater sampling where samples are 456 assigned as IN patch from SF₆ tracer levels above 10 fM and are otherwise regarded as OUT 457 patch (a) Surface (top 10 m) nitrate and silicate concentrations IN and OUT of the patch. (b) 458 Median surface (2 m) dissolved iron measured from towed torpedo trace iron sampler. The 459 vertical bars extend between minimum and maximum values. (c) Total euphotic zone 460 chlorophyll-a by trapezoidal integration to the 0.5 % light level as mean and standard error as calculated by Peloquin et al. (2010b). (d) Photosynthetic competence F_v/F_m measured at 461 462 night. Vertical bars show the mean and standard deviation for each night-time. (e) Total 463 euphotic zone primary productivity by trapezoidal integration to the 0.5 % light level as mean 464 and standard error as calculated by Peloquin et al. (2010b). (f) Median fugacity of CO2. The 465 vertical bars extend between minimum and maximum values.

466

Figure 7: Median, maximum and minimum daily u_{10} windspeed calculated from vessel anemometer and corrected for flow distortion according to Popinet *et al.* (2004). The dashed bar to the left shows a horizontal mark at the median and extends from the 5th to the 99th percentile of ship windspeed observations presented by Hadfield (2010).

471

Figure 8: Measured and theoretical maximum clear sky daily incident photosynthetically active radiation calculated with an atmospheric transmission coefficient of 0.86 and top of the atmosphere PAR of 2500 μ mol m⁻² s⁻¹. Inverted triangles are 8-day composite surface PAR from SeaWIFS for 1°x1° box including the SAGE site presented by Hadfield (2010).

476

Figure 9: Comparison of light availability in iron addition experiments. The black bars show the range of theoretical maximum clear sky daily incident PAR calculated with an atmospheric transmission coefficient of 0.86 and top of the atmosphere PAR of flux of 2500 μ mol m⁻² s⁻¹. The box plots show the range, quartiles and median of surface PAR (allowing for cloudiness) based on 8-day composite SeaWIFS PAR estimate (Frouin et al., 2003) for a 7 x 7 tile of pixels at 9-km resolution over the duration of each experiment.

483

Figure 10: A comparison of the maximum IN:OUT patch difference in fCO_2 versus the maximum surface chlorophyll for a number of FeAX's. Data sources are from Boyd et al. (2007) including supplemental tables. In addition SEEDSII data are from (Tsumune et al., 2009) and KEOPS data from a study of natural iron fertilisation on the Kerguelen Plateau (Blain et al., 2007).

- Figure 11: The enhancement in surface chlorophyll *a* ranked in approximate order of
 reducing mixed-layer depth for 10 FeAX's (note IronEx-1 did not evolve due to patch
 subduction after 4 days). Adapted from de Baar et al (2005), with inclusion of data from
 SEEDS II and SAGE (Boyd et al., 2007 Suppl. tables).

495 **Tables**

- 4		1
4	ч	h
-	,	v

Variable ± stdev	Initial condition			
SST (°C)	11.5 ± 0.05			
Salinity	34.316 ± 0.003			
Background dissolved Fe (nM)	0.09 ± 0.005			
Surface NO ₃ range (µM)	7.6 – 10.3			
Surface SiO ₄ range (µM)	0.83 - 0.97			
Dissolved reactive phosphorus (µM)	0.62 - 0.85			
Fv/Fm	0.27 ± 0.02			
Primary Productivity (mmolCm ⁻³ d ⁻¹)	0.53 ± 0.02			
Biology	Picophytoplankton dominated			
3 hour prior wind (ms ⁻¹)	10.7 ± 1.1			
"Mixed-layer depth" (m)	~60			
Surface chlorophyll $a (\text{mg m}^{-3})$	0.64 ± 0.05			
Integrated chlorophyll $a \text{ (mg m}^{-2}\text{)}$	44.4 ± 1.5			
pCO ₂ (µatm)	327.3 ± 2.0			

497

498 Table 1: Summary of initial conditions at the SAGE first release site 46° 44'S 172° 32'E with

499 seawater sampled from ships scientific supply (5 m depth)

500

Infusion	Date (NZST)	Tracer added	Fe added	Flow rate		Ship speed	Post infusion Fe
	`		kg (Fe)	L	h ⁻¹	kts	nM
1	25/03/04	$SF_6 \& {}^3He$	265	Fe	925 Lh ⁻¹	4.25	3.03
	1500 - 2330			$SF_6 \& {}^{3}He$	475 Lh ⁻¹		
2	31/03/04	$SF_6 \& {}^{3}He$	265	Fe	1370 Lh ⁻¹	5.5	1.59
	0000 - 0600			$SF_6 \& {}^{3}He$	690 Lh^{-1}		
3	03/04/04		265	Fe	1200 Lh^{-1}	7-8	0.55
	1230 - 1830						
4	06/04/04	SF ₆	265	Fe	1200 Lh ⁻¹	5-6	1.01
	2220 - 0330			SF ₆	500 Lh^{-1}		

501

502 Table 2: SAGE infusion details

503

504 **References**

505

Archer, S.D., Safi, K., Hall, J.A., Cummings, D.G., Harvey, M., 2010. Grazing suppression of
 dimethylsulphoniopropionate (DMSP) accumulation in iron fertilised sub-Antarctic waters.
 Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography.

Bathmann, U., 2005. Ecological and biogeochemical response of Antarctic ecosystems to iron
 fertilization and implications on global carbon cycle. Ocean and Polar Research 27, 231-235.

511 Blain, S., Quéguiner, B., Armand, L., Belviso, S., Bombled, B., Bopp, L., Bowie, A., Brunet,

512 C., Brussaard, C., Carlotti, F., Christaki, U., Corbière, A., Durand, I., Ebersbach, F., Fuda, J.-

513 L., Garcia, N., Gerringa, L., Griffiths, B., Guigue, C., Guillerm, C., Jacquet, S., Jeandel, C.,

- Laan, P., Lefèvre, D., Lo Monaco, C., Malits, A., Mosseri, J., Obernosterer, I., Park, Y.-H.,
 Picheral, M., Pondaven, P., Remenyi, T., Sandroni, V., Sarthou, G., Savoye, N., Scouarnec,
 L., Souhaut, M., Thuiller, D., Timmermans, K., Trull, T., Uitz, J., van Beek, P., Veldhuis, M.,
 Vincent, D., Viollier, E., Vong, L., Wagener, T., 2007. Effect of natural iron fertilization on
 carbon sequestration in the Southern Ocean. Nature 446, 1070-1074.
- Blain, S., Treguer, P., Belviso, S., Bucciarelli, E., Denis, M., Desabre, S., Fiala, M., Martin
 Jezequel, V., Le Fevre, J., Mayzaud, P., 2001. A biogeochemical study of the island mass
 effect in the context of the iron hypothesis: Kerguelen Islands, Southern Ocean. Deep Sea
 Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 48, 163-187.
- Boyd, P., LaRoche, J., Gall, M., Frew, R., McKay, R.M.L., 1999. Role of iron, light, and
 silicate in controlling algal biomass in subantarctic waters SE of New Zealand. J. Geophys.
 Res. 104, 13395-13408.
- Boyd, P.W., Abraham, E.R., 2001. Iron-mediated changes in phytoplankton photosynthetic
 competence during SOIREE. Deep-Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography
 48, 2529-2550.
- 529 Boyd, P.W., Jickells, T., Law, C.S., Blain, S., Boyle, E.A., Buesseler, K.O., Coale, K.H.,
- 530 Cullen, J.J., de Baar, H.J.W., Follows, M., Harvey, M., Lancelot, C., Levasseur, M., Owens,
- N.P.J., Pollard, R., Rivkin, R.B., Sarmiento, J., Schoemann, V., Smetacek, V., Takeda, S.,
 Tsuda, A., Turner, S., Watson, A.J., 2007. Mesoscale Iron Enrichment Experiments 1993-
- 532 Fisual, A., Futher, S., Watson, A.S., 2007. Mesoscale from Emferment533 2005: Synthesis and Future Directions. Science 315, 612-617.
- Boyd, P.W., Law, C.S., Abraham, E.R., Hadfield, M., Hill, P., Oliver, M., Pinkerton, M.,
 Smith, M., Hutchins, D.A., Handy, S., Hare, C., LeBlanc, K., Croot, P.L., Ellwood, M., Hall,
 J., Pickmere, S., Safi, K., Frew, R.D., Hunter, K.A., Sander, S., Strzepek, R., Higgins, J.,
 Mioni, C., Wilhelm, S.W., Maldonado, M.T., McKay, R.M., Sanudo-Wilhelmy, S.A., TovarSanchez, A., 2005. FeCycle: Attempting an iron biogeochemical budget from a mesoscale
 SF6 tracer experiment in unperturbed low iron waters. Global Biogeochem. Cycles 19, doi:
 10.1029/2005GB002494.
- Boyd, P.W., Law, C.S., Wong, C.S., Nojiri, Y., Tsuda, A., Levasseur, M., Takeda, S., Rivkin,
 R., Harrison, P.J., Strzepek, R., Gower, J., McKay, R.M., Abraham, E., Arychuk, M.,
 Barwell-Clarke, J., Crawford, W., Crawford, D., Hale, M., Harada, K., Johnson, K.,
 Kiyosawa, H., Kudo, I., Marchetti, A., Miller, W., Heedoba, J., Nishioka, J., Ogawa, H., Page,
 J., Robert, M., Saito, H., Sastri, A., Sherry, H., Soutar, T., Sutherland, N., Taira, Y., Whitney,
 F., Wong, S.K.E., Yoshimura, T., 2004. The decline and fate of an iron-induced subarctic
 phytoplankton bloom. Nature 428, 549-553.
- Boyd, P.W., Watson, A.J., Law, C.S., Abraham, E.R., Trull, T., Murdoch, R., Bakker, D.C.E.,
 Bowie, A.R., Buesseler, K.O., Chang, H., Charette, M., Croot, P., Downing, K., Frew, R.,
 Gall, M., Hadfield, M., Hall, J., Harvey, M., Jameson, G., LaRoche, J., Liddicoat, M., Ling,
 R., Maldonado, M.T., McKay, R.M., Nodder, S., Pickmere, S., Pridmore, R., Rintoul, S., Safi,
 K., Sutton, P., Strzepek, R., Tanneberger, K., Turner, S., Waite, A., Zeldis, J., 2000. A
 mesoscale phytoplankton bloom in the polar Southern Ocean stimulated by iron fertilisation.
 Nature 407, 695-702.
- 555 Browman, H., Boyd, P.W., 2009. Theme Section: Implications of large-scale iron 556 fertilization of the oceans. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 364, 213-309.
- Brzezinski, M.A., Jones, J.L., Demarest, M.S., 2005. Control of silica production by iron and
 silicic acid during the Southern Ocean Iron Experiment (SOFeX). Limnol Oceanogr 50, 810824.

560 Buesseler, K.O., Boyd, P.W., 2003. Will Ocean Fertilization Work? Science 300, 67-68.

561 Buesseler, K.O., Doney, S.C., Karl, D.M., Boyd, P.W., Caldeira, K., Chai, F., Coale, K.H., De

562 Baar, H.J.W., Falkowski, P.G., Johnson, K.S., Lampitt, R.S., Michaels, A.F., Naqvi, S.W.A.,

563 Smetacek, V., Takeda, S., Watson, A.J., 2008. Environment: Ocean iron fertilization -564 Moving forward in a sea of uncertainty. Science 319, 162.

Canadell, J.G., Le Quéré, C., Raupach, M.R., Field, C.B., Buitenhuis, E.T., Ciais, P., Conway,
T.J., Gillett, N.P., Houghton, R.A., Marland, G., 2007. Contributions to accelerating
atmospheric CO2 growth from economic activity, carbon intensity, and efficiency of natural
sinks. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 104, 18866-18870.

- Carr, M.-E., Tang, W., Liu, W.T., 2002. CO2 exchange coefficients from remotely sensed
 wind speed measurements: SSM/I versus QuikSCAT in 2000 doi:10.1029/23002GL015068.
- 571 Geophys. Res. Lett. 29, 30-31.

572 Coale, K.H., Johnson, K.S., Chavez, F.P., Buesseler, K.O., Barber, R.T., Brzezinski, M.A., 573 Cochlan, W.P., Millero, F.J., Falkowski, P.G., Bauer, J.E., Wanninkhof, R.H., Kudela, R.M., 574 Altabet, M.A., Hales, B.E., Takahashi, T., Landry, M.R., Bidigare, R.R., Wang, X., Chase, Z., 575 Strutton, P.G., Friederich, G.E., Gorbunov, M.Y., Lance, V.P., Hilting, A.K., Hiscock, M.R., 576 Demarest, M., Hiscock, W.T., Sullivan, K.F., Tanner, S.J., Gordon, R.M., Hunter, C.N., 577 Elrod, V.A., Fitzwater, S.E., Jones, J.L., Tozzi, S., Koblizek, M., Roberts, A.E., Herndon, J., 578 Brewster, J., Ladizinsky, N., Smith, G., Cooper, D., Timothy, D., Brown, S.L., Selph, K.E., 579 Sheridan, C.C., Twining, B.S., Johnson, Z.I., 2004. Ocean Science: Southern Ocean Iron 580 Enrichment Experiment: Carbon Cycling in High- and Low-Si Waters. Science 304, 408-414.

Coale, K.H., Johnson, K.S., Fitzwater, S.E., Gordon, R.M., Tanner, S., Chavez, F.P., Ferioli,
L., Sakamoto, C., Rogers, P., Millero, F., Steinberg, P., Nightingale, P., Cooper, D.,
Cochlamn, W.P., Landry, M.R., Constantinou, J., RollwagenG, Trasvina, A., Kudela, R.,
1996. A massive phytoplankton bloom induced by an ecosystem-scale iron fertilisation
experiment in the equatorial Pacific Ocean. Nature 383, 495-508.

- 586 Cullen, J.J., 1995. Status of the iron hypothesis after the Open-Ocean Enrichment Experiment.
 587 Limnol Oceanogr 40, 1336-1343.
- Currie, K.I., Macaskill, B., Reid, M.R., Law, C.S., 2010. Processes governing the carbonate
 chemistry during the SAGE experiment. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in
 Oceanography.
- 591 D'Asaro, E., McNeil, C., 2008. Air-sea gas exchange at extreme wind speeds measured by 592 autonomous oceanographic floats. Journal of Marine Systems 74, 722-736.
- de Baar, H.J.W., Boyd, P.W., Coale, K.H., Landry, M.R., Tsuda, A., Assmy, P., Bakker,
 D.C.E., Bozec, Y.T., Barber, R.T., Brzezinski, M.A., Buesseler, K.O., Boyé, M., Croot, P.L.,
 Gervais, F., Gorbunov, M.Y., Harrison, P.J.T., Hiscock, W.T., Laan, P., Lancelot, C., Law,
 C.S., Levasseur, M., Marchetti, A., Millero, F.J., Nishioka, J., Nojiri, Y., van Oijen, T.,
 Riebesell, U., Rijkenberg, M.J.A., Saito, H., Takeda, S., Timmermans, K.R., Veldhuis,
 M.J.W., Waite, A.M., Wong C.-S, 2005. Synthesis of iron fertilization experiments: From the
 Iron Age in the Age of Enlightenment. J. Geophys. Res. 110, doi:10.1029/2004JC002601.
- Dugdale, R.C., Wilkerson, F.P., 1998. Silicate regulation of new production in the equatorialPacific upwelling. Nature 391, 270-273.

- Fairall, C.W., Hare, J.E., Edson, J.B., McGillis, W., 2000. Parameterization and
 micrometeorological measurement of air-sea gas transfer. Boundary-Layer Meteorology 96,
 63-105.
- Feely, R.A., Cosca, C.E., Wanninkhof, R., McGillis, W., Carr, M.-E., 2004. Effects of wind
 speed and gas exchange parameterizations on the air-sea CO2 fluxes in the equatorial Pacific
 Ocean. Journal of Geophysical Research C: Oceans 109, 10.1029/2003JC001896.
- Frouin, R., Franz, B.A., Werdell, P.J., 2003. The SeaWiFS PAR product. NASA Technical
 Memorandum SeaWIFS Postlaunch Technical Report Series, 46-50.
- Hadfield, M., 2010. Predicted and observed conditions during the SAGE Iron Addition
 experiment in Sub-Antarctic Waters. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in
 Oceanography.
- Ho, D.T., Law, C.S., Smith, M.J., Schlosser, P., Harvey, M., Hill, P., 2006. Measurements of
 air-sea gas exchange at high wind speeds in the Southern Ocean: Implications for global
 parameterizations. doi:10.1029/2006GL026817. Geophys. Res. Lett. 33, L16611.
- Kudo, I., Noiri, Y., Cochlan, W.P., Suzuki, K., Aramaki, T., Ono, T., Nojiri, Y., 2009.
 Primary productivity, bacterial productivity and nitrogen uptake in response to iron
 enrichment during the SEEDS II. Deep-Sea Research Part Ii-Topical Studies in Oceanography
 56, 2755-2766.
- Kuparinen, J., Hall, J., Ellwood, M., Safi, K., Peloquin, J., Katz, D., 2010. Bacterioplankton
 responses to iron enrichment during SOLAS-SAGE experiment. Deep Sea Research Part II:
 Topical Studies in Oceanography.
- Law, C.S., Smith, M., Stevens, C., Abraham, E.R., Ellwood, M., Hill, P., Nodder, S.,
 Peloquin, J., Pickmere, S., Safi, K., Walkington, M., 2010. Did dilution limit the
 phytoplankton response to iron addition in HNLCLSi Sub-Antarctic waters during SAGE?
 Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography.
- Law, R.M., Matear, R.J., Francey, R.J., 2008. Comment on "Saturation of the Southern Ocean
 CO2 Sink Due to Recent Climate Change". Science 319, 570a.
- 629 Le Quéré, C., Rödenbeck, C., Buitenhuis, E.T., Conway, T.J., Langenfelds, R., Gomez, A.,
- 630 Labuschagne, C., Ramonet, M., Nakazawa, T., Metzl, N., Gillett, N., Heimann, M., 2007.
- 631 Saturation of the Southern Ocean CO2 Sink Due to Recent Climate Change. Science 316,632 1735-1738.
- Lenton, T.M., Vaughan, N.E., 2009. The radiative forcing potential of different climate
 geoengineering options. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics Discussions 9, 2559-2608.
- Liss, P.S., 1983. Gas Transfer: Experiments and geochemical implications., in: Liss, P.S.,
 Slinn, W.G.N. (Eds.), Air-Sea Exchange of Gases and Particles. Reidel, pp. 241-298.
- 637 Liss, P.S., Merlivat, L., 1986. Air-sea gas exchange rates: introduction and synthesis, in:
- Buat-Ménard, P. (Ed.), The role of air-sea exchange in geochemical cycling. D.Reidel,
 Dordrecht, pp. 113-127.
- Martin, J.H., Gordon, R.M., Fitzwater, S.E., 1990. Iron in Antarctic waters. Nature 345, 156-158.

- Minnett, P.J., Smith, M., Ward, B., 2010. Measurements of the oceanic thermal skin effect.
 Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography.
- Mokhov, I.I., Schlesinger, M.E., 1994. Analysis of global cloudiness 2. Comparison of
 ground-based and satellite-based cloud climatologies. J. Geophys. Res. 99, 17045-17065.
- Morel, F.M.M., Rueter, J.G., Price, N.M., 1991. Iron nutrition of phytoplankton and its
 possible importance in the ecology of ocean regions with high nutrient and low biomass.
 Oceanography 4, 56-61.
- 649 Nightingale, P.D., Malin, G., Law, C.S., Watson, A.J., Liss, P.S., Liddicoat, M.I., Boutin, J.,
- 650 Upstill-Goddard, R.C., 2000. In situ evaluation of air-sea gas exchange parameterisations
- using novel conservative tracers. Global Biogeochem. Cycles 27, 2117-2120.
- Olsen, A., Wanninkhof, R., Trinanes, J.A., Johannessen, T., 2005. The effect of wind speed
 products and wind speed-gas exchange relationships on interannual variability of the air-sea
 CO2 gas transfer velocity. Tellus Ser B Chem Phys Meteorol 57, 95-106.
- Peloquin, J., Hall, J., Safi, K., Ellwood, M., Law, C.S., Thompson, K., Kuparinen, J., Harvey,
 M., Pickmere, S., 2010a. Control of the phytoplankton response during the SAGE experiment:
 a synthesis. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography.
- Peloquin, J., Hall, J., Safi, K., Smith Jr., W.O., Wright, S., van den Enden, R., 2010b. The
 response of phytoplankton to iron enrichment in Sub-Antarctic HNLCLSi waters: results from
 the SAGE experiment. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography.
- Pollard, R.T., Salter, I., Sanders, R.J., Lucas, M.I., Moore, C.M., Mills, R.A., Statham, P.J.,
 Allen, J.T., Baker, A.R., Bakker, D.C.E., Charette, M.A., Fielding, S., Fones, G.R., French,
 M., Hickman, A.E., Holland, R.J., Hughes, J.A., Jickells, T.D., Lampitt, R.S., Morris, P.J.,
 Nédélec, F.H., Nielsdóttir, M., Planquette, H., Popova, E.E., Poulton, A.J., Read, J.F.,
 Seeyave, S., Smith, T., Stinchcombe, M., Taylor, S., Thomalla, S., Venables, H.J.,
 Williamson, R., Zubkov, M.V., 2009. Southern Ocean deep-water carbon export enhanced by
 natural iron fertilization. Nature 457, 577-580.
- Popinet, S., Smith, M., Stevens, C., 2004. Experimental and Numerical Study of the
 Turbulence Characteristics of Airflow around a Research Vessel. Journal of Atmospheric and
 Oceanic Technology 21, 1575-1589.
- Smith, M.J., Ho, D.T., Law, C.S., McGregor, J., Popinet, S., Schlosser, P., 2010.
 Uncertainties in Gas Exchange Parameterization during the SAGE dual-tracer experiment.
 Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography.
- Stevens, C., Ward, B., Law, C.S., Walkington, M., 2010. Surface layer mixing during SAGE
 Ocean Fertilisation Experiment. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography.
- Sura, P., 2003. Stochastic analysis of Southern and Pacific Ocean Sea Surface Winds. Journal
 of the atmospheric Sciences 60, 654-666.
- Suzuki, K., Saito, H., Isada, T., Hattori-Saito, A., Kiyosawa, H., Nishioka, J., McKay,
 R.M.L., Kuwata, A., Tsuda, A., 2009. Community structure and photosynthetic physiology of
 phytoplankton in the northwest subarctic Pacific during an in situ iron fertilization experiment
 (SEEDS-II). Deep-Sea Research Part Ii-Topical Studies in Oceanography 56, 2733-2744.
- Takahashi, T., Sutherland, S.C., Sweeney, C., Poisson, A., Metzl, N., Tilbrook, B., Bates, N.,
 Wanninkhof, R., Feely, R.A., Sabine, C., Olafsson, J., Nojiri, Y., 2002. Global sea-air CO2

flux based on climatological surface ocean pCO2, and seasonal biological and temperature effects. Deep-Sea Res. II 49, 1601-1622.

686 Takahashi, T., Sutherland, S.C., Wanninkhof, R., Sweeney, C., Feely, R.A., Chipman, D.W., Hales, B., Friederich, G., Chavez, F., Sabine, C., Watson, A., Bakker, D.C.E., Schuster, U., 687 688 Metzl, N., Yoshikawa-Inoue, H., Ishii, M., Midorikawa, T., Nojiri, Y., KAIrtzinger, A., 689 Steinhoff, T., Hoppema, M., Olafsson, J., Arnarson, T.S., Tilbrook, B., Johannessen, T., 690 Olsen, A., Bellerby, R., Wong, C.S., Delille, B., Bates, N.R., de Baar, H.J.W., 2009. 691 Climatological mean and decadal change in surface ocean pCO2, and net sea-air CO2 flux 692 over the global oceans. Deep-Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 693 doi:10.1016/j.dsr2.2008.12.009.

- Trull, T., Rintoul, S.R., Hadfield, M., Abraham, E.R., 2001. Circulation and seasonal
 evolution of polar waters south of Australia: implications for iron fertilization of the Southern
 Ocean. Deep Sea Research II 48, 2439-2466.
- Tsuda, A., Saito, H., Machida, R.J., Shimode, S., 2009. Meso- and microzooplankton
 responses to an in situ iron fertilization experiment (SEEDS II) in the northwest subarctic
 Pacific. Deep-Sea Research Part Ii-Topical Studies in Oceanography 56, 2767-2778.

700 Tsuda, A., Takeda, S., Saito, H., Nishioka, J., Kudo, I., Nojiri, Y., Suzuki, K., Uematsu, M., 701 Wells, M.L., Tsumune, D., Yoshimura, T., Aono, T., Aramaki, T., Cochlan, W.P., Hayakawa, 702 M., Imai, K., Isada, T., Iwamoto, Y., Johnson, W.K., Kameyama, S., Kato, S., Kiyosawa, H., 703 Kondo, Y., Levasseur, M., Machida, R.J., Nagao, I., Nakagawa, F., Nakanish, T., Nakatsuka, 704 S., Narita, A., Noiri, Y., Obata, H., Ogawa, H., Oguma, K., Ono, T., Sakuragi, T., Sasakawa, 705 M., Sato, M., Shimamoto, A., Takata, H., Trick, C.G., Watanabe, Y.W., Wong, C.S., Yoshie, 706 N., 2007. Evidence for the grazing hypothesis: Grazing reduces phytoplankton responses of 707 the HNLC ecosystem to iron enrichment in the western subarctic pacific (SEEDS II). Journal 708 of Oceanography 63, 983-994.

- 709 Tsuda, A., Takeda, S., Saito, H., Nishioka, J., Nojiri, Y., Kudo, I., Kiyosawa, H., Shiomoto,
- 710 A., Imai, K., Ono, T., Shimamoto, A., Tsumune, D., Yoshimura, T., Aono, T., Hinuma, A.,
- 711 Kinugasa, M., Suzuki, K., Sohrin, Y., Noiri, Y., Tani, H., Deguchi, Y., Tsurushima, N.,
- 712 Ogawa, H., Fukami, K., Kuma, K., Saino, T., 2003. A mesoscale iron enrichment in the
- 713 Western subarctic Pacific induces a large centric diatom bloom. Science 300, 958-961.
- Tsumune, D., Nishioka, J., Shimamoto, A., Watanabe, Y.W., Aramaki, T., Nojiri, Y., Takeda,
 S., Tsuda, A., Tsubono, T., 2009. Physical behaviors of the iron-fertilized patch in SEEDS II.
- Deep-Sea Research Part II-Topical Studies in Oceanography 56, 2948-2957.
- van Oijen, T., van Leeuwe, M.A., Granum, E., Weissing, F.J., Bellerby, R.G.J., Gieskes,
 W.W.C., de Baar, H.J.W., 2004. Light rather than iron controls photosynthate production and
 allocation in Southern Ocean phytoplankton populations during austral autumn. J Plankton
 Res 26, 885-900.
- Wanninkhof, R., 1992. Relationship between wind speed and gas exchange over the ocean. J.
 Geophys. Res. 97, 7373-7382.
- Wanninkhof, R., 1993. Gas transfer experiment on Georges Bank using two volatile
 deliberate tracers. J. Geophys. Res. 98, 20237-20248.
- Wanninkhof, R., McGillis, W.R., 1999. A cubic relationship between air-sea CO2 exchangeand wind speed. Geophys. Res. Lett. 26, 1889-1892.

- Wanninkhof, R., Ortner, P.B., Zhang, J.-Z., Hitchcock, G., Wiseman, W.J., Vargo, G.,
 Masserini, R., Fanning, K., Asher, W., Ho, D.T., Schlosser, P., Dickson, M.-L., 1997. Gas
 exchange, dispersion, and biological productivity on the west Florida shelf: Results from a
- T30 Lagrangian tracer study. Geophys. Res. Lett. 24, 1767-1770.
- Wanninkhof, R., Sullivan, K.F., Top, Z., 2004. Air-sea gas transfer in the Southern Ocean. J.
 Geophys. Res. 109, doi:10.1029/2003JC001767.
- 733 Ward, B., Wanninkhof, R., McGillis, W.R., Jessup, A.T., DeGrandpre, M.D., Hare, J.E.,
- Edson, J.B., 2004. Biases in the air-sea flux of CO₂ resulting from ocean surface temperature
 gradients. J. Geophys. Res. 109, doi:10.1029/2003JC001800.
- Woolf, D.K., 1997. Bubbles and their role in gas exchange, in: Liss, P.S., Duce, R.A. (Eds.),
 The Sea Surface and Global Change. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, pp. 173-205.
- 738 Zickfeld, K., Fyfe, J.C., Eby, M., Weaver, A.J., 2008. Comment on "Saturation of the
- 739 Southern Ocean CO2 Sink Due to Recent Climate Change". Science 319, 570b.
- 740
- 741
- 742



743 744 Figure 1: Bathymetry map to the south-east of New Zealand in the vicinity of the SAGE 745 experiment. Depth (meters) is indicated by the colour bar.

* **** Ξ

748 749 750 751 752 753 Figure 2: SeaWiFS chlorophyll-a composite Mar – Apr 2004 SAGE site is shown as a red dot.



754 755 Figure 3: Timeline of SeaWiFS chlorophyll-a for SAGE site, extracted from 8 day composite 756 757 standard mapped images. Statistics are for a tile of up to 48 pixels (approx 50 x 50 km) centred on 46.5°S 172.5°E. The vertical arrow marks the time of the SAGE experiment.



760 761 Figure 4: Sea surface height plot for 24 March 2004 from AVISO delayed-time, reference, 762 merged, Mapped Sea Level Anomalies (MSLA_DT_REF) from sea level anomaly data set at 763 $0.25^{\circ} \times 0.25^{\circ}$ derived from satellite altimeters on TOPEX/Poseidon and ERS satellites 764 www.aviso.oceanobs.com and NRL Coastal Ocean Model Sea Surface Height Mean. Release 765 site is centred on the white dot. Anomaly (m) is indicated by the colour bar. 766



767 768 Figure 5: Geostrophic current velocity calculated from SSH for 3 April 2004, data source as 769 in Figure 4 (Hadfield, 2010). The yellow line shows the entire voyage track which progressed in an anti-clockwise direction. Current barbs show direction, filled contours show 770 speed (m s⁻¹): 0-0.05 white, 0.05-0.10 light grey, 0.10-0.20 darker grey, 0.20-0.30 blue, 771 772 0.30-0.40 navy. 773



774 775 Figure 6: Evolution of the SAGE fertilised patch. Variables in the left column were measured 776 from daily CTD casts, where Day 0 is the night 25/26 March (19:00 25-Mar-2004 for 777 continuous data). The vertical arrows show the mid-times of the four iron infusions. Variables 778 in the right column are from continuous underway seawater sampling where samples are 779 assigned as in patch from SF₆ tracer levels above 10 fM and are otherwise regarded as OUT 780 patch (a) Surface (top 10 m) nitrate and silicate concentrations IN and OUT of the patch. (b) 781 Median surface (2 m) dissolved iron measured from towed torpedo trace iron sampler. The 782 vertical bars extend between minimum and maximum values. (c) Total euphotic zone 783 chlorophyll-a by trapezoidal integration to the 0.5 % light level as mean and standard error as 784 calculated by Peloquin et al. (2010). (d) Photosynthetic competence F_y/F_m measured at night. 785 Vertical bars show the mean and standard deviation for each night-time. (e) Total euphotic 786 zone primary productivity by trapezoidal integration to the 0.5 % light level as mean and 787 standard error as calculated by Peloquin et al. (2010). (f) Median fugacity of CO_2 . The 788 vertical bars extend between minimum and maximum values. 789



791 Figure 7: Median, maximum and minimum daily u_{10} windspeed calculated from vessel anemometer and corrected for flow distortion according to Popinet et al. (2004). The dashed bar to the left shows a horizontal mark at the median and extends from the 5^{th} to the 99^{th} percentile of ship windspeed observations presented by Hadfield (2010)



799

Figure 8: Measured and theoretical maximum clear sky daily incident photosynthetically active radiation calculated with an atmospheric transmission coefficient of 0.86 and top of the atmosphere PAR of $2500 \,\mu$ mol m⁻² s⁻¹. Inverted triangles are 8-day composite surface PAR from SeaWIFS for 1°x1° box including the SAGE site presented by Hadfield (2010).





Figure 9: Comparison of iron addition experiments. The black bars show the range of theoretical maximum clear sky daily incident PAR calculated with an atmospheric transmission coefficient of 0.86 and top of the atmosphere PAR of flux of 2500 μ mol m⁻² s⁻¹. The blue box plots show the range, quartiles and median of surface PAR (allowing for cloudiness) based on 8-day composite SeaWIFS PAR (Frouin *et al.*, 2003) estimate for a 7 x 7 tile of pixels at 9-km resolution over the duration of each experiment.

- 812
- 813



Maximum surface Chla (mg m⁻³)

815 816 Figure 10: A comparison of the maximum in:out patch difference in fCO2 versus the 817 maximum surface chlorophyll for a number of FeAX's. Data sources are common with 818 (Boyd et al., 2007) including supplemental tables. In addition SEEDS-II data were presented by (Tsumune et al., 2009); KEOPS are data from a study of natural iron fertilisation on the 819 820 Kerguelen Plateau ((Blain et al., 2007).



823 824 Figure 12: The enhancement in surface chlorophyll-a ranked in approximate order of 825 reducing mixed-layer depth for 10 FeAX's (note IronEx-1 did not evolve due to subduction 826 after 4 days).). Adapted from de Baar et al (2004), with inclusion of data from SEEDS II and 827 SAGE (Boyd et al., 2007 Suppl. tables)

829