

### Vygotskian Perspectives on Literacy Research

The authors in this collection use Vygotsky's cultural-historical theory of human development to frame their analyses of schooling, with particular emphasis on the ways in which literacy practices are mediated by social interaction and cultural artifacts. This volume extends Vygotsky's cultural-historical theoretical framework to embrace nuances of learning and development that are influenced by culture as instantiated through the experiences of race, ethnicity, and language variation. Rather than seeking to provide definitive answers to social questions using Vygotsky's core principles, the authors wrestle with educational problems through the mediation of Vygotsky's theory. In doing so, they both sharpen their focus on the problems and speak back to Vygotsky, helping to extend the foundation of his work to address modern problems. This collection serves as a form of collaborative inquiry that itself will stimulate further consideration of these topics and further learning with Vygotsky about the ways in which individuals and social groups inquire and learn.

Carol D. Lee is Associate Professor of Education and Social Policy at the School of Education and Social Policy, Northwestern University.

Peter Smagorinsky is Associate Professor of English Education at the University of Georgia.





## Learning in Doing: Social, Cognitive, and Computational Perspectives

#### General Editors

ROY PEA, SRI International, Center for Technology in Learning JOHN SEELY BROWN, Xerox Palo Alto Research Center

Computation and Human Experience

PHILIP E. AGRE

The Computer as Medium

Edited by PETER BOGH ANDERSEN, BERIT HOLMQVIST, and JENS F. JENSEN

Understanding Practice: Perspectives on Activity and Context

Edited by SETH CHAIKLIN and JEAN LAVE

Situated Cognition: On Human Knowledge and Computer Representations WILLIAM J. CLANCEY

Cognition and Tool Use: The Blacksmith at Work

CHARLES M. KELLER and JANET DIXON KELLER

Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation

JEAN LAVE and ETIENNE WENGER

Sociocultural Psychology: Theory and Practice of Doing and Knowing Edited by LAURA M. W. MARTIN, KATHERINE NELSON, and ETHEL TOBACH

The Construction Zone: Working for Cognitive Change in School DENIS NEWMAN, PEG GRIFFIN, and MICHAEL COLE

Street Mathematics and School Mathematics

TEREZINHA NUNES, DAVID WILLIAM CARRAHER, and ANALUCIA DIAS SCHLIEMANN

Distributed Cognitions: Psychological and Educational Considerations

Edited by GAVRIEL SALOMON

Plans and Situated Actions: The Problem of Human-Machine Communication LUCY A. SUCHMAN

Mind and Social Practice: Selected Writings by Sylvia Scribner Edited by ETHEL TOBACH, RACHEL JOFFE FALMAGNE, MARY B. PARLEE, LAURA M. W. MARTIN, and AGGIE KAPELMAN

Sociocultural Studies of Mind

Edited by JAMES V. WERTSCH, PABLO DEL RIO, and AMELIA ALVAREZ

Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning and Identity

ETIENNE WENGER

Learning in Likely Places:

Edited by JOHN SINGLETON





# Vygotskian Perspectives on Literacy Research

Constructing Meaning through Collaborative Inquiry

Edited by

CAROL D. LEE

Northwestern University

PETER SMAGORINSKY

University of Georgia





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521630955

© Cambridge University Press 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000 Reprinted 2001, 2003, 2005

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Vygotskian perspectives on literacy research: constructing meaning through collaborative inquiry / edited by Carol D. Lee, Peter Smagorinsky.

p. cm. - (Learning in doing)

Chiefly based on papers presented at a conference entitled A Vygotsky centennial held 1996, Chicago, Ill.

Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 0-521-63095-9. – ISBN 0-521-63878-X (pbk.)

1. Vygotskii, L. S. (Lev Semenovich), 1896–1934. 2. Learning,

Psychology of – Congresses. 3. Literacy – Social aspects – Congresses.

4. Cognition and culture - Congresses. 5. Sociolinguistics -

Congresses. I. Lee, Carol D. II. Smagorinsky, Peter. III. Series.

LB1060.V95 1999

370.15'23 - dc21

99-12568

CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-63095-5 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-63878-4 Paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2009

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.



#### **Contents**

In Memoriam		page ix
Contributors		xi
1	Introduction: Constructing Meaning through Collaborative Inquiry Carol D. Lee and Peter Smagorinsky	1
Par	rt I Paradoxes in Vygotsky's Account of	
	Development	
2	Vygotsky's Two Minds on the Nature of Meaning James V. Wertsch	19
3	Creativity and Collaboration in Knowledge Construction Vera P. John-Steiner and Teresa M. Meehan	31
Par	rt II Studies of Collaborative Inquiry	
4	Dialogic Inquiry in Education: Building on the Legacy of Vygotsky Gordon Wells	51
5	Consequential Progressions: Exploring Collective-Individual Development in a Bilingual Classroom LeAnn G. Putney, Judith Green, Carol Dixon,	86
6	Richard Durán, and Beth Yeager Linking Writing and Community Development through the Children's Forum Anne Haas Dyson	127

vii



#### viii Contents

7	Synchronic and Diachronic Dimensions of Social	
	Practice: An Emerging Methodology for Cultural-	
	Historical Perspectives on Literacy Learning	150
	Kris D. Gutiérrez and Lynda D. Stone	
8	Idiocultural Diversity in Small Groups: The Role of	
	the Relational Framework in Collaborative Learning	165
	Peter Smagorinsky and Cindy O'Donnell-Allen	
9	Signifying in the Zone of Proximal Development	191
	Carol D. Lee	
10	Teachers' Developing Philosophies on Literacy and	
	Their Use in Urban Schools: A Vygotskian Perspective	
	on Internal Activity and Teacher Change	226
	Arnetha F. Ball	
11	Inspired by Vygotsky: Ethnographic Experiments in	
	Education	256
	Luis C. Moll	
Au	thor Index	269
	Subject Index	
$\mathcal{I}_{u}$	//CC IIIMCA	274



#### In Memoriam

Dr. Jan Hawkins, our Learning in Doing series co-editor, friend, and colleague, died on February 9, 1999, of cancer at the age of 47. We will miss Jan's wisdom, integrity, and leadership in the humanistic study of learning, technology, and education.

Roy Pea John Seely Brown





### **Contributors**

**Arnetha F. Ball** Stanford University, School of Education, Stanford, CA 94305

**Carol Dixon** University of California at Santa Barbara, Graduate School of Education, Department of Education, Teaching and Learning Emphasis, Santa Barbara, CA 93106

**Anne Haas Dyson** University of California at Berkeley, Graduate School of Education, Berkeley, CA 94720

**Richard Durán** University of California at Santa Barbara, Graduate School of Education, Department of Education, Teaching and Learning Emphasis, Santa Barbara, CA 93106

**Judith Green** University of California at Santa Barbara, Graduate School of Education, Department of Education, Teaching and Learning Emphasis, Santa Barbara, CA 93106

Kris D. Gutiérrez University of California, Los Angeles, Graduate School of Education and Information Studies, Division of Urban Schooling: Curriculum, Teaching, and Policy Studies, Los Angeles, CA 90024

**Vera P. John-Steiner** University of New Mexico, Department of Linguistics and Education, Albuquerque, NM 87131

**Carol D. Lee** Northwestern University, School of Education and Social Policy, Program in the Learning Sciences, Evanston, IL 60208

**Teresa M. Meehan** New Mexico State University at Grants, Department of Education and Psychology, Grants, NM 87020

**Luis C. Moll** University of Arizona, College of Education, Department of Language, Reading and Culture, Tucson, AZ 85721

**Cindy O'Donnell-Allen** Colorado State University, Department of English, Fort Collins, CO 80523–1773

**LeAnn G. Putney** University of Nevada at Las Vegas, College of Education, Department of Educational Psychology, Las Vegas, NV 89154-3003

xi



#### xii Contributors

**Peter Smagorinsky** University of Georgia, College of Education, Athens, GA 30602

**Lynda D. Stone** California State University at Sacramento, College of Education, Sacramento, CA 95819–0679

**Gordon Wells** University of Toronto, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, Department of Curriculum and Center for Teacher Development, Ontario, Canada M5S 1V6

**James V. Wertsch** Washington University in St. Louis, Department of Education, St. Louis, MO 63130-4899

Beth Yeager McKinley Elementary School, Santa Barbara, CA 93106