Verification and Validation in Computational Science and Engineering

by

Patrick J. Roache

hermosa
publishers

PO Box 9110
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87119-9110
USA
http://www.hermosa-pub.com/hermosa

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface iii

Acknowledgments vii

Part I Overview 1

Chapter 1 Introduction 3
1.1 Sketch of Historical Development of CFD 3
1.2 The New Impetus Toward Higher Quality Solutions 7
1.3 A Personal Anecdote Illustrating the Importance of Systematic Code Verification 11
References for Chapter 1 14

Chapter 2 Semantics: Terminology, Taxonomies, and Definitions 19
2.1 Introduction 19
2.2 Semantics 20
2.3 Code Verification and Validation: Numerical vs. Conceptual Modeling 23
2.4 Code Confirmation 30
2.5 Benchmarks and Inter-Code Comparisons 31
2.6 Code Certification, Quality Assurance, and Accreditation 33
2.7 Verification of Calculations 35
2.8 Quantification of Uncertainty 36
2.9 Grid Convergence vs. Iterative Convergence 36
2.10 Error Taxonomies 36

2.11 Truncation Error vs. Discretization Error 43
2.12 Calibration and Tuning 44
2.13 Quality assurance (QA) vs. Quality Work 46
2.14 Customer Illusions vs. Customer Care 46
2.15 Other Distinctions: Authors, Users, Modelers, Code and Software 47
2.16 Sensitivity, Uncertainty, and Risk 48
2.17 Etymology and Near Synonyms 49
2.18 Accuracy vs. Reliability 49
2.19 Additional Remarks on Verification 50
2.20 Conclusion: Limitations of Semantic Distinctions 51
References for Chapter 2 52

Part II Verification 63

Chapter 3 A Methodology for Accuracy Verification of Codes: the Method of Manufactured Solutions 65
3.1 Introduction 65
3.2 Warnings: the Division of Labor in Code Development and Use 65
3.3 Order of Convergence 66
3.4 A General Procedure for Generating an Analytical Solution for Code Accuracy Verification: the Method of Manufactured Solutions 67
3.5 Example: Verification of a 3-D Poisson Equation Code in Nonorthogonal Grid and a 3-D Grid Generation Code 70
3.6 Another Path to Manufactured Solutions 79
3.7 Code Verification Including Shock Waves 79
3.8 Need for a Theorem 81
3.9 Specific Analytical Solutions 81
3.10 Manufactured Solutions vs. Infinite Series Solutions 82
3.11 The Sensitivity of Grid Convergence Testing 82
3.12 Examples of Unanticipated Convergence Rates Determined by Systematic Grid Convergence Tests 83
3.13 Special Considerations for Problems with Multiple Scales: Turbulence Modeling 88
3.14 Warnings: What the Method Does Not "Verify" 88
3.15 Robustness and Confidence 89
References for Chapter 3 90

Chapter 4 Error Estimation for Quantification of Uncertainty; Verification of Calculations 95
4.1 Introduction 95
4.2 Error Estimation for Grid Adaptation vs. Quantification of Uncertainty 96
4.3 Taxonomy for Additional Information for Error Estimates 97
4.4 Grid Refining and Coarsening 98
4.5 Levels of Simulation Use 99
4.6 Verification of Computer Round-off Errors 100
4.7 Effect of Differing formulations 103
References for Chapter 4 103

Chapter 5 Systematic Grid Convergence Studies and the Grid Convergence Index (GCI) 107
5.1 Introduction 107
5.2 Background on Grid Convergence Reporting 108

5.3 Richardson Extrapolation 109
5.4 A Generalization of Richardson Extrapolation 112
5.5 Richardson's Extrapolation for π 114
5.6 Grid Convergence Index for the Fine Grid Solution 114
5.7 Grid Convergence Index for the Coarse Grid Solution 117
5.8 Example GCI Calculation 119
5.9 Should the Coefficient Be "1" Or "3" Or "1.25"? 120
5.10 Additional Features of Grid Convergence Studies for Verification of Codes and Calculations 123
5.11 Conclusion 135
References for Chapter 5 136

Chapter 6 Applications of Systematic Grid Convergence Studies and the Grid Convergence Index 143
6.1 Introduction 143
6.2 Two Further Examples of (Partial) Code Verification in Groundwater Flow 144
6.3 Issues in Calculation Verification 157
6.4 An Example of the Effective Grid Refinement Ratio 158
6.5 A Benchmark Problem for Driven Cavity Flow 160
6.6 A Benchmark Problem for Free Convection 160
6.7 Laminar Plane Jet Impinging on a Heated Flat Plate 162
6.8 A k-ε Model of a Free Shear Layer 162
6.9 Transonic Airfoil Calculations 163
6.10 Ordered Estimation of Far-Field Boundary Error 166
6.11 Artificial Dissipation Effects 168
6.12 Single and Dual Porosity Contaminant Transport: Source Term Location 170
6.13 Convergence Behaviors for Mixed-Order Methods 179
6.14 Grid Convergence of Zero Drag Coefficient 180
6.15 Anomalous Result Possibly Due to Grid Stretching 181
6.16 Non-Smooth Property Variation: Global Error Norms 182
6.17 Discrete Vortex Methods 184
6.18 Observed Convergence Rates for Euler Equations with Shocks 185
6.19 Completed Richardson Extrapolation 187
6.20 Truncation Error in Elliptic Grid Generation 187
6.21 One Dimensional Moving Adaptive Grid Problems 189
6.22 GCI Application in Solution Adaptive Grids with Non-Integer Grid Refinement 189
6.23 High Quality Grid Resolution Studies Leading to a Safety Factor of 1.25 190
6.24 Transport Code Verifications Using the GCI: Partitioning the Option Matrix 190
6.25 Turbulent Separated Flow: the Error Estimator of Celik and Karatekin 195
6.26 Level of Accuracy Estimates from Grid Convergence Studies 197
6.27 Other Examples of Careful Use of Richardson Extrapolation 198
6.28 Parameter Convergences of a Compressible Flow Code Near the Incompressible Limit 198
6.29 Justification of the Dupuit Approximation 203
6.30 Concluding Comment on Parameter Uncertainty vs. Numerical Uncertainty 206
References for Chapter 6 207

Chapter 7 Single Grid Error Estimators 217
7.1 Error Estimation from Higher or Lower Order Accuracy Solutions on the Same Grid (Category B) 218
7.2 Auxiliary PDE Solutions on the Same Grid (Category C) 220
7.3 Auxiliary Algebraic Evaluations on the Same Grid: Surrogate Estimators (Category D) 223
7.4 Time Accuracy Estimation 228
7.5 Concluding Remarks on Single Grid Error Estimators 230
References for Chapter 7 231

Chapter 8 Hard Stories 237
8.1 Factors Influencing Convergence Rates 237
8.2 Behavior of Quasi-Higher-Order Methods 245
8.3 Some Good News for Turbulence Modeling 250
8.4 The Myth of the Converged "Solution" 251
8.5 Esoteric Coding Mistakes 253
8.6 A False Verification Test of a Particle Tracker 253
8.8 Hard-Wired Data vs. User Input Data 258
8.9 Degraded Rate of Convergence Due to User Modeling Errors 259
8.10 Lessons from Nonlinear Dynamics 259
8.11 Adaptive and Local Time Stepping, and Steady State 263
8.12 Other Questions Related to the Steady State 263
References for Chapter 8 264

Part III Validation 271

Chapter 9 Difficulties With Experiments and Validation 273
9.1 Credulousness 273
9.2 Historical Methods of Validating Scientific Theories 275
9.3 The Theory Laden Experiment 276
9.4 Random and Systematic Errors in Experiments 277
9.5 Experimental Errors in Physical Properties 278
9.6 Boundary Conditions, Continuum and Numerical 278
9.7 Trends, Computational and Experimental 278
9.8 False Negatives and False Positives 280
9.9 "Nearby" Problems 280
9.10 Difficulty of the Option Tree 282
9.11 Data Sparsity and Lack of Synchronicity: Groundwater, Ocean/Lake, and Meteorology Modeling 282
9.12 The Effect of Parameter Resolution on Grid Convergence 284
9.13 Scale of Unsteadiness 284
9.14 Spatial Scales, Scaling Up, and Dimensionality 286
9.15 Assumptions of Periodicity 288
9.16 Other Difficulties of Validation in Aerospace 289
9.17 Universal Turbulence Models vs. Zonal Modeling 289
9.18 Strong and Weak Model Definitions and Model Validation 291
9.19 The Myth of the Totally Validated Code 292
References for Chapter 9 293

Chapter 10 Methodologies and Examples of Validations, Calibrations, and Certifications 299
10.1 Sources of Physical Modeling Errors in Aerodynamics CFD 299
10.2 Accuracy Level for Validation 300
10.3 Generic Models vs. Realistic Models for Validation and Calibration: Phases of Validation 301
10.4 CFD and Experimental Facility Corrections 303
10.5 Verification Must Be Independent of Validation: Airfoil Calculations 304
10.6 Synergism Between Computation and Validation Experiments 304
10.7 The Difficulty of Defining a "Nearby" Problem 308
10.8 Missing Experimental Details 309
10.9 Onset of 3 Dimensionality in Backstep Flow 309
10.10 Gray Area: "Validation" from a Calculated Benchmark 310
10.11 Gray Area: "Validation" of an Experimental Technique by a Computation 310

10.12 The MADE-2 Experience: Can Groundwater Flow Models Be Validated? 311
10.13 Dynamic Stall Wind Tunnel Data: Who Does the Tweaking? 313
10.14 Consortium Effort at CFD Code Certification 314
10.15 Simulation Team Responsibilities in Validation 323
10.16 Shifting Responsibilities and Gray Areas 324
10.17 WUA Benchmarks in 1994 and 1996 325
10.18 CFD Triathlons 326
10.19 Canadian CFD Society Test Case 326
10.20 Workshops 327
10.21 AGARD 1988 Validation of Computational Fluid Dynamics 327
10.22 A Case Study for CFD Code Validation Methodology 330
10.23 Joint Consideration of Experimental and Simulation Uncertainties 331
10.24 Dynamic Databases for Validation 335
References for Chapter 10 340

Part IV Broader Issues 349

Chapter 11 Code Quality Assurance and Certification 351
11.1 Introduction 351
11.2 Quality Assurance (QA) vs. Quality Work 352
11.3 QA vs. Creativity 352
11.4 QA and Temperament Types 352
11.5 The Prevalence of Errors in Scientific Software: Use of Static Analyzers 353
11.6 Factors of Code Quality Assurance 356
11.7 Some Components of Project Code Certification 357
11.8 Engineering Teams and the Division of Labor 358
11.9 Personnel Roles, Code Levels, and Code Sources 359
11.10 Desirable (But Not Required) Code Characteristics 359
11.11 Code Documentation 362
11.12 Code Module Communication Structure 364
11.13 Code Updates 364
11.14 Built in Automatic Error Detection Tests 365
11.15 Designing for Code Maintenance 366
11.16 Commercial Codes and their Users 366
11.17 Code to Code Comparisons 366
11.18 General Software Certification and ISO-9000 Standards 367
11.19 QA for Large Public Policy Projects 367
11.20 QA of Analyses 368
11.21 QA / Certification of Users and Regulators 368
11.22 Assessment of Codes? Or Users? 368
11.23 QA Procedures 370
11.24 A Template for a QA System 374
11.25 Concluding Remarks On QA 380
References for Chapter 11 380

Chapter 12 Conclusions 385
12.1 The Overall Process for Quantification of Uncertainty 385
12.2 Internet Archive 387
12.3 Fulfilling the Promise of Computational Power 387

Appendix A. Need for Control of Numerical Accuracy 389
I. Introduction 390
II. Resistance and Objections 390
III. Difficulties in Applications 395
IV. Examples of What Can Be Done 396
V. Conclusions and Recommendations 396
Appendix: Editorial Policy Statement on the Control of Numerical Accuracy 398
Acknowledgments 399
References 399

Appendix B. Other Journal Policy Statements on Control of Numerical Accuracy 403
Journal of Heat Transfer Editorial Policy Statement on Numerical Accuracy 403
International Journal for Numerical Methods in Fluids-Editorial 406
AIAA Editorial Policy Statement on Numerical Accuracy and Experimental Uncertainty 407
Journal of Fluids Engineering-Editorial and Policy Statement 408
Policy Statement on the Control of Numerical Accuracy 410

Appendix C. Comment on Oreskes et al 413
Comment on "Verification, Validation, and Confirmation of Numerical Models in the Earth Sciences" 413
References 417

Appendix D. CFD Parody: Will the Wind Tunnel Replace the Computer? 419
Original 419
Response 420

Appendix E. A Biographical Sketch of Lewis Fry Richardson 423
References 427

Index 429