

THE SUBSTANTIVE
LAW OF THE EU

THE FOUR FREEDOMS

CATHERINE BARNARD

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xix
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxxv
<i>Table of Equivalences</i>	lxxix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	lxxxvii
<i>List of Figures</i>	xcı

PART I INTRODUCTION

1 INTRODUCTION TO THE ISSUES	3
Introduction	3
The Importance of Free Trade	3
Introduction	3
The Theory of Comparative Advantage	4
The Problems with the Basic Model	6
The Different Stages of Integration	8
Introduction	8
Free Trade Area and Customs Union	8
Common Market and Single Market	10
The Common Market	11
The Single Market	11
Economic, Monetary, and Political Union	13
Understanding the Integration Process	14
The Principles Underpinning the Common Market	17
Introduction	17
The Decentralized Model	18
Non-discrimination	18
Market Access	19
Competitive Federalism	19
The Centralized Model	21
Conclusions	23

PART II FREE MOVEMENT OF GOODS

2 INTRODUCTION TO THE FREE MOVEMENT OF GOODS	27
Introduction	27
The Internal Dimension: the Rules on Free Movement of Goods	28
The External Dimension: the Common Commercial Policy	29
The Effect of the WTO	30
Conclusions	33
3 ARTICLE 25: CUSTOMS DUTIES AND CHARGES HAVING EQUIVALENT EFFECT	35
Introduction	35
Customs Duties and Charges Having Equivalent Effect	36
Customs Duties	36
Charges Having Equivalent Effect to Customs Duties	36
Introduction	36
‘Any pecuniary charge, however small . . .’	37
‘. . . whatever its designation and mode of application . . .’	37
‘. . . imposed unilaterally on domestic or foreign goods by reason of the fact that they cross a frontier . . .’	38
‘. . . even if it is not imposed for the benefit of the State, is not discriminatory or protective in effect and if the product on which the charge is imposed is not in competition with the domestic product.’	38
Remedies	39
Direct Effect	39
Repayment of Unlawful Charges	39
‘Permissible’ Charges	41
Payments for Genuine Administrative Services Rendered to the Importer/Exporter	42
Charges for Inspections Required by Community Law	43
Charges Falling Within the Scope of Internal Taxation	44
4 ARTICLE 90: INTERNAL TAXATION	45
Introduction	45
Member State Autonomy to Determine its own Taxation Policies	46
The Relevant Treaty Provisions	48
Goods which are Similar (Article 90(1))	49
Definition of ‘Similar’	49

Types of Discrimination	51
Direct Discrimination	51
Indirect Discrimination	53
(a) Establishing a <i>Prima Facie</i> Case of Discrimination	53
(b) Objective Justification	54
Goods which are in Competition (Article 90(2))	55
The Court's Approach to Article 90(2)	55
The Globalized Approach to Article 90	57
Remedies	58
The Boundary between Article 90 and Other Treaty Provisions	59
Introduction	59
The 'Exotic' Import	60
Para-fiscal Charges	60
Other 'Levies'	62
Conclusions	62
5 QUANTITATIVE RESTRICTIONS UNDER ARTICLE 28; DEROGATIONS UNDER ARTICLE 30	63
Introduction	63
Quantitative Restrictions	64
The Article 30 Derogations	64
Introduction	64
Public Morality	66
Public Policy	66
Public Security	71
The Protection of Health and Life of Humans, Animals, or Plants	73
The Protection of National Treasures Possessing Artistic, Historic, or Archaeological Value	77
The Protection of Industrial and Commercial Property	78
The Second Sentence of Article 30 and the Principle of Proportionality	78
Arbitrary Discrimination and a Disguised Restriction on Trade	78
Proportionality	79
Decision 3052/95/EC on Exchange of Information about National Measures Derogating from the Principle of Free Movement of Goods	83
Harmonization and Trust	84
6 MEASURES HAVING EQUIVALENT EFFECT TO QUANTITATIVE RESTRICTIONS UNDER ARTICLE 28	86
Introduction	86

What are Measures having Equivalent Effect?	87
Introduction: The <i>Dassonville</i> Formula	87
‘All Trading Rules’	87
‘Enacted by Member States’	89
‘Directly or Indirectly, Actually or Potentially’	91
‘Actually or Potentially’	91
‘Directly or Indirectly’	92
Distinctly Applicable Measures	93
Introduction	93
Examples of Distinctly Applicable Measures	93
Imposing an Additional Requirement on the Imported Goods	93
Rules Limiting Channels of Distribution	94
National Rules Giving Preference to Domestic Goods	94
Discrimination Arising from Treating National and Imported Goods Alike: Price Fixing	98
‘Reverse Discrimination’	99
Indistinctly Applicable Measures	100
Definition of Indistinctly Applicable Measures	100
Introduction	100
Examples of Indistinctly Applicable Measures: Product Requirements	101
<i>Cassis de Dijon</i>	104
The ‘Mandatory Requirements’	108
Proportionality	112
Fundamental Human Rights	117
Blurring the Distinction between Distinctly and Indistinctly Applicable Measures	117
Litigation Avoidance: Directive 98/34 on the Provision of Information in the Field of Technical Standards and Regulations	119
Conclusions	127
7 ARTICLE 28 AND CERTAIN SELLING ARRANGEMENTS; QUANTITATIVE RESTRICTIONS AND MEASURES HAVING EQUIVALENT EFFECT ON EXPORTS UNDER ARTICLE 29	128
Introduction	128
Market Circumstances Rules and Article 28	129
The Problem with Market Circumstances Rules	129
The Road to <i>Keck</i>	132
The Decision in <i>Keck</i>	134
The Judgment	134

What are ‘Certain Selling Arrangements’?	137
Criticisms of the Court’s Approach	137
Discriminatory Certain Selling Arrangements	140
Non-discriminatory Certain Selling Arrangements	144
Quantitative Restrictions and Measures having Equivalent Effect on Exports (Article 29)	149
Introduction	149
Quantitative Restrictions (QRs)	149
Measures having Equivalent Effect (MEEs)	149
The Difference between Articles 28 and 29 in Respect of MEEs	152
Conclusions	154
8 INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND THE FREE MOVEMENT OF GOODS	155
Introduction	155
The Concepts, Rules, and Principles	155
The Role of IPRs in National and Community Law	155
The Relevant Treaty Provisions	157
The General Principles: Existence and Exercise of IPRs, the Specific Subject Matter of IPRs, and the Doctrine of Exhaustion of Rights	158
Patents	162
Trade Marks	166
Introduction	166
Specific Subject Matter, Exhaustion, and Consent	167
The General Principles	167
Consent and the (Abortive) Doctrine of Common Origin	168
International Exhaustion	172
Legitimate Reasons for the Trade Mark-Holder to Oppose Further Marketing of the Trade-Marked Goods	175
Repackaging	175
(a) <i>Hoffmann-La Roche</i>	175
(b) Elaboration of the <i>Hoffmann-La Roche</i> Requirements	178
Affixing a New Trade Mark	181
Advertising	183
Similarity of Trade Marks and Risk of Confusion	184
Copyright and Designs	186
Copyright	186
Introduction	186
Rights in Reproduction and Sale of Products Incorporating Copyright Material	186

Rights in Performance and Other Temporary Use	188
Conclusions	189
Industrial Designs	190
Quasi-IP Cases	191
Conclusions	193
9 EXTERNAL ECONOMIC RELATIONS OF THE EU: THE COMMON COMMERCIAL POLICY	194
Introduction	194
The Constitutional Foundations of EC External Relations	195
The Power to Act	195
Express Powers	195
Implied Powers	199
The Nature of the Power: Exclusive or Shared Competence?	200
Express Powers	200
Implied Powers	201
Tariff Barriers to External Trade: the CCT	203
Introduction	203
Combined Nomenclature	204
The Process of Classification	204
The Role of the European Court of Justice	207
Valuation	208
Determination of (Non-preferential) Origin	209
The Customs Tariff	211
Tariff Quotas	212
The Role of the Member States	212
Non-tariff Barriers to External Trade	213
The Export Regime: Regulation 2603/69	213
Introduction	213
Derogations	214
The Import Regime: Regulation 3285/94	216
Introduction	216
Derogations and Safeguard Measures	217
The Commercial Defence Instruments	218
Goods in Free Circulation	221
Definitions	221
Restrictions on Free Circulation: Article 134 EC	222
The Bananas Dispute	223
Conclusions	227

PART III FREE MOVEMENT OF PERSONS AND SERVICES

10 INTRODUCTION TO THE FREE MOVEMENT OF PERSONS	231
Introduction	231
Common Principles	233
Introduction	233
Refusal of Entry/Deportation	234
Non-discrimination on the Grounds of Nationality	234
Introduction	234
Direct and Indirect Discrimination; Distinctly and Indistinctly	
Applicable Measures	236
Non-discriminatory Measures	238
Defences and Justifications	240
Proportionality	243
Fundamental Human Rights	244
Reverse Discrimination	252
Going Beyond the Model of 'Discrimination on Grounds of Nationality'	256
Restrictions Liable to Prohibit or Otherwise Impede Free Movement	256
Access to the Market and Exercise of the Freedom	258
Obstacles to Free Movement	260
Direct Effect of Articles 39, 43, and 49	261
Conclusions	262
11 FREE MOVEMENT OF WORKERS	264
Introduction	264
The Definition of a 'Worker'	264
The Right Conferred on Workers by EC Law	267
Introduction	267
Rights of Departure, Entry, and Residence	268
The Right to Depart the Home State	268
The Right to Enter the Host State	268
The Right of Residence in the Host State	269
Employment and Family Rights	271
Introduction	271
Access to Employment	271
Equal Treatment during the Employment Relationship	274
(a) Equal Treatment in Respect of Terms and Conditions of Employment	274

(b) Equal Treatment in Respect of Social and Tax Advantages	276
Tax Advantages	276
Social Advantages	278
(c) Equal Treatment and Vocational Training	281
(d) Equal Treatment and Other Benefits	284
Workers' Families	284
(a) Introduction	284
(b) Spouse	285
(c) Dependants	287
(d) Housing	287
(e) Other Family Rights	287
The Right to Remain in the Host Member State	289
Conclusions	290
12 THE RIGHT OF ESTABLISHMENT	291
Introduction	291
Who is Entitled to Benefit from the Right of Establishment?	291
The Right of Establishment for Individuals	291
The Right of Establishment for Companies	292
The Rights Conferred on Natural Persons: the Self-employed	293
Introduction	293
Rights of Departure, Entry, and Residence	293
The Right of Access to Self-employment	294
Primary and Secondary Establishment	294
Equal Treatment and Beyond	295
Qualifications	297
(a) Where there is No Community Legislation	297
(b) Where there is Community Legislation	299
The Vertical Approach	299
The Horizontal Approach	300
The Legal Profession	303
Non-application of Horizontal Directives	303
(c) Qualifications Obtained in Third Countries	304
The Exercise of Activities as a Self-employed Person	305
Equal Treatment and Beyond	305
Social Advantages, Equal Treatment, and Beyond	307
Equal Treatment and Taxation	308
The Right to Remain	309
The Rights Conferred on Legal Persons: Companies	309
Introduction	309
The Right to Leave the Home State	310

Access to the Market of the Host State	311
Primary and Secondary Establishment	311
(a) The Basic Rules	311
(b) Regulatory Competition	320
Equal Treatment and Beyond	324
The Exercise of the Right of Establishment	325
Social Advantages, Equal Treatment, and Beyond	325
Equal Treatment and Taxation	326
Conclusions	329
13 FREEDOM TO PROVIDE AND RECEIVE SERVICES	330
Introduction	330
Who can Rely on Articles 49 and 50?	331
The Scope of Articles 49 and 50	331
The Freedom to Provide Services	331
The Freedom to Travel to Receive Services	332
Neither Provider nor Recipient Travels	333
Performance of a Service for Remuneration	335
What Activities Constitute 'Services'?	335
Services are 'Normally Provided for Remuneration'	335
(a) The Need for an Economic Link	335
(b) Services and the Welfare State	342
The Temporary Nature of Services	343
The Rights Conferred on Service Receivers or Providers	343
Rights of Departure, Entry, and Residence	343
Rights of Access to the Market in Services in Other Member States	346
Discriminatory Measures	346
(a) Distinctly Applicable Measures	346
(b) Indistinctly Applicable Measures	348
(c) Non-discriminatory Measures	349
Measures 'liable to prohibit or otherwise impede' the activities of a service provider	350
Justification	351
Proportionality	353
The Exercise of Rights to Provide or Receive a Service	360
Discriminatory Measures	360
Measures Liable to Prohibit or Impede the Exercise of the Freedom to Provide or Receive Services	361
Abuse of Rights	369
Conclusions	370

14 FREE MOVEMENT OF PERSONS: DEROGATIONS, LIMITATIONS, AND CONDITIONS	373
Introduction	373
Public Policy, Public Security, Public Health	374
Introduction	374
Public Policy and Public Security	375
Public Policy and the Individual	375
(a) Personal Conduct	375
(b) Measures which can be Taken against the Migrant	379
(c) The Right to Reapply	381
Public Policy and Legal Persons	381
Public Health	382
Public Health and the Individual	382
Public Health and Welfare Policies	383
Procedural Requirements	384
General Provisions	384
Remedies	385
(a) Article 8: Same Legal Remedies	385
(b) Article 9: The Decision of a 'Competent Authority'	386
Article 9(1)	386
Article 9(2)	388
(c) The Relationship between Articles 8 and 9	388
Public Service Exception	391
Introduction	391
Article 39(4): 'Employment in the Public Service'	391
The Exercise of 'Official Authority'	394
Other Limitations	396
Conclusions	399
15 UNION CITIZENSHIP	400
Introduction	400
Citizenship of the Union	401
Rights and Duties	403
The Rights	403
Article 18(1) EC: the Right to Move and Reside Freely	405
Early Days	405
The Initial Right to Entry under Article 18(1)	407
The Right of Residence under Article 18	408
Social Advantages for Citizens Lawfully Resident	409

(a) Direct Discrimination	409
(b) Equality, Integration, and Solidarity	413
(c) Indirect Discrimination and Beyond	417
The Relationship between Article 18(1) and Articles 39, 43, and 49	420
Membership	421
Participation	423
Representative Democracy	423
Deliberate or Participatory Democracy	425
Access to Justice	428
Conclusions	430
16 THIRD-COUNTRY NATIONALS AND THE EU	432
Introduction	432
The Historical and Legal Context	432
Introduction	432
The Evolving Legal Context	434
The Creation of an Area of Freedom, Security, and Justice	439
Measures under Title IV EC	442
Introduction	442
Border Control at External Frontiers	443
Immigration Policy	445
Conditions of Entry and Residence	445
Illegal Immigration, Residence, and Repatriation	454
Conclusions	455
Conclusions	455

PART IV FREE MOVEMENT OF CAPITAL

17 FREE MOVEMENT OF CAPITAL AND ECONOMIC AND MONETARY UNION	461
Introduction	461
Free Movement of Capital	461
Introduction	461
The Legal Context	462
The Prohibition of Restrictions on Movement of Capital between Member States	465

Introduction	465
The Definition of 'Capital'	465
The Discrimination Model	466
The Model Based on Restrictions	469
Justifications	472
Express Derogations	474
Introduction	474
Article 58(1)(a): Tax Provisions Distinguishing between Resident and Non-resident Taxpayers	476
Article 58(1)(b): General Derogations	477
(a) 'All requisite measures to prevent infringements of national law and regulations, in particular in the field of taxation and the prudential supervision of financial institutions'	477
(b) To Lay Down Procedures for the Declaration of Capital Movements for the Purposes of Administrative or Statistical Information	478
(c) Public Policy and Public Security	478
The Prohibition of Restrictions on the Movement of Capital and Payments between Member States and Third Countries	480
The Relationship between the Provisions on Capital and the Other Freedoms	481
Economic and Monetary Union	482
Introduction	482
Monetary Union	483
The Stages to Monetary Union	483
(a) Stage One	483
(b) Stage Two	484
(c) Stage Three	485
Monetary Policy	486
Economic Union	487
Conclusions	489

PART V COMPLETING THE SINGLE MARKET

18 REGULATING THE INTERNAL MARKET	493
Introduction	493
The Power to Harmonize: Article 95 EC	493
Introduction	493
The Circumstances in which Article 95(1) can be Used	497
Elimination of Obstacles to the Exercise of Fundamental Freedoms	497
Removal of Appreciable Distortions of Competition	498

Choice of Legal Basis	500
The Application of the Principles of Subsidiarity and Proportionality to Measures Adopted under Article 95	502
Derogations from Measures Adopted under Article 95(1)	504
Different Approaches to Harmonization	506
Introduction	506
Mutual Recognition	507
Exhaustive Harmonization	508
Optional Harmonization	515
Minimum Harmonization	515
Introduction	515
Reverse Discrimination	517
The New Approach to Technical Harmonization and Standardization	520
Introduction	520
The New Approach	520
Reflexive Harmonization and the Open Method of Co-ordination	525
Completing the Internal Market: Beyond 1992	528
Introduction	528
Simplification, Implementation, and Enforcement	528
Problem Avoidance Mechanisms	532
Conclusions	534