

Trade in Goods

*The GATT and the Other Agreements Regulating
Trade in Goods*

PETROS C. MAVROIDIS

*Edwin B. Parker Professor of Law, Columbia Law School, NY,
Professor at the University of Neuchâtel, Switzerland
Research Fellow at CEPR (Centre for Economic Policy Research)*

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

1. From GATT 1947 to GATT 1994	1
1 The Genesis of the GATT	2
2 Why the GATT?	6
2.1 Why ask the question?	6
2.2 The negotiators say...	7
2.3 Economic theory suggests	12
2.4 And some unexplored avenues	18
2.5 To conclude (?)	20
3 The GATT in the GATT era: An Agreement, and an Institution as Well	20
4 The GATT Rounds of Trade Liberalization	23
5 Expanding the GATT: The Emergence of the Codes	24
6 The GATT in the WTO era: Just an Agreement, Albeit a Pivotal One	25
7 The Modern GATT discipline in a Nutshell	30
7.1 The GATT in its WTO context	30
7.2 The legal relation of the GATT with the WTO Agreement	31
7.3 The substantive content of modern GATT	34
2. Disciplines on Trade Instruments	39
1 Introduction	42
2 The Treatment of QRs	42
2.1 The legal text	42
2.2 What is a QR?	43
2.2.1 The attribution of practices to governments	45
2.2.2 The measures covered	50
2.2.3 The standard of review: no effects test and no intent test	55
2.2.4 The relationship between Art XI and other GATT provisions	58
2.2.4.1 Art III of the GATT	58
2.2.4.2 Art VI of the GATT	62
2.2.4.3 Art XX of the GATT	63
2.2.4.4 Art XXI of the GATT	63
2.2.4.5 Infant industry protection (Art XVIIIc)	63
2.2.4.6 Arts XII and XVIII of the GATT	63
2.2.4.7 Art XIII of the GATT	63
2.3 Trade in textiles	67
2.4 Discriminatory legal QRs	67
2.5 The non-segmentation nature of Art XI of the GATT	68

- 3 Tariff Protection in the GATT 68
 - 3.1 The legal text 68
 - 3.2 The basic discipline with respect to tariff protection 70
 - 3.3 Why yes to duties and no to QRs? 71
 - 3.4 The mechanics of binding the duties 72
 - 3.4.1 The Harmonized System (HS) 72
 - 3.4.2 What is the tariff promise? Ordinary customs duties, other duties and charges 74
 - 3.4.3 The typology of ordinary customs duties 78
 - 3.4.4 Multilateral trade negotiations (rounds) 79
 - 3.4.5 The treatment of export tariffs (taxes) under GATT 84
 - 3.4.6 Certification of schedules 86
 - 3.5 Interpreting tariff commitments 87
 - 3.5.1 The legal relevance of HS 87
 - 3.5.2 Scheduling of concessions must be WTO consistent 88
 - 3.5.3 The (non) impact of legitimate expectations 93
 - 3.6 Changes in tariff protection after their consolidation 93
 - 3.6.1 Switching between different types of duties 94
 - 3.6.2 Withdrawing concessions from members leaving the WTO 95
 - 3.6.3 Renegotiating the tariff protection 97
 - 3.6.3.1 INR holders 99
 - 3.6.3.2 PSI countries 100
 - 3.6.3.3 SI countries 102
 - 3.6.3.4 MFN trade is the basis for defining PSIs and SIs 102
 - 3.6.3.5 New products 103
 - 3.6.3.6 The mechanics of the negotiation 103
 - 3.6.4 Rectifications and modifications of schedules 112
 - 3.7 Fees and charges for services rendered 114
 - 3.8 Customs Valuation (CV) 118
 - 3.9 The Agreement on Pre-shipment Inspection (PSIA) 119
 - 3.10 The MFN 120
 - 3.10.1 The MFN discipline in a nutshell 123
 - 3.10.2 The measures coming under the purview of the MFN 124
 - 3.10.2.1 Any advantage... 124
 - 3.10.2.2 ...granted to products originating in any country... 125
 - 3.10.2.3 ...irrespective whether it discriminates *de jure* or *de facto*... 126
 - 3.10.3 ...must be extended to like products 126
 - 3.10.4 The rules of origin 129
 - 3.10.5 The MFN treatment must be extended immediately and unconditionally 132
 - 3.10.6 No rebalancing permitted 135
 - 3.10.7 The standard of review: no effect and no intent test 136
 - 3.11 Special and differential treatment for developing countries 137
 - 3.11.1 The *Enabling clause* 137

3.11.2	Some historical features	138
3.11.3	The <i>Enabling clause</i> in the WTO legal order	143
3.11.4	The test for compliance with the <i>Enabling clause</i>	144
3.11.5	Is the candle worth the flame? (criticism of the <i>Enabling clause</i>)	145
3.12	Preferential Trade Agreements (PTAs)	148
3.12.1	PTAs in the WTO: FTAs and CUs	148
3.12.2	Globalization yes, preferences yes as well	148
3.12.3	What matters when discussing preferential trade?	150
3.12.4	PTAs in the GATT	152
3.12.4.1	No per se inconsistency	152
3.12.4.2	The Art XXIV of the GATT test in a nutshell	153
3.12.4.3	Designed at home, approved (?) in Geneva	153
3.12.4.4	The multilateral track	156
3.12.4.5	The bilateral track	168
3.12.4.6	Why not litigate more?	171
3.12.5	What is the permissible extent from MFN deviation when a PTA is formed?	177
4	Export Subsidies	179
4.1	Rigidity required?	179
4.2	From discouraging to outlawing export subsidies	181
4.3	Counteracting prohibited subsidies	184
3.	Domestic Instruments	190
1	National Treatment and its Rationale	193
2	The Coverage	195
2.1	Wide coverage	195
2.2	Subsidies	195
2.2.1	What is a (domestic) subsidy?	195
2.2.1.1	Financial contribution	196
2.2.1.2	Benefit to recipient	198
2.2.1.3	The specificity requirement	200
2.2.2	The classification of subsidies	200
2.2.3	Counteracting subsidies	201
2.2.4	Remedies	201
2.2.5	Farm subsidies	202
2.2.5.1	The regulation of farm trade in the GATT era	202
2.2.5.2	The WTO Agreement in a nutshell	206
2.2.5.3	AG over SCM	208
2.3	Government procurement	210
2.3.1	What is government procurement?	210
2.3.2	The basic discipline: non-discrimination	211

- 2.3.3 The past and present of GPA membership 211
- 2.4 The coverage of Art III of the GATT—revisited 212
- 3 National Treatment, and Negative Integration 215
- 4 National Treatment: The Legal Discipline 216
 - 4.1 Fiscal measures 216
 - 4.1.1 DCS products 217
 - 4.1.1.1 Defining DCS 217
 - 4.1.1.2 SATAP 221
 - 4.1.2 Like products 234
 - 4.1.2.1 Defining like products 234
 - 4.1.2.2 Taxation in excess 236
 - 4.2 Non-fiscal measures 237
 - 4.2.1 A measure... 237
 - 4.2.2 ...affecting sale, offering for sale,... 238
 - 4.2.3 ...of like products 238
 - 4.2.4 Less favourable treatment 242
 - 4.3 A critique of the case-law concerning NT 247
 - 4.4 General exceptions 254
 - 4.4.1 Coverage 254
 - 4.4.2 An exception to which provisions? 254
 - 4.4.3 Regulatory diversity 259
 - 4.4.4 A two-tier test for compliance with Art XX of the GATT 260
 - 4.4.5 Public morals (Art XX(a) of the GATT) 261
 - 4.4.5.1 Coverage 261
 - 4.4.5.2 The necessity requirement 262
 - 4.4.6 Human, animal and plant life (Art XX(b) of the GATT) 262
 - 4.4.6.1 Coverage 262
 - 4.4.6.2 The necessity requirement 262
 - 4.4.6.3 No science required 263
 - 4.4.7 Domestic laws and regulations (Art XX(d) of the GATT) 264
 - 4.4.7.1 Coverage 264
 - 4.4.7.2 The necessity requirement 264
 - 4.4.8 Exhaustible natural resources (Art XX(g) of the GATT) 266
 - 4.4.8.1 Coverage 266
 - 4.4.8.2 Jurisdictional limits 268
 - 4.4.8.3 Measure must be relating to the objective pursued 269
 - 4.4.8.4 Measures restricting domestic production or consumption 270
 - 4.4.9 The chapeau of Art XX of the GATT 271
 - 4.4.9.1 The scope of the chapeau 271
 - 4.4.9.2 Complying with the chapeau 271
 - 4.4.9.2.1 Arbitrary or unjustifiable discrimination 271
 - 4.4.9.2.2 Disguised restriction of trade 274
 - 4.4.10 A critique of the case-law 276
 - 4.4.10.1 The discontents of an exhaustive list 276
 - 4.4.10.2 Extra-territoriality 277

4.4.10.3	A two-tier test?	285	
4.4.10.4	The standard of review	285	
4.5	A specific exception: films	286	
5	Dealing with NTBs		287
5.1	The TBT and SPS Agreements	287	
5.2	The legal relationship between GATT, TBT, and SPS	288	
5.3	TBT	288	
5.3.1	Coverage	288	
5.3.2	International standards	289	
5.3.3	Unilateral technical regulations	295	
5.3.4	Domestic standards	296	
5.4	The WTO SPS Agreement	297	
5.4.1	Coverage	297	
5.4.2	The SPS Agreement in a nutshell	298	
5.4.3	International standards	299	
5.4.4	Unilateral measures based on scientific evidence	299	
5.4.5	Measures adopted on the basis of precaution	309	
6	State Trading Enterprises (STEs)		315
6.1	STEs: definitional issues	315	
6.2	The legal obligation in a nutshell	316	
4.	State Contingencies		320
1	Introduction		321
2	National Security (Art XXI of the GATT)		322
2.1	The legal discipline	322	
2.2	Practice in the GATT years	322	
2.3	Practice in the WTO era	330	
3	BoP		331
4	Exchange Restrictions		335
5	Antidumping (Art VI of the GATT)		338
5.1	An unfair (?) price discrimination	338	
5.2	Finding dumping	343	
5.3	Establishing injury	349	
5.4	Sunset reviews	352	
5.5	Price differentiation in antitrust statutes	358	
5.6	What does the 'anti' in AD refer to?	361	
5.6.1	Discriminatory pricing	361	
5.6.2	Predation	362	
5.6.3	Strategic dumping	363	
5.6.4	AD as a safeguard mechanism	364	
6	Countervailing Duties (CVD)		365
7	Safeguards		365
7.1	The regulatory framework	365	
7.2	The typology of safeguards	366	
7.3	Safeguards imposed by PTAs	367	

7.4	Conditions for lawful application of safeguards	368
7.4.1	Initiation of investigation	368
7.4.2	Unforeseen developments	370
7.4.3	Increased imports	371
7.4.4	Injury	371
7.4.5	Are safeguards truly non-discriminatory?	375
7.4.6	The issue of compensation	376
7.4.7	The duration of safeguards	378
7.5	Safeguards and voluntary export restraints (VERs)	380
7.6	Safeguards: a safe harbour too far?	381
8	The Notion of Market Access Revisited	385
5.	Institutional Provisions	388
1	Introductory Remarks	389
2	Participation	390
2.1	Contracting Parties to the GATT, WTO members	390
2.2	Accession	391
2.3	Non-application	394
3	Decision Making	395
3.1	Consensus, the default rule	395
3.2	Special procedures	396
3.2.1	Interpretations	396
3.2.2	Amendment of the GATT	397
4	Dispute Settlement	398
4.1	The early GATT years	398
4.2	The late GATT years	400
4.3	The WTO DSU	402
4.4	The WTO: exclusive forum for adjudication of trade disputes	404
4.5	A closer look into procedures	406
4.5.1	Request for establishment of a panel	406
4.5.2	Burden of proof	407
4.5.3	Discovery powers	408
4.5.4	Standard of review	410
4.5.5	The process before the AB	411
4.5.6	The types of complaints before panels and the AB	411
4.5.6.1	Violation complaints	412
4.5.6.2	NVCs	412
4.5.6.3	Situation complaints	415
4.5.7	Recommendations and suggestions by panels and the AB	416
4.6	Enforcing WTO obligations	417
4.6.1	The process in a nutshell	417
4.6.2	The types of complaint matter for enforcement purposes	418
4.6.3	Compliance within a reasonable period of time	418
4.6.4	Compliance panels	419
4.6.5	Compensation	420
4.6.6	Suspension of concessions	421

4.6.6.1	Procedural issues	421	
4.6.6.2	Quantifying suspension of concessions	422	
4.7	Monitoring compliance	424	
4.8	The value of precedent in the WTO	425	
4.9	Does WTO enforcement work?	426	
5	Waivers		435
6	Transparency		436
6.1	Introductory remarks	436	
6.2	Trade Policy Review Mechanism (TPRM)	437	
6.3	Art X of the GATT	440	
6.3.1	The discipline in a nutshell	440	
6.3.2	The coverage	441	
6.3.3	The standard of review	442	
6.3.4	Laws of general application	443	
6.3.5	Uniform, reasonable, and impartial administration	443	
6.3.5.1	Uniform administration	444	
6.3.5.2	Reasonable administration	444	
6.3.5.3	Impartial administration	445	
6.3.6	The obligation to maintain independent tribunals	445	
7	Relation to the Havana Charter		446
6.	The GATT, Then and Now		447
1	The GATT 1947: A Solid Text (with some compromises)		447
2	The Evolution of the GATT: No Keeping up with the Joneses		448
3	Rule of Reason		451
	<i>Appendices</i>		455
	<i>References</i>		478
	<i>Index</i>		499